SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIAL WORKERS AT RISK:
EXPLORING PATHWAYS TO THEIR RESILIENCE

ELMIEN TRUTER
BA (SOCIAL WORK), MA (SOCIAL WORK)

VAAL TRIANGLE CAMPUS
NORTH-WEST UNIVERSITY

THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILMENT OF THE DEGREE PHILOSOPIAE
DOCTOR IN SOCIAL WORK AT THE VAAL TRIANGLE CAMPUS OF THE
NORTH-WEST UNIVERSITY

Promoter: Dr A Fouché
Co-promoter: Prof. LC Theron

5 May 2014
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to acknowledge my Pillar, my Lord, and my Saviour, Jesus Christ, without whom I am void. I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my family for their never-ending support, motivation, love, and patience during this journey. Thank you for the supportive friends and special people in my life: Mamma, Pappa, Karlien, Johan, Devan, Nelanie, Samantha, Chantelle, Werner, Christa, Tannie Adri, Oom Hedley, Fiennie and Koos. Thank you, Lizle, Grey, Hanli, Lalie, Yolinda, Claudia, Karin, Anita and Prof. Elda de Waal. Also, thank you Mandie and Victoria. Thank you to everyone near and far who has supported me in completing this thesis.

I wish to thank study participants for sharing their views and lived experiences, without which the current study would not have been possible. I also wish to thank all other South African designated social workers who dedicate their lives to protecting the defenceless. Thank you for your courage, your sacrifice, and the daily choice you make to face and confront the dark side of human behaviour when many others choose to look away.

“The only thing necessary for the triumph [of evil] is for good men to do nothing.”

I gratefully acknowledge the following people who assisted me in the completion of this thesis:

- Dr Ansie Fouché, for her expert mentorship, leadership, guidance, encouragement, and absolute dedication – for the long hours and late nights of hard work, perseverance, and support. You have become one of my role models in life.
▪ Prof. Linda Theron, for her willingness and devotion to act as co-promoter, her constant support, and her incredibly knowledgeable inspiration. Without her exceptional direction in writing this thesis, I may have never submitted it. I will forever be grateful to her.

▪ Prof. Cornelia Wessels, for her encouragement and support and her significant role in the very first phase of initiating this PhD and also my academic career.

▪ Dr Werner Nell, not only a dear friend who really carried me through the difficult times, but an exceptional critical reader, whose valued feedback assisted me in the completion of this thesis. His friendship and peer support are rare and much appreciated.

▪ Ms Martie Esterhuizen, for her continuous support in providing literature when I needed it. What a guardian angel she is!

▪ Ms Hendia Baker, for the language editing of my work.

▪ Prof. Chrizanne van Eden, who assisted me in the fine-tuning of this work before submission. I am forever grateful for her willingness, time, and esteemed feedback.

▪ My family, who has supported and carried me through unconditional love, sacrifice, protection, and patience.

▪ The North-West University, especially Prof. Ian Rothman and Dr Elrie Botha, for financial assistance.

▪ Every NWU staff member who assisted me in any direct or indirect way to successfully complete this thesis.

▪ Thank you Aldine for her technical assistance!

▪ Every experienced researcher with whom I have had research-related dialogues; they, too, have contributed to my improved understanding of research-related matters. Thank you.

▪ Prof. Rankin, for his critical feedback on a section of my work; his comments were of great value.
▪ All social work supervisors employed in the Vaal Triangle area, for their critical feedback (during a social work supervision training session facilitated by the social work staff at the NWU Vaal Triangle Campus) regarding the need for DSW resilience-promoting guidelines. Their feedback supported the writing of Manuscript 4.

▪ To all the service users with whom I have worked and every colleague in practice. They have contributed to my practice experience and have, thus, contributed to my insight and experience as a South African DSW, which has helped me to understand study participants’ experiences and perspectives.
THIS STUDY IS DEDICATED TO

My mother, Marieta Truter: a woman characterised by quiet strength and exceptional perseverance; a mother who loves and protects her family like a wolf defending her young.

My father, Johan Truter: a loving father, loyal friend and a man of leadership, integrity, and justice.

Every designated social worker who places his or her life on the line for every abused, neglected, or abandoned child.
PREFACE AND DECLARATION

The article format was chosen for the current study. The researcher, Elmien Truter, conducted the research and wrote the manuscripts. Dr Ansie Fouché and Prof. Linda Theron acted as promoter and co-promoter, respectively. Four manuscripts were written and will be submitted for publication in the following journals:

MANUSCRIPT 1: SOCIAL WORK/MAATSKAPLIKE WERK

MANUSCRIPT 2: THE SOCIAL WORK PRACTITIONER-RESEARCHER

MANUSCRIPT 3: QUALITATIVE HEALTH RESEARCH

MANUSCRIPT 4: SOCIAL WORK/MAATSKAPLIKE WERK

I declare that SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIAL WORKERS AT RISK: EXPLORING PATHWAYS TO THEIR RESILIENCE is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted are indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

Elmien Truter (Student number: 21293236)

5 May 2014
DECLARATION BY SUPERVISOR OR PROMOTER

In terms of the provisions of paragraph 80 of the Statutes of the North-West University, the undersigned declares that the candidate attended an approved course of study for the relevant qualification and that the work for the course has been completed or that work approved by the Senate has been done.

[Handwritten text]

Candidate: Ms Elmien Truter
Student Number: 21293236
Degree: PhD(Social Work) (Curriculum code G921V 805 108)
Title of thesis / dissertation / mini-dissertation:

[Handwritten signatures]

Signature of Supervisor / Promoter: [Signature]
Date: 03/11/2013
Signature of School Director: [Signature]
Date: 13/11/2013

2012-04-23

Ref 7.11.8
To whom it may concern

I hereby declare that I edited the PhD entitled “South African Social Workers at Risk: Exploring Pathways to their Resilience”, written by Elmien Truter. I am an accredited editor with the South African Translators’ Institute (SATI Member No.: 1000193).

Yours sincerely

Hendia Baker

APTrans (SATI)

APEd (SATI)
ABSTRACT

Social workers worldwide play a pivotal role in delivering social services to those in need of such services. Designated social workers (DSWs) deliver statutory services pertaining to the protection of children in need of care and protection. All social workers are confronted by several professional risk factors that jeopardise their well-being; yet risks specifically observed in DSWs support the plea to enhance their resilience. The purpose of this qualitative phenomenological inquiry was to explore pathways of resilience among resilient South African DSWs by studying relevant literature and examining South African DSWs’ lived experiences. A secondary purpose was to draw on these experiences and literature to develop guidelines for South African DSW supervisors who may encourage the promotion of DSW resilience. Conducting a qualitative research synthesis was the first step and resulted in the confirmation of social worker risk and a deficient understanding of South African DSW resilience. An advisory panel of social work, DSW, and resilience experts assembled and formulated indicators of resilience in resilient South African DSWs, namely: a value-embedded life, having a support network, and having personal strengths, which, next, facilitated the identification of 15 resilient South African DSWs through snowball sampling. These 15 DSWs wrote narratives and were interviewed through semi-structured interviews in order to explore their lived experiences of workplace risks and their resilience processes. The findings concluded that these DSWs adapted to workplace adversities by living a purpose- and practice-informing creed, enjoying supportive collaborations, engaging in constructive transactions, and accentuating the positive. Guidelines for South African DSW supervisors, which emerged from these findings and literature, were proposed to be framed by reflective supervision as a step towards promoting South African DSW resilience.
Keywords: South African, risks, social work, designated social work, child protection work, statutory social worker, qualitative, phenomenological, exploratory, advisory panel, indicator, resilience processes, guidelines, reflective supervision, supervisor, qualitative research synthesis
Maatskaplike werkers wêreldwyd speel ‘n deur slaggewende rol in die lewering van maatskaplike dienste aan diegene wat sodanige dienste benodig. Statutêre maatskaplike werkers (SMWs) lewer statutêre dienste met betrekking tot die beskerming van kinders wat sorg en beskerming benodig. Alle maatskaplike werkers het met verskeie professionele risikofaktore te kampe wat hul welstand in gevaar stel; tog ondersteun risiko’s wat spesifiek in SMW waargeneem word, die pleidooi om hul veerkragtigheid te versterk. Die doel van hierdie kwalitatiewe fenomenologiese ondersoek was om paaiie van veerkragtigheid onder veerkragtige Suid-Afrikaanse SMWs te ondersoek deur tersaaklike literatuur te bestudeer en Suid-Afrikaanse SMWs se beleefde ervarings te ondersoek. ’n Sekondêre doel was om uit hierdie ervarings en literatuur te put om riglyne vir Suid-Afrikaanse SMW-supervisors te ontwikkel wat die bevordering van SMW-veerkragtigheid mag aanmoedig. Die uitvoer van ’n kwalitatiewe navorsingsintese was die eerste stap en het tot die bevestiging van die risiko vir maatskaplike werkers en ’n gebrekkige begrip van Suid-Afrikaanse SMW-veerkragtigheid geleë. ’n Adviespaneel van maatskaplike werk-, SMW- en veerkragtigheidsdeskundiges het aanduiders van veerkragtigheid in veerkragtige Suid-Afrikaanse SMWs ingesamel en geformuleer, naamlik, ’n waarde-geankerde lewe, die bestaan van 'n ondersteuningsnetwerk en die besit van persoonlike kragte, wat vervolgens die identifisering van 15 veerkragtige Suid-Afrikaanse SMWs deur ’n sneeuvalsteekproef vergemaklik het. Hierdie 15 SMWs het narratiewe geskryf, en daar is semigestructureerde onderhoude met hulle gevoer ten einde ondersoek na hul beleefde ervarings van werkplekrisiko’s en hul veerkragtigheidsprosesse in te stel. Die bevindings het tot die gevolgtrekking geleë dat hierdie SMWs by werkpleksteëspoed aangepas het deur ’n doel- en praktykgeïnspireerde belydenis uit te leef, ondersteunende
samewerkings te ervaar, aan konstruktiewe transaksies deel te neem en die positiewe te beklemtoon. Riglyne vir Suid-Afrikaanse SMW-supervisors wat uit hierdie bevindinge en literatuur na vore gekom het, is voorgestel om deur reflektiewe supervisie geformuleer te word as ’n stap tot die bevordering van Suid-Afrikaanse SMW-veerkragtigheid.

*Sleutelwoorde:* Suid-Afrikaanse, risiko’s, maatskaplike werk, statutêre maatskaplike werk, kinderbeskermingswerk, statutêre maatskaplike werker, kwalitatiewe, fenomenologiese, ondersoekend, adviespaneel, aarduier, veerkragtigheidsprosesse, riglyne, reflektiewe supervisie, supervisor, kwalitatiewe navorsing sintese
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ii
PREFACE AND DECLARATION vi
PERMISSION LETTER vii
DECLARATION OF LANGUAGE EDITOR viii
ABSTRACT ix
OPSOMMING xi

SECTION A: OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

1. Background and rationale for the research 3
   1.1 Importance of social workers and designated social workers 3
   1.2 The risk-laden nature of social work 6
   1.3 Recognition of designated social worker (DSW) risks 9
   1.4 Defining resilience 10
   1.5 Resilience research 10
   1.6 An inadequate understanding of South African DSW resilience 11

2. Purpose statement 14
   2.1 Definitions of concepts 14
   2.1.1 Social worker 14
   2.1.2 Designated social worker 15
## SECTION B: MANUSCRIPTS

### MANUSCRIPT 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines for authors</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract and keywords</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opsomming en sleutelwoorde</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A social ecological understanding of resilience</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribution to the field</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The review</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aim of study</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search methods</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality appraisal</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data extraction and synthesis</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The risk-laden nature of social work</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on the risks inherent in designated social work (DSW)</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An inadequate understanding of DSW resilience</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western-saturated explanations of DSW resilience</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of the study</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
References

Table i: Demographics of AP members

Figure i: Indicators of resilience in resilient South African DSWs

MANUSCRIPT 3

Preface

Guidelines for authors

Abstract and keywords

Introduction

Earlier studies

Social workers at risk

Resilience processes in resilient designated social workers (DSWs)

An inadequate understanding of South African DSW resilience

Method

Population and sampling strategy

Data collection

Data analysis

Trustworthiness

Ethical issues

Findings

Risk factors experienced by South African DSWs

Resilience processes among South African DSWs
Practice and purpose informing creeds 160
Supportive collaborations 162
Constructive transaction 167
Accentuating the positive 172
Discussion 174
Conclusion 180
References 181
Table 1: Identifying details of study participants 154
Figure 1: South African DSW resilience processes 160

MANUSCRIPT 4

Preface 195
Guidelines to authors 197
Abstract and keywords 200
Opsomming en sleutelwoorde 201
Introduction 202
Resilience promotion 205
Social work supervision 206
Research question 208
Method and procedure 208
Development of guidelines 209
Resilience-promoting guidelines framed by reflective supervision 214
Fundamentals of reflective supervision 214
Key considerations pertaining to resilience contexts 216
Key considerations pertaining to guideline stages

Stage 1: Return to the experience

Stage 2: Attend to feelings and development of potential risks

Stage 3: Evaluate existing processes of positive adaptation to risks, and propose reflection on additional resilience processes

Strategy - Purpose and Practice informing creeds

Strategy - Supportive collaborations

Strategy - Constructive Transactions

Strategy - Accentuating the positive

Stage 4: Learning and planning

Summary and conclusions

Limitations

References

Table 1: Application of practice- and purpose-informing creeds

Table 2: Application of supportive collaborations

Table 3: Application of constructive transactions

Table 4: Application of accentuating the positive

Figure 1: Resilience-promoting guidelines framed by an adapted reflective supervision model

Figure 2: South African DSW resilience indicators and processes (Truter, 2013b-d) aligned with recognised (Masten & Wright, 2010) resilience processes and former empirical findings

Figure 3: Exploring potential and existing risks and related feelings
### SECTION C: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Introduction 252
2. Questions reconsidered 252
3. Conclusions emanating from the study 255
4. Personal reflections 260
5. Limitations of the study 263
6. Contributions made by the study 263
7. Recommendations for future studies 265
8. Final conclusion 266

Figure 2 Overview of thesis 251
Figure 3 A schematic representation of how research questions were explored 254
Figure 4 Indicators of resilience in a resilient South African designated social worker (DSW) 257
Figure 5 Relationships among research findings 259

Combined reference list 267

Appendix 1 Programme of supervision training for social worker supervisors from the Vaal Triangle 299

Appendix 2 Summary of studies selected for the qualitative research synthesis 301
Appendix 3 Advisory panel (AP) programme 302
Appendix 4 Protocol for identifying prospective participants 303
Appendix 5 Informed consent form for AP members 305
Appendix 6 Interview schedule 309
Appendix 7  Participant information letter  317
Appendix 8  Informed consent forms for resilient South African DSWs  320
Appendix 9  NWU Letter of ethical approval  323
Appendix 10  Audit trail: Journal insert, coding table and example of coded narrative  325