The Lord of the Rings: The Representation of Space in the Novel and Film Texts of The Return of the King

SHANÉ DU TOIT
20277660

Dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Magister Artium in English at the Potchefstroom Campus of the North-West University

Supervisor: Prof ES van der Westhuizen
Co-supervisor: Prof MJ Wenzel

May 2014
I hereby wish to gratefully acknowledge the financial assistance offered by the National Research Foundation (NRF) and the Research Unit: Language and Literature in the South African Context. Opinions expressed and conclusions reached in this study are those of the author and should not be ascribed to either the NRF or the North-West University.

My sincerest gratitude to my supervisors, Prof. E.S. van der Westhuizen and Prof. M.J. Wenzel, for their guidance, intellectual contributions, advice, continual enthusiasm and encouragement. I have learned much and will treasure it always.

A huge thank you to Prof. D. Levey for the excellent editing of the dissertation and to Mrs. E. Strydom for the formatting.

To my parents, I cannot thank you enough for your financial support in my education, your emotional support, continual interest and love.

I wish to thank all of my friends for their advice, encouragement and just for always being there.

To my husband and son, I wish I could fully express my gratitude for your support and love. Thank you for being there every step of the way and always believing in me. Amin melia lle.

Soli Deo Gloria
ABSTRACT

This study investigates the representation of narrative space in the novel and the film of *The Return of the King*. As the two representations belong to two different mediums, the theories on narrative space in the novel and in the film are examined in order to distinguish between their modes of representation of space. In essence, the theory utilised for the spatial analysis focuses on the content, function and symbolic meaning within spaces, as created by the description of objects, the repetition and accumulation of spatial information, as well as the movement of characters within spaces and the interaction between characters and different spaces. This spatial interaction relates to the events, representations of time and the role of the narrator within the different dimensions of narrated space, that is, concrete and abstract space. The three most significant spaces within the novel and the film, namely Minas Tirith, Mount Doom and Hobbiton form the basis of the analysis, which focuses on the narrative spaces as they are represented. From this study, it becomes clear that there are different levels of meaning embodied within a space: the physical and geographical space, the social space of interaction and the abstract, symbolic space.

The significant spaces and their meanings in the novel have been subjected to filmic transformation. Essentially, the spaces in both the novel and the film display the fact that space ultimately influences those events and people who interact with it and vice versa. These spaces thus embody specific meanings, which contribute towards the undertaken journey represented in Tolkien's fantastical, imaginative world.

KEYWORDS:

Narrative Space, Space and Place, Novel, Film, Film Adaptation, Semiotics, Symbolism, Fantasy, Alternate Worlds, Boundaries, *The Lord of the Rings, The Return of the King*, J.R.R. Tolkien, Peter Jackson
In die studie word die die representasie van die narratiewe ruimte in die roman en die film *The Return of the King* ondersoek. Aangesien die roman en die film aan twee verskillende mediums behoort, word die teorie oor representasie van die ruimte in sowel die roman as die film betrek. Die essensie van die teorie wat gebruik is vir die analise van die representasie van die ruimte fokus op die inhoud, funksie en simboliese betekenis binne in die ruimtes wat geskep word deur die betrek van voorwerpe, herhaling en akkumulasie van ruimtelike inligting, sowel as die beweging van karakters in die ruimte en interaksie tussen karakters en verskeie ruimtes. Die interaksie van die ruimte met ander verhaalaspekte hou verband met die verteller en fokalisator, die karakters, die gebeure, asook die tyd binne verschillende dimensies van die vertelde ruimte - konkreet en abstrak. Die drie belangrikste ruimtes in die roman en die film, naamlik Minas Tirith, Mount Doom en Hobbiton, vorm die basis vir die analise van die representasie van die ruimte. Deur die studie word dit duidelik dat daar verschillende vlakke van betekenis in die ruimte vergestalt word: die fisiese en geografiese ruimte, die sosiale ruimte van interaksie, en die abstrakte, simboliese ruimte.

Alhoewel die representasiewyses van die ruimte in die roman en die film verskil, het die kernbetekenisse van die ruimte in die roman en die film dieselfde gebly. Uiteindelik dui die representasie van die ruimtes in beide die roman en die film daarop dat ruimte uiteindelik gebeure en diegene wat daarmee in interaksie is, beïnvloed, en omgekeerd. Die ruimtes verkonkretiseer dus verschillende betekenisse, wat bydra tot die reis wat onderneem is in Tolkien se fantasiematige, verbeeldingryke wêreld.

**SLEUTELWOORDE:**

Narratiewe ruimte, Ruimte en plek, Roman, Film, Filmtransformasie, Semiotiek, Simboliek, Fantasie, Alternatiewe Wêrelede, Grense, *The Lord of the Rings*, *The Return of the King*, J.R.R. Tolkien, Peter Jackson
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ........................................................................................................ ii

ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................................... iii

KEYWORDS: ............................................................................................................................. iii

OPSOMMING ........................................................................................................................... iv

SLEUTELWOORDE: ............................................................................................................... iv

TABLE OF CONTENTS ............................................................................................................ v

LIST OF MAPS ....................................................................................................................... viii

LIST OF TABLES ..................................................................................................................... viii

LIST OF FILM STILLS ........................................................................................................... ix

CHAPTER 1:  INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXTUALISATION OF TOLKIEN’S

  THE LORD OF THE RINGS ................................................................................................... 1

1.1  INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................... 1

1.2  CONTEXTUALISATION ..................................................................................................... 2

1.3  RESEARCH QUESTIONS ................................................................................................. 6

1.4  EXPOSITION OF RESEARCH AND DISSERTATION ..................................................... 7

1.5  CENTRAL THEORETICAL STATEMENT ....................................................................... 8

1.6  RESEARCH METHOD ...................................................................................................... 8

1.7  CONCLUSION .................................................................................................................... 10

CHAPTER 2:  TOLKIEN AND HIS WORLD: A THEORETICAL CONTEXT ........ 12

2.1  INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................. 12

2.2  FANTASY AS GENRE ...................................................................................................... 14
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>SPACE IN NARRATIVE</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>Space</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>Semiotics in Novel and Film: a Brief Definition</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3</td>
<td>The Journey as an Expansion of Symbolic Vision</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>FOCUSSING ON SPACE IN THE COMPLETE NOVEL AND FILM TEXTS OF <em>THE LORD OF THE RINGS</em></td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>FOCUSSING ON SPECIFIC SPACES IN THE NOVEL AND FILM TEXTS OF <em>THE RETURN OF THE KING</em></td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 3:** SPACE IN THE NOVEL, *THE RETURN OF THE KING* | 47   |
| 3.1     | INTRODUCTION | 47   |
| 3.2     | NARRATIVE SPACE IN THE NOVEL | 49   |
| 3.3     | ANALYSIS OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE NOVEL, *THE RETURN OF THE KING* | 53   |
| 3.3.1   | Gondor: Minas Tirith | 56   |
| 3.3.2   | Mordor: Mount Doom | 73   |
| 3.3.3   | The Shire: Hobbiton | 84   |
| 3.4     | CONCLUSION | 96   |

**CHAPTER 4:** SPACE IN THE FILM, *THE RETURN OF THE KING* | 98   |
| 4.1     | INTRODUCTION | 98   |
| 4.2     | FILM THEORY RELEVANT TO THE ANALYSIS OF NARRATIVE SPACE IN *THE RETURN OF THE KING* | 99   |
| 4.3     | ANALYSIS OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE FILM, *THE RETURN OF THE KING* | 114  |
| 4.3.1   | Gondor: Minas Tirith | 115  |
4.3.2 Mordor: Mount Doom ................................................................. 135
4.3.3 The Shire: Hobbiton ................................................................. 147
4.4. CONCLUSION ............................................................................ 156

CHAPTER 5: SYNTHESIS: COMPARISON AND CONCLUSION .............. 158

5.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................... 158
5.2 COMPARISON OF THE REPRESENTATION OF NARRATIVE SPACES IN THE NOVEL AND THE FILM, THE RETURN OF THE KING ................................................................. 159
5.3. VARIANTS IN THE REPRESENTATION OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE NOVEL AND FILM ................................................................. 162
5.3.1 Gondor: Minas Tirith ................................................................. 164
5.3.2 Mordor: Mount Doom ................................................................. 169
5.3.3 The Shire: Hobbiton ................................................................. 172
5.4 CONSTANTS IN THE REPRESENTATION OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE NOVEL AND FILM ................................................................. 173
5.4.1 Gondor: Minas Tirith ................................................................. 174
5.4.2 Mordor: Mount Doom ................................................................. 176
5.4.3 The Shire: Hobbiton ................................................................. 178
5.5 CONCLUSIONS ........................................................................... 184

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................................. 187

APPENDIX A: Photos of spaces in New Zealand where Selected Spaces were filmed ........................................................................... 199
APPENDIX B: Illustrations by Alan Lee .................................................. 201
APPENDIX C: Declaration ................................................................... 204
LIST OF MAPS

Map 1: The West of Middle Earth (Tolkien TLR 1141) .......................55
Map 2: Map of Gondor and Mordor (Tolkien TLR 1145) ...................59
Map 3: Tolkien’s map of a part of the Shire (Tolkien TLR 20) .............88

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Variants and Constants in Novel and Film ............................180
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Screen capture</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Gandalf and Pippin on route to Minas Tirith.</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Minas Tirith exterior taken from inside the City.</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Minas Tirith aerial shot</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>White Tree and guards, with Mordor in the background.</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The first blossom on the withered Tree of Minas Tirith.</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Mordor seen from the Citadel.</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The armies of Mordor seen from the Citadel.</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The siege of Minas Tirith, aerial shot.</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Minas Tirith ablaze. Interior shot of City.</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>The armies of Rohan seen in front of the sunrise.</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Sunlight shining on the City after the War of the Ring.</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The coronation of the King (Aragorn).</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>The crowd gathered in the Citadel and the blossoming White Tree of Gondor.</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Aragorn and Arwen reunited.</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>The journey through Mordor.</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Sam framed by structure.</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>The first sighting of Mount Doom.</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>The Eye of Sauron.</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Mordor terrain.</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Ruggedness and barrenness of Mordor.</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Screen capture</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Mount Doom, exterior.</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Inside the Crack of Doom in Mount Doom.</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>The Tower crumbling to the ground.</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Tower shattering, Mount Doom erupting.</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>The destructive blast from the tower.</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>The four Hobbits entering Hobbiton.</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Sunset over Hobbiton.</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>In the tavern.</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Hobbiton before the journey to the Grey Havens.</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Frodo walking through Bag End.</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Frodo in the study.</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Sam’s house.</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>The round yellow door.</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1:
INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXTUALISATION OF TOLKIEN’S THE LORD OF THE RINGS

1.1 INTRODUCTION

*The Lord of the Rings* by J.R.R. Tolkien, is known as a trilogy which has been adapted into film format by film director Peter Jackson. Lothe (86) mentions that the adaptation of a literary text is not simply “to ‘transfer’ a work of art from one medium to another”; since this is almost impossible, the adaptation of a literary text to film is, in some sense, rather a “translation to film language”; (Lothe 8). It is the purpose of this dissertation to make a comparison between the novel, *The Return of the King*, which actually consists of two books: Book Five and Book Six and the film adaptation of the novel by the same title, *The Return of the King*. The comparison will consist of an analysis of the two texts, with the focus on the narrative spaces and the role they fulfil within the respective texts. For this purpose, the focus is on three particular spaces within the written text that are important to the success of the plot and the quest undertaken by the fellowship¹ of friends, within the novel. These same spaces are then also focussed on as central to the filmic plot, for the purpose of a comparison. An analysis of the three identified spaces is undertaken on both the novel and the film texts. Firstly, the analysis of the spaces focusses on the concrete, geographical space; secondly, the focus is on the psychological space which includes social-, economic- and cultural space and lastly, the focus falls on the abstract spaces. A symbolic meaning may be derived from the interpretation of these spaces, which are then compared to each other in order to establish what the variants and constants are with regards to the representation of the spaces within the novel and the film, and whether or not the meaning of these spaces has changed.

¹ The fellowship consists of a Hobbit called Frodo Baggins, an Elf, a Dwarf, a Wizard, three other Hobbits and two humans.
1.2 CONTEXTUALISATION

In *The Lord of the Rings*, Tolkien creates an alternate world inhabited by Hobbits and other fantastic creatures such as Elves and Dwarf. This imaginary world might be created along with its inhabitants in order to illustrate the perpetual conflict between good and evil and to create an awareness of the destructive influence of the abuse of power in our human world as well as in other parallel worlds. In the novel, a fellowship of friends travels through the wonderful and dangerous world of Middle-Earth, in search of the Ring of Power in order to destroy it and save the world from domination by the Dark Lord, Sauron. As the concept of a journey implies, the expansion of experience by traversing unknown landscapes, crossing strange boundaries, visiting new places and meeting different people, the journey tends to assume a symbolic meaning for the fellowship and for the readers, or spectators\(^2\) in the case of the film adaptation. The travellers encounter various situations that challenge their respective strengths and weaknesses with regard to physical endurance and mental fortitude. Furthermore, their interaction with various contexts and communities along the way also fosters moral awareness that shapes their respective identities. Although the interpretation of space and places is important in the novel as a whole, this study will only focus on the last book of the novel and on the equivalent film text, *The Return of the King*, as these versions constitute the culmination of the quest and illustrate the vindication of good over evil.

Several critics have commented on Tolkien’s concept of alternate worlds, his use of fantasy, and on the symbolic implications of the quest for the ring, but the significance of space and place have not received due recognition in the interpretation of his oeuvre. For instance, his creation of a credible world has been admired by Lewis (*blurb*) as found in the reviews on *The Lord of the Rings* book cover, when he claims that

\(^2\) The plural of reader and spectator is used within the dissertation to describe both the researcher and the implied reader or implied spectator of *The Return of the King*. 
no imaginary world has been projected which is at once multifarious and so true to its own inner laws [...] none so relevant to the actual human situation yet free from allegory. And what fine shading there is in the variation of style to meet the almost endless diversity of scenes and characters – comic, homely, epic, monstrous or diabolic.

According to Tolkien a secondary world is the fantasy world created by the author, with elements from reality (which is our world, the primary world); he describes fantasy as a sub-creative art. Therefore the author is a sub-creator, because God is the first Creator of a world.

In On Fairy-stories, Tolkien writes that “the story-maker […] a successful 'sub-creator' […] makes a Secondary World which your mind can enter. Inside it, what he relates is ‘true’: it accords with the laws of that world. You therefore believe it, while you are, as it were, inside.” (Tolkien 139) Tolkien created this fantastic secondary world filled with imaginary regions set in what he called Middle-Earth. His novels are classified as fantasy; the term is explained in more detail in Chapter 2.1.1. For purposes of this dissertation, the term fantasy refers to the genre of literary text and other media, since the genre of fantasy is not only the class of literature (the mode), but also a means of understanding and interpreting the text within a specific framework. A significant theoretical debate exists with regard to whether fantasy is a mode or a genre. There is evidence for both a mode and a genre in his work, as Tolkien received recognition for his use of fantasy by Mancing (403) 3 and Ursula Le Guin (61-65) who remarked that fantasy (as a mode) is regarded as “…the medium best suited to a description of that journey, its perils and reward […] that it [The Lord of the Rings] is told in the language of fantasy is not an accident, or because Tolkien was an escapist […] it is a fantasy because fantasy is the natural, the appropriate language for the recounting of the spiritual journey and the struggle of good and evil”.

Perhaps Matthews (1) captures the elusive character of fantasy best when he intimates that: “Although it is difficult to define literary fantasy precisely, most critics agree it is a type of fiction that evokes wonder, mystery, or magic – a sense of possibility beyond the ordinary, material, rationally predictable world in which we live”. The definition of fantasy literature has changed much over the ages, but to create a link between the novels and

3 For this dissertation the 2009 7th edition MLA citation and bibliographical referencing style is used.
the genre, Tolkien himself describes fantasy in his essay *On Fairy-stories* (139) and says that it is “Sub-creative Art in itself and a quality of strangeness and wonder [...] derived from the Image”. An alternate world would imply certain correspondences with our world, but would also contain elements of mystery or fantasy. Consequently, the most critical characteristic of fantasy fiction, as it appears in this dissertation, would entail that it features a world similar to our own real world, but also a very different, sub-created world with themes, characters and spaces relevant to any reader or spectator. Middle Earth is indeed a representation of our own world, with the exception of extraordinary aspects such as magic, different fantastical races such as Elves, Orcs and Wizards. Fantasy might differ almost completely from reality, but in the case of *The Return of the King*, it generally differs only slightly, creating the effect of an actual world for the readers and spectators. Todorov reinforces the idea of sub-created worlds when he quotes Castex (qtd. in Todorov 26) as saying that “…the fantastic […] is characterized […] by a brutal intrusion of mystery into the context of real life”.

The symbolic meaning of *The Lord of the Rings* is captured by the various challenges and battles that are fought to conquer evil and acquire additional meaning in the spaces or landscapes in which they occur. The journey, or quest for freedom, starts in the first novel4 (*The Fellowship of the Ring*) with the discovery of the ring in the Shire. It progresses to the breaking of the fellowship and the different battles fought against Sauron and his armies in *The Two Towers*, finally reaching a culmination in the last part of the novel, *The Return of the King*. *The Return of the King* focuses specifically on the last mountain that needs to be crossed by Frodo and Sam in order to destroy the One Ring in Mount Doom. While they are travelling through Mordor to reach Mount Doom, Aragorn and the rest of the company proceed to Minas Tirith, the capital city of Gondor, in order to resist the enemies’ approach on the White City5 (Minas Tirith), which represents the last beacon of hope and freedom.

Place, and specifically in this respect Space, is an important aspect of this research, since the focus of the dissertation falls on the represented landscapes and the different layers of meaning found in these spaces and places. Appropriate definitions follow. Narrative space

---

4 *The Lord of the Rings* trilogy is actually one epic novel, comprising six books (Anderson xi), but for this dissertation the complete novel, *The Lord of the Rings*, will be referred to as the trilogy, and the each of the three separate parts, *The Fellowship of the Ring*, *The Two Towers* and *The Return of the King* will be referred to as novels.
may be defined as the “environment in which story-internal characters move about and live.” (Buchholz & Jahn 552). The three spaces chosen for the study are Mount Doom, Minas Tirith and the Shire. The chronotope in narratology is the term used to describe the “…intrinsic connectedness of temporal and spatial relationships that are artistically expressed in literature” (Bakhtin 15); the term literally means “time-space” (Prince 13). In *The Return of the King*, the inter-connectedness of time and space is evident in the different events happening to different characters in different spaces at the same time, but without the one knowing of the other. *The Lord of the Rings*, with specific focus on *The Return of the King*, is a text or visual medium, as in the case of the film, that contains contiguous sub-spaces, meaning that characters are able to move around freely from one space to another. According to Bal (140) the movement of characters is also a goal in itself, because the character has to develop, change and finally receive knowledge about him- or herself as well as wisdom. In such travel stories the characters move from one space to another, as is the case in *The Return of the King*, and they evidently need a whole world to reach their goal. This crossing of spaces and their borders may very often be from a positive space to a negative one and vice versa. These literary spaces “cannot be measured, but […] can be experienced” (Fincham 39).

These spaces found in the novel and the film may then be divided into different levels, but for this dissertation only three will be specifically used. Firstly, all the spaces in the novel, as well as in the film, are represented in a concrete, topographical manner, with locations and certain objects within these locations. Not only are these structural objects tangible, such as a wall and a house, but so are the characters who move around and interact with objects and other characters in these spaces. Through characters, the reader is introduced to the “…perceptual representation of space” (Bal 136) by means of sensory perception (sight, sound and touch). All of these spaces create a certain atmosphere and meaning in the novel that contribute to the plot of the novel through the broad overview of the space as a whole, as separate individual spaces, but also by the objects that are found in them since “…objects have spatial status” (Bal 138). However, there is also a second level in which the narrative interest of a concrete space really lies, the way that characters experience the space, not only socially, but also psychologically. Bachelard (qtd.in Buchholz & Jahn 551) called it “lived space”, one through which characters are affected and they in turn affect it. Crang (22) says that landscapes are shaped by people and these landscapes also shape the people who live in them; they are thus dependent

---

5 The word “City” is used it refers to Minas Tirith, but city in lower case refers to a city in general.
on each other. The characters also experience the lived space through the living conditions, the mood and atmosphere present in the space, as well as the changes that take place in the space (even if the dimensions of the space remain physically constant). These changes may take place through "...association of certain locations with the events that occur in them" (Bridgeman 56). For example a war that takes place in a previously peaceful country changes the meaning of the space. This psychological experience of space, as in the mood and atmosphere of a space, is the location where the symbolic meanings of certain spaces and objects in these spaces come into play, creating a third level, since they create a metaphysical space for the character to live in. Frodo does not only undertake a journey from his homeland over many different concrete landscapes to finally reach Mount Doom, but he also undertakes a metaphysical journey where his ideology is put to the test.

1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Three questions form the focus of the research done in this study on *The Lord of the Rings*, with specific focus on the last two books. The first point examined is discovering how the spaces are represented in the abovementioned novel and how these same spaces are represented in the film version of this last book of the trilogy. Of importance is noting whether the film adaptation has used the same information provided in the novels as the basis for the design of the sets (representation) for the film and if not, where the deviation(s) from the original notes by Tolkien are present in each space. The second question addresses the determination of the corresponding spaces that play a significant role in the symbolic interpretation of the novel. These places have to fulfil certain criteria with regard to their importance in the text, which include the symbolic meaning that is found in the space, the interaction that takes place between the characters at this specific space and if the space has indeed influenced the quest and/or the character in any way. The places have therefore to be determined according to their significance in the whole of the novel and film and the definition of symbolic interpretation requires clarification. The final question concerns whether or not the representation of the spaces within the film, and thus the meaning of the space has remained as close as possible to the narrative representation of the spaces in the novel and whether or not additional meaning has been discovered by the comparison between the novel and the film *The Return of the King.*
Tolkien’s legendary fantasy world, Middle Earth, is represented in *The Lord of the Rings*. He needed to create a world of different spaces for his characters in which to live and interact and thus created Middle Earth as a secondary world. The aim of this dissertation is to determine exactly how Tolkien represented space in his novel *The Return of the King*, and then to determine how Jackson represented these same spaces in his film adaptation of the novel. The second aim of the dissertation is to determine three corresponding spaces in the novel and the film that play a significant role in the interpretation of the novel or the film and are symbolically meaningful at the same time. These three spaces are then compared with each other in both of the media to determine if the meaning that was intended by the original author, Tolkien, is still valid or whether Jackson’s version is lacking in some way or reveals additional meaning. The third aim was thus not to merely compare these three identified spaces, but also to determine or interpret whether the representation of space in the novel and the film versions of *The Return of the King*, has generated additional meaning.

In addition to the introduction in Chapter 1, this dissertation provides a theoretical background in Chapter 2, presenting information on not only the author and his novel *The Lord of the Rings*, but also on the film by Jackson and the theoretical elements applied and discussed in the dissertation. The third and fourth chapters are individually devoted to the novel and the film respectively. Chapter 3 discusses the narrative space in the novel, with reference to the relevant theory applicable to the written novel in general. The three spaces selected for analysis in the novel are identified and described in detail and their respective implications and meanings with regard to the said spaces are determined. Chapter 4 follows the same basic pattern, consisting of the description of the film theory to clarify any uncertainties. The three spaces referred to in Chapter 3 are identified in the film production and the same processing of the film spaces done, giving a detailed description of the spaces as well as the meaning generated on each level and in each space. The final chapter is dedicated to the comparison between the novel and the said film. The comparison considers the three spaces selected in the novel and the film in order to compare the variants and the constants within the representation of the space, to determine in which manner the representation of the spaces differs or correlates. It is also the objective of the comparison to determine whether there is any difference in meaning between the novel and the film.
1.5 CENTRAL THEORETICAL STATEMENT

In this dissertation it is argued that the significance of space and place represents an important element in the symbolic interpretation of the concept of a journey, or quest, and that the journey undertaken by Frodo and his fellowship in *The Lord of the Rings* should be interpreted in terms of symbolic spaces/places. In such an analysis, the presence of physical, social and mental boundaries applies as they contribute towards the expansion of human spatial experience and the formation of identity of each of the characters who participate in the quest. Many of the spaces encountered in the novel, as well as the film, convey specific meanings and are important for the development of the main theme of good versus evil. The significance of the three major spaces in *The Return of the King* that have been investigated and discussed in this dissertation depends on their influence on Frodo, as well as the rest of the individuals in the company, and the choices that they make on account of that influence. Cognitive narratology also comes into play in this dissertation in terms of the importance of the readers and spectators, and their individual backgrounds as well as the interpretations that they bring to the novel and film. The research furthermore maintains that the final book of the trilogy represents a key episode in the battle of good over evil and that a comparison of the key spaces represented by the novel and film texts, will enhance interpretation of the novel. It is also suggested that the most important meanings have been retained in the two versions despite the change of medium from novel to film.

1.6 RESEARCH METHOD

As indicated earlier, this dissertation examines both the novel and the film, *The Return of the King*, in order to compare the two different modes of representation of space. Even though the same basic plotline runs through both the novel and the film, the spaces are represented in different ways. Mittell (156) describes the difference between space as represented in novels and in films, when he says that the spaces in novels are described in “cinematic [...] language that evokes visual and aural details”, whereas the film depicts these same spaces, but in images. Literature thus creates a verbal map of spaces found in the novel, whereas the film creates a visual map of exactly the same spaces. Ryan (*Cognitive* 236) describes mental maps created by the readers of literature as narrative spaces “...centered on the characters, and they grow out of them” in contrast to film, which starts with a fully created scene of a specific landscape that is gradually populated by characters. The focus will be on the nature of the represented “lived” spaces in the
narratives in order to determine the symbolic or metaphysical meaning attached to each space and how these meanings contribute to the main character, Frodo’s, moral awareness. In order to undertake an in-depth examination and analysis of the novel as well as the film, not only are the above-mentioned theoretical tenets regarding literature itself examined, but also film theory as found in Casetti and by Zettl. It was possible to perform a comparative analysis between film and novel, specifically with the focus falling on space in the narrative, because although they do differ in media and other aspects, “…the most important components […] – time, space, and causality – are central concepts in film theory as well” (Lothe 8).

The study therefore consists of a comparative analysis of the three major landscapes in the novel *The Return of the King* and their equivalents in the film, with the purpose of finding out if the level of symbolism and meaning has indeed been maintained in the transition from novel to film, or if the meanings have been diminished in any way. These spaces were chosen according to the role that they play in the plot, the importance of the specific space regarding the mission of the fellowship as well as the symbolic meaning found in each space. In some art, as well as in this narrative, the theme is the battle between good and evil, but in *The Lord of the Rings* this battle also involves a journey across different spaces that need to be transcended in order for good to triumph and the story to run a full circle and reach completion.

The preliminary study consisted of reading the complete trilogy, *The Lord of the Rings*, as well as viewing all three films. However, the researcher’s focus was on reading and the viewing of the third part of the trilogy, *The Return of the King*. The last novel and film require the context in which the readers’ and spectators’ frame of reference includes knowledge of the former two novels and films. This was accomplished with the aim of compiling a list of spaces in both of the genres (novel and film) and required an identification of the most important spaces with regard to meaning and interpretation of the trilogy, as well as with regard to the symbolic meanings that could be found in these spaces. The second phase of the research entailed a textual literature study, where literary theory was studied with regard to fantasy, symbolism and space in the narrative (in both the novel and the film). This literary theory, specifically regarding space in narrative, was applied to the preliminary study and was also intended to support and validate the analysis made.
The final phase of the research was an intensive study of the spatial representations in the novel and the transformation of these specific spaces into filmic spaces. Appendix A contains some photographs taken of the physical locations that were used during the filming for the three selected spaces. These spaces were chosen according to the role that they played in the plot, the importance of the specific space with regard to the fellowship's mission, with particular focus on Frodo, and the contribution that these spaces have made to the overall story and awareness of moral values. From the above-mentioned research and analysis, a comparison was done between the spaces in the two genres to determine if the same meaning had been retained even though there was a transformation from prose to filmic space. The method of research for this dissertation entailed an integrated analysis, interpretation and evaluation of The Return of the King novel and thereafter of the film by that title. However, for the sake of clarity the analysis was presented in two separate chapters followed by the comparison.

1.7 CONCLUSION

The Lord of the Rings is one of the most famous and most widely read novels in the world but some readers may feel that the literary achievements and value of the novel have been “dumbed down”. This is due to it having been made into a film, which on the whole may be considered easier, containing less value and for those who do not wish to broaden their horizons through reading. The dissertation attempts to prove that for the most part, the film has been kept as close as possible to the novel and that the meaning, which Tolkien wanted to convey to his readers, has been carried over into a more accessible visual representation. To demonstrate this, the next chapter is devoted to an analysis of the novel, which firstly explains the theory on narrative space within written texts, specifically novels, and then provides an in-depth consecutive analysis of the three identified spaces. Following the analysis of the novel is an analysis of the film in the same order; firstly mentioning the theory of film, then describing the theory on narrative spaces within a film and finally an in-depth analysis of the same identified spaces. The last chapter contains a comparison between the two texts and the three spaces within the texts. The predominant theme of this fantasy novel and film contains one of the oldest messages in time, that good will triumph over evil through self-discovery and self-sacrifice. There are a variety of different other themes within the novel and the films as well, such as the importance of friendship, loyalty and love, the conservation of nature and that one’s size, gender or race are not important in making a difference within the world. It is the
objective of this dissertation not only to show that every space in the novel or in the film, is loaded with meaning which contributes to the overall understanding and experience of the narrative, but also that these symbolically loaded spaces are able to be adapted successfully from the written to the visual modus.
2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter briefly discusses Tolkien’s engagement with fantasy as well as attempting to define the genre, as represented in the novel and film texts of The Return of the King. Because narratology provides pertinent guidelines for the analysis of the various scenes selected, it is also able to contribute towards a meaningful interpretation of space and place by focussing on their relevance and significance in the two texts. It will also serve as the point of departure in the analysis, with due reference to cognitive narratology. Furthermore, as mention is made of both concrete and abstract space/place and various interpretations of space are identified and discussed the relevance of semiotics cannot be ignored. The chapter concludes with a brief summary of the six novels (three books), while the relevance of the third book is placed in context to justify the comparison with the film text since the focus of the research falls only on the last novel and film. A more in-depth and detailed overview is given of The Return of the King in order to establish which spaces are central to the quest and to indicate the various characters and their experiences of the events in these spaces.

According to (Duriez 10), John Ronald Reuel Tolkien (1892 - 1973), better known as J.R.R. Tolkien, always felt that some kind of mythology was needed for England such as Beowulf for the Anglo-Saxons. He wanted to create this mythology as a contribution towards his beloved country. As a young boy, he lived in South Africa, but immigrated to England where the family moved to a little town in the countryside called Sarehole, near Birmingham (Carpenter 264). This beautiful rural landscape later on became the basis for the region called the Shire, where the Hobbits live in The Lord of the Rings. In 1910, after leaving school, Tolkien went on to study philology at Exeter College, Oxford and then joined the British troops in World War I in France in 1916 (Duriez 6). On his return from the war, he became a professor of Anglo Saxon Studies at Oxford and remained in this scholarly profession for the remainder of his life (Duriez 7). His immense love for
languages, spoken and written, as well as their individual constructions and respective origins, inspired Tolkien to create his own language which he later attributed as the Elves’ languages, Sindarin and Quenya (Duriez 7). His study of literature and languages, of not only Old English, but also Finnish, Old Norse and Old Welsh, gave Tolkien the background he needed to create his own mythology filled with new races, new languages, exciting new landscapes and heroic characters.

The first series of myths and legends that he wrote, titled *The Silmarillion* (1977) a comprehensive history of Middle Earth, which Tolkien described as our own world’s very early history (McFadden 37), were published only after his death. His experiences and travels provided Tolkien with material to construct a fantastic world that illustrated his love of stories and fairy tales and inspired his depiction of landscapes and plots that describe these fantastical worlds filled with magnificent creatures and awe-inspiring landscapes (Duriez 7). *The Hobbit* (1937), which started out as a bedtime story for his children, was his first fantasy novel, published in 1937 by Allen & Unwin (Carpenter 266). After the success of Bilbo Baggins and his adventures in *The Hobbit* (1937), a sequel to the novel was needed that had captured the imagination of so many readers; old and young alike. Tolkien then wrote the “second Hobbit”, which he developed over the next twelve years and which finally went on to become the famed novel, *The Lord of the Rings*, published close to his retirement in 1954-1955 (Carpenter 266).

Tolkien’s Middle Earth is a world similar to the real world as we know it, but which differs in many aspects, making it alien and familiar all at the same time (McFadden 37) as if any reader could walk through any Middle Earth space and recognise the surroundings. According to Tolkien in his paper published in 1947 titled *On Fairy-stories* (139), a secondary world is the fantasy world created by the author as mentioned in Chapter 1.2, who acts as a secondary creator. Tolkien describes fantasy as a sub-creative art. In *On Fairy-stories* (139) he writes that “the story-maker […] a successful ‘sub-creator’[…] makes a Secondary World, which your mind can enter. Inside it, what he relates is ‘true’: it accords with the laws of that world. You therefore believe it, while you are, as it were, inside”. Tolkien first created a secondary world in *The Hobbit* (1937) and perfected the act of creation in *The Lord of the Rings*. As Kocher (17) notes, his creation of a world did not “spring full-blown, but developed out of his experience in writing *The Hobbit* (1937), his first attempt at narrative”.

---

Chapter 2:  
Tolkien and his World: A Theoretical Context
Tolkien is probably one of the most renowned fantasy writers of the twentieth century and as “…Tolkien isn’t exactly an unread, suppressed writer”, it is not uncommon for him to receive much critique and even be ignored completely by other critics. However, “…the readers stood solidly behind him: in commercial terms, he is one of the most successful writers of the century” (Rottensteiner 89). Feist (15) suggests that Tolkien may be regarded as the grandfather of modern fantasy as he caused it to become a popular genre and is featured as the first best-selling international fantasy author. Tolkien strove to create an everlasting mythology for England, as mentioned, and it may be asserted that he succeeded in *The Lord of the Rings* which “is at once modern and immortal; there had never been anything quite like it before or since” (Shippey 150). He also notes that Tolkien created in one lifetime, that which other cultures created over many centuries, when he “created a mythology that is comparable to pantheons of entire cultures such as the Greek mythos, Arthurian mythos, or the Catholic mythos”. Not only did he launch fantasy as a written genre, but his novel, *The Lord of the Rings*, has also been transformed into famed computer games, board games, an animated movie in the 1970s and furthermore became a record-breaking film trilogy (2001-2004) in the twenty-first century, with the same title as the novel. The film, *The Return of the King*, won 11 Oscars (Waxman *Lord of the Rings dominates the Oscars*) in total, one of only three films (the others being *Ben-Hur* and *The Titanic*) in history to achieve this award. The director, Jackson, has subsequently also released *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey* in 2012 and has started filming *The Hobbit: The Desolation of Smaug* to be released at the end of 2013, following the success of *The Lord of the Rings*. *The Hobbit* is also to be released in three parts.

### 2.2 FANTASY AS GENRE

As a genre, fantasy provides a frame of reference for the reader to indicate the relevance of perspective and emphasises the value of context in the interpretation of a novel or other text. The genre holds an appeal for those readers who find the idea of different worlds fascinating, who recognize a familiarity and similarity with the real world and realise the psychological and symbolic impact of the story told in the fantasy genre. This section focuses specifically on fantasy as a genre, discussing the three aspects that characterise it: the world within the fantasy, also known as the sub-created world; the characters and
their actions within this created world as well as the effect that the world and characters have on the recipients\(^6\).

The term “genre” is one of the many terms in literary theory that proves difficult to define. Genre is not only a way of categorising texts any longer, it has also become a means of studying the texts’ “…defining features, their production […], their processing (by individuals and audiences), and their reception (as a social, cultural, ideological and historical phenomenon)” (Kearns 201). For this reason, Hegerfeldt (43) argues that genre, as it is traditionally defined, does not completely suffice in meaning as it lacks in certain areas. One of the more traditional definitions describes genre as the class of literature, classifying literature into certain categories, for example Mystery, Adventure and Romance genres (McHale 199). Genre however will be used in this dissertation as Fowler (1982) and Hegerfeldt (2005) would “redefine” it: as a term used to describe the categories of literature, and not the classes of literature, since genre not only defines the class of literature, but also aids the recipients in analysing the text by providing information as to how it is written, as well as to the cultural, social and ideological background. Genre, as it is used here, is thus the form of a text and “…invariably contain[s] thematic elements” (Hegerfeldt 48). By regarding genre as a type of literature, it becomes a means “…of communication […] a way of conveying information about a text” (Hegerfeldt 43) and not only a means of classification; it is an instrument for interpreting texts. Derrida (in Brooke 370), also notes that a text does not always belong to one genre since “…every text participates in one or several genres, there is no genreless text”; but by texts’ participating in one or more genres, the genre corpus also changes due to historical and political events and reigning ideologies of the time in which the specific text is published.

Like any science, the study of literature and the theory of literature is constantly changing and evolving, leading to the situation where “…every literary work changes the genre it relates to […] consequently, all genres are continuously undergoing metamorphosis” (Fowler 23). In regarding genre in terms of category, one is furthermore able to account for the changes in genre through time, as the genre constantly alters with the introduction of a new text seen as an example of a specific genre. The literary mode of a text refers

---

\(^6\) The term recipients will refer to both the readers and the spectators, as the receivers of the text.
not to the form or content of a text, but to the “...manner of narration”, the representation of fictional worlds “…that cut across genre boundaries” (Hegerfeldt 47). This is evident in both the written and visual texts of *The Return of the King*.

Taavitsaainen (140) suggests that genre may be seen as “…a mental frame in people’s minds which gets realised in text for a certain purpose in a certain cultural contexts”. In *Historicising genre (2): sensation fiction, women's genres and popular narrative forms* Higons and Vincendaue (qtd. in Pykett 74) mention that genre has changed from a structure of themes to comprise “…a processing of narrative point of view, subjective position and desire”. It thus causes the analysis of a text and its genre to take the recipients, and the various points of view given to the latter, into account.

Although fantasy is one of the literary genres, it also involves the psychological dimension, which relates to the theory of Cognitive Narratology. The characters and in fact the whole world is created in the mind of the author as mentioned by Zunshine (161). These characters and the world in which they live also come to life in the mind of the readers or the spectators. Thus fantasy is also “…mental image(s) or imaginary narratives that distort or entirely depart from reality. Primary fantasies arise spontaneously from the unconscious, while secondary fantasies are consciously summoned and pursued” (Farlex par.1). In his citation Farlex saw fantasy as a vehicle for the “…expression of repressed desires”. It is also stated that fantasy is important for children and is crucial in the way they develop. However, it is pointed out that fantasy is useful not only to children but also to adults. It is mentioned that fantasy in adult life helps to develop creative thinking and in the creation of art. Through this argument, it is evident that the mind and the mental images created within the mind also play an important role in experiencing a novel and thus other media too, such as film.

Cognitive Narratology may be briefly described as the “…study of mind-relevant aspects of a story” (Herman “Cognitive Narratology” par.2). It is a study that does not only involve written texts, but which transgresses the borders of different mediums of storytelling such as cinema and radio, as well as other narrative media. This “mind-relevance” may also be studied with regard to the story-producing activities of the storytellers: the process by means of which interpreters make sense of the narrative worlds (or “storyworlds”) evoked...
by narrative representations or artefacts and the cognitive states and disposition of characters in those “storyworlds” (Herman “Cognitive Narratology” par.2). According to Herman (“Cognitive Narratology” par.2) in The Living Handbook of Narratology, cognitive narratology may be used to study and understand texts (or other media) better, insofar as the story functions as both a target of a certain interpretation and a means of making sense of certain experiences, thus comprehending the world and situations better. The study of cognitive narratology is concerned with the aspect or question of which cognitive processes support narrative understanding, which in turn, allows the recipients to construct these mental images of “storyworlds”. In this respect, “Narrative is a mode of representation tailor-made for gauging the felt quality of lived experiences” where spaces may be experienced by the readers or spectators (Fludernik qtd in Herman “Cognitive Narratology” par.6). Ryan (Cognitive Maps 215) comments that “Narrative thus entails a process of cognitive mapping that assigns referents not merely a temporal but a spatio-temporal position in the storyworld”.

Genette (qtd in Hegerfeldt 49) does not recognise “…the fantastic […] as modes, because they are historically contingent and at least to a certain extent depend on a specific thematic content”. Fantasy as employed in this dissertation, therefore, refers to the genre of literary text and other media, since the genre of fantasy is not only the class of literature, but also a means of understanding and interpreting the text within a specific framework of understanding. When considering the word “fantasy” the general idea of children’s tales, of little dwarfs and fairies, princesses and dragons, is the first that comes to mind. Fantasy, though, is so much more than just that; it is not simply restricted to one age group, one gender, one race or one culture. It is a universal genre that speaks to all people’s imaginations, transcends age groups, genders, and is not restricted to any race, culture or even to time itself. Lewis (Bluspels and Flanlanspheres 265) claims: “…for me, reason is the natural organ of truth, but imagination is the organ of meaning”, because through fantasy, which is created by the imagination of the writer, a specific meaning is given to each recipient, as if created for each individual.
Fantasy according to the *Funk and Wagnall's Dictionary* is “…the form of representation that brings before the mind a sequence of images serving to fulfil a need not gratified in the real world” (Marcwardt 458). This is thus the reason why fantasy literature is also described as escapist literature, since it involves a world not our own, but so very similar to ours.

Fantasy is a specific genre concerned with all things that are created in the mind of the writer, which are alien and at the same time familiar to the readers, as they consist not only of those things not physically present in the world we live in, like ogres and dragons, but also elements of our known world such as mountains, kings and certain animals. According to Matthews (1), “…Fantasy enables us to enter worlds of infinite possibilities. The maps and contours of fantasy are circumscribed only by imagination itself”. In order for the reader to relate to the fantastic world created, an “…explicit attempt is made to render plausible the fictional world by reference to known or imagined scientific principles, […] or to a drastic change in the organization of society. Among the notable […] writers of fantasy are C.S. Lewis and J. R. R. Tolkien, whose works incorporate materials from classical, biblical, and medieval sources” (Abrams 279).

The way in which fantasy has been regarded within literature has changed much over the ages and to this day there are still many different definitions and descriptions of what fantasy is. Tolkien’s use of fantasy has received recognition by Mancing (402) as noteworthy in the genre of fantasy novels since it had achieved some “…mainstream critical recognition, as well as a cult following”. Le Guin (61-65) remarks, as mentioned in Chapter 1.2, that fantasy is a genre suitable to the description of a journey. The journey is a very important aspect of the fantasy novel and film; it is through this journey that self-discovery and character growth are achieved and the journey thus also functions as a symbolic act undertaken by the characters in a novel as in *The Lord of the Rings*.

Tolkien himself describes fantasy in his essay *On Fairy-stories* (139) and says that it is “Sub-creative Art in itself and a quality of strangeness and wonder in Expression”. An alternate world would imply certain correspondences with our world, but would also contain elements of mystery or fantasy. Consequently, the most critical characteristic of fantasy fiction would entail that it features a world similar to our own real world, but also a
very different sub-created world. Brooke-Rose (234), mentions that "...all types of fantastic [...] need to be solidly anchored in some kind of fictionally mimed 'reality', not only to be plausible as possible within the implausible, but to emphasise the contrast between the natural and the supernatural elements". In order to make the fantasy world more plausible to the recipients, the creator of such a fantasy world has to intertwine elements of reality that are easily recognisable.

Tolkien creates his fantastic secondary world with imaginary regions set in what he calls Middle Earth. This world is indeed a representation of our own world filled with fantastical elements. Tolkien's creation of a credible world has been admired by his friend and fellow writer, Lewis, as mentioned in Chapter 1.2. Fantasy worlds are worlds that overlap with our own reality world, also overlapping with the fantasy world in the text, or whichever media it is represented and in-between these two spaces, a space or world space is created in the mind of the receivers. This idea of sub-created worlds is also previously mentioned by Todorov when he quotes Castex as mentioned in Chapter 1.2. Manlove (1) who deals with the subject in detail in his work *Modern Fantasy*, gives a more specified and sophisticated definition of the genre when he claims that fantasy is "...a fiction evoking wonder and containing a substantial and irreducible element of the supernatural with which the mortal characters in the story or the readers become at least partly familiar terms". Fantasy is created for entertainment, for giving the readers a fantastical place to escape to, but it also needs to create a feeling of reliability and truthfulness, since the worlds and the characters that are created seem real, but also unreal at the same time. To a certain extent, the characters inhabiting the fantasy world also help create this impression of reality, reliability and truthfulness. A link is created between the recipients and the characters of a text through the recipients' ability to relate to these characters through the human emotions that the character experiences and also through the actions in which the characters partake.

Zunshine (155) notes that cognitive psychology gives recipients "...a new way of approaching fictional narratives". She mentions that the author of a novel constructs elaborate mental worlds for characters that never really exist, because the readers expect a novel to use a description of the characters' behaviour "...to inform us about their feelings"; by interpreting that behaviour, the characters' state of mind may be determined by the readers (Zunshine 4). When reading and interpreting such signs provided in a
novel (or in a film), the recipients not only evoke their own personal history (Zunshine 4), but they also have to participate in the creation of meaning of this text by bringing it to life (Zunshine 161) and filling in the missing information surrounding the thoughts, emotions and behaviour of characters. People possess the ability to keep track of the sources of representations within a novel; she calls this “metarepresentation” (Zunshine 5); by involving the reader’s own state of mind and attributing certain states of minds to certain characters the readers are able to connect to certain characters and situations. The readers recognise their own states of mind in the characters’ states of mind and a connection forms through these similarities. It is through this reading and connecting that the readers are able to pattern, in a new way, their own “emotions and perceptions; it bestows ‘new knowledge or increased understanding’ [...] and it creates new forms of meaning for our everyday existence” (Zunshine 164).

2.3 SPACE IN NARRATIVE

This section focuses on the narratological aspects that support the interpretation of specific spaces in the two texts. There are different types of space within a text: such as the recipients’ impression, the perspective from which the text is created, the context and so forth. All of these spaces and the theory relevant to each aspect are discussed in order to create a framework within which the spaces in the texts, novel and film, may be analysed. In Chapter 3, detailed information as well as the theory for the interpretation of the space in the novel specifically, is given. In Chapter 4, a more detailed theory for the interpretation of space within the film is provided.

The first important theoretical point highlighted is the relevance of frame theory with regard to the interpretation of representation, by the recipients and the researcher in the cognitive narratology. A theoretical frame with information on the approach and understanding which the researcher is following to interpret the spaces that follow in the next few chapters is provided. This framework is then considered the frame of the actual recipients and will be used for the interpretation of the represented spaces below. The term “frames”, when used with regard to the recipients’ response, describes the reproduction of their “…knowledge and expectation about standard events and situations” (Jahn 69). There are two distinct levels of space: concrete and abstract space. The main facts to be considered in concrete space may be related to the recipients (real and
implied); context (place and space); perspective; the author (real and intended); narrated space; aperspectival and perspectival space and objects in space. The second level of space is abstract space that can be perceived via strategies of repetition, accumulation, interaction between spaces or movements across boundaries. These factors create meaning within the space, and the meanings combined with the mentioned factors illustrate a certain theme or themes.

2.3.1 Space

Two kinds of recipients make use of a frame in order to understand a text, the real readers or spectators and the implied readers or spectators. The real readers of a text or real spectators of a film are the physical and actual persons reading the text or viewing the film. These recipients do not always need to possess all the presupposed knowledge and other information to understand a text or film as the author or director intended it to be in order for it to achieve its full effect. The real recipients thus bring in their own frame of reference, personal background and history as well as different ideologies (Schneider 485). The response of the real recipient is thus “…inevitably colo[u]red by his or her accumulated private experiences” (Abrams 300).

On the other hand, implied readers or spectators are the perfect, hypothetical recipients, whom the creator of the text or film had in mind at the time of creating this text. The implied recipients are the ideal presupposed readers and spectators who have the same ideologies and attitudes with regard to culture, social and religious background appropriate to the text or film. The implied readers and spectators are “…expected to respond in specific ways to the ‘response-inviting structure’ of the text” (Abrams 300). Even though the views of the real recipients and the implied recipients might differ, the text and film permit a varied range of possible interpretations and meanings.

As these real recipients move through a narrative they create mental maps of the narrative within their minds in order to understand and process the text or film. These mental maps, which are very detailed, are also called “frames” which enable the recipients to “…track the movement of characters through time and space, and to experience and understand focalised narration” (Gavins 300). The action of reading of a text is situated in
between the narrative text and the narrative understanding of the reader (Jahn 68). The readers and spectators will thus read or view a text and make use of certain codes in order to understand the text. Kearns (66) notes that Barthes specifies five codes which the recipients use to shape their movement through a text. The first discovery the recipients make is to identify the text as a narrative and thus apply the “…proairetic code to organise the text’s actions”. Subsequent to this, the referential code connects the world exposed by the text to the bodies of knowledge the readers and spectators have and accept (Kearns 66). A semic code is used to organise the characters and the details about the characters so that the characters may be understood and they can connect to the recipients and vice versa. A symbolic code is then used to “…connect the text to larger structures of signification” that the recipients might have. Finally, the hermeneutic code allows the recipients to follow the “development of narrative suspense” (Kearns 66). By subconsciously using these five codes, the readers and spectators are able to form a mental map and experience, understand and connect with a text, in whichever medium it is presented. Each reader and spectator thus identifies with specific characters in the novel and film, as they display certain traits with which the readers or spectators can identify, or may even create some emotional link with the character because of a situation the character finds him- or herself in.

For the recipients to create a map, they first have to understand the landscape within the created world, in order to construct a framework. This leads the researcher to an explanation of the concept of representation of space. Spatial representations are not only found in narrative texts, but also in paintings, geographical maps and even on stage. A very important aspect of space in narrative is of course the concept of representation of space within the novel, as well as the film. Buchholz and Jahn (553) note that there are three means of spatial representation, each of which has a unique term that refers to the mode of representation. When representing space on a theatrical stage the term “scenic representation” is used; with regard to pictures as well as in film, the term “depiction” of space is used while in verbal narratives, the term “description” (Buchholz & Jahn 553) applies. It is thus clear that for the novel, a verbal narrative, it is acceptable to use the term “description” since the work is a representation of the fictional fantasy world that the author, Tolkien, in the case of The Return of the King, had in mind when he conceptualised and wrote the novel. The term “representation of space” in film is also suitable as the space within the film is a transposed or transferred representation of the space within the novel to the film.
Place, and specifically the term space, formed an important aspect of this research, as the focus of the dissertation is on the represented landscapes and the different layers of meaning found in these spaces. Bal (178) notes that location or place is an element of fabula and that the term refers to the “topological specification” of where events happen. Place is thus the topological position in which the characters and actors are situated and in which events take place. The concept of place is thus related to the physical, mathematically measurable shape of the spatial dimensions within a narrative (Bal 134). Space on the other hand fleshes out the specific emotional attributes of a specific place (Bal 178); for example, the feeling of anguish within Minas Tirith before Sauron’s armies descend upon them causes Minas Tirith to be a space with a specific look and feel at that time within the text. Space may be denoted from its conceptual position between focalization, “…of which the representation of space constitutes in a way, a specialized case” and that of place, which has already been mentioned as an element of fabula (Bal 134). Place is linked to specific points of view; it is by seeing these places in relation to a certain perspective that place comes to be called space (Bal 136). This point of perception might be that of a character within the space who observes and interacts with elements within the space, such as Pippin’s view of Minas Tirith that provides the recipients with an introduction to the City.

Within the term “space”, there are sub-categories or different types of spaces; these include lived spaces and the places of identity, embodied/disembodied spaces, haunted spaces/places and non-spaces. Another type of space is set design, the construction of space and the representation of space in film, as well as on television and in theatre. Spaces also consist of inner and outer spaces, that are considered frames, the opposition of which accords them meaning (Bal 137). Inner spaces would include houses, such as Bag End and even the throne room of Minas Tirith, whereas the town of Hobbiton and the forests would be considered outer spaces. Bal (137) also mentions that the meanings created by inner and outer spaces are not fixed meanings, but that these frames have a highly symbolic function which is either endorsed, changed or rejected by a narrative.

---

7 Bal mentions that she is opposed to the use of the current terms “point of view” and “perspective”, and rather suggests the use of the term “focalization” (Bal 146). Focalization is the relation between the “vision and that which is ‘seen’ ” (Bal 145).
When creating a text, and later when it is read, there are different spaces that come together to contribute to the understanding and interpretation of a text. For the recipients to have a clear understanding of the text, the author also has to feature within the framework of the readers and spectators. As with the reader, there are two kinds of authors, a real author and an implied one. A real author refers to the real world agent who creates a text. When creating a text or film, the true or real author exists within a specific time and place: the space of the real author. This is the space from which the author creates his text (Brink 110) and it is important with regard to the historical understanding of a text, because the author is the "main link between a text and its historical and pragmatic context" (Jannidis 33). Barthes (qtd. in Jannidis 34) wrote *The Death of the Author* (1977) where he mentions that the “…author concept enables a reader to construct common features across text based on shared systems of values, similar style, and historical or theoretical unity or development”. The readers (or spectators) thus replace the original author and create their own text.

The term implied author was introduced by Booth (qtd. in Nünning 239): according to him, the term “…describes the real author’s ‘second self’”, thereby making this author the source of beliefs and norms. The implied author is the embodiment of each character’s morals and his /her emotional content: whether happy or suffering, he/she holds the true meaning of the text (Nünning 239). Bal (17) notes that this concept of the implied reader, to an extent does not make room for the reader, since the interpretation of a text does not also involve the reader according to this theory, but the interpretation rests with the “…authority of knowing what the author meant to say”. Although critics still do not agree what the true definition of the term “implied reader” designates, here it is used as the reader to whom or by whom the author implied the text to be read, who further contributes to the text.

Apart from the space of the real/implied reader and the space of the real/implied author, the text itself is also a space of narration. Brink (109) notes that the narrative does not have space in itself, but that it consists of many signs of information, complex signals through which the readers are prompted to create a story space in their imagination. The text as space of narration is thus in the first place a language space, as it comprises words that create images within the mind of the author and of the readers (Brink 110). It is the space within the text told by the narrator (Brink 111). Here the real author and the
readers meet: the two spaces, even if divided by time and physical place, collide and in that narrated space the two spaces become one. Eco (qtd. in Schneider 456) notes that a true understanding of a narrative is conceived by “…codes of signification shared by author and reader”.

A specific perspective may represent the narrated space within a text. In earlier narrative texts, according to Buchholz and Jahn (551), space is most often reduced to an element which functions as a backdrop or stage design whose relevant features are largely assumed to be known. This concept of space being merely a backdrop for a story is known as an aperspectival representation of space. An aperspectival space is the manner in which the author describes the space within the text to the readers; this representation “remains indetermined” in so far as the interior of a space, as described by the author in the text, can never be fully sketched, because there will always be missing elements (Buchholz & Jahn 554). Two examples of the above would be Bag End which is described to the readers by the author, as is the glorious haven of Rivendell when the company first arrive in the presence of Lord Elrond.

However a change in meaning occurred in the function of space and the representation of space at the beginning of the “twentieth century […] [when] narratorial description (was) largely replaced by perceptions of space shown from the perspective of an internal focalizer” (Buchholz & Jahn 554). This perspectival representation of space consequently gives a broader image of what the characters themselves see and their experience within a space, which leads to a fuller picture of the space for the readers as it is represented by not only the author (in written words), but also by internal focalisers experiencing the spaces. Pippin for example describes the City of Minas Tirith to the readers, and the way in which he experiences the atmosphere and the physical aspects of the City constitute the readers’ representation of the City. Ryan (“Space” par.2) mentions that “…all narratives imply a world with spatial extension, even when spatial information is withheld”; therefore this is the represented space of a narrative.

Narrative space may be defined as the “…environment in which story-internal characters move about and live” (Buchholz & Jahn 552). These environments include, for example, Hobbiton and Bree, and any space within Middle Earth, within the text, in which characters
reside. Buchholz & Jahn (522) comment that narrative space is characterised by a complex of parameters; by boundaries that separate it from the “…coordinate, superordinate and subordinate spaces”, explaining why there are different spaces and why some of them are more important than others, while others are of equal importance, such as Minas Tirith and the Mount Doom, which is a more important space than, for example, Lothlórien with regard to the plot of the story. Narrative space therefore includes landscapes as well as friendly or inimical conditions where the setting is the base-level of the narrative. The second parameter which characterises it comprises the objects found within the space: these may be geographical objects that form part of the landscape, such as forests and mountains, as well as artificial objects such as the White City and bridges that so to speak, fill the space. The third and fourth parameters are the living conditions which the space provides, as well as the temporal dimension, or time, to which the space is bound (Buchholz & Jahn 552). Each of the spaces within the text has a specific feel or emotion connected to it; for example Rivendell is described as a haven, a place of safety, whereas the tower of Cirith Ungol is filled with fear and despair as Frodo is captured there and held by the Orcs. Each of these spaces also reveals different living conditions; Hobbiton is fertile and the Hobbits love gardening while on the other hand, the Dead Marshes are uninhabited and sterile with no fertile land; thus the two spaces differ drastically in this respect.

Narrative space is therefore the world, the specific region the characters inhabit, as well as the smaller and more personal spaces such as a personal world, town, house or a room. Not only is space in narrative the physical environment of the characters, which includes regions with landmarks such as lakes and mountains, but also the setting of these spaces, the social, economic and cultural milieux, which, as mentioned before, also constitute the third parameter, the living conditions of the space. Ryan (“Space” par.5) comments that space may be broken down into a few categories to better describe and understand the true meaning of spaces in a narrative. She divides space into the following sub-categories: spatial frames, settings, story space, narrative (also called story), and narrative universe. The spatial frames are the actual surroundings of the action occurring at a specific moment. These “Spatial frames are shifting scenes of action, and they may flow into each other” (Ryan “Space” par.5). Either the boundaries of spatial frames may be clear-cut or they can become indistinct or vague, for example, when a character moves slowly through a specific landscape (Ryan “Space” par.6). The setting is described as a rather stable category, as it will normally stay the same throughout the whole text. Setting is the “…general socio-historico-geographical environment in which the action takes
place” (Ryan “Space” par.7). Story space refers to the space relevant to the specific plot; it consists of all the spatial frames as well as the other locations that are mentioned, but are not locations of events taking place. The thoughts and actions of characters describe the story space (Ryan “Space” par.8), with each reader or spectator completing and understanding it by means of his or her own cultural background, world experiences and frame of reference. Thus the reader reads the novel and by signs in it “[...] the narrative world is conceived by the imagination (of the recipients) as a coherent, unified, ontologically full and materially existing geographical entity, even when it is a fictional world that possesses none of these properties” (Ryan “Space” par.9). In a wholly imaginative world, like Middle Earth, the recipients assume that there is a much larger world than only the locations mentioned where the story takes place and that between the spaces mentioned are also spaces with different names, but these are not important to the story of the narrative. The last category denotes the narrative universe and this is the complete world as presented by the text, as well as the counterfactual worlds which are created by the characters through beliefs, wishes and hypothetical thoughts (Ryan “Space” par.10).

As a reader reads a text and interprets the spatial aspects mentioned within the text, he or she creates a perception of the represented space; however, as with any interpretations, innumerable possibilities exist. Most texts and its interpretation still take place within an international community that also might know the text. With the creation of a certain perspective, each reader or spectator brings their own background, ideology and social morals to the text in order to interpret it. This interpretation of a space is an aspect that is more concerned with the second level of abstract space interpretation: as discussed earlier, the concrete space is the first level while the second level is the way that characters experience the space, not only socially, but also psychologically. The space “...in narrative is the environment in which story-internal characters move about and live” (Buchholz & Jahn 552). Bachelard (qtd. in Buchholz & Jahn 551) calls it “lived space”: space by which characters are affected and in turn affect the space in which they move and live (Buchholz & Jahn 553). Crang (22) asserts that people shape landscapes and these shape the people who live in them; they are thus interdependent. The characters also experience the lived space in a bodily manner by reacting to events happening within the space. Bal (136) notes that characters within a text bring their senses to bear on the

---

8 All of the above mentioned information by Ryan is from her contribution to *The Living handbook of Narratology* called “Space” on the web and thus does not contain page numbers, but paragraph numbers.
space in which they live and that “...there are three senses which are especially involved in the presentation of space: sight, hearing and touch”. What the characters hear, see and feel, even what they smell and taste, contributes to the representation of the space, since it also evokes these certain elements in the mind of the readers and a much clearer representation is able to be imagined by the readers. The characters are also able to “feel” the space through the living conditions, the mood and atmosphere present in the space, as well as the changes that take place in that space; even if the physical dimensions of the space remain the same (Buchholz & Jahn 553). These changes may take place through “…association of certain locations with the events that occur in them” (Bridgeman 56); an earlier example in Chapter 1.2 referred to the instance of a war taking place in a peaceful country that changes the meaning of that space.

Interpretation of the represented space in a narrative by the readers occurs after all of the information concerned with the space, the spatial aspects, has been given, whether by means of a direct description by the author or by detail contributed by the characters. The readers are thus required to interpret the content, function and meaning of the given space. Every minute piece of information works together to form a concrete meaning, as well as a symbolic or abstract meaning: for example, a stone may come to have the concrete meaning of being solid while also conveying a more symbolic meaning of trustworthiness and steadfastness. Spaces create a certain atmosphere and meaning in the novel that contribute to the plot of the novel through the broad overview of the space as a whole, as separate individual spaces, but also by the objects that are found in them since “…objects have spatial status” (Bal 138). She notes that the objects within a space contribute to the overall effect of the room by their different shapes, colours and measurements, as well as the way in which they are arranged within the space (Bal 138). Sometimes the objects are presented in great detail and other times the “…space may be presented in a vague and implicit manner” (Bal 138). The readers are capable of establishing the semantic meaning of certain spatial aspects by finding the “…preliminary combination of determination, repetition, accumulation, transformation and relations between various spaces”, where the determination is acquired by the readers’ personal frame of reference (Bal 138-139).
Reading and taking cues from within a text helps the readers form a reconstructed map of the fictional world (Buchholz & Jahn 554) with such a mental map also contributing to the meaning of the space. Lotman (qtd. in Buchholz & Jahn 554) states that spatial “…oppositions such as near /far, high/low, front/back […] are usually correlated with judgmental values such as good/bad, familiar/strange” and so forth. Pfister (qtd. in Buchholz & Jahn 554) calls these spaces semantically charged spaces; some of the spatial opposition may be regarded as “…emotionally laden cultural constructs” (Van Baak, Hess-Luttich et al., qtd. in Buchholz & Jahn 554). The interpretation of a space relies not only on the major geographical detail given, but also on the objects within the space, as already mentioned. These objects receive more attention from the readers, as they prove to be more important, if the spatial information is repeated. Repetition of certain cues attributes greater meaning to that object; this is also the case with spatial aspects that accumulate within a description.

Movement within and across the space is also an important aspect for interpretation. Bal (140) mentions that the “movement of characters can constitute a transition from one space to another” and that very often the two spaces will be each other’s opposites; therefore movement may be mostly circular in form, returning finally to the point of departure. *The Lord of the Rings*, with specific focus on *The Return of the King*, is a text or visual genre, as in the case of the film, that contains contiguous sub-spaces wherein the characters are able to move around freely from one space to another space, constantly crossing boundaries, whether physical or emotional. According to Bal (140) the movement of characters is also a goal in itself, because the character has to develop, change and finally receive knowledge about him- or herself as well as wisdom. In such travel stories the characters move from one space to another, as is the case in *The Return of the King*, and evidently need a whole world to reach their goal. This crossing of spaces and their borders may very often be from a positive space to a negative one and vice versa. Space within a story may function in many different ways: it may be the place of action or remain totally in the background and may be thematised, becoming “an object of presentation itself, for its own sake” (Bal 139). Hobbiton is an excellent example of a journey starting in a space, and also ultimately ending in the same space, completing a circular movement. In order to return to the Shire, the characters have to cross into and through many different spaces, to reach the end of their journey and finally completing their journey where they started it, a full cycle.
Within such a space there is interaction between spatial aspects as such, because of the
way in which the elements are combined and presented (Bal 141). There is also
interaction between the space and other aspects such as time, character and events (Bal
141). When one considers the interaction between a space and an event, it becomes
clear how they are able to interact; and that certain spaces and certain events are
connected so that they might also thus portray that event which happened in the space,
for example a battle or a celebration. Events take place within spaces at a specific time
within the story. Time and space are connected within the narrative and cannot function
without each other: Chronotope as mentioned in Chapter 1.2.

The relation between characters and space may be seen in two ways: the way in which
the character experiences the space as well as the space in which the character is
situated. This space is called the frame, an inner space for example, within a room in a
building and an outer space, which would then be the outside of the building; the way in
which characters experience these spaces contributes to the meaning of the space (Bal
137).

There are two other levels of meaning within a space: the psychological experience of
space, as in the mood and atmosphere of a space, where the symbolic meanings of
certain spaces and objects in these spaces come into play, which is also part of the
second level. The third level involves the ideological aspects. These levels are the spaces
as interpreted by the characters, how they feel about the space, how they experience it
and what significance it has for them. This interpretation however also spills over to the
recipients, as they also link that which the character says or feels about the space with
their own interpretation of the ideological or abstract meaning found within the space. This
is important as the interpretation of space on different levels of meaning differs from
recipient to recipient and the “relevance of space categories is evident in cultural studies,
gender studies and post-colonial studies in which ethnic, racial, gendered and class-
based segmentations and perceptions play a major part (McDowell & Sharp, Higonnet &
Templeton qtd. in Buchholz & Jahn 554). Many different readers from different times,
countries and backgrounds interpret the represented space in terms of the influence of all
of these elements. The recipients might additionally bring into account their own
knowledge of certain aspects, such as an event that happened to them in the past, which
might be similar to that of a character. Moreover, each reader brings his or her own ideologies, norms, beliefs and morals to bear on the interpretation.

After the recipients have processed the information, the theme becomes clear, if not already explicitly mentioned within the text. The readers, spectators and the researcher of this study all read and interpret the texts in different ways. The research and interpretation of both these texts, novel and film, was carried out from the researcher’s point of view. Also taken into account was that the recipients of these texts are part of a worldwide interpretative community and the given texts are interpreted with the goal of identifying within these meanings the values, norms and ethical problems within the text. Even though the ideologies, norms, beliefs and background of the researcher may differ from that of the global interpretative community, the aspects mentioned above were used to undertake an analysis and interpretation of the text, *The Return of the King*. It was the aim of the dissertation to discover and interpret the meaning of spaces within the novel, as well as being concerned with the ethical dimension of the texts. This is merely one possible interpretation; as Altes (145) mentions: the interpretation of represented space is an ethical open question to be answered and interpreted by “many and all”.

### 2.3.2 Semiotics in Novel and Film: a Brief Definition

Semiotics is the study of the “…production, transmission, reception, interpretation, reaction to and the storage of significations and meanings via signs” (Johansen 522). It is a constant, unconscious process of receiving and interpreting signs as well as communication to others via signs. Saussure during the twentieth century analysed and noted that language is a system of signs (Johansen 522). This system of signs consists of the signifier, which is the form of the sign and the signified, which is the concept to which the signifier refers. The signified may be analysed in two ways: denotation and connotation. Chandler (qtd. in Viljoen 18) explains that the denotation is the determination of a sign’s literal meaning, while connotation is the interpretation of a sign’s possible meanings. Peirce analysed this concept even further and decided that signification is not only the relation between signifier and signified, but a three-fold relationship between “sign-vehicle, object and ‘interpretant’” (Johansen 523). The interpretant refers to the interpretation of the signs through “a feeling, an effort or action, a habitual reaction, or another sign” (Peirce qtd. in Johansen 523). Chandler (qtd. in Viljoen 19) states that the interpretant does not refer to the interpreter, but rather to the sense that is made of the
sign; thus the meaning is inferred from the sign. According to Lothe (12) semiotics is suitable for film as well as for written narrative texts, as film is a form of language, but a “...hybrid form in which visual aspects dominate the verbal, and in which the signs become meaningful, not only by virtue of themselves [...] but also through the film context into which they fit”. The semiotics of a text thus relate to the journey as an expansion of symbolic vision, since by the interpretation of signs, the meaning, and also symbolic meanings of a text are unearthed. Semiotics are thus signs that are denoted and interpreted (connotated) within a text to further contribute to the meaning and understanding of the latter.

2.3.3 The Journey as an Expansion of Symbolic Vision

As mentioned, when reading, certain elements within the narrated space become symbolically significant: this is an “...important aspect of the cognitive mapping of narrative texts [...] the attribution of symbolic meaning to the various regions and landmarks of the narrative world” (Ryan “Space” par.22). Symbols are those objects or elements found to have meaning beyond what is at first apparent: the meaning of which, the reader or spectators ultimately determine and feel. A symbol is most commonly a material object that represents something else by association or by convention. Cirlot (xiv) mentions that symbolism adds new “...value to an object or an act”, giving another meaning to it, in such a way that: “...everything is linked by a system of correspondences and assimilations”. A symbol, if it is a traditional symbol, involves the meaning given to an object, this meaning being recognised as timeless, although not always universal. Symbolism is an art form that occurs within the unconscious of the reader/spectators as the “...symbol exists wholly in the mind, and is then projected outwards” (Cirlot xxxi). Symbolism crosses boundaries, not only of one’s mind, but also of society, culture and the universe; it is a corresponding link between all orders of reality and consequently extends the natural to the supernatural. Lotman (qtd. in Ryan “Space” par.22) notes that a narrative is only born when the characters of a text cross the different boundaries between these “...symbolically charged spaces”.

An epic novel builds upon a heroic quest undertaken by more than one person, and might involve a group or fellowship of characters. Each of the characters might be following a main, shared, quest as well as one specific to each of the other characters that form the group. A quest is a journey with the purpose of finding something or gaining something
tangible or something more abstract, such as knowledge. A heroic quest is a quest in which the hero has to go off on an adventure, on an explicit quest, to rescue someone, or bring back something or complete some kind of almost impossible task. Physical journeys are normally fraught with danger, contain unexpected obstacles and many difficulties; however, every problem that the hero overcomes, brings him or her growth of character and of course, in the end, the success of completing the task. As Auden (qtd. in *The Tolkien Society*) informs us, “quest narratives like Tolkien’s use the image of the physical journey as a symbolic description of human experience”. These journeys are not only physical, but are also thought of as psychological journeys, since such an adventure tests not only the physical strength of the hero(ine), but also the strength of his (or her) mind, willpower, morals, values and character.

For a journey to take place within a novel or a film, the space has to be suitable to a journey. This is called a “dynamically functioning space” (Bal 139) which allows the characters to move between spaces. The spaces change to allow the characters to travel and the characters are affected by travelling through these spaces. For example, since they must go on a journey, they will need a path, they might have to travel past various dangers so the author may insert a dark forest in which the hero is required to do battle with the evil characters. Bal (140) states that space is indicated as a space in which or through which a character is moving and that “…a traveller in narrative is in a sense always an allegory of the travel that narrative is”.

Journeys obviously involve many travels, which also allow the storyteller to exhibit many cultures, geographical landscapes and other characters, all of which contribute to the quest. In literature, the quest or journey towards a goal is frequently perceived as a symbol. A journey or quest is in fact the creation of a specific path by characters (Ferber 151). The latter is regarded as symbolic of life itself: “life as a journey, produces a widespread spatial conceptualization of narrative as a journey” (Mikkonen 25), and the decisions that one makes in life, may take one either on a journey of success or of failure. Ferber (151) observes that the journey to any worthy destination is “…steep, thorny, rugged, and narrow”. The journey is a quest undertaken from the known into the unknown; through traversing the latter, it becomes known. It is frequently possible for a character to travel to spaces which are each other’s opposite, from a positive space to a negative space and vice versa, the space is the goal of the move (Bal 140). As the concept of a
journey implies the expansion of experience by traversing unknown landscapes, crossing strange boundaries, visiting new places and meeting different people, the journey tends to assume a symbolic meaning for the fellowship and for the reader. The travellers encounter various situations that challenge their respective strengths and weaknesses with regard to physical endurance and mental fortitude; and furthermore, their interaction with various contexts and communities along the way fosters moral awareness that shapes their respective identities. With the undertaking of a journey, the characters broaden their view on the world, since they enlarge their vision through the experiencing of new landscapes, new environments and through their interaction with objects or characters in these areas. Not only does this broaden their view of the world, but a journey is also symbolic of the characters’ search for their place in their world, as well as their experience of self-discovery.

“J.R.R. Tolkien’s epic trilogy remains the ultimate quest, the ultimate battle between good and evil, the ultimate chronicle of stewardship of the earth. Endlessly imitated, it has never been surpassed” (Eberhart 1). Although The Lord of the Rings is a heroic quest at its most elemental, the normal quest formula is reversed, since Frodo does not need to go on a journey to seek out the One Ring, but he must destroy the Ring which is almost indestructible. “Frodo’s quest is an anti-quest” (Brooke-Rose 235), but it is a quest nonetheless: a journey that starts off swiftly, and accumulates adventure, new landscapes, new characters and novel experiences as he travels. This journey ends differently; he does not gain treasure, but rather returns swiftly to his home, with only peace and wisdom as his reward. This explains some of the morals of the story, that in order to be successful in a quest the hero is not necessarily materially rewarded, but may also be rewarded in innumerable intangible ways. A journey may also be symbolic in that it refers back to the past, completing a circular motion (Bal 140). This may be both the same character going and returning on this same path, or a future character taking the same path/journey as a previous character to which the later character is bound. One of the features that, in some cases, pertains to fantasy is the earlier mentioned circular structure of the plot; the story ends where it starts. Any journey is in the end, at the most basic of levels, symbolic of choice. The first choice for any of the characters is whether they are willing to take the first step and go on this journey; and whether they are willing to risk their lives for the greater good. They are frequently bombarded with choices, not only direct and clear, but also ones that come hidden and veiled.
2.4 FOCUSSING ON SPACE IN THE COMPLETE NOVEL AND FILM TEXTS OF THE LORD OF THE RINGS

The Lord of the Rings\(^9\), which mistakenly might be seen as a trilogy, actually consists of one novel, comprising six books, which was distributed by Allen and Unwin in three parts for financial reasons (Anderson xi). For purposes of this dissertation, as previously mentioned in footnote 4, the complete novel, The Lord of the Rings, will be referred to as the trilogy and each of the three parts of the trilogy as novels. The novels consist of the books Tolkien called the first, the second and the third parts of The Lord of the Rings. Books one and two are jointly referred to as The Fellowship of the Ring and thus the first novel; books three and four jointly form the second novel, as The Two Towers and books five and six together form The Return of the King, the last novel. This inspirational trilogy also led to the creation of three films\(^10\) (2001-2003) directed by Peter Jackson, released with the same titles as the novels. The novels and the films share the same basic plotline, but with exclusions in the film versions and changes in the chronological timeline, discussed in later chapters of this dissertation. For the sake of creating an overview encompassing the story of both the novels and the films, this essential story\(^11\) is given in a chronological order of events as derived from both the novels and the film, starting at The Fellowship of the Ring, continuing to The Two Towers and ending with The Return of the King. However, it is important to note that many of the events occurring are taking place concurrently, but at different locations and affecting different characters. These events cannot be described simultaneously in written form and will follow on each other even though they occur at the same time.

The story begins in the North-Western region of the secondary created world called Middle Earth. In an external retroversion\(^12\) regarding TLR, the Dark Lord Sauron forged a magical ring, the One Ring, in order for him to gain power over the other rings; nine were given to the nine kings of men, three rings were given to the Elven kings and seven rings

\(^9\) The Lord of the Rings, the complete trilogy edition used for citations, will later only be referred to as TLR in the references.

\(^10\) The films that are used are the extended version films, The Fellowship of the Ring, The Two Towers and The Return of the King.

\(^11\) The definitions of plot and story are multiple and many different approaches to these terms exist within narrative theory. For this dissertation however plot will refer to the “more complex” construction of the narrative while story as used in this dissertation is the “basic chronology of events” (Dannenberg 435). Bal (5) mentions that it (story) is the “logically and chronologically related events that are caused or experienced by actors”.

\(^12\) External retroversion is described by Bal (89) as “a retroversion that provides information about the antecedents […] in so far as the past can be relevant for the interpretation of events”. This background information is important to the reader and spectators in order to understand the events taking place in The Lord of the Rings.
given to the seven Dwarf lords. The forging of the Ring is told in *The Silmarillion* (1977). In the war fought, Sauron is defeated by Isildur, the son of the King, who cuts off Sauron’s finger with the Ring and keeps it as an heirloom, instead of destroying it as he was advised to do. The Ring however is treacherous by nature as its deepest being is evil and leads Isildur to his doom, killed by Orcs.13 The Ring is lost in the river Anduin, which divides the land of Gondor from Mordor, where Isildur is slain; more than two thousand years later the ring is accidentally found by a Hobbit14 called Déagol. His cousin Sméagol, on the banks of the river strangles Déagol, in order to claim the Ring for himself, as his birthday present. Sméagol is banished by his community of river folk and seeks refuge in the Misty Mountains where, over hundreds of years, he is slowly corrupted by the Ring and transformed into the vile creature Gollum, hardly recognisable as Sméagol anymore. In *The Hobbit* (1937), the story is recounted of how Bilbo Baggins claims the Ring from Gollum.

*The Fellowship of the Ring*

The first part of *The Lord of the Rings*, called *The Fellowship of the Ring*, starts with the 111th birthday party of Bilbo Baggins (and his nephew, Frodo Baggins’ coming-of-age 33rd birthday) in the tranquil countryside village called the Hobbiton in the Shire (Tolkien TLR 21-40). Gandalf the Grey, a Wizard and friend of the Bagginses, discovers the true nature of the Ring, concealed all these years by Bilbo, and advises Frodo, who inherits the Ring after Bilbo disappears, to take it far away from the Shire, as Sauron, in a new form, is in search of his lost Ring of power (Tolkien TLR 41-63). Frodo prepares to leave, along with Samwise (Sam) Gamgee, Meriadoc (Merry) Brandybuck and Peregrin (Pippin) Took. While within the boundaries of the Shire, they have a close encounter with the

---

13 According to *The Silmarillion* (1977) these are the Quendi, which are Elves “who came into the hands of Melkor […] was broken […] and by slow arts of cruelty were corrupted and enslaved; and thus did Melkor breed the hideous race of the Orcs in envy and mockery of the Elves” (Tolkien *The Silmarillion* 47). They “tended to be short, squat and bow-legged, with long arms, dark faces, squinty eyes and long fangs” (Foster 318). Orcs are weakened by the sun, hate all things beautiful and eat raw flesh, even at times, their own kind. They hate all other living things, even their own master, but fear him too much.

14 A Hobbit is one of the speaking races found in Middle Earth. Hobbits are little people, smaller still than Dwarves. Their feet have leatherlike soles and are clad in thick curly hair; this same brown curly hair is found on their heads. “Their faces were as a rule good-natured rather than beautiful, broad, bright-eyed, red-cheeked, with mouths apt to laughter, and to eating and drinking” (Tolkien TLR 2). They dress in bright colours and seldom wear shoes. Tolkien describes them as “unobtrusive, but very ancient people” (Tolkien TLR 1). They are people who love peace and quiet; they are mostly farmers.

15 Sauron hid his identity many times, as he is a powerful necromancer (also a name by which he is known: Necromancer) he can change his form/appearance. After the Battle of the Last Alliance, Sauron’s power is diminished and he loses his physical form (Foster 359-363).
Ringwraiths\textsuperscript{16}, but they escape through the Old Forest, a place they would normally not enter. They make their way to Bree where they are supposed to meet Gandalf, but he is nowhere to be found (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 64-145).

In Bree, at the Prancing Pony Tavern, they meet Aragorn, a Ranger, who is actually Isildur’s true heir. Aragorn, or Strider as they call him, joins them as guide and protector on their journey to Rivendell. The group escapes the grasp of the Ringwraiths again in Bree, but they are followed to Weathertop, a hill on which the ruins of an ancient watchtower stand, and where Frodo is wounded by the Witch King’s Morgul Blade (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 146-191). The Shirelings (Hobbits) are led to Rivendell, an Elven refuge under the guidance of yet another Ringbearer, Lord Elrond, where Frodo recovers under the care of the Lord of the House (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 192-232). At Rivendell a council is called to decide on the fate of the One Ring. The council consists of people of every race, as Elrond explains that it is the task of not just one race, but all of Middle Earth to decide on the Ring and destroy it. It is explained that the Ring cannot be wielded by anyone except Sauron, because the Ring and the power that it wields will corrupt the wielder. It thus has to be destroyed, which can only be effected by returning it to the place in which it was forged, Mount Doom, the mountain in the heart of the land of the enemy called Mordor. Frodo volunteers to take the Ring and a group, that come to be known as “the Fellowship of the Ring”, is chosen to accompany him on his quest. The three Hobbits, Sam, Merry and Pippin, as well as the Wizard Gandalf, Gimli a Dwarven Lord, Legolas an Elven Prince, Aragorn and another from the race of men, Boromir son of the steward of Gondor (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 233-286) make up the group.

After the company fails to cross the Misty Mountains by way of the pass, they are forced to pass through the mines of Moria, a city that the Dwarven lords delved carved and built within the mountain. As the company struggles, outside of the mines, to find the magical door into the mine that will only open to a specific password, they are attacked by the

\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{16} Ringwraiths, also called Nazgûl, are the ensnared nine Kings of Men. They had “unending life […] and fell under the domination of the One Ring, which was Sauron’s” (Tolkien \textit{The Silmarillion} 346). They entered into the shadow realm and walked in a world between life and death: “they were invisible to normal eyes” and “could emit extremely loud, piercing, frightening cries” (Foster 296). The Nazgûl became the Enemy’s (Sauron’s) most “terrible servants” (Tolkien \textit{The Silmarillion} 346).
Watcher of the Water. Inside the mines they are once again attacked by Orcs who came to inhabit the mines after killing the Dwarves who dwelt there. Here Gandalf also meets an ancient enemy which he fears, a Balrog and falls while fighting it, sacrificing himself to save the rest of the company (Tolkien TLR 287-323).

The rest of the fellowship, escaping while Gandalf distracts the Balrog, recovers in Lothlórien, an Elven Forest situated between the Misty Mountains and the river Anduin, ruled over by Lord Celeborn and Lady Galadriel. After taking a few days to mourn and recuperate they receive special, individually chosen gifts and boats from Lady Galadriel (Tolkien TLR 324-370). The fellowship continues down the river Anduin to Amon Hen. Here Boromir succumbs to the allure of the Ring and attempts to take it from Frodo. Frodo thus flees from the company in order to keep the Ring away from them and protect them; Sam leaves the company as well, refusing to part from Frodo’s side. Together they continue their quest to Mordor alone. Meanwhile, the rest of the fellowship is ambushed by Orcs under the leadership of a white Wizard called Saruman, who is in alliance with the dark lord Sauron (Tolkien TLR 371-398).

The Two Towers

Boromir is killed as he tries to save the Hobbits, Merry and Pippin, who are kidnapped by the Orcs, mistaken for the Hobbit who carried the One Ring. Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas pursue the Orcs through the forests and over hills into the kingdom of Rohan where they learn from the Rohirrim that the group of Orcs has been slain. Merry and Pippin escape the slaughter and make their way into Fangorn Forest, a very old one, closely resembling the Old Forest through which they had escaped near Bree (Tolkien TLR 403-494). In Fangorn, they befriend an Ent called Treebeard, one of the few Treeherders that still roam the ancient forest. While tracking the two Hobbits through the forest Aragorn, Gimli

---

17 The Watcher of the Water is a many-tentacled creature, which guards the west gate of Moria. It was definitely an evil creature, but it is unclear whether or not it was under the control of Sauron (Foster 434).
18 A Balrog is the name given to the spirits of fire, who bear whips of flame and are clothed completely in shadow. The name Balrog in Sindarin means “demon of might” (Foster 33).
19 The Rohirrim are men, inhabitants of Rohan and descendants of Eotheod. They are tall and blond, with fair faces and great strength, even in old age. “They raised the noblest horses and were the best horsemen in all of Middle Earth” (Foster 351). They are also friends of Gondor.
20 Ents are tree herders or shepherds. They are trees “inhabited by spirits summoned by the thought of Yavanna to be the guardians” (Foster 124). Ents look like a “fourteen-foot-tall cross between a tree and a man” (Foster 125), they can walk and talk.
and Legolas stumble upon an old friend, Gandalf, who has been resurrected and reborn as “Gandalf the White” after his heroic battle with the Balrog (Tolkien TLR 450-494). The four comrades ride on over the grass fields to the capital of Rohan, Medusald, where Gandalf rouses Théoden the King of Rohan from a spell inflicted upon him by Saruman. To protect his people Théoden takes them all to the ancient fortress of Rohan, called Helm’s Deep, which is enclosed and protected by the mountain (Tolkien TLR 495-513).

Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas go with Théoden to Helm’s Deep, while Gandalf rides on to gather more soldiers. Helm’s Deep is besieged by Orcs under Saruman’s control, but fortunately Gandalf arrives just in time with the previously banished Rohirrim and together they defeat the Orcs (Tolkien TLR 514-529).

While the battle at Helm’s Deep takes place, the Ents along with Merry and Pippin attack Isengard and trap Saruman in the Tower of Orthanc. Isengard is one of the two towers to which the title of the second novel and film refers. It is a tall black tower, surrounded by a circular wall and is the home of the Wizard Saruman. After surviving the attack at Helm’s Deep, Gandalf, Théoden and the rest of the company arrive at Isengard, where Gandalf strips Saruman of his rank and power. Pippin looks into the Palantir21, which was in Saruman’s possession but claimed by Gandalf after his (Saruman’s) defeat. By looking into the Palantir, Pippin in turn misleads Sauron to think that he is in fact the Ringbearer. Aragorn, Gimli, Legolas and Merry stay in Rohan, while Gandalf takes Pippin to Gondor for his own protection and to warn the Steward that the mighty City of Minas Tirith is in danger (Tolkien TLR 546-586).

Meanwhile, on their journey to Mordor, Sam and Frodo capture the creature Gollum who has been following them for some time; he agrees to guide them through Mordor, as he has been there before. When they come to the gate and find it impassable, they travel by way of a secret pass known to Gollum. For a short time, while travelling with Frodo and

---

21 Crystal globes created by the Noldor, also called the Seven Seeing-stones. The Palantiri “showed scenes far away in time and space, especially things near to another palantir; two Stones thus could be used for communication” (Foster 325).
Sam, the evil side of Gollum’s character is replaced by that of Sméagol\textsuperscript{22} who, to some extent is loyal to Frodo and wants to do good. Unfortunately, as they approach the pass Sméagol’s character is conquered by that of Gollum, who is completely consumed by his enslavement to the Ring. Gollum betrays Frodo and leads him into the lair of the great spider, Shelob, in the dark tunnels of Cirith Ungol. Shelob’s sting incapacitates Frodo as he tries to escape. Sam fortunately comes to his rescue and fights her off, but thinking that Frodo is dead, he takes the Ring and leaves when he hears Orcs approaching. Sam overhears the Orcs talking after they find Frodo’s body, saying that he is in fact not dead and that they are taking him to the tower of Cirith Ungol. Sam is determined to rescue Frodo from the tower, which he does and they continue their journey through Mordor once again, disguised as Orcs. The evil that the Ring inflicts on Frodo starts to weigh heavily on him as they come closer to Mount Doom, but Sam, aids Frodo in his suffering, encouraging him as they make their way into Mordor and even carrying him up to Mount Doom in order to destroy the Ring (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 589-725).

\textit{The Return of the King}

The great battle between good and evil begins as Sauron starts his assault upon Gondor at the City of Minas Tirith. Gandalf and Pippin arrive in Minas Tirith to warn the Steward in charge of governing the City, Denethor, about the impending attack, but Denethor, manipulated by Sauron through another Palantir, which he secretly possesses, loses all hope. As the siege upon Minas Tirith begins the people try to stand fast in hope as they are led by Gandalf who inspires and leads them, since the Steward is unwilling to participate. When his son, Faramir is wounded and Denethor thinks him dead, he, Denethor, gives up hope, setting himself aflame during the siege; fortunately Gandalf and Pippin save Faramir from the same fiery end (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 731-839). Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas travel to Minas Tirith by the Paths of the Dead, a road engulfed on both sides by mountains where no living thing resides. Upon arriving in the City of the Dead, Aragorn commands the army of Undead\textsuperscript{23} to fulfil their oaths to the King of Gondor and fight

\textsuperscript{22} Sméagol is the name of the Hobbit who murdered his cousin for the One Ring and was driven out of the community. Sméagol hid in the Misty Mountains; his long years in the dark and dampness altered his appearance (Foster 171). From the novel and the film it is clear that the creature Sméagol has multiple personalities. He has been alone with the Ring for so long that he has come to divide his better and his more corrupted sides; Sméagol is the last remnant of his original self-whereas Gollum is the completely evil creature always longing for the Ring.

\textsuperscript{23} The Undead Army is also called the Dead Men of Dunharrow. They were men who swore allegiance to Isildur, but when they were called to battle in the Last Alliance, they were corrupted by Sauron and broke their oath. Isildur cursed them, to dwell in and near the White Mountains as spirits, until they are called upon and fulfilled their oath to the heir of Isildur (Foster 85).
alongside him, against the armies of Mordor, at the City of Minas Tirith. The army of Undead help them defeat the Corsairs of Umbar invading from the South of Minas Tirith. The cavalry from Rohan, as well as Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas race to Minas Tirith to ward off the attack from Sauron, in which they are successful (Tolkien *TLR* 840-864).

Strategically, Aragon suggests that the Eye of Sauron be diverted from the true quest of Frodo and Sam and thus leads the remainder of the Gondorian and Rohirrim armies on a siege of the Black Gates at Mordor, where they valiantly fight, heavily outnumbered by the armies of Mordor (Tolkien *TLR* 865-874). While Sauron has his eye fixed on the battle at the gate, Frodo and Sam enter the Crack of Doom where, unable to resist the Ring, Frodo fails and claims the Ring for himself, just as Isildur did before him. Gollum however suddenly appears on the narrow pathway leading to the edge of the chasm filled with fire; attacks and struggles with Frodo to claim his “Precious” back (Tolkien *TLR* 923). Gollum manages to bite off Frodo’s finger adorned with the Ring, but during the struggle on the thin ledge, he falls into the inferno below along with the Ring, thereby destroying it. The Ring’s destruction sees the simultaneous perishing of Sauron; his armies retreat in despair and the Black Tower crumbles. The land of Mordor falls into ruin and the shadow that hung over the region is lifted (Tolkien *TLR* 877-936).

After their triumph at the Black Gates Aragorn is crowned king of Gondor in the White City of Minas Tirith after which the rest of the fellowship separates, each going on their own new journey. The four Hobbits return home to the Shire where Sam marries his long-time love, Rosie Cotton, and becomes the mayor of Hobbiton. Frodo still carries the wound inflicted by the Morgul blade on Weathertop, a wound that will never truly heal. He eventually travels by ship from the Grey Havens, to the Undying Lands along with Bilbo, Gandalf and the last of the Elves (Tolkien *TLR* 937-1008).
2.5 FOCUSSING ON SPECIFIC SPACES IN THE NOVEL AND FILM TEXTS OF THE RETURN OF THE KING

Although a broad overview of the complete trilogy was given, the focus of this study is only on the last part of the novels, *The Return of the King*. Therefore a more detailed synopsis, with the focus on the spaces in which the characters interact, and through which they journey in order to fulfil their quest, is given. From this perspective, the most relevant and important spaces may be identified and will be discussed in detail in Chapter 3 and Chapter 4.

The third and final part of *The Lord of the Rings* opens with Pippin and Gandalf arriving in the City of Minas Tirith on a quest to warn Denethor of the impending threat from Sauron’s army. This is the first time that Pippin sees and enters the great White City of Minas Tirith, it is also the first occasion the City is mentioned by some of the characters as well as being described in more detail. It is the capital of Gondor and the reigning seat of the King of Gondor, but the latter has been occupied by the House of the Steward since Isildur’s heir never came forward to claim his throne. It is thus a city of Kings and has a wonderfully rich atmosphere and presence of history, safety, royalty and power. It is the last standing beacon of hope to the people of Middle Earth; a great White City built against the mountain in seven levels and surrounded by circular walls and gates. Since Minas Tirith is a positive space, directly in contrast with the negative space of Mordor, it is possibly the most important space within the novel. Minas Tirith along with Mordor, are the two spaces in which most of the events within *The Return of the King* take place, being both the major spaces within the novel and film. Denethor is already aware of the fact that his son, Boromir, is deceased when Gandalf arrives to bring him the news. What is unbeknown to Gandalf however is that Denethor also has one of the Palantiri, as Denethor has kept this fact secret; it is through the Palantir that Denethor gains so much knowledge of the enemy and the world around him. Pippin tells him of Boromir’s valour and offers his services to Denethor in payment for his loss, who then proclaims Pippin a Citadel Guard.

Meanwhile, Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas take their leave from King Théoden and the armies of Rohan moving to Minas Tirith, to travel through the Path of the Dead to the Stone of Erech. To reach the Undead Army they have to travel through a narrow gorge
within the White Mountains. There are no living creatures and the whole area is dull, dry and rugged, creating a very ominous and frightful space. Once they reach the City of the Dead located at the Stone of Erech, Aragorn commands a host of ghost warriors to fulfil their former oath to Elendil and fight for him, the true heir of Elendil. Meanwhile Merry and Théoden go on to Dunharrow, where they wait for reinforcements to arrive to join them on their quest to Gondor.

In Minas Tirith, Faramir, the other son of Denethor, arrives to report on his meeting with Frodo. Shortly after his arrival in Minas Tirith, he is sent by his father to lead a group of soldiers on a quest of certain death against the host at Osgiliath. His troops are destroyed and he is wounded. After yet another defeat, a mortally wounded Faramir returns to Minas Tirith. Shortly after his return, the City is besieged under the command of the Lord of the Nazgûl. The lower levels of the City, called circles, are invaded and the first gate is destroyed. The once tranquil and glorious City is suddenly filled with dark creatures, fire, destruction and death. As the gates are destroyed by the vast army, Gandalf is confronted by the Lord of the Nazgûl, but before long the confrontation is disturbed by the sound of the horns of the Rohirrim who have arrived to aid Gondor. They fight bravely on the Fields of Pelennor for the sake of the whole of Middle Earth. King Théoden is cut down by the Lord of the Nazgûl, but Éowyn\textsuperscript{24} (disguised as a man) seizes the moment and kills the Lord of the Nazgûl amidst the destruction of the battle. Denethor, somewhere in the chaos of the siege within the City had lost all hope as “battle is vain” (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 835) and decided to set himself and the wounded Faramir alight. Gandalf, led by Pippin to the House of the Dead on top of the Citadel, saves Faramir from the flames but Denethor perishes. The battle is won with the help of many men, but the destruction wrought by the siege has to be repaired; the wounded need to be aided and the dead buried. Merry is found wandering wounded through the fields amidst the devastation of the battle and is also taken to the House of Healing in the Citadel. It is in the House of Healing that Aragorn reveals through one of his gifts that he is the true King as he displays the power of healing and heals Éowyn, Merry and Faramir. After the battle, the armies are led by Aragorn in a march on the Black Gates of Mordor in order to draw out Sauron’s armies from the dark land and keep the Eye of the enemy occupied to give Frodo, the Ring-bearer, a chance to destroy the One Ring.

\textsuperscript{24} Éowyn is the sister of Éomer, the White Lady of Rohan. She defeats the Lord of the Nazgûl with the help of Merry and finally marries Faramir to become the Lady of Ithilien (Foster 127).
At the same time as the battle of Pelennor Fields, but unbeknown to the companies at Minas Tirith, Sam makes his way to the Tower of Cirith Ungol to save Frodo from the Orcs that captured him in Shelob’s lair. Upon entering the dark Tower of the Moon, he sees that most of the Orcs have already killed each other, squabbling over who is to receive the captured Frodo’s possessions. Sam and Frodo escape from the tower, disguised as Orcs, into the darkness of Mordor. One of the Orcs from the Tower however, also gets away with Frodo’s sword, Mithril shirt and Elven Cloak. Meanwhile, at the Black Gate of Mordor the armies of Gondor and Rohan are met by the Mouth of Sauron\(^{25}\) who tries to convince them that Frodo is indeed dead and that they have no hope left. Gandalf, Aragorn and the rest of the company remain hopeful and refuse to believe the lies that come from the so-called Mouth. Within the darkness of the land and the shadow that covers it, Sauron’s army attacks the company and engages them in battle, just outside of the Black Gate. The company fight bravely and are also joined in their noble cause by the Eagles\(^{26}\) as first noted by Pippin when he cried out “The Eagles are coming! The Eagles are coming” (Tolkien \textit{TLR} 874).

Frodo and Sam also find themselves in a battle; a battle to reach Mount Doom by crossing many harsh, barren plains filled with geysers and sharp, spiky rocks. The Ring is taking its toll on Frodo mentally and physically and Sam finds himself carrying Frodo up the rugged black mountain, where Gollum again attacks them. Frodo leaves Sam to deal with Gollum as he runs up the Mountain to the Crack of Doom, a vast cavern leading to the heart of the mountain filled with flame, the birthplace of the Ring. Mount Doom is in the middle of the open stretch of land called Mordor and is thus the focus of the events within the novel. The climax of the story is reached within this Mountain of fire. Sam fights Gollum off and follows Frodo into the Crack of Doom, arriving just in time to see Frodo put the Ring on his finger to claim it for himself. Because of the power of the Ring, Frodo becomes invisible. Suddenly, Gollum appears on the narrow ledge within the cavern leading to the fire filled pit where the Ring was forged. He attacks and fights with Frodo to reclaim the Ring, the desire of which has consumed his whole life. During the fight, he bites off Frodo’s finger adorned with the Ring and during the struggle Gollum falls into the fire below. Frodo and Sam run from the cavern as the volcanic fire erupts and the mountain collapses. At the

\(^{25}\) The Mouth of Sauron is a black Numénorean. He serves Sauron as a great sorcerer, which is how he could preserve his life for hundreds of years. During the War of the Ring, he is the lieutenant of the Tower of Barad-dûr (Foster 287).

\(^{26}\) The Great Eagles, under the command of Gwaithir in the time of the Great War told in \textit{The Lord of the Rings}, are the “greatest and noblest of birds” (Foster 103). These Eagles can speak in the tongues of Men and Elves and might also be
precise time of the Ring’s demise the Black Tower crumbles to the ground, Sauron is
destroyed and his armies retreat in bewildered despair. The region of Mordor, the seat of
evil within Middle Earth and thus one of the most important spaces in *The Return of the
King*, falls into ruin. The shadow lifts from the land and the evil is swept away with the
convulsing ground as the Gates are destroyed. Shortly after Mount Doom erupts and
Mordor is destroyed, Frodo and Sam are saved from a fiery grave on the burning slopes
of Mount Doom by Gandalf and the Lord of the Great Eagles.

On returning to Minas Tirith, Aragorn is welcomed and crowned as King of Gondor, where
after he marries his long-time love Arwen, the Elven Princess, and takes his seat as King
of Gondor in the White City. After his coronation, a sapling found by Aragorn replaces the
Withered Tree in the middle of the Citadel and the White Tree of Gondor, the emblem of
the City, comes to life again. The Hobbits continue their journey back to their beloved
Shire, a safe haven from the war and a region almost completely forgotten by the enemy:
a green and lovely countryside filled with rolling hills, trees and colourful flowers. The
Shire is the third most significant space within the novel and film with regard to spaces in
which important events and characters feature within the novel. Sam marries Rosie and
becomes the mayor of Hobbiton. Frodo however, never really recovers from the wound
caused by the Morgul Blade of the Ringwraiths. He says that they had set out to save the
Shire and it “has been saved, but not for me” (Tolkien *TLR* 1006). Sam and Frodo take
their last journey together to the Grey Havens, where Frodo, Bilbo and the remaining
Ring-Bearers (Elrond, Galadriel and Gandalf) prepare to leave Middle Earth and sail to the
Undying Lands across the sea, never to return.

immortal. They played “key roles […] during the WR (War of the Ring), freed Gandalf from Orthanc and rescued Frodo
and Sam from the burning slopes of Orodruin” (Foster 103).
2.6 CONCLUSION

It is argued by the researcher that the theoretical framework concerning genre, space and place, as well as semiotic references and a summary of the most salient points on spatial interpretation will provide sufficient background and context from which to analyse the plot and story of *The Return of the King* and justify the selection of spaces/places. In the chapters to follow: Chapter 3 and 4, the theory of narratology, as well as novel and film theory is applied and discussed in more detail with regard to these media and it is anticipated that the final comparison of the two media provides useful information and contributes towards a better appreciation of Tolkien’s work.
CHAPTER 3:
SPACE IN THE NOVEL,
THE RETURN OF THE KING

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Where Chapter 2 was devoted to defining the principles of spatialisation and their relevance to narrative space, Chapter 3 discusses the application of these tenets, concentrating exclusively on the last part of *The Lord of the Rings*. This chapter, firstly, attempts to clarify the theoretical concepts of narrative space in the novel as genre and, secondly, to focus on the analysis of its narrative space. The discussion centres on the theoretical concepts of spatiality in the novel as genre in order to emphasise how narrative space functions in a way that is similar to three identified aspects of space within the human experience: human interaction with the environment, social interaction, the reality of abstract space and abstract space. The concept of a journey, as recounted in fiction such as *The Lord of the Rings*, is especially pertinent to this discussion, because it encapsulates all these different spaces: it illustrates the progression of awareness, consciousness and emotions in the protagonists who learn from their experiences and in the process develop in understanding and character. The narrative spaces are however situated within an alternate world that, like the actual world, is described in terms of boundaries and places, to indicate the characters’ perceptions of their own identity and subsequent experiences of possession and belonging - that is, home as a point of orientation. Nøjgaard (qtd. in Lothe 50) mentions that within a novel “….a journey, which can of course take place in inner space, is the expression of a strong spatialization of the experience of time and is therefore well suited to expressing the complex of problems associated with our realization of ourselves, which is fundamental to narrative texts”. Through the journey that the characters undertake within the novel, they also attribute meaning to their environment and imprint their experience with symbolism.
It is emphasised that “place” is a demarcated space with specific attributes. Bal (134) in Chapter 2.3, notes that place is an element of fabula and the “concept of place is related to the physical, mathematically measurable shape of the spatial dimensions within a narrative”. These different places are represented by the different kingdoms and their respective aspirations to obtain more power, their fierce battles to gain ascendancy over the other kingdoms and the natural boundaries such as rivers and mountains that hinder their progress towards the attainment of power. Space is an aspect of story that is “connected to the characters who ‘live’ it” (Bal 136). Space differs from place in the respect that it not only implies the boundaries that define a place, but also enhances the specific look and feel of the place (Bal 178). Space forces the characters to make use of their senses and as such it is mostly perceived visually from a specific perspective or point of view (Bal 136). Lothe (50) distinguishes between “story space”, as the immediate space in which the action is taking place and in which the characters are interacting, and “discourse space” as the space in which the narrator finds himself. Braningan (qtd. in Lothe 50) “uses the term ‘story world’ synonymously about film”. To illustrate the significance of narrative spaces in *The Return of the King* and underline their value in the interpretation of the novel, three narrative spaces that feature prominently in these last two books have been identified: Minas Tirith in Gondor, Mount Doom in Mordor and finally, the Shire in Hobbiton. These spaces have been chosen according to the specific environment, character interaction, symbolic value and the important role they play with regard to the quest and the success of the mission completed by the Fellowship. The analysis of these three spaces will focus on their significant role in creating the scope for the characters to develop, to associate symbolic meaning with these spaces and indicate how they all contribute towards the interpretation of good that triumphs over evil.
3.2 NARRATIVE SPACE IN THE NOVEL

As the novel attempts to capture human experience, it is essentially a social product, which Bakhtin (qtd. in Williams 213) acknowledges when he explains it as a text that is heteroglossic and dialogical, multiple and interactive. He thus implies interaction between the actual and the imaginative world. According to Bakhtin, as cited above, heteroglossic refers to the state of plurality in a text: the novel “must be a microcosm of heteroglossia’, suggesting that the more the novel incorporates social heteroglossia, the better”. The spaces within the novel are thus microcosms, which present the readers with numerous reactions and points of view to and about the space. The word dialogism or dialogic refers to the dialogue or interaction between characters, within a certain context, as the social and political dimension of the “world” in which the dialogue takes place creates a specific meaning for the speakers’ interaction or speakerly exchange. This term thus refers to the multi layering of meaning, which “…downgrades the individual subject as [the] intentional source of meaning and emphasises the socially located and constructed nature of meaning” (Williams 104). It is thus the use of different viewpoints within a text, whose interaction and even contradiction is important for the readers’ interpretation of meaning in the text.

A narrative may be defined as the written account of certain connected events in specific places, to contribute to the formation of a plot or story. Abbott reserves the term “narrative” as the combination of story and narrative discourse, while “story” refers to the events or sequence of actions taking place within a text, whereas narrative discourse refers to “those events as represented” in the text (Abbott 16). Narrative is thus a combination of discourse and story, but what distinguishes it from other text types is its “ability to evoke stories in the mind” (Ryan “Narrative” 347). A space is required for these events to be represented, for them to occur; thus the representation of the story has to take place within a space specifically suited to the event. Normally such a space will also contribute to the event, by adding different meaning and objects that will enhance the said event.

27 Heteroglossia in terms of narrative stands as “the appearance in real life of that plurality of language of class, gender, region, or ideology which enters the novel in the form of dialogism” (Williams 213).
As mentioned in Chapter 2.4.1 the term used to represent space in a verbal text is description and verbal description; thus the representation of spaces in novels may be “described” (Buchholz & Jahn 553). The description of space in a novel is very distinctive, because, unlike the depictions of a certain space on film, the description of a space in a novel relies on the readers to complete it. Since it is not possible to completely portray detailed space in a novel, it relies on the readers to become, to some extent, an internal focaliser who can follow clues to complete the task of describing a scene in full detail, thus allowing the gradual awareness of plot and character to develop. To fully grasp the space as it is represented in a novel, it is thus necessary for the readers to become fully involved, and they must make use of cognitive mapping\(^\text{28}\) in order to keep track of every little detail as mentioned and derived by the readers themselves. In order for them to create an image of the space, characters and events, they rely on the descriptions given to them in the novel. Bal (139) mentions that the more detailed the presentation of a space, the more concrete the picture of that space will be.

Just as readers will create a map within their own minds to keep track of the spaces as well as the events and characters within these spaces, some texts might also include paratext to help the readers with visual mapping. Paratext is the term given by Genette to any additional textual matter included within a text to make the text more accessible (qtd. in Gorman 419). Paratext might include a variety of matter and Gorman (419) notes that within a novel, these might include prefaces; epigraphs; afterwords and even the jacket of the book. Within the novel, *The Return of the King*, Tolkien included paratextual material, which includes appendices, forewords and epilogues; however, one of his most intriguing components in the paratexts is the geographical maps that he drew himself and included within the text. Habermann and Kuhn (263) note that Tolkien “…always worked closely with maps” and that these maps which are integrated within his work “…produce spatial expanses which appear to be ‘already there’, without gaps, before the story unfolds” which suggests to the readers that there is some material reality to the novel. These maps serve as a visual aid to the readers in further creating an even more precise and detailed mental map of the spaces within Middle Earth.

\(^{28}\) Also known as mental maps or mind maps, cognitive mapping is an individual’s way to keep track of, derive and acquire information about a certain setting and the movements of characters within a discourse. It is a spatial representation of a certain setting that is kept in the mind of the readers (Gavins 300).
This leads to the next definition central to the analysis of space, namely narrative space. At first, narrative space received little attention, because its basic function was perceived as supplying a general background setting within a text (Buchholz & Jahn 551). However, Bakhtin (qtd. in Buchholz & Jahn 551) argues that it is almost impossible to separate time and space, and that time thus supplies the “fourth dimension of space”. Bachelard’s (qtd. in Buchholz & Jahn 551) idea of “lived space” provides a liberating concept where space may be addressed within the framework of literature. Consequently, space became a significant aspect of narration. In this chapter, narrative space is regarded as the environment in which characters move about within a novel. Ronen mentions that the base-level spatial frame is the setting: a room for example, can be seen as the base-level setting which is part of the framing spaces – a room in a house, a house in a town, a town in a country, a country in a world. It is possible to have close/near and distant spaces, open and closed spaces, foreground and background spaces, actual and imaginary spaces as well as static and dynamic spaces (Ronen qtd. in Ryan par. “Space” 8). This relates to the ideas of boundaries previously mentioned (in Chapter 1.2, 2.11 and 2.2.3).

Within a novel, the story takes place within the space of a story world, such as Middle Earth as created by Tolkien. A story world is defined as the “...discourse model used for understanding organised discourse in particular.” (Herman “Storyworld” 570). Story worlds are thus the mental notes on what was done, where, to whom, at what time. In terms of cognitive narratology, it may better be suited to the “ecology of narrative interpretation” (Herman “Storyworld” 570), since the reader is trying to make meaning of and fully understand the narrative. The reader then also tries to reconstruct the environment, the attributes of the characters and the actions and events in which the characters are involved and are then to some extent transported into this story world. Bal (139) also mentions that a space can frequently be “...thematized: it becomes an object of presentation itself [...] the fact that ‘this is happening here’ is just as important as ‘the way it is here’ “. To summarise, story worlds are the mental and emotional environments in which the readers may experience the imaginative and cognitive interpretation of a novel.

There are three types of spatial organisation within narrative texts where characters move freely about from one to another space (contiguous subspaces), texts that allow communication only in exceptional circumstances (discontinuous, ontologically distinct spaces) and texts that do not allow any communication, only communication through
metalepsis\(^{29}\) (ontologically distinct spaces) (Buchholz & Jahn 552). *The Return of the King* consists of contiguous subspaces, as the characters move from one space to another constantly. This movement may be seen in the journey the characters undertake. “Lived space” is a deictically orientated space as it is understood in everyday life, implying that there is always a subject who is affected by the space, a subject who reacts to space in a certain manner and who experiences or “…feels space through existential living conditions, mood, and atmosphere” (Buchholz & Jahn 553). It is through these “lived spaces” that spaces within the written texts acquire the same richness as they have in real life; by interpreting such spaces the readers are able to create an image of the space within the novel and experience this space.

These narrative spaces found within a text are not only landscapes and landmarks situated within landscapes, but also the objects encountered within spaces such as houses and regions, as well as adverse conditions, such as climate, economic and social environments. Bachelard’s *The Poetics of Space* (1957) is not only a study on how literature represents space, but also on how spatial imagery and the connectedness of the readers to the environment and the “presence of things” function and interact with each other (Ryan “Space” par.25). The characters within a space also contribute to it because “…man [sic] at once affects the space around him while simultaneously being affected by that space” (Zlogar 24); therefore, not only does the character contribute to the space, but the space also contributes to the character’s identity formation within that specific space.

These narrative spaces as described are not only physical, concrete spaces, but also consist of two other levels of meaning. The psychological space is the second such level. Within this space the character experiences events and emotions as the situation tends to create certain feelings in the character, which might also evoke similar feelings and experiences in the readers. The third level of space is the abstract, symbolic or ideological space. However, all three of these levels might contain symbolic meaning. A symbol may be regarded as an extended metaphor, as Eco (162) states: a symbol may be understood as “…textual modality, a way of producing and of interpreting the aspects of a text”. By repeating a specific word or gesture at important points within the text, certain symbolic meanings or qualities are attributed to this gesture or word (Lothe 64). These symbolic

---

\(^{29}\) Metalepsis occurs when the natural levels of hierarchical structure of a narrative are paradoxically transgressed (Pier
meanings then contribute to the meaning of the space, which enables the readers to contribute more meaning, not only to the space, but additionally to the characters within it and the events that take place within it. Stephens mentions, in his conference presentation: *Routes, Movements and Situatedness: Narrative Space and Cognitive Mapping* that “...represented space is designed to be interpreted”. A novel, which is written with the intention of giving meaning to space, will embed within it certain clues to guide the readers as to the mapping of the space. Through this they will gather the best possible meaning from the novel.

3.3 ANALYSIS OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE NOVEL, *THE RETURN OF THE KING*

As mentioned in 3.2 above, Tolkien incorporates maps within his novel to enhance the reading experience and understanding of his story world, Middle Earth. These maps are regarded as a paratext to the novel and in order to incorporate these exquisite maps and to help the readers create a more detailed image of the spaces, this dissertation will include a few of them where applicable. Map (1) is included at the end of the novel *The Lord of the Rings*, making it easily accessible to the readers of *The Return of the King*. This map, featuring the western part of Middle Earth, includes all of the spaces mentioned within the trilogy. It is thus also a comprehensive summary of all the spaces within the novel, creating a complete, detailed image of the country. This map is being included at the beginning of the analysis of the three spaces, Minas Tirith, Mordor and Hobbiton to present the readers of the dissertation with a complete view of the spaces under discussion. The other maps are included to provide a view of the specific spaces for the abovementioned readers in anticipation of these artworks leading to a better understanding of the descriptions that follow.

The three spaces chosen in *The Return of the King* were selected according to the importance of the space in the overall quest undertaken by the Fellowship and the symbolic value that they contribute to the journey. As might have been intended and created by the author, these spaces are all imbued with meanings. The spaces are thus chosen because of the meaning they already inherently possess within the novel which

“Metalepsis” 303).
contributes to the characters’ development and influences the choices that they make throughout the journey. This dissertation intends to make these meanings clear by explaining the way the meanings are created within the spaces\textsuperscript{30}. The first space identified is Minas Tirith in Gondor; the second is Mount Doom in Mordor and the last is Hobbiton in the Shire. These three spaces all play an essential part in the journey the Fellowship undertakes. For the Hobbits, the Shire, and specifically Hobbiton for Frodo and Sam, is the starting point of their travels as well as the end destination of their quest. Mount Doom is also, to some extent, the starting point of all the troubles brought upon Middle Earth as the One Ring was created there and moreover, as it is the only place where it may be destroyed, it therefore becomes the final destination with regard to the finalising of the quest to destroy the One Ring. Minas Tirith is the third space, the safe haven and the capital City of Gondor from where Aragorn will rule the free people of Middle Earth. It is the beacon of hope for the people of Middle Earth. Map (1) depicts all three of these spaces.

\textsuperscript{30}Since the readers of The Return of the King would most probably also have read the preceding The Fellowship of the Ring and The Two Towers, it is presumed that the readers will also possess foreknowledge of these novels when reading the last novel. It is further assumed that the researcher possesses this foreknowledge which will play a part in the analysis of the three pre-selected spaces in The Return of the King. Throughout the analysis of the representation of the spaces, the experiences and expectations of the implied readers as literary-theoretical abstracts within the text are taken into account.
Map 1: The West of Middle Earth (Tolkien TLR 1141)
3.3.1  Gondor: Minas Tirith

Minas Tirith is clearly visible in the centre of this map originally drawn by Tolkien to illustrate his novel. Orodruin (Mount Doom) is visible to the far right, and in the east of the map in Mordor may be seen (See Map 2). The City of Minas Tirith is situated in the region of Gondor, in the south-western part of Middle Earth, according to Map (2). The City is located in the corner where the great river Anduin and the “dark mass of Mount Midolluin” meet and “upon its outthrust knee was the Guarded City” (Tolkien TLR 734). Across the river from Minas Tirith the city of Osgiliath may be seen, which, to an extent, is the gateway into Mordor through the mountain range of Ephel Dúath. The exact locations of these spaces are all plainly distinguishable on the map of Gondor and Mordor (Map 2) which is included as part of the paratext at the end of the novel. The name Minas Tirith means Tower of Guard in Sindarin31 (Foster 277). It should be noted that the original City of Minas Tirith was destroyed by Luthien after it was taken over by Sauron and a second city was built (Foster 277).

Minas Tirith was the name given to Minas Anor32 after the fall of Minas Ithil33 (Foster 277). Minas Tirith, the capital of Gondor is a symbol of hope during the War of the Ring34. Gandalf comforts Pippin by telling him that he need not be afraid, for he (Pippin), unlike Frodo, is not going to Mordor, “...but to Minas Tirith, and there you will be as safe as you can be anywhere in these days.” (Tolkien TLR 732). The City had a surrounding wall called Rammas Echer, which ran “for ten leagues or more [...] from the mountains' feet and so back again, enclosing in its fence the fields of the Pelennor” (Tolkien TLR 734). The Fields of Pelennor comprise a fertile town land and terrace sloping down to the great river Anduin. The people living within the Pelennor fields are few in numbers since most of the people live within the seven circles of the City (Tolkien TLR 734).

---

31 Sindarin is the language developed and spoken by the Sindar Elves. It is a beautiful and fluent language (Foster 376).
32 Minas Anor: the fortress city of Anarion. Minas Anor is translated as “the Tower of the Sun in Sindarin” (Foster 276).
33 Minas Ithil (The Tower of the Moon), is the fortress city of Isildur. After the city fell, it was known as Minas Morgul until reclaiming its name of Minas Ithil after the War of the Ring (Foster 276).
34 The War of the Ring was the war fought against Sauron by all the free people of Middle Earth during the end of the Third age (Foster 431).
Minas Tirith is significant within the plot of *The Return of the King*; not only is it depicted as the beacon of hope mentioned earlier, but because of character development in Pippin, Aragorn and Faramir and its symbolic meaning. Minas Tirith is sometimes referred to as “the City”. A city corresponds to landscape-symbolism, where it forms one of the representational aspects, and is an important symbol of rank, level and space. Cities are built strictly according to the doctrine their society upholds, thus becoming a symbol of this doctrine and the people that share it (Cirlot 49). The traditional symbol of cities as used by Cirlot is associated with cities from many years before. Jung also sees the city as a maternal symbol (qtd. in Cirlot 49), a mother who protects her (inhabitants). While Minas Tirith is not specifically portrayed as a maternal figure, nonetheless, the City is personified by power and strength, both physically and emotionally, with the wish to protect those that dwell within him/her.

The earliest detailed description given to the reader of the City is from Pippin’s point of view on first entering Minas Tirith, filling the readers with awe, similar to that which Pippin experiences. From the start of his description the vast height and size of the City is emphasised. It is important though to note that Pippin sees the City from his diminutive stature and not from a normal-sized, adult human perspective. The grandeur of the City also increases his admiration of the space. Before the creatures invade Minas Tirith, Pippin and Gandalf enter and describe the City. They stay in a “…fair room, light and airy” and walk down “…a cool stair” (Tolkien *TLR* 742). All of the words used to illustrate the spaces that Pippin sees, their room as well as the outside of the City, describe the light and spaces that inspire a sensation of calmness. Gandalf tells Pippin that the people of the City are “…kindly to beasts, for that they are good and wise folk” (Tolkien *TLR* 742-746). In this manner, not only do the exterior and interior of the City, as portrayed by Pippin, represent a city of power, light and goodness, but also the people (thus the social space of Minas Tirith), indicate that it is a space of kindness.

Through this description, it is clear that the construction of the City is on several levels, rising from the base formed by the Pelennor fields to end at the Tower. This description might create the image of not only a normal city, but rather the image of a castle or fort. A castle once again enforces the idea of royalty as the City is also known as the City of Kings (Tolkien *TLR* 951), its majesty represented by the towers, the banners that sway in the wind upon the Citadel and the large stone arches, gateways and columns which line the streets as well as the High Court. The majesty of the City as a castle is also suggested
by the fact that it is the place to where Aragorn will return to rule as king (Tolkien TLR 737). From the first descriptive sentence, the readers are confronted by the power and importance of the City and the strength which is present in its very name. Cirlot (38) mentions that a castle, in the broadest sense of the meaning, symbolises an “...embattled, spiritual power, ever on the watch”. A city is constructed, according to Cirlot (49), with the intent of making clear its inherent ideological tenets, thus none of the structures within the city are without meaning.

The City is “…built on seven levels” (Tolkien TLR 735) on the Hill of Guard35. Great white walls surround each level of the City and the walls all have gates which are built in order that each gate faces a different direction from the gate beneath it: “…so that the paved way that climbed towards the Citadel turned first this way and then that across the face of the hill” (Tolkien TLR 735). The first level gate is known as the Great Gate and faced eastward; from there the paved way goes criss-cross from one gate to another. The narrator describes the “…seven walls of stone” as “…so strong and old that it seemed to have been not builded but carven by giants out of the bones of the earth.” (Tolkien TLR 734). From the rear of the Great Gate a bastion of stone protruded, partly natural and partly manmade, with its edge as sharp as “…a ship-keel” facing east and dividing “…in two all the circles of the City save the first” (Tolkien TLR 735). This cliff is almost 700 feet from bottom to the top where it forms part of the wall of the seventh level, known as the Citadel.

The Citadel is also called the High City and contains the High Court, the Place of the Fountain36 both of which lie at “…the feet of the White Tower” (Tolkien TLR 735). The White Tower is found in the Citadel of Minas Tirith, built on top of the Tower Hills: “…fifty fathoms from its base to the pinnacle” (Tolkien TLR 735). When Pippin first gazed upon this tower he exclaimed that the Tower “shone out against the sky, glimmering like a spike of pearl and silver, tall and fair and shapely, and its pinnacle glittering as if it were wrought of crystals; and white banners broke and fluttered” (Tolkien TLR 735). All of these structures, their colour and the way in which Pippin experiences and explains them emphasise the majesty, size and nature of the space of Minas Tirith.

35 The Hill of Guard is the “easternmost spur of Mindolluin, upon which Minad Tirith was built” (Foster 203).
36 The Place of the Fountain is also called the Court of the Fountain. This is a “plaza in the Citadel of Minas Tirith containing a fountain in the middle of which stood the White Tree or the Withered Tree.” (Foster 75).
Map 2: Map of Gondor and Mordor (Tolkien TLR 1145)
The fact that there are seven rings or levels to the City, each with a wall and a gate, is significant because seven is symbolic of perfect order, as well as a “...complete period or cycle” (Cirlot 234). As noted, this City is the last remnant of hope, light and protection during the War of the Ring, which may be inferred from Gandalf’s belief that they will be as safe as they can be in Minas Tirith (Tolkien TLR 732). It was built by the ancients in perfect order and with the function of protection and security. By attaining this meaning of a completed cycle, it also foreshadows the return of the king, Aragorn, since this is where his ancestors dwelled and is the seat from where the king rules (Tolkien TLR 931). When the cycle finally comes full circle and the King has returned, it suddenly becomes even more real that Aragorn is no longer the Ranger the Hobbits met in The Fellowship of the Ring, but a true, noble and righteous king, King Elessar. So not only does the circular form of the levels of the City symbolise the return of the king, but also a cycle of growth for Aragorn, from ranger to king.

The City is built in seven circles: according to Cirlot (16), in architecture, all circular forms “...relate to the sky or heaven”. The mention of the sky and heaven also brings to mind the structure of the City, as it is a city rising in levels until it reaches the high peak of the Tower, reaching towards the heavens. A circle is a closed ring symbolising continuity, wholeness and completeness (Cirlot 16). The circles of the City are thus not only symbolic of wholeness and continuity, but of a journey, that has come full circle too. The fact that the City has seven levels, each ascending to the next also symbolises to the readers that the higher the level, the higher the value by virtue of the space and thus also of the characters that dwell there. In the case of Minas Tirith, the chief inhabitant is the King. Another symbol of ascension is that of the inner, spiritual impulse to rise higher and become more and better in virtue.

In another sense, the number seven, a number of spiritual significance, is also symbolic of pain (Cirlot 233). The glorious City built to be a symbol of hope and a sign of majesty has slowly fallen into ruin (Tolkien TLR 736). Thus the seven levels which are physically falling into decay also show the pain in which the City finds itself. The pain and suffering of the City is further mirrored by the tree in the courtyard, which has endured so much pain in the form of evil and the shadow of Sauron stretching out over the land, that it has come to wither and die. Pippin thought on first seeing the withered tree that “…it looked mournful” (Tolkien TLR 736) and indeed it is. The City has not had a true king for many years and its governance was carried out by the Stewards of Gondor. The current Steward, Lord...
Denethor, has been influenced by the shadow of Sauron and like the City, has fallen into decay and despair. Gandalf declares that Denethor has become mad and has lost hope, making decisions based on madness and evil (Tolkien TLR 834-836). Unknown to any, Denethor had found one of the lost Palantiri and by looking into it finds much knowledge, but at a terrible price. Gandalf states that he finally knows how the enemy entered the City: that Sauron influences Denethor through the Palantir and using it the former breaks Denethor’s will and hope, so that he becomes a man suffering anguish and pain (Tolkien TLR 838). Thus Denethor’s rule of the City does not create prosperity, stimulate growth and build hope. The people of the City have also become poor, remain in pain and without hope. It was once a bustling city with a large population, but during the time of the War of the Ring, the people dwindled and the City started to fall into decay, year by year (Tolkien TLR 748-749). It is also the City’s pain to bear “…the chief hatred of the Dark Lord”, a hatred that has forever been between Minas Tirith and Sauron. The City lies constantly within the shadow, for Mordor is near to Minas Tirith and the two regions can feel each other’s presence constantly (Tolkien TLR 749).

Another aspect of pain that the City may symbolise is the pain within Aragorn, because Aragorn is entwined forever with the City. While the rightful king of Gondor, Aragorn, has waited a very long time to take the throne, he lives with the pain of being the heir of Isildur. Isildur is a hero, but at the same time brings shame, not only to Aragorn, but also to Minas Tirith. He was the King of Gondor who destroyed the Dark Lord in the battle of the Final Alliance, but who could not destroy the One Ring and thus brought shame upon his descendants and upon the City (Tolkien TLR 51). Aragorn considers that he may not be fit to be king, as the blood of Isildur runs through his veins and he too might succumb to the power of Sauron and his Ring. He wrestles with the thought of not being a worthy king, of failing the test set before him and “…the doom that was laid on him” (Tolkien TLR 1035). He battles with this, travels many paths and does not return to Gondor until he feels himself worthy and fit to be a strong and wise king. Aragorn in his wisdom saves Middle Earth, just as much as Frodo does. Aragorn is also called Estel by some of the characters in the text, meaning “Hope” (Tolkien TLR 1032), and is also known as “Envinyatar, the Renewer” (Tolkien TLR 845), a fitting name for the long lost King who finally returns and restores hope in the hearts of all his people and renews the glory of Gondor and Arnor. In

---

37 The singular term enemy refers to Sauron himself; the plural (enemies) refers to his armies as well.
this way his pain is dispelled, just as the City is freed of the pain and suffering caused by Sauron and his forces.

The White Tower in the Citadel also functions as the royal court; its main room is known as the Tower Hall. This Tower is also known as the Tower of Ecthelion (Foster 440). In the Place of the Fountain, a sapling of the great White Tree of Gondor was planted many years before the War of the Ring, but it dies and no sapling could be found to be replanted; thus the Withered Tree is left standing in the courtyard of the Citadel. Pippin describes the scene as he first lays his eyes on the Tree, saying that within the sweet playing fountain stood a dead tree from which the “falling drops dripped sadly from its barren and broken back” (Tolkien TLR 736). Thankfully, Aragorn finds a last sapling on the slopes of Mindolluin and replants it in the place of Withered Tree after the War of the Ring (Tolkien TLR 950). The old and withered is replaced by newness and growth. This tree symbolises not only the rebirth of Aragorn and of the City of Minas Tirith, but also of the new Gondor and Middle Earth. This White Tree of Gondor had dark leaves that were silver underneath and grew clusters of white petalled flowers. The tree was also the symbol of Gondor, alternatively known as the Tree of the Eldar. On the uniforms worn by the Citadel Guard “…a white tree blossoming like snow beneath a silver crown and many pointed stars” (Tolkien TLR 736) is embroidered.

On the highest level of the City named the Citadel, as mentioned before, three very distinctive and important landmarks or objects are found: the Place of the Fountain, the White Tower and the Tree of Gondor (Tolkien TLR 736). The fountain is symbolic of a source, the centre of action (Cirlot 113), while Jung, according to Cirlot (113), was also convinced that a fountain represents an image of the soul as the source of the inner spirit and spiritual energy. This fountain might therefore also symbolise the inner spirit of the castle, which, as mentioned, signifies a “spiritual power” (Cirlot 38). This fountain is situated on top of the highest circle of the City, in its heart, because this is the governing place of the City. It is thus a symbolic reference to the innermost heart and also the governance of the City, the source as it were. Jungian theory as interpreted by Cirlot (113) also mentions that a fountain placed in the centre of a garden “signifies strength in adversity”, which the City has also come to be in the War of the Ring. It is, therefore, very striking that the Tree of Gondor is planted in this fountain, but it is withered, an unnatural sight: a dead tree in water.
A tree in the most general sense signifies the life of the Cosmos, inexhaustible life; therefore a “symbol of immortality” (Cirlot 347). Trees are also thought of as a link between the three worlds: the under-world or hell, the middle-world or the earth and the upper-world or heaven; these three worlds are also found within the structure of the tree itself, the roots, the trunk and the foliage. Of importance in the case of the Tree of Gondor, as noted before, is that the tree is withered. After Aragorn’s coronation Gandalf leads him to a place where he finds a sapling and he “replants” the Tree of Gondor, renewing it (Tolkien TLR 950). It is significant that the Tree of Gondor is a sapling from the original two trees of the Valar, as Aragorn notes that it “…is a scion of the Eldest of trees” (Tolkien TLR 950), the Trees of Silver and Gold as mentioned in *The Silmarillion* (1977). These two trees might also be references to the two trees as found in Biblical texts, the Tree of Knowledge of good and evil and the Tree of Life (Cirlot 348). When iconography is brought into the equation, the Tree of Life (lunar side) is always depicted in full bloom and the Tree of Knowledge or death (solar side) is “dry and shows signs of fire” (Cirlot 349). It is virtually impossible not to see the link between the two trees mentioned and that of the Tree of Gondor. The Tree is withered and dry, similar to that of the Tree of Knowledge, of death. After Sauron has finally been destroyed and Aragorn returns to Gondor claiming the throne, he plants a new Tree, which grows, blossoms and is thus similar to the Tree of Life. Only after the knowledge of good and evil has been gained and the evil (Sauron) destroyed could the Tree of Life, of immortality, be planted and grow fruitfully as did the City of Minas Tirith under the rule of the new king. The image of the withered Tree is thus also a paradox, since it has not completely lost all of its meaning. It might seem lifeless and withered, but in fact still has the same basic meaning and intense power of revival, which is only fully portrayed at the end of the novel when the Tree starts to bloom.

The White Tower of Gondor is also found within the Citadel. A tower is generally symbolic of rising above something, whether a social structure, economic structures, mental impasse or individual goals set by a character (Cirlot 345). The implicit meaning found in the image of a tower is that of ascension and transformation as well as creating a link between heaven and earth; a tower, in the same way as a tree, is one of the only structures “distinguished by verticality” (Cirlot 345) with this analogy forming a link between a man and a tower, as both are single upright forms looking out onto the world. Generally, a king is thought of as “…expressing the ruling and governing principle, supreme consciousness and the virtues of sound judgement and self-control” (Cirlot 167). In this way, Aragorn may be regarded as the link between the people of Middle Earth and their values or moral system (since there is no religious system or belief explicitly
mentioned in *The Return of the King*, this researcher only alludes to it as a general system of values and morals). Aragorn is metaphorically seen as the “tower” of righteousness that is supposed to inspire men to be inherently good and strive to be so through his example, but before he can be the king as intended, he has to transform himself, overcome his fear and rise above that which hampered him for so long, as indicated earlier. As previously mentioned, an additional meaning of the name, Minas Tirith, is that of “Tower of Guard”. The implication of this name may be taken to indicate that this city may also guard and protect people, not only from threatening attempts from physical enemies, but also from the spiritual enemies: greed, lust, envy and pride, to mention a few. During the rule of the Steward, who has become “infected” by Sauron (Tolkien *TLR* 838), the degeneration of Minas Tirith has begun; the Great Tree of Gondor has withered and the rule of the Kingdom is no longer a righteous and fair rule. The City falling into disorder and slow decay is also symbolic, as it (the City) yearns for its true leader to return and transform it to its former beauty and glory.

The City is depicted as white (Tolkien *TLR* 734) which is generally regarded as a symbolic colour of joy, solace, sincerity, faithfulness and innocence (Ferber 234) as well as symbolising light, which contrasts with darkness (black). These attributes are all part of the description of Minas Tirith; only after the war has been won, however, does the white truly stand for joy and solace. The symbolic meaning of white has good and bad connotations that create a binary opposition, enhancing this meaning. In contrast to the positive qualities attributed to the colour, white symbolises death (Cirlot 58) too and this decay is mirrored in the whiteness of the City. Minas Tirith is the city of old, it was once the city where the Dunedain dwelled and it became a fortress of good.

The City is portrayed as shining white in the sunlight, creating an indirect, but strong contrast with the Black Gates of Mordor, situated on the opposite side of the river (the above map refers). Once again, this contrast reminds the readers of the conflict of good versus evil, white against black, positive against negative. This constant battle between good and evil is not only evident in the physical battle between the Fellowship and the armies of Sauron, but it further suggests that according to the functioning of binaries in symbolism, the one cannot be fully understood without the other, complementing each other in their oppositeness. A notable example of this is that of Sauron, once one of the Valar, the chosen, and inherently good people, but who succumbed to greed and, giving in to his darker desires, he was transformed into that which he had embraced. “The
function of white is derived from the sun” (Cirlot 58); white is thus a positive principle, representative of timelessness and purity (Cirlot 59), “…joy, solace and gladness” (Ferber 234). According to Guenon, white is also “…representative of the spiritual centre” (Cirlot 58), and the same may be said for Minas Tirith, as it is the “spiritual centre” of Middle Earth and of Gondor where the king resides, the true embodiment of law and righteousness and from where the kingdom’s values and morals are observed.

Minas Tirith was so impenetrable that no enemies had ever entered its gate, except during the War of the Ring, as it is recalled in The Lord of the Rings. The narrator describes the siege of Gondor through the eyes of characters such as Pippin and Gandalf. Gandalf lit candles because the air was “…heavy as with approaching thunder” (Tolkien TLR 788), which already foreshadows to the readers that something terrible is imminent. The view from the Citadel is described several times as “…brown and drear”; Pippin and Beregond sit outside since Pippin feels “imprisoned indoors” (Tolkien TLR 790). Within the space of Minas Tirith different interior and exterior spaces are portrayed. Here Pippin’s words inform the reader that he has moved from the inside of a building to the exterior of the building. As noted, the City is mostly described from Pippin’s point of view and he finds himself in interior and exterior spaces, which interact with each other and influence each other. It is said that Pippin reluctantly “…climbed on to the seat and looked out over the wall” and he sees the great Pelennor field beneath him stretching to the river Anduin which is scarcely visible (Tolkien TLR 791). In this description the City appears to be an interior space from where Pippin and Beregond behold the opaque space (exterior) of the area surrounding the City, which is being intruded on by the Black Riders, as untimely as night. As Pippin and Beregond watch, they see the Black Riders swooping down to Lord Faramir and his soldiers. As they stand and witness this event playing out in front of their eyes, but are not directly involved, the readers can experience their tenseness, fear and suspense building as it increases in the characters. The readers experience the physical space in a psychological way. By perceiving the impending doom as if they are outsiders, they can only cry out for Gandalf to aid them, as they themselves cannot do anything, the same way that the readers cannot assist any of the characters in any of the spaces. Gandalf arrives like a “…flash of white and silver” to fend off the Black Riders and help the soldiers to the City (Tolkien TLR 791). Throughout the novel, Gandalf saves the other characters multiple times, although some are brief, but he “…always turns up when things are darkest” (Tolkien TLR 791).
Beregond mentions to Pippin that this is not the normal weather found in Minas Tirith, but that the air that seems so “...thick and brown” is “...no weather of the world” it is “...some device of his malice; some broil of fume from the Mountain of Fire that he sends to darken hearts and counsel” (Tolkien TLR 790). The first sign of the enemies at their door is the shuddering cry of the Ringwraiths’ fell beasts, but the cry has grown in power and in hatred since the first time Pippin heard it. Not only do the readers now expect the coming danger conveyed by the sight of the dark air as described by Beregond, but also by the eerie cry of the “...fell things below” (Tolkien TLR 791). Suddenly the fair and calm City, as earlier described by Pippin, has turned cold and gloomy. Not only does the atmosphere in the space change, but so do the characters and their interaction with other characters. After the foul cry of the Nazgûl, Faramir is confronted by his father and the atmosphere becomes more tense (Tolkien TLR 794-795).

On the fourth day after Pippin had entered Minas Tirith, the “…darkness had reached its full and grew no deeper, it weighed heavier on men’s hearts” (Tolkien TLR 799). This was the day that the Orc army and the Black Captain had taken Osgiliath and fear entered the hearts of the men in the City. The atmosphere in the City is suggested by the characters’ dialogue. Dialogue is used in the novel to enunciate and better describe the atmosphere from a specific point of view of a character within the space. Beregond cries in “dismay” and Pippin cried out in “terror” (Tolkien TLR 800), these words impressing on the readers the fear and anguish with which the characters are filled. The narrator notes that “…here and there they [wounded men] crept across the plain” to find shelter in the City; the houses and barns were set alight and all knew that the enemies had finally arrived (Tolkien TLR 801). When Osgiliath is lost and Faramir wounded, the people lose hope, as he was also, like the City, a beacon of hope to his people. “…So now at last, the City was besieged, enclosed in a ring of foes” (Tolkien TLR 803). Once again, the image of a ring makes an appearance: just as the One Ring in its evil binds, so does this ring of foes at the foot of the City, reinforcing the image of the ring. The once White City is now represented in darkness and the plain has become dark with the hordes of enemies gathering to enter the City. The first direct siege upon the City comes in the form of great machines called catapults, which the people of the City did not fear at first, throwing “missiles marvellously high” that burst into flame and toppled down into the City, setting the first wall and level alight (Tolkien TLR 804). The army of Sauron then create even more fear in the hearts of the men of the City as they catapult something even more horrible over the wall: the severed heads of their fellow soldiers that seemed to have “died in pain” and are marked with the “foul token of the Lidless Eye” (Tolkien TLR 804). The
Dark Lord conquers the City with his fastest weapons: “dread and despair” (Tolkien *TLR* 805). The City is disgraced and made an abomination littered with the remains of fallen soldiers, and the innocence once presented by the white colour of the City is now changed and blighted. This tactic of the enemy’s army dishonoured and disgraced the people of the City as well as the City itself. “…Ever they [the Nazgûl] circled above the City” in the same way a vulture would do over a carcass. This image might give the readers the impression of a dying city, as implied by the remains thrown over the walls.

Another image representing the death of the City is found in the funeral procession led by Denethor. As they carry Faramir to the Mansions of the Dead, the procession halts next to the Withered Tree: where complete silence reigns, except for the “rumour of war in the City down below, and they heard the water dripping sadly from the dead branches into the dark pool” (Tolkien *TLR* 807-808). The water assumes the emotions of the bearers in this instance as it portrays their sadness within the space itself. These images further accentuate the fear of the population and the silent death of the City as the inhabitants too fall into the metaphorical pool of darkness, represented by the enemies besieging the City. Symbolically, Denethor and Faramir’s struggle with each other points not only to exterior issues within the lives of people, but also interior struggles, emotions. Their relationship is an example of a battle fought within the City while the enemies close in on it from outside the walls. In this situation of fear and death present in the City, Gandalf takes up the command. While the Nazgûl trouble the hearts and minds of the men of Gondor with thoughts of fear and death, Gandalf actually and metaphorically lifts their spirits, taking the place of Faramir as a beacon of hope for the City and its people. The enemies push on through the walls and the first gate, their drums ever audible and their beasts and machines crawling into the City followed by fire and death. In the moment that the Lord of the Nazgûl confronts Gandalf, “a cock crowed […] welcoming only the morning that in the sky far above the shadows of death was coming with the dawn” and with it the sound of the great horns of Rohan coming to the aid of Minas Tirith (Tolkien *TLR* 811). A cock symbolises “vigilance and activity” and is an metaphor for resurrection. It might also allude to the Biblical scene where Peter denies Christ three times before the cock crows three times. The new morning, as well as the cock crowing, are symbolic actions announcing the new beginning, which metaphysically rises above the concrete, physical space in that within this space it is also the sound of deliverance, hope and a “tending towards eternity” (Cirlot 51).
As previously mentioned, the colour white symbolises innocence, as is traditionally associated with a young bride. During the siege, the readers might experience that the City, personified as an innocent woman, is besieged and dishonoured by the Orcs and Uruk-hai who crawl and push to get through the walls. Not only do they dishonour her with their presence, but also in the way that they interact with the City. They burn her walls, throw human remains within the walls and break down the gates which have stood so fast. The innocence of the City is being washed away as the enemies stream into and try to corrupt her. Reinforcements eventually come to her aid in the form of the Rohirrim and save her from further violation.

The narrator explains the fear and chaos of the citizens as the enemy forces approach the City. The space of Minas Tirith changes as the enemies start setting light to the buildings and fields as well as to the dead and wounded. Not only does the description of the represented space alter to show the readers what is happening, but eerie sounds may also be heard: the cry of the Nazgûl as well as the “…harsh voices like beasts and carrion-birds” (Tolkien TLR 805) are described to echo the atmosphere created by the foe to intimidate the people of the City. The manner in which the characters interact makes the readers aware of the fact that the wait is finally over; the war has begun. Many of the objects found in the City, as well as the City itself, symbolically refer to certain characters and the actions that they have to take, such as the transformation of Aragorn into the king he was intended to be. Many of the symbols refer to the kings, as the last book mainly focuses on the completion of the quest and the return of the king.

After the battle at the Black Gate, Aragorn and all of his companions return to Minas Tirith where, upon entering the City, Aragorn is met by Faramir. He presents a white rod to Aragorn, which Aragorn returns to him, telling him that he is now Steward of Gondor. The arrival of the king is announced in a clear voice by the new Steward, who asks the people: “…Shall he be king and enter into the City and dwell here?” (Tolkien TLR 946). By his also asking the people of the City, all of that society is involved in the election of their king: “All the host and all the people cried yea with one voice” (Tolkien TLR 946). An ancient crown is taken from a casket and held up; it is in the same shape as that of the helmets belonging to the Guards of the Citadel, except that it is even “…loftier, and it was all white.

38 The term ‘her’ within this paragraph refers to the City of Minas Tirith.

Chapter 3:
Space in the Novel, The Return of the King
and the wings at either side were wrought of pearl and silver”, containing seven gems set within the circlet, while in the centre is a “single jewel the light of which went up like a flame” (Tolkien TLR 946). Within the crown, the symbolism of the number seven is once again reinforced by the seven jewels within the crown of the king. Frodo gives the crown to Gandalf, also known as Mithrandir, who crowns Aragorn as King with the words “…now come the days of the King, and may they be blessed while the thrones of the Valar endure” (Tolkien TLR 946). Gandalf is given the honour usually bestowed upon the father of the king and by means of this Aragorn suggests that Gandalf is a father figure in his life and that “…all that has been accomplished” as well as the victory, was his doing (Tolkien TLR 946). As Aragorn rises it is as if he has changed and now he is “revealed to” the people for the first time, he has become a king of strength, healing and wisdom with “…a light about him” (Tolkien TLR 946). The coronation is accompanied by music and clear singing as the king passes through a flower- bestrewn streets. Happy, indeed joyful, songs as well as flute, harp have replaced the war cries and drums of the Orcs and Uruk-hai and violin music and the blood and human remains and debris on the streets have been replaced by flowers. This is the beginning of the “reign of King Elessar” (Tolkien TLR 947). After his crowning Aragorn, greets and converses with many embassies; he judges strictly, but fairly and rewards those who have shown great valour and strength in battle. In the days following the victory the Hobbits gaze out over the City, and see that the towers of the City look like “…white pencils touched by sunlight, all the Vale of Anduin was like a garden and the Mountains of Shadows were veiled in a golden mist”; the City as well as the space surrounding it has become light (Tolkien TLR 949).

The final act of renewal occurs when Arwen arrives at Minas Tirith “…when the sky was blue as sapphire and white stars opened in the East […] the air was cool and fragrant” (Tolkien TLR 951). Frodo mentions as he sees Arwen and the other Elves enter the City that now “…night shall too be beautiful and blessed and all its fear pass away” (Tolkien TLR 951). Arwen is the Evenstar of her people, and now night too has been transformed into beauty, personified by her. The evil associated with darkness has changed and the fear has fallen away. Arwen represents a beautiful and peaceful night time. She might also signify the City of Minas Tirith in this chapter. Previously during the siege, as indicated the City, symbolically represented as an innocent woman, was dishonoured and violated by the enemies, but now her beauty as a young glimmering bride is placed parallel to the beauty of the renewed City. She is married to Aragorn, claiming honour, respect and beauty (Tolkien TLR 951). Since Arwen comes to restore the image of a pure bride, the City is no longer violated, but a whole city with a new king, a new queen, a new
white tree in the Citadel and a new future of “...which many songs have been told” (Tolkien *TLR* 947).

All the companions end their journey together as a group in Minas Tirith. However, not all of them travel to Minas Tirith or interact with other characters as a group. The entire Fellowship only arrives at Minas Tirith at the end of the War of the Ring, when Aragorn is crowned as King. Frodo and Sam only arrive at Minas Tirith for the crowning of its king, after the war has been won and peace has been established (Tolkien *TLR* 946-945). They experience the City as a place of new beginnings; of old splendour still standing after the horrible darkness of Sauron has been swept away. The urban space preserves “...the memory and the glory of the years that were gone” (Tolkien *TLR* 947). The City is suddenly even more “...fair than it had ever been [...] and all was healed and made good” (Tolkien *TLR* 947).

Up until this point Aragorn, to an extent, tries to avoid Minas Tirith as he knows that he has been avoiding his destiny and his duty, as King of Gondor, and if he is to enter Minas Tirith, his freedom from kingship will come to an end. Throughout the journey Aragorn evolves as his character learns and develops. He not only becomes the leader of the Fellowship, the protector of the Hobbits and his fellow travellers, but also becomes an advisor, a warrior and leader of armies. Aragorn gives advice to Théoden, King of Rohan, on the safety of his people as well as the tactics needed to do battle and succeed at Pelennor Fields. One of the great changes in Aragorn occurs when he travels to Minas Tirith to fight in the battle against Sauron, only to realise that he does not have enough warriors, so that he will have to travel through Dunharrow, take the Path of the Dead and call on the Army of the Dead to assist them (Tolkien *TLR* 764-773). This is one of the biggest alterations in his character, because he knows that the latter answer only to the heir of Elendil and Isildur, the rightful King of Gondor. He thus has to face his inner struggle and decide whether or not he will be able to handle the power of the monarch, and if he is prepared to carry the weight of being king. Aragorn tells Gimli that the living never use the road, but that the heir of Isildur “...may use it, if he dare” (Tolkien *TLR* 764), which gives the readers the impression that even Aragorn is fearful to take the road and meet the dead. On this journey Legolas, Gimli and thirty Dunedain, led by Halbarad, accompany him. He does not enter Minas Tirith, because he says that he will then enter unbidden. Because he is the king, but the Steward still rules, it will cause doubt and
debate about the matter which they could not afford to have happen while fighting the enemy; therefore he will only enter after the battle has been fought and won (Tolkien *TLR* 843).

Aragorn wagers an interior battle with himself. However, after gaining the Army of the Dead as allies, Aragorn seems to have made peace with the fact that he will be able to rule, but not as a power hungry king, rather one intending to rejuvenate Gondor. After joining in the battle and saving Minas Tirith, Aragorn further uses his power as Dunédan and King by going to the House of Healing, and healing those who had been hurt in battle. Gandalf notes that it is “…only in the coming of Aragorn that any hope remains” and is revived (Tolkien *TLR* 844).

At the coronation of Elessar, it is Gandalf who crowns Aragorn. He is probably the only character that does not, in a sense, develop, but brings about the development of the other characters with whom he comes into contact. He leads them in the right direction, he gives them advice when he sees that they are heading for trouble and he always stands by them, so much so, that he even comes back to finish the quest and help the Fellowship after his supposed death during the fight with the Balrog. Even though the character of Gandalf does not develop in such a fashion as that of Aragorn, Gandalf interacts and helps the spaces to acquire additional meaning. His character development, such as it is, is determined by the space in which he finds himself, but his character also contributes to the actions of the other characters within the space and how the space is experienced. His character becomes clearer to the readers through the spaces in which and between which he interacts, not only with the physical spaces, but also the characters within the space. After Gandalf is resurrected as Gandalf the White in *The Two Towers*, the readers begin to understand that Gandalf transcends the boundaries of time and even space. All know him, but by different names; he has been in Middle Earth for a very long time and continues to be one of the advisers and key role players for the future and the preservation of Middle Earth.
Pippin discovers his own courage in the White City (Minas Tirith). In Hobbiton, when Pippin is first introduced, he is a naïve young Hobbit, unaware of the dangers that lurk outside of the Shire and quite happy to sit around doing nothing and just being cheerful. However, after his encounter with the Palantir, things change for him; he suddenly comes to the realisation that this adventure is serious, that their whole future is at stake, and that he too has a part to play in shaping it. During his audience with Denethor, Pippin is pronounced a squire of Minas Tirith, and he is finally the last character to stand up and fight for that which he loves, as the others did, as will be explained below (Tolkien TLR 739). In Minas Tirith he is shown through the City by one of the guards, Beregond, and he realises that even though he is small, just as small as the guard’s son Bergil, he is a man, or at least a full grown Hobbit of nearly twenty-nine years (Tolkien TLR 752), and he too can and does make a difference. Through interacting with these two new friends, Pippin comes to realise that the carefree young Hobbit which he used to be has become a more worldly, serious and knowledgeable Hobbit. He has been separated from Frodo, and then from Merry; finally all alone, he has come to face the facts and comes into adulthood fairly quickly. As mentioned when Pippin first arrives in Minas Tirith the City fills him with awe and that which he experiences is a concrete as well as psychological space of lightness and even joy (Tolkien TLR 742-746), but as time moves on, the space changes and a feeling of doom starts to take hold in the City as well as in Pippin (Tolkien TLR 755).

Merry, who has become the shield-bearer of King Théoden of Rohan, fights alongside Éowyn on the Fields of Pelennor, for he has already recognised the courage and love for Middle Earth, not only in Aragorn and some of his fellow companions, such as Boromir, but also in Éowyn. He admires her greatly and supports her when she desires to fight in the war for Middle Earth and protect those she cares about. Because she is a woman, however, she is underestimated and treated in the same way as Merry; someone who is not strong enough, big enough in physical stature, or good enough to fight for that which they love (Tolkien TLR 784-787). Merry discovers, though, that he can indeed play a role and assists Éowyn in the battle against evil, both of them in disguise. He at last feels “…beyond doubt: a change” (Tolkien TLR 819). Merry plays a major contributing role in saving Minas Tirith, as he is the one who stabs the Witch King and gives Éowyn the opportunity to kill him (Tolkien TLR 823-824). He is healed by Aragorn in the House of Healing, alongside Éowyn in Minas Tirith. Pippin and Merry have become stout hearted and loyal. Without them, victory would not have been achieved during the War of the Ring.
Chapter 3: Space in the Novel, The Return of the King

Gimli and Legolas are minimally involved in Minas Tirith, except when they recount a few flaws and good qualities of the City as well as of the Prince Imrahil. This is purposively to emphasise the space, not the characters and the atmosphere of the space of the City. They, however, have travelled alongside Aragorn, for instance on the Path of the Dead, and have come to the City’s aid in its hour of need. Gimli and Legolas both know the splendour of the City, but seeing its ruin, both of them long to build and beautify the City in order to restore it to its former glory (Tolkien TLR 854). The two of them have also grown in that they have learned to accept and learn from each other: Elf and Dwarf can indeed be friends. The people of the City in fact “…marvelled to see such companions” as they pass through the streets of Minas Tirith (Tolkien TLR 854).

Minas Tirith is represented as a fantasy space within the novel through descriptions, the psychological and sensory experiences of the characters, events that take place, the sounds and colours that alter and the emotional atmosphere that they experience. The description of the represented space is provided through the imagery, figures of speech and other stylistic techniques. As with a character’s development in a novel, so the City develops from a static space suffused with light and people awaiting the coming battle, to a city of utter chaos, fear and death as the enemies enter, burning and almost destroying the City. Finally, however, the City is restored and all is renewed after the victory in the War of the Rings and, metaphorically speaking, by the gifts of healing when the king takes his throne. A new City with a fresh atmosphere of hope, peace and happiness is described.

3.3.2 Mordor: Mount Doom

The second space this dissertation addresses appears in direct contrast to the clear, positive beauty of Minas Tirith. It is Mordor, the Black-land, also called the Nameless Land and the Land of the Shadow. It is the region of Middle Earth situated just to the east of Gondor (Map 2 refers), separated by the eastern, lower part of the great river Anduin and “…bounded and protected” (Foster 283) on the northern side by the mountain range of Ered Lithui (Ash Mountains) and on the southern and western side by Ephel Dúath (Mountains of Shadow). Since Sauron settled there in SA 1000, 2019 years before the War of the Ring, Mordor had become a stronghold for evil. From the city of Minas Morgul a road leads straight across the Plateau of Gorgoroth to Mount Doom, also called
Orodruin. Gorgoroth (Haunted) was a great barren plateau which formed the northwestern plateau of Mordor (Foster 283). When Sam first gazes over the land he sees that it is a “hard and cruel and bitter” land that confronts him (Tolkien TLR 879). It is a “...desolate area scarred with countless Orc-dug pits” (Foster 174); Sam explains that the ground contains great cliffs falling into dark troughs and has jagged edges with “...crags like fangs that stood out black against the red light behind them” (Tolkien TLR 879).

A shadow constantly hangs over Mordor, and is thus the main metaphor used for evil when referring to this land. Sauron’s stronghold is “…wrapped in a brooding gloom […] gate on gate, and tower on tower” (Tolkien TLR 902). A shadow is somewhat ambiguous, it is intangible and without substance; it is the absence of light. On the other hand, it is something that may be defined as an object, with outlines and a shape. The shadow is believed to be the “…negative ‘double’ of the body” (Cirlot 290) and in all aspects a shadow is believed to represent the evil side, otherwise, the symbol of darkness and evilness. In the *Return of the King*, the Shadow spreads over Middle Earth as Sauron’s power grows and as the number of creatures and peoples that form allegiance with him increases. The Shadow also plays an important role in that it covers Mordor and the rest of Middle Earth in darkness as they are plagued by Sauron. This shadow also creates fear and doubt in the heart of those that it covers. Pippin feels that his hope seems to wither (Tolkien TLR 749) as the shadow creeps towards Minas Tirith and its inhabitants feel more fear and dread in darkness than in light. Beregond also attributes another purpose to the shadow when he tells Pippin that it is the “…sign of our fall, and the shadow of our doom” (Tolkien TLR 749).

Darkness is one of the most prominent symbols in literature or life (Ferber 114-115); however, according to Cirlot (76) darkness does not become a symbol of evil, until there is a definite split or differentiation between light (good) and darkness (evil). As discussed in 3.3.1, Minas Tirith, the White City, symbolises goodness, joy and innocence. In contrast with this, Mordor is depicted as black, contrasting directly with the white of Minas Tirith. In *The Return of the King*, and for that matter throughout the complete trilogy, there is always the contrast between good and evil, between the light and the darkness of Sauron penetrating this light. It is thus safe to assume that in this novel, darkness does indeed embody the symbol of evil. There are multiple references within *The Return of the King*, describing how the darkness spreads over Middle Earth. Pippin and Beregond watch as
the shadow of darkness creeps up to Minas Tirith and Beregond predicts that “…all realms shall be put to the test […] under the Shadow” (Tolkien TLR 748-749).

The darkness burgeons, from a mere rumour at the beginning of journey, to a shadow which also conceals dark masses of evil creatures to a “…vast Black Gate” (Tolkien TLR 869) situated at the boundaries of a “…wide lake of darkness dotted with tiny fires” (Tolkien TLR 879). The darkness and the evil increase constantly, “…nearer and nearer it drew, looming blacker, like the oncoming of a wall of night at the last end of the world.” (Tolkien TLR 914). As the allusion to darkness develops within the narrated space of Middle Earth, so does the atmosphere of tension within the characters and the readers. Before the siege on Gondor it is implied that the “…heavy shadow had deepened and all the hearts in the City were oppressed” (Tolkien TLR 789) so that when the darkness reaches its full “…it weighed heavier on men’s hearts” (Tolkien TLR 799). These images and suggestions reinforce the argument that the shadow and darkness also caused unhappiness, depression and despair in those who came under its shadow; it altered the atmosphere which is present within the space it covers. Darkness does not only symbolise the evil of either the space or the characters that dwell in this space, but also chaos (Cirlot 77). Chaos is regarded as unorganised creation; according to some religions, in chaos one will meet death and evil (Cirlot 43). Once again, the shadow of darkness that encloses the chaos points to the evilness that lurks in its corners, that covers it: in darkness chaos is more easily created. Chaos is also directly related to the colour black (Cirlot 43), which is again reinforced by the gates of Mordor, called the Black Gates.

Black is of the utmost importance, not only because it is such a universally known symbolic colour which also recurs in The Return of the King, but also because, together with the colour white as mentioned in 3.3.1, it restates the fact that the two colours are “…diametrically opposed symbols of the positive and the negative” (Cirlot 56). It is necessary in any world created that there be black and white, because these two keep the balance of a world. Black thus symbolises the opposite of what White symbolises. The colour black not only symbolises evil, darkness and chaos, but also strikes fear into characters (Tolkien TLR 749). Where the colour white symbolises timelessness or immortality, black symbolises being time-bound and therefore mortality, something that will fade and end. Black is represented in The Return of the King by the darkness that hangs over Mordor; the Gates (Tolkien TLR 749); the fact that the Orcs and the Uruk-hai that serve Sauron are dressed in black and portrayed as dark masses and that Orcs,
unlike Uruk-hai, can only travel in darkness or in shade (Tolkien *TLR* 462). Treebeard tells Pippin and Merry that it “…is a mark of evil things that came in Great Darkness that they cannot abide the Sun” (Tolkien *TLR* 462). When Aragorn and his company meet the Mouth of Sauron, the small company (of Sauron) consists of “…black-harnessed soldiery, and a single banner, black but bearing on it in red the Evil Eye⁹¹” (Tolkien *TLR* 870). This also points out to the readers that these spaces, these characters and all that surrounds them are shrouded in unhappiness, misery, danger, fear, death and evil. Another symbol of evil, fear and death is perfectly presented to the readers in the form of the Black Riders. Their name contains the word black, they are shrouded in mantles “vast and dark” (Tolkien *TLR* 811). They bring fear and hopelessness to all that see and hear them. Pippin notes that their voices which utter only “…his [Sauron’s] will and his malice” are filled with evil and horror and “…at length even the stout-hearted” would be filled with blackness and would only think of “hiding and of crawling and of death” (Tolkien *TLR* 805). The most fearsome of all is the King or Lord of the Nazgûl who rides in as a “…great black shape […] grown to a vast menace of despair” and who refers to himself as “Death”, functioning as a personification of death (Tolkien *TLR* 811). These riders have become evil and are reduced to fearsome wraiths; an evil physically represented to bring fear into the hearts of the hearers as well as the readers by the animal cries that emanate from them and warn of their coming, as well as their ghost-like appearance and their voices filled with malice and hatred.

Mordor, while surrounded by mountains on three sides, consists almost solely of a barren desert, called the Plateau of Gorgoroth, (Tolkien *TLR* 868). The narrator describes that Sam sees the ground as “…all broken and tumbled. Indeed the whole surface of Gorgoroth was pocked with great holes" (Tolkien *TLR* 913). The names of the mountains also refer back to the symbol of darkness, Ash Mountains and the Mountains of Shadow. Sam notes when he first enters into Mordor that he has now entered into “…a land of darkness where the days of the world seemed forgotten, and where all who entered were forgotten too” (Tolkien *TLR* 877). The same perspective is used to describe this space where the two small Hobbits enter into a vast space filled with malicious-seeming geographical structures and even viler creatures. The description of their experience of the space is told from the perspective of their diminutive stature, just as Pippin’s of Minas Tirith was told. In this manner the vastness and fear are emphasised to a greater degree. This sense of smallness, fear and helplessness influences Frodo and Sam’s perception,

---

⁹¹ The Eye of Sauron and the symbolism it contains is discussed in further detail later in the chapter.
which is further affected by their euphoria at their freedom and the expectation of a peaceful future once Sauron is defeated and the war is ended.

Within this encampment on the plateau nothing grows, there is no life to be seen, only that of the creatures that lurk there, such as the Orcs and fell beasts. It is clearly a negative landscape when contrasted to that, for example of Hobbiton in Chapter 3.3.3 or even to that of Gondor and Rohan, where there are forests and fields. It is a place of absolute dryness and lifelessness. This death and aridity might be the effect of the volcanic mountain, Mount Doom, which is found in the middle of the land. There are no living trees, flowers or grass, yet Frodo and Sam discover water within Mordor. Out of a rock a little streamlet emerges that falls and gets lost among the dead stones; this water however has “…an unpleasant taste, at once bitter and oily” (Tolkien TLR 899-900). It is thus not nutritious water, but, too is infected with the evil of the land. As previously mentioned in this chapter, there is a darkness hanging over Mordor, a shadow that it [the land] had made for its own defence” (Tolkien TLR 878), and in this darkness no plant can grow: the land is dry and filled with lava which has molten and then set, which also inhibits the growth of plants. Even though no green plants grow in Mordor, there are some other species: Sam explains to Frodo that he “…didn’t know anything grew in Mordor […] these thorns” that they found on the harsh and dry earth are long and no mail or “…leather jerkin” can keep them out (Tolkien TLR 896). Thorns might be seen as the conjunction between existence and non-existence as well as between pleasure and pain (Cirlot 341). Dryness is the direct opposite of organic life. Cirlot writes that dryness is a sign of “…virility […] of the predominance of the Element of Fire” (Cirlot 89). From the fissures in the plateau, fumes and smoke curl and fill the air with shadow.

Oroduin and Barad-dûr are found on this plateau. Frodo and Sam behold the latter as a great black tower standing close to Oroduin, and they describe the air surrounding it and the mountain as “ever mirky” while from under the Tower “…the veils of Shadow that Sauron wove about himself” (Tolkien TLR 915) creep out. Towers are built for military purposes to guard an area. The White Tower has become a symbol of hope to the people of Middle Earth and a beacon of light. In Chapter 3.3.1, this tower of majesty and authority is contrasted to Barad-dûr. The tower is described as consisting of iron with gates constructed from steel and its tower was made of adamant, totally unyielding. At the top of the tower is an “iron crown” (Tolkien TLR 921). Iron is associated with Mars/Ares, the god of war. Iron is thus symbolically associated with violence, warfare, hardness and
inflexibility (Ferber 103-104). The iron crown might thus symbolise the superiority of Sauron as an idol of violence and warfare. The Tower is dark and covered in shadow, which causes it not to be seen clearly as Sam has to peer into “the dense shadow” and his sight seems “thin and vague” (Tolkien TLR 878). This is where the spirit of Sauron presides and from where he controls all of his servants. At the top of the Tower is “a flame of red, the flickering of a piercing Eye” (Tolkien TLR 921). The Eye of Sauron gazes and rules (Foster 133-134) from here. A tower symbolises levels, and ascension, while material height might imply spiritual elevation. Sauron chose this tower to serve him as a watch tower from where his Eye would be able to see everything that moved in Middle Earth; it is possible too that this might symbolically indicate Sauron’s desire to be elevated above the other inhabitants of Middle Earth as he wants to rule over them. Unlike the White Tower in Minas Tirith which is only a tower, Barad-dûr is represented in the novel as having the Eye of Sauron on its uppermost level when Sam notes that the tower is “frowning black, and in it the red eye glowed” (Tolkien TLR 716).

One of the most prominent images in the novel associated with Mordor is the Eye of Sauron. Frodo first sees the Eye in Galadriel’s mirror, perceiving that the “…Eye was rimmed with fire, but was itself glazed, yellow as a cat’s, watchful and intent, and the black slit of its pupil opened on a pit, a window into nothing” (Tolkien TLR 335). Plotinus (qtd. in Cirlot 99) states that the eye cannot see without the sun, if it is not in a manner itself a sun, a concept which imbues the eye with the symbolic meaning of intelligence and spirit. Sauron is never physically represented to the readers within The Return of the King”; he is only a spirit, so the burning eye on top of the tower thus physically and metaphorically embodies the evil spirit of Sauron. Frodo is troubled by it, describing the ever roving Eye as a “…horrible growing sense of hostile” power that searches ever through the shadow, clouds, earth and flesh “…to see you: to pin you under its deadly gaze, naked, immovable” (Tolkien TLR 616). Sauron’s spirit is continuously searching for his precious Ring. According to Cirlot (108) the idea of “spirit” is quite often represented as incandescent air. In this case the eye of Sauron is burning, thus an incandescent, fiery eye. The single eye, as is the case with the Eye of Sauron, is a symbol that implies superiority and “…the subhuman, because it is less than two” (Cirlot 100), whereas fire symbolises superiority, control and “…implies the desire to annihilate time and bring all things to their end” (Cirlot 105-106), which is exactly what Sauron has in mind for Gondor
and its people. From this it can be determined that not only is the Eye of Sauron a way to invoke fear of someone or something always watching, but also that through this he is able to control his forces, and in a way, those that defy him too. Sauron thinks himself superior and yet, in the end, ironically, he is defeated by two small Hobbits.

The only other structure found on the plateau is Orodruin, or Mount Doom, as it is known (Foster 321). “Orodruin” translated from Sindarin, means the Mountain of the Red Flame. The land surrounding the mountain is “rough and hostile” (Tolkien TLR 917). Sauron first forged the one Ring in this volcanic mountain in about SA 1600. Foster (321) writes that “…always at his [Sauron’s] rising Orodruin erupted”, almost as if it physically responds to the evil coming, so the fire erupts from the mountain. Orodruin is about 4 500 feet high, or about 1 400 meters, but as it stands all alone on the plane of Gorgoroth, it appears taller than it actually is. Its base measures about 3 000 feet high and a cone rises from there, which ends in a wide crater (Foster 320). From Sam’s point of view, the mountain is a burning glow from which rise “…huge columns” of “…swirling smoke, dusty red at the roots, black above where it merged into the billowing canopy that roofed in all the accursed land” (Tolkien TLR 879). This tower of smoke connects the dark sky, or shadow as it is called by the characters, to the mountain.

The door of Sammath Naur is situated within this crater through which one can enter the chambers finally to reach the Crack of Doom (Tolkien TLR 923). The Crack of Doom is a cavern excavated from the eastern side of Orodruin, from which a road runs to Barad-dûr. The cavern is constantly “…dark and hot and a deep rumbling shook the earth” (Tolkien TLR 924). Sam explains that a constant “surging and throbbing” is heard within the caves (Tolkien TLR 879). This might suggest machinery constantly working nearby, or even that Tolkien, through this metaphor, may be personifying the mountain as having a heart: the pit of fire burning in its core. The Crack of Doom is a great fissure within the mountain containing the Fire of Doom, the ever burning pit of fire or lava “in which the One Ring was forged and the only flame in which it could be unmade” (Foster 75). Sam notes that as they enter the Crack of Doom, they enter into the “…heart of the realm of Sauron and the forges of his ancient might, greatest in Middle-Earth” (Tolkien TLR 924).

40 Even though Sauron is not presented to the readers in a physical form, it is suggested to the readers that he does indeed have a physical form, as Gollum explains that Sauron has one finger missing from his one hand when he mentions that he “has only four on the Black Hand, but they are enough” (Tolkien TLR 627).
This mountain is not particularly high and impressive in stature, but since it is one of the only structures upon a barren wasteland, it appears more impressive and “taller” than it really is (Tolkien *TLR* 920). Mount Doom is not just a mountain, but also a volcanic one. When the Eye first becomes aware that the Ring is within the mountain, the “…fires below awoke in anger, the red light blazed, and all the cavern was filled with a great glare and heat.” (Tolkien *TLR* 925). A volcano is linked with the “idea of evil” (Cirlot 361) while Beaudoin (qtd. in Cirlot 361) relates a volcano to the psychological symbol of passion and the source of the spirits’ energy. As previously mentioned, Sauron has no physical form, but is epitomised as a “naturally pure” spirit (Brown “Was Sauron Invisible” E10). Mount Doom, which is the place in which he creates the One Ring, is thus his source of energy as it is the source of evil (the Ring), so that once the Ring is destroyed and the mountain erupts, Sauron, whose power was in the Ring, also fades. The idea of a volcanic mountain, which contains a cavern in which the fires constantly burn and bubble, fits perfectly with the alchemical symbol of a cavernous mountain. According to alchemy, a mountain with a cavern is seen as the “philosophers’ oven” (Cirlot 219). Sauron first decided to take Mordor as his seat of governance because of Oroduin and its fiery pit (Foster 321). It may be assumed that the fire within the mountain is also imbued with the power of Sauron. The fire that burns within Mount Doom is also directly linked to evil, fire being a symbol for destruction as well as regeneration (Cirlot 106).

Ferber (74) also comments that fire may be the symbol for any passion, whether it is good or evil, such as the case in Mount Doom, where the fire burns like the passion Sauron has for power and dominance. The fire is directly linked to Sauron, not only by his magic, but also by the fact that it acts on his emotions (Foster 320). When Sauron is defeated in the battle of the Last Allegiance, the fires of Mount Doom are dormant but once Sauron returns (Tolkien *TLR* 57), they blaze up and burn with renewed passion. In the book *The Return of the King*, it is written that there is a constant throbbing sound within the Crack of Doom (Tolkien *TLR* 879). This, as previously mentioned, could also symbolically refer to the fire that burns within the mountain as the heart of evil, an interpretation which is once again reinforced as previously suggested when the Ring is destroyed within the fire, when at that same moment the Tower of Barad-dûr, crumbles to the ground. At the moment of the Ring's destruction, Gandalf watches and suddenly hears a “…terrible call out of the Dark Tower”: the hosts of Mordor start to shiver in fear and doubt as the “…Power that drove them on and filled them with hate and fury was wavering; its will was removed from them” (Tolkien *TLR* 927). He further describes that the earth moves under his feet and then, rising swiftly above the Towers of the Black Gate, a “…vast soaring darkness sprang
into the sky, flickering with fire” and the Tower sways and falls down, crumbling to the ground (Tolkien TLR 928). Sauron’s power is completely, suddenly and violently obliterated; almost suggesting through personification of the land that his heart has been ripped out.

As Gollum falls into the fiery chasm below, holding the One Ring the “…throbbing grew to a great tumult, and the Mountain shook”, the fire leaps up and a great roar and confusion of noises is heard (Tolkien TLR 925). With the destruction of the Ring all the “…towers fell and mountains slid; walls crumbled and melted, crashing down; vast spires of smoke and spouting streams went billowing up” (Tolkien TLR 925-926). At last, the great Orodruin reels as fire belches “from its riven summit” whiles the skies burst into thunder and lightning and a “torrent of black rain” falls over Mordor. “Slow rivers of fire” roll down the dark slopes of the mountain where the cone is split open and deep pits and rifts produce fumes and smoke. The mountain is described as being “convulsed” and so the power of Sauron and Mordor falls (Tolkien TLR 929). The Ring has flourished and worked its mischief since its creation, through greed, the greed for wealth and power. Isildur, Bilbo, Gollum and Frodo have all shown how the Ring influences the bearer and evokes greed in their hearts: they desire it and the power that comes with it more than they desire anything else. They lose their sense of reason and think only of the Ring. Gollum is the most prominent in this group as he has possessed the Ring the longest and it has not only changed his heart and mind, but also his exterior features. Gollum represents human greed personified. He searches for it continuously and is willing to deceive and even kill for the Ring. It is important to note that Gollum, in his greed, destroys that which he hungers for, and symbolically also destroys the greed for power caused by Sauron as the effect of the Ring immediately disappears while it melts away.

There is a striking contrast between this land of Mordor described as having fangs, like a dark and evil animal, while Minas Tirith is personified as an innocent woman (Chapter 3.3.1 refers). Sam develops the animal-like image of Mordor when he notes that the molten rock from the mountain “…lay like twisted dragon-shapes vomited from the tormented earth” (Tolkien TLR 879). Using the term “dragon” suggests that the land of Mordor is metaphorised as a black, fire-breathing dragon. Frodo and Sam experience the land as becoming “more evil” (Tolkien TLR 914). This dragon might then be seen as the serpent in the bosom of Middle Earth, which metaphorically signifies a poison or illness.
(Ferber 187). The land is sick with evil in the form of Mount Doom and the evil that flows from it, as it flows within the veins of Sauron. Cirlot (86) also reinforces the symbolism of poison when he cites Dontenville as favouring a historicist and sociological approach to the symbolism surrounding a dragon as signifying a “…plague which beset the country”. Sneider is also cited by Cirlot (86) as viewing the dragon as symbolising sickness. The dragon might also be the symbolic embodiment of “the animal as the adversary”; broadly speaking it comes to represent in psychological terms “something terrible to overcome” (Cirlot 86-88). In this manner then, this sickness in the land of Mordor could be described as being physically visible in the darkness, the fire and the evil behaviour of the characters that inhabit the land, and as also symbolically represented by multiple images. The land of Mordor is “…something terrible to overcome” (Cirlot 88) for Frodo and Sam, as well as the whole world of Middle Earth.

The first two of the characters to enter into Mordor are Frodo and Sam. On their way they meet up with Gollum, who agrees to act as their guide through Mordor, since he has been there before (Tolkien TLR 248, 601). By his recommendation they pass through the Dead Marshes and on to the Black Gate where they turn away to Minas Morgul and to Shelob’s Lair. Gollum tries anything that he can think of to separate Frodo from the Ring (Tolkien TLR 693,797). However, the ever trustworthy and loyal Sam is always there to keep Frodo on target. Sam has always thought himself less important than Frodo, but it is Sam who rescues Frodo from Cirith Ungol (Tolkien TLR 876-891). Throughout their struggle to reach the mountain Sam tries to lighten the ever-darkening atmosphere and tension in the space by encouraging Frodo, and pushing them forward. Sam is himself encouraged by receiving the one thing he wanted in Mordor: “…a bit of light. Enough to help us” (Tolkien TLR 898). It is also Sam who encourages Frodo, saying “…I can’t carry it for you, but I can carry you and it as well” (Tolkien TLR 919). Sam helps him carry his burden and even carries Frodo up the steps of Mount Doom to the Crack of Doom. Through the epic journey that they undertake, Sam has come to realise that he is Frodo’s protector, that he is indeed strong. He is making a difference, without being praised for it. Even though he is small in stature and merely Frodo’s gardener, Sam has discovered his strength of character, placed within the specific space of Mordor to grow and bring hope to the dull and dark space. Sam is meant to be in Mordor, to encourage and help Frodo; this is his mission.
Frodo travels alongside Sam, they encounter many Orcs and other appalling, unnameable creatures, but through it all, he has his trusty friend there to help him. Throughout the latter part of their quest, Sam and Frodo encounter mostly evil characters, except for Faramir, the brother of Boromir. Together they travel from the River Anduin in The Two Towers\(^4\), where they take their leave from the rest of the Fellowship to the Wasteland where they come upon Gollum. Frodo forms a type of bond with Gollum, who joins them on their journey and he finds that they are not as different from each other as first appears; they both know the power of the Ring and the effect it has on its bearer. The main difference however is that Frodo has Sam as a loyal companion (Tolkien TLR 626). The last stage of their journey to the mountain is a greater torment than could have been anticipated; they are in pain and parched with thirst, it is dark, because of the smoke of the mountain as well as the fact that there “…seemed to be a storm coming […] there was a shimmer of lightning under the black skies.” (Tolkien TLR 918). The air is filled with fumes, making breathing painful, and as they look up they see in front of them a “…huge mass of ash and slag and burned stone” (Tolkien TLR 919). When they finally arrive at the Crack of Doom, Sam urges Frodo to do what they have travelled all this way to do, but Frodo reneges on his promise saying: “I have come […] but I do not choose now to do what I came to do […] the Ring is mine” (Tolkien TLR 924). At that very last moment the Ring finally wins dominance over its bearer. Gollum, who in some way symbolises the dark side of Frodo, comes to the rescue at this point. Gandalf has foretold that evil may sometimes do well without the evil doer knowing or intending it to, remarking that “…even Gollum may have something yet to do”, and if not for Gollum, ironically, and the specific space of the cavern, the Ring might not have been destroyed (Tolkien TLR 926). Gollum betrays himself and does something for the good of all, which he did not intend (Tolkien TLR 797). Prophetically, the death of Gollum and the destruction of the Ring are supposed to coincide with each other, as Gandalf mentions to Frodo that Gollum “…is bound up with the fate of the Ring” and that he has a part to play (Tolkien TLR 58).

Aragorn, Gimli, Legolas, Pippin, Merry and Gandalf only enter into Mordor after they have been triumphant in the battle of Pelennor Fields. They travel to the Black Gate with the intention of keeping Sauron’s Eye fixed upon them; thus blinding him to Frodo and Sam moving within Mordor itself. It is “…the last move in a great jeopardy” and this final strategic move will mean “…the end of the game” for either side (Tolkien TLR 864). They

---

41 Some of the events mentioned here are from the second novel, The Two Towers, but it is necessary to note them as they are essential in revealing Sam’s commitment to his master and friend, Frodo.
travel together as an army, marching on the Black Gates. On their arrival there, they are met by the Mouth of Sauron whom informs them that the forces of Mordor have captured the Hobbits, who are dead. All of these friends battle together, almost without hope, as they have no evidence that Frodo and Sam are still alive at this stage. Most of them have travelled by different paths to finally meet at Minas Tirith to go onward to Mordor, but each of these paths has enlightened the traveller upon it; they have grown in character, in loyalty, courage, friendship and love. They have all reunited (except Merry who was still not strong enough and Frodo and Sam) and still their flame of hope burns bright: as friends and as warriors they fight on together for the shared cause.

The complete region of Mordor is covered in darkness, shadow and smoke: it has no life, it is a barren wasteland and all that inhabits it comes to represent the evil and corruption of the Dark Lord in search of ultimate power. It is a symbol for the evil of Sauron, as well as the utter desolation and emptiness that Frodo experiences as the Ring grows in power when he draws nearer to Mount Doom. The mountain\(^3\) when taken in context, of the evil space it is situated in, is generally thought of as comprising “…dangerous obstacles and excrescences on the face of the earth” (Ferber 132). This is exactly what Mount Doom is to Frodo and Sam: an obstacle in the heart of the enemy’s lair into which they must break to unmake that which has corrupted and plagued Middle Earth for such a long time. In the novel it is a physical symbol for the spiritual ascent the two Hobbits must make in order to complete their journey and destroy the Ring.

### 3.3.3 The Shire: Hobbiton

Most of the information regarding the Shire is presented to the readers in the first novel, *The Fellowship of the Ring*. This information will thus be knowledge acquired by the readers before reading *The Return of the King*, assuming that the readers of third novel will also have read the first novels. All of these small pieces of information accumulate over the many pages to form a complete image of the space of Hobbiton, the characters within the space and the part it has to play in the novel. The Shire is situated in the region of Eriador, a piece of land encompassing about 18 000 square miles (46 620 km\(^2\)). Most of the Hobbits in Middle Earth lived in the Shire, which they divided into four Farthings as
they called it, which were further divided into a number of folklands. Hobbiton is located in the West Farthing, along the stream named The Water, north of the Great East Road (Foster 369). Hobbiton is also home to the four Hobbits who form part of the Fellowship of the Ring. Hobbiton is primarily an agricultural part of Middle Earth where the land is rich and kind (Tolkien TLR 1). Here the grass is green, with rolling hills and clear skies filled with birdsong. The dwellings of Hobbits are from the old “Smials” (Tolkien TLR 6) as they call them, underground holes that had been dug. The poorer hobbits live in small holes, with one window or none, while the rich build extravagant, large and luxurious holes, with many windows. As if this is not strange enough, they also have “a preference for round windows and even round doors” which is the “chief remaining peculiarity of Hobbit-architecture” (Tolkien TLR 7).

Bilbo and Frodo’s house, Bag End, is situated on the Hill, just above the lane, Bagshot Row, in the neighbourhood called Underhill (Tolkien TLR 21). Bag End, a luxurious smial with many rounded windows and a large, round green door is located on the Hill. To the west are beautiful and bright gardens (Foster 31). To the south of Bag End is a field, called the Party Field, in the middle of which stands the tallest and most majestic tree for as far as the eye could see, the famed Party Tree. (Tolkien TLR 26). The Party Tree is a gathering place for all the Hobbits in the Shire to come and celebrate special occasions. Year round it is decorated with colourful streamers and has a pavilion close by for guests (Foster 327). “The Mill”, which has a giant waterwheel, is located on the north bank of the Water.

Within the novel, The Return of the King, most of the information regarding the Shire and Hobbiton is established in reflections by those who miss and long for their home: the four Hobbits. All of the reflections on their home portray a warm, sunny and secure space. In the examples mentioned, the seasons of spring and summer, which are also warm and pleasant seasons, are mentioned. Sam thinks back to home as they travel through Mordor, and as his hunger grows he wishes for a supper or breakfast “…by the fire in the old kitchen at Bagshot Row” (Tolkien TLR 638). From this, the readers are able to deduce that a fireplace within a kitchen, representative of security and homeliness, is what Sam remembers of his beloved Shire. A hearth might also symbolise a “form of domestic sun, a

42 Mountains also contain positive imagery and symbolism, but as this mountain is depicted as the source of all the evil
symbol of the home” (Cirlot 142). In the same way that Sam dwells on fond memories of the sunshine and good food in the Shire, so does Pippin when he says that it would have been nine o’clock in the Shire on the morning he arrives in Minas Tirith and the perfect time for “…a nice breakfast by the open window in the spring sunshine” (Tolkien TLR 743). When Sam comes to save Frodo from the Tower of Cirith Ungol, he tries to “…sound as cheerful as he had when he drew back the curtains at Bag’s End on a summer’s morning” (Tolkien TLR 889). Just as Sam longs for the warmth of a fire and the cheerfulness he felt in Bag End, so does Pippin long for the warmth of the spring sun. Both of these characters thus implicitly impress on the readers that the spaces in which they find themselves at a certain moment are not warm, but might be cold and uncomfortable, as both of these spaces are preparing for war and danger. Moreover, both of the pleasing images mentioned above invoke a sense of security and relaxation, which do not correlate with the Hobbits’ current situations and they long for these simple pleasures. Jung (qtd. in Cirlot 142) notes that whenever heat is mentioned, it symbolises maturation, whether biological or spiritual. Both of these characters long back to what they had when they were still unaware of the privileges they enjoyed such as peace, security, joy and very few burdens. They have changed and matured, not only physically, but also psychologically. As they journey home to the Shire, Gandalf tells the Hobbits they have “grown up now. Grown indeed very high; among the great you are” (Tolkien TLR 974).

Frodo carries the burden of the Ring into Mordor. He was also once, just as Pippin, Merry and Sam were, unaware of the dangers that lurked and was quite happy with his home. The nearer they travel to Sauron, the heavier the Ring weighs on Frodo (Tolkien TLR 914). He tells Sam that while he was in the prison of Cirith Ungol he tried to remember “…the Brandywine, and Woody End and The Water running through the mill at Hobbiton. But I can’t see them now” (Tolkien TLR 897). When they see a rim of light over Ephel Dúath, Sam asks Frodo if he does not have “…some hope now?” to which he answers, “…well no, not much Sam […] the Ring is so heavy, Sam. And I begin to see it in my mind all the time, like a great wheel of fire.”(Tolkien TLR 898). Unlike Pippin, Merry and Sam, who treasure the memories of their home as something to look forward to after the War of the Ring, Frodo cannot access his comforting memories of home. He has lost hope of returning home and has no incentive to drive him on except to get rid of the heavy burden he carries, the Ring. After the War of the Ring, as Frodo stands and gazes out from his window in Rivendell, he has the feeling that it is “…time he went back to the Shire”; this with in this dark and gloomy space, the symbolism associated with the mountain is also negative.
feeling of longing for his home is also shared by Sam who tells Frodo “I think we ought to be going soon” (Tolkien *TLR* 964).

All the previous images that the readers might have conjured up of the Shire are of a contented, sun-filled, green and peaceful space. This image is reinforced by the memories of the Hobbits as mentioned, and the previous knowledge that readers have gleaned from the first novel. Hobbiton is, to some extent, isolated from the troubles that are brewing in the rest of Middle Earth with the return of Sauron, and the Hobbits who live there are kept safe at all times by the Rangers who patrol their borders. Tolkien (*TLR* 5) writes that Hobbits were
Map 3: Tolkien’s map of a part of the Shire (Tolkien TLR 20).
“...sheltered, but they ceased to remember” that they were only sheltered because of this protection. On this subject Foster (369) also mentions that “...the Hobbits of the Shire managed to ignore the outside world for so long that they almost forgot it existed”. It may thus be deduced that within the novel, The Lord of the Rings, Hobbiton was in a way, a sort of limbo. This space is isolated from the rest of Middle Earth so that the inhabitants are unaware of the threatening danger approaching them. It is also a space forgotten by the other parties; be they the alliance of free people, Saruman or Sauron (Tolkien TLR 47). Gandalf tells Butterbur that they “...have been on the edge of very great troubles, and I am only glad to hear that you have not been deeper in” (Tolkien TLR 971), a foreshadowing that all might also not be as peaceful as the company left it.

After the war, the Hobbits, accompanied by Gandalf, leave for Hobbiton and they are “...eager now to see the Shire again” (Tolkien TLR 967). On their journey, they often linger in “...the fair woodlands where the leaves were red and yellow in the autumn sun.” (Tolkien TLR 967). Already the readers are made more aware of the colours that have changed from black in Mordor, white in Minas Tirith, to yellow and red in the Shire. de Jacobi (qtd. in Cirlot 53) suggests that yellow is the colour of “the far-seeing sun, which appears bringing light into the darkness” while the colour red is associated with pulsing blood and fire, with “...surging and tearing emotions”. The darkness has gone and the sun is now shining on the company as they journey on. Although the yellow might symbolise that the sun is indeed shining again and that light and happiness are present, the red reminds them of what has passed and that these memories, no matter how terrible they might seem, have played a part in their lives and have shaped them into the characters that they have become, at the conclusion of the novel.

However, their light-heartedness does not last long. The information accumulated by readers, throughout all three novels, formed a wholesome image of the Shire and Hobbiton, but the destruction the Hobbits encounter also shocks the readers even more because the images do not correlate with the previous impressions. As they come to the South gate of Bree the sky darkens and the wind blows the rain vigorously (Tolkien TLR 967-968). The characters that they encounter all appear frightened and Mr Butterbur43 tells Nob that he “...shouldn’t go scaring” him in such a manner, “...with times as they are”

43 Mr Butterbur is the owner of The Prancing Pony Inn in Bree.
Chapter 3: Space in the Novel, The Return of the King

(Tolkien TLR 968). Already a sense of suspense is created for the readers, with the atmosphere being different from what is expected, as well as the distant interaction between the characters. Pippin tells Mr Butterbur that they thought they had “...left all trouble behind”, yet it seems from what Mr Butterbur tells them that “newcomers and gangrels” have arrived who brought fights and death, and even now the folks bar their windows and doors (Tolkien TLR 970). As they come to the Brandywine, they discover that the way is barred and very “un-Shirelike” ill-lit, gloomy houses have been built there. They also discover that Lotho Baggins is now called “the Chief” and lives up in Bag End, from where he gives orders to the other Hobbits (Tolkien TLR 975). Sam accurately sums up the difference in the Shire they left behind and the Shire they are beginning to uncover when he says that there is “...no welcome, no beer, no smoke, and a lot of rules and orc-talk instead. I hoped to have a rest, but I can see there’s work and trouble ahead.” (Tolkien TLR 977).

As they come to the Shire, the land looks “…rather sad and forlon” and there seems an “…unusual amount of burning going on, and smoke rose from many points around about” (Tolkien TLR 977). As the company approach Frogmorton they are arrested, but they ignore the warning and they laugh and carry on as before. They are told that the Chief has many men and spies, and all folk who do not abide by his new rules are thrown into the Lockholes. Unbothered by concerns about the Chief or any of his wishes, the company travels further to Bag End. At Bywater, Frodo and Sam’s own country, they experience their “…first really painful shock”: many of the houses that they have known are missing and some have even been burned down, some Hobbit-holes are deserted and the little gardens are rank with weeds. The avenue of trees along the Hobbiton road is gone and ugly new houses stand there now. As they look up towards Bag End, they see in dismay a tall brick chimney puffing out black smoke (Tolkien TLR 981). All of the Hobbits are deeply pained by the state of their beloved home and Sam even bursts into tears when he sees the Party Field (Tolkien TLR 993). Ironically, the Shire is beginning to acquire the same appearance as Mordor.

Pippin mentions to them that he would never have thought it necessary “…to fight half-orcs and ruffians in the Shire itself”, so much has changed in their once beloved Shire, and evil has also stretched its claws here (Tolkien TLR 983). Another hint is given to the readers as to the attitude of the Hobbits they encounter and their changes attitudes when
Frodo warns the others that there will be “….no slaying of Hobbits […] no Hobbit has ever killed another on purpose in the Shire, and it is not to begin now.” (Tolkien TLR 983). They only mean to “….raise the Shire” and “….clear out the ruffians”, to drive out the filth that has also poisoned their homeland (Tolkien TLR 984). The Hobbits who were filled with fear now take up arms to save their home, to fight and do all that is necessary to restore that which has been taken from them. At the Battle of Bywater, the Hobbits slay nearly seventy of the ruffians and nineteen Hobbits are killed. They are buried together in a grave on the hill-side, “….where later a great stone was set up with a garden about it”; this was the only battle in the Shire (Tolkien TLR 992).

As they walk up to Bag End it is “one of the saddest hours in their lives” (Tolkien TLR 993). The ruffians “….cut down trees and let ‘em lie, they burn houses and build no more”; even Bag Shot row has been dug up (Tolkien TLR 988-989). Sandyman’s mill has been knocked down and replaced with an even bigger one filled with “….wheels and outlandish contraptions”, there is no more peace in Hobbiton. Along with the strange contraptions that came to the Shire, the water is also fouled as they pour their filth into it. (Tolkien TLR 990). The stream is filled with “….steaming and stinking outflow”, the chestnut trees are gone, tarred sheds replace the Old Grange, the banks and hedges are broken and all the grass has been replaced by sand and gravel (Tolkien TLR 993). “They’ve cut down the Party Tree”, which lay withered in the field. This devastation is the “final straw” for the company (Tolkien TLR 993). As Merry blows his silver horn, Hobbits come pouring out of their holes with “cheers and loud cries” as they follow the company up the hill to Bag End. Bag End’s garden is full of huts and sheds and there are “…piles of refuse everywhere”. The once beautiful green round door is scarred and the bell-chain hangs loose, unable to ring. The inside is in disorder, filthy and filled with a stench. Sam tells his friends that this is much worse than Mordor as it “….comes home to you […] because it is home, and you remember it before it was all ruined” (Tolkien TLR 994). Saruman and Wormtongue (Grima) have come to Hobbiton to destroy it, just as their home was destroyed by the Fellowship. Saruman assures the Hobbits that even long after he is gone, they will not be able to undo that which he has done (Tolkien TLR 996). Saruman has severely damaged not only the psyche of the people of the Shire, but also physically (in some cases); he destroyed their agriculture and damaged the ecology almost to the brink of extinction.
After the death of Saruman and Wormtongue, the Hobbits begin to clear up the Shire. The others are willing to work and there are many hands to help. “One of the first things done in Hobbiton, before even the removal of the new mill” is the clearing of the Hill and Bag End and the “…restoration of Bagshot row” (Tolkien TLR 999). The large sand-pits are levelled and transformed into beautiful gardens once again. The Hobbits have broken down every brick building in the Shire and used the bricks to repair many of the broken holes. Sam, with the help of Lady Galadriel’s gift, goes around the Shire and plants seeds where the most beautiful of trees have stood, as well as in the Party Field. In the summer the trees begin to “sprout and grow” and the new party tree is a beautiful sapling with a silver bark, with long leaves and golden flowers; a mallorn tree and the wonder of the neighbourhood (Tolkien TLR 1000). All of the stolen food is discovered and there is much joy in the Shire as all of the Hobbits have enough food again (Tolkien TLR 999). The Shire has been restored, there is “…sunshine and delicious rain […] an air of richness and growth, and a gleam of beauty beyond that of mortal summer”; the children born after these events are strong and beautiful, the fruit is plentiful, the grass green and no illness has occurred. Everyone is pleased to live in the Shire again. No one could express this better than Old Gaffer who often says, “…all’s well as ends better” (Tolkien TLR 999).

Not all of the company returned to Hobbiton in The Return of the King. Legolas and Gimli never visited the Shire (Tolkien TLR 959). While it is not stated whether Aragorn, as Strider, ever entered the Shire while he and the rest of the Rangers guarded it, after his coronation Aragorn issued a decree that no “big person” should enter the Shire, and he also kept to it, and never entered (Tolkien TLR 1019). The rest of the company however are more than comfortable in the quiet and peaceful village. Gandalf was an old visitor to Hobbiton, as he came to visit the Hobbits, in particular Bilbo and Frodo, often throughout this novel as well as in The Hobbit. He was one of the only normal sized people to take notice of the Hobbits and he was indeed the only Wizard to mingle with them. It is through Gandalf that Bilbo first sets out on his adventure in The Hobbit, where he comes across the One Ring (Tolkien TLR 10). Gandalf takes the responsibility of keeping an eye on Frodo after Bilbo has gone, since he is most certainly the first character to understand and know the value and future of the Ring, and of Frodo’s part to play in the fate of Middle Earth (Tolkien TLR 32). Throughout the trilogy, Gandalf assists with advice and he even dies protecting them against the Balrog, and is resurrected to finish his task as Gandalf the White. It is clear though, that in Hobbiton he can rest, smoke his pipe and entertain people with his fireworks (Tolkien TLR 24-25). However, Gandalf does not enter the Shire again after the War of the Ring. He explains to Frodo, Merry, Pippin and Sam that his time
is past and that it is no longer his “…task to set things to rights, nor to help folk to do so.” (Tolkien TLR 974). Gandalf’s part within the space of the Shire was to encourage others to do that which had already been set out for them to do by the fate of the Valar. After the War of the Ring, his purpose has been fulfilled as all has been achieved and the Shire and the Hobbits have played their part, with some help from Gandalf.

In The Fellowship of the Ring, as the reader already knows, it is clear that Merry, Pippin, Sam and Frodo are all content with their lives in the Shire, naively unaware of the dangers that lurk outside their borders. In the beginning of the novel, Sam seems a quiet kind of subservient character, barely noticeable (Tolkien TLR 62-63). However, after their travels to Rivendell, Mordor and Minas Tirith, Sam comes back to Hobbiton as a warrior, someone who has discovered his courage and also becomes a co-hero along with Frodo, within the story. It is clear within the novel, that anyone can become a hero, and heroes as often created by social interaction, the helping of each other to succeed. The same is true for Merry and Pippin: they were always in trouble, but on their return, both of them have served two great cities, Rohan and Gondor, having grown up and come to the realisation that life is not always about being flippant. They are heroes in their own right. Merry and Pippin have encountered Uruks, Orcs, Ents, valiant Rohirrim and many other characters, all of which have contributed to their development, in the same way as Sam and Frodo’s lives were changed by those they met. All of these characters were meant to meet each other. Frodo is the only one of the Hobbits, who leaves the Shire with the intent to save it, but returns with a feeling of no longer finding his meaning in Hobbiton as he might feel drained by the struggle he went through. Frodo reminds Sam that he tried to save the Shire, and he has done so, but not for himself (Tolkien TLR 1006). Frodo is scarred by his experiences; not only his travels through Middle Earth and his encounters with Gollum, but also by the weight and burden that the Ring has left on him. As told in The Fellowship of the Ring, he was critically wounded on Weathertop by a Morgul Blade, and it is a wound that never truly heals. He however recovers in some degree and starts writing in the book that Bilbo left him and finds new meaning in his life.

Agriculture and the natural environment as described in the novel (The Fellowship of the Ring) clearly state that Hobbiton is a symbol of fertility. There is growth and the characters living there exist in close association with nature. As mentioned earlier in this chapter Sam is a gardener and it is made clear that from Bag End, a garden can be seen with flowers.
Each flower has a specific meaning, but since the names of the flowers are not specifically mentioned, only the meaning of flowers in general is given. Flowers symbolise beauty and the transitoriness of Spring (Cirlot 109). It is thus not difficult to see why the village has been unaware of what goes on outside of it: the inhabitants are peaceful and mind their own business; the landscape is welcoming, friendly and they are always as cheerful as the Spring. As the flowers also symbolise transition, it might foretell the transition that all four of the Hobbits undergo through their journey, to finally come into full bloom as grown and “among the great” (Tolkien TLR 974).

A very important element in Hobbiton is the old Party Tree. It is in the centre of the town and it is also the place where all the Hobbiton Hobbits gather for festivities. A tree symbolises immortality, inexhaustible life, growth, proliferation and the centre of the world (Cirlot 347). The Party Tree represents the centre of the Hobbits world; it is where they meet, where they all share each other’s happiness and feast together. The Party Tree therefore symbolises the unity of the people and of a race. After the War of the Ring, the Hobbits return home only to find the war has now come to them. While they were fighting the great battle against Sauron, Saruman and Grima have taken over the village and the Party Tree has been chopped down, left lying dead in the field (Tolkien TLR 993). The tidiness and liveliness of Hobbiton and its inhabitants have been destroyed and thrown away; the once fertile space has become polluted by Saruman’s evil and his machinery. It is only after Saruman’s defeat that a new Party Tree is planted by Sam and the symbolism of growth and regeneration associated with trees finally becomes visible. Just as the new tree saplings have brought new life to the Shire, so has the restoration of the town after the destruction by Saruman created a new and even better Hobbiton. Lady Galadriel tells Sam that the “…Shire shall now be more than ever blessed and beloved” (Tolkien TLR 1005). Flowers and trees together also symbolise “…longevity and fertility” (Cirlot 350). The Shire and Hobbiton are spaces of fertility, since the space is represented as agricultural, filled with green grass over rolling hills, a multitude of flowers and trees. The longevity of the symbol of flowers and trees is personified in the Hobbits themselves as they tend to age quite well and grow very old. Bilbo for example celebrated his 131st birthday before they took the ship across the seas from the Grey Havens (Tolkien TLR 1003).
The town is at the foot of, or under the Hill. Bag End is a hole, dug into this Hill (Foster 31). They are the only inhabitants of Middle Earth that inhabit Smials. A hole has two distinct meanings: the first is one of fertility and fertilising power, which relates to the agricultural aspect mentioned above. The second is that of the opening from this world to another (Cirlot 149). This symbolic meaning of a door opening into another world fits perfectly with Hobbiton and the Smials in which the Hobbits live, because it is through these holes in their homes, their doors, that the Hobbits, and especially then Frodo, start their adventure. Frodo has to step over the boundaries of his comfortable home; through his door into the world to experience something new. They have lived safe and secluded lives in Hobbiton but all this changes as soon as they cross their doorsteps and the borders of their little region, the Shire. A hole is in some way also a cave. The cave or cavern often appears in “…emblematic and mythological iconography as the meeting-place for figures of deities, forebears and archetypes” (Cirlot 30). This symbolism may be observed in the arrival of Gandalf, a visitor to the home of Frodo and Bilbo on multiple occasions. A cave contributes to the meaning found in the houses of the Hobbits, by attributing a symbolic meaning of containment and concealment, it also translates to the heart being a “spiritual centre” (Cirlot 40). A person’s home is where their heart is, so the saying goes. The cave is further also associated with the womb, a safe environment, where the inhabitants may rest easily (Cirlot 40).

Doors convey all the symbolic values of a hole, since it is through the door that access is granted either in or out of the hole (Cirlot 85). All the windows are round, as are the doors. The focus in this portion of the dissertation is on Bag End, with specific attention to the doors and windows. Circular objects symbolise completeness and wholeness. They also carry a nuance of unity and the return to unity. The alchemists took this symbol and applied it to destiny: “…now, by virtue of its movement as much as its shape, circular motion carries the further significance of that which brings into being, activates and animates all forces involved in any given process, sweeping them along” (Cirlot 48). These circular doors and windows are a foreshadowing of some of the types of adventures that will be undertaken by Frodo and his friends: the circular form here relates to destiny, as the Ring might have been destined to find Bilbo and Frodo. Through these doors the Hobbits travel into a new world, being pushed into action without being able to stop what will happen. The circle will be completed and they will return home; certain parts of their characters will grow and be born, while others will diminish and die. The cycle will be completed; the journey will start and end at its source, in the same way as the Ring will end at the source of its beginning. Even though the circular motion is completed by the
Hobbits returning to their place of origin, the first impression of Hobbiton is distorted when they return and is only later restored to the first image the readers may have created of this space.

The colour of the round door, the main entrance into Bag End, is green. The colour green symbolises once again the fertility of fields, growth and earthiness, representing the function of sensation, that which is tangible (Cirlot 54, 56). The Shire in itself is a symbol of life, of growth and of unity. Here there was peace and its inhabitants stayed untouched by the War until Saruman and Grima arrived. But that same peace and happiness was also restored, without there being as much damage as could have been caused by an ongoing war of years and years. As noted, Hobbiton is almost some sort of limbo in Middle Earth. The Hobbits were unaware of the dangers of Sauron and the Ring and of the trouble brewing. It is thus important and interesting to note that this is the place where the Ring is hidden, and it stayed here since Bilbo first found it, until the point when Frodo starts his journey to Mordor. It is in Hobbiton that Gandalf finally discovers it and it is from this little, forgotten region and village that the Ring-bearer and his heroic companions originate. Without Hobbiton, and the little people that live there, their braveness and hardiness, there would have been no victory.

### 3.4 CONCLUSION

The Shire, unlike Minas Tirith and Mordor, might not seem significant at first glance, but when the individuals meet and interact in these spaces, their characters’ development is evident in the light of the symbolically loaded spaces in which they develop and Minas Tirith, Mordor and Hobbiton become the main points of focus within the plot.

All three of these spaces are verbally described to the readers from a character’s vantage point, overlooking the spaces, recounting his impressions and experiences. These spaces might be personified and some of the descriptions are metaphorical in nature. In addition, the characters within the spaces and the effect the spaces have on the characters are described to the readers; their emotions and feelings are presented to the latter by various repetitions of certain elements and by emphasis of or focussing on specific elements more prominently than on others. When the readers take all of these descriptions, symbolic
actions and objects into account, whether they be direct or abstract, they are able to form a specific image of the space, not just physically and geographically, but also socially and symbolically. Not only do they find explicit meanings directly illustrated within the novel, but they are also implicitly given signs which the readers must decipher to discover the meaning. The spaces are constructed in the mind of the readers from the smallest concrete details to the largest geographical landscapes, the smallest basic meaning and the larger, all-inclusive meaning. It is through these specific descriptions that the readers come to know the spaces intimately, and through the spaces their inhabitants, their values and world views. The readers create this map within their minds, and these spaces, with all of their characters and different atmospheres, have a captivating effect on the readers.

Hobbiton is important in the novels, because it is the space where everything started, and at the end of the war, the novel ends here. It is a completed circle. Minas Tirith is central since it is the space to which all people of Middle Earth may turn for help and protection, the place where the new King of Gondor will rule over the City that symbolises goodness and life. In direct contrast to Minas Tirith are Mordor and Mount Doom, the origin of the evil that threatens the Shire and the only space that Sauron ever occupies. It is from Mordor that he rules and it is in Mordor that he falls. Mordor is the embodiment of evil, it is dark, filled with fire and brings forth nothing good. These three spaces are also important with regard to the adaptation to film, since most of the last film, *The Return of the King*, takes place in Mordor and Minas Tirith, Hobbiton is also featured in the film, but only at the conclusion. The visual content of these same spaces is evaluated in the film version of the novel, *The Return of the King*, in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 4:  
SPACE IN THE FILM,  
THE RETURN OF THE KING

4.1 INTRODUCTION

In the previous chapter, the focus fell on spaces within the novel and the meaning they convey, consciously and unconsciously, to the mind of the readers. This chapter analyses the same spaces that were discussed in the previous chapter, but the emphasis is placed on the filmic narration of the representation in the film adaptation of Tolkien’s imaginative fantasy world as found in The Return of the King. Film is the general term used to describe a sequence of events recorded by camera and captured in the form of a set of moving images combined with sounds, which is then shown on either a television or at the cinema.

Film is also classified as visual art and may be seen as a type of “Gesamtkunstwerk” (Grodal 168) or a combined work of art, since it is a medium that not only involves visual art, but also incorporates most other art forms such as music, digital art, architecture and acting. According to Grodal (168), “film has aesthetics of its own, linked to the ability to show moving pictures”, fitting perfectly with Lothe’s idea that it is a visual representation of a story (Lothe 11).

The term Adaptation refers to “the representation of a work in another medium” (Elliott 3) or, in terms of filmic representation, Lothe (8) explains that it involves the “transposing of literature to film” which is “…based (more or less directly) on literary texts” (Lothe vii). The process involves choosing literary works suitable for such an adaptation. As discussed in Chapter 2.3, where the theoretical precepts of narrative space served as guidelines for analysis, similar precepts of the representation of narrative space within film theory will be used to analyse specific spaces in a film. The identified spaces have been retained in the
same order, because in the chronological order of events within the film, Minas Tirith is the first major space to be presented to the spectators\textsuperscript{44} and is also the first space in which most of the action takes place. Mordor is the second of the major spaces to be presented, as Frodo and Sam only arrive in it near the end of the film in the scene\textsuperscript{45} where they walk from the Tower of Cirith Ungol over the hill to gaze upon the great plateau, Mount Doom and the Dark Tower with the Eye at its peak. Thus it is chronologically second in the film. The third space, Hobbiton, is only presented at the end of the film when, after the War of the Ring and after Aragorn has been crowned as King, the Hobbits return to their home, the Shire, after thirteen months away - returning to the beginning and completing the cycle of the journey.

4.2 FILM THEORY RELEVANT TO THE ANALYSIS OF NARRATIVE SPACE IN \textit{THE RETURN OF THE KING}

Casetti (xvii) mentions in his introduction to \textit{Inside the Gaze} that the reason for writing his book is that he “…wanted to understand the ways in which a film pre-arranges its receptions and pre-figures its spectators”. Casetti (1) describes these spectators as a “…given [that] functions as a nodal point located at the intersection of numerous complex and diverse paths” (Casetti 1). The spectators are thus the persons who view the film, who take in what is shown and make meaning of that which is shown. Casetti (123) also mentions that “…the spectators’ actions directly define – the truth of a text”; since the spectators are not passive in their reception of a film, it is also important to mention the spectators’ image formation within cognitive film theory\textsuperscript{46}. According to Caroll (200), cognitive theory is not yet “a unified theory”; it includes and refers to theories not only from literature and linguistics, but also from other fields of study, including psychology and anthropology. Therefore, one of the approaches to cognitive theory, as it will be used in this analysis, focuses on the general cognitive processes of the human brain when viewing a film, human interaction with film and the way that humans perceive and make sense of that which they perceive. This chapter concentrates on cognitive film theory from

\textsuperscript{44} For the film theory in this chapter the term “spectators” is used instead of the term “viewers”, as this is the term most commonly used by theorists mentioned within this chapter. In addition, the plural form of the word is used in order to signify that the spectator is not only the researcher, but also the implied spectators of the film.

\textsuperscript{45} The term scene refers to the “unit of narrative” described by Metz (qtd. in Newman and Herman 513) as “a segment of film narrative occurring in a single space and in continuous time”; whereas mise-en-scène and screen capture refer to the frame shot used to discuss the detail within a scene.

\textsuperscript{46} This dissertation is not an intensive study into cognitive film theory, which is why the existing theories of Casetti, Buckland and Bordwell and Thompson have been chosen as the basis for the analysis.
a literary, narrative and filmic angle; the views used are those based on theory by Buckland, Casetti and the recent works of Bordwell and Thompson. Buckland remarks that cognitive film theory “…develops a more informed understanding […] of film’s underlying structure, together with the way spectators comprehend films” (Buckland 3). Bordwell explains that it makes sense to him that the “storytelling” within a film does not work unless the spectators experience something; they have to experience and connect, they have to make assumptions, draw conclusions from certain cues within the film, notice certain things and make judgments about the events enacted on screen (Bordwell “Observations on Film Art”). Usually, when viewing a film, the spectators firstly connect with and experience something emotional concerning the film, and secondly, often only after connecting emotionally, will they be able to understand and comprehend the events depicted within the film.

By actively urging the spectators of a film to reach these conclusions and constantly think about or interpret everything taking place on the screen, the film emphasises “…the mind’s role in actively building up structures of meaning on the basis of incomplete or ambiguous information.” (Bordwell “Observations on Film Art”). Spectators are constantly urged to build on that which the film has begun and are expected to fill in the missing pieces, completing the message and meaning to fit into their lives and to suit their situations. Metz (xv) mentions in his introduction to Inside the Gaze that “films inspire to think”. Consequently, cognitive film theory is concerned with why and how the above-mentioned processes work within the spectators’ minds. This also includes why the same film might cause different reactions in different spectators, but at the same time evoke a similar feeling or emotion at a certain point from all the spectators present. Bordwell again notes that film narratives “…streamline their real-world components [to] invite us to fill in what is left unshown and unsaid. What outline drawings are to the eye, narratives are to the mind” (Bordwell “Common Sense + Film Theory”). In this article, Bordwell also mentions that cognitive film theory places more emphasis on the explanation of a film, rather than its interpretation. This explanation may be offered causally by saying what caused what to happen in a film or it might be furnished by explaining the purpose that something specific fulfilled, which would then be called a functional explanation.
When explanations and analyses carried out on a film use cognitive theory, this is done bearing in mind that there are spectators of different genders, ages, races, environments and backgrounds. Still, as in the case of The Lord of the Rings, the film appeals to many spectators from all corners and spectrums, and it has gathered a “cult following” (Mancing 403). For the spectators to make sense of a film, they have to relate the events, spaces, time, characters and emotions to their real-life knowledge of social interaction and relationships in much the same way as they did with the novel. As Bordwell (“Observations on Film Art”) describes it, most cognitivists “…hold to the post-Chomskyan view of learning as the unfolding and refinement of innate predispositions and mental structures”. Zettl (6) claims that “…in our habitual ways of seeing we generally select information that agrees with how we want to see the world, and we screen out almost everything that might interfere with our constructs”. Because we, as spectators, have to make sense of the film and gather meaning from what we see, we will take cues from the film and the way that certain scenes are constructed to convey a specific meaning. Spatial cues tend to be the most reliable to the spectators, since they are the only physically visible cues.

To address the issue of the significance of spatial representation within the film, landscape, when viewed in a geographical sense, portrays a specific topography which the spectators can recognise by means of certain markers. Lukinbeal (68) explains that once a story takes place in this mentioned landscape, it “…transforms place [the landscape] into narrative space”. When a film is dominated by spaces which are defined by the events that take place in them, LeHéron (qtd. in Carl 32) calls these films “landscape-dominated films”. The Lord of the Rings, and specifically The Return of the King, embodies an excellent example of such films. The landscapes are not merely a backdrop to the events taking place in the film, but they each become like individually identified characters that also change and interact with other characters. Spaces in films, and in texts, are some of the best metaphors through which the author, or in the case of the films, the director, “…can appropriate ideology and meaning” (Lukinbeal 69). It is the way that spaces are depicted and portrayed within a film which allows the story and the characters within it to develop and come to realise the truth about themselves and discover their purpose as to the quest at hand. As a film conveys to its spectators some specific message, therefore it (the film) has to guide them along the path to discover this message; guidance which comes in the form of the filmic techniques used within the film. The message of a film might change a spectator’s perspective on a subject or enhance
the already present views. Gianetti (xi) argues, “...we spend a lot of time watching moving images [...] uncritically, passively, allowing them to wash over us, rarely analysing how they work on us, how they can shape our values”.

The Lord of the Rings film trilogy, as is well known, is based on the novels by the same titles written by author J.R.R. Tolkien. Sibley (23) notes that the films stuck “slavishly” to “Tolkien’s word”; this will be discussed further in Chapter 5. The films were directed by Peter Jackson and distributed by the producers, New Line Cinema. The filming of these three films took eight years, since the films were shot simultaneously in the director’s home country of New Zealand (Sibley 31). The Fellowship of the Ring was released in 2001, The Two Towers in 2002 and the last, The Return of the King, was released in 2003. Each of the films has a special extended edition that was released a year after the films first appeared in theatres. These special, extended edition DVDs are used for the analysis of the filmic adaptation of The Return of the King.

Film has the function or objective of narrating a story to its spectators, not in the written word as in text, but “…its narrative mode is showing”, says Bal (44). For the film to “show” the spectators, and to make them aware of its message, it needs to make use of film techniques. The first aspect of a film that attracts any spectator’s attention is the general description, which includes the title and the genre of the film. The title of the film, The Return of the King, explicitly states that this part of the narrative is concerned with the return of a specific king who has been absent or unavailable or has been travelling for some time and is only now, in the time of this film, returning home or to the place where he is supposed to be. Yet, the title alone does not explain who the king is, or where he has returned to or from. When considering the genre and style of the film, both may be categorised as fantasy, as the theme and subject of the film are concerned with fantasy and the mode of filming used is also fantasy. However, the intention could also be to enlarge the field of connotations so that “the King” could refer to a specific king, or might even encompass the Biblical perception of the coming of the King.

---

47 The term “aspects” is used within this dissertation not only as Mieke Bal uses the term, but also as a term describing certain elements of something.
48 As explained in Chapter 2.2.
The genre of *The Return of the King* is not only fantasy, because the film may also be described as an adventure film. Both adventure and fantasy films are in some or other way rooted in reality. However, the mode of representation may be described as fantasy, because it depicts an alternate world. “[T]he fiction film shows us an illusory real world that resembles to the point of confusion the world we know ourselves” (Lothe 11): a world alien from our own world inhabited by unreal people whose ideas and actions relate to our own world, although they are depicted as Elves, Dragons and Orcs. Still, this world seems real, reliable in some aspects and the spectators are able to relate to it. Major (qtd. in Sibley 47) explains that there is a constant need for these spaces, “…however fantastic to look real: audiences need to be helped toward suspending disbelief. We have to enable them to believe that a Hobbit or a Balrog might actually exist”. Their world represents a different reality, a dimension that may be distinguished from our own.

The techniques used in a film are important, because they are the key markers that attribute certain characteristics to a space and depict the character within the space. Within the written text, these characteristics would be seen as the descriptive words used by a writer to convey information to the readers. Zettl (13-14) calls these devices, which include light, colour, space, time and sound, the “…method of presenting applied media aesthetics”, and argues that these are considered “…the essential prerequisite to the proper shaping of ideas into messages”. The film techniques that are discussed in this chapter only consider techniques that have a direct influence on the creation of space and are concerned with space. For the spectators to clarify and interpret the events in film, these techniques have to guide the spectator’s gaze and they might also be aware of them, which would enhance their experience of the film. Casetti (45) indicates that “…the look into the camera […] enables us to inquire into how a film defines its own parameters, puts these parameters in perspective, and makes them a space accessible to the viewer”. Therefore, by looking into a film, the spectators can experience and understand the spaces as well as the characters within the film, which defines the term “aspects” with regard to the film. The list of aspects is deduced from Casetti (*Inside the Gaze*), Gianetti (*Understanding Movies*) and the more technically descriptive Zettl (*Sight, Sound, Motion: Applied Media Aesthetics*).

---

49 Within the literary world, there is a dispute as to whether fantasy may be referred to as a genre or a mode. Within this chapter, fantasy is used as a genre, as it is described and explained in Chapter 2.2 of this dissertation.
The first means of identifying a film is the genre and style. The aspects used to create space within a film and which is discussed, include image as created by camera shots, camera angles, camera movement and focus. Lighting and colour, sound, or the sound track, consisting of dialogue, music and sound effects also contribute to the representation of space. The above mentioned list constitutes this researcher’s understanding of techniques or devices. The other techniques that contribute to the creation of space are set design, costume design, make-up and finally, world view. These techniques may be regarded as the most important of the film techniques used and they fulfil an integral part of the analysis of space in *The Return of the King*. The theme of a film is not in its technique, but the interaction between the different techniques and narrative creates the theme.

The first important aspect that contributes to the creation of space is the image, with regard to camera shots. There are different kinds of camera shots that may be used within a film and even within a single frame. Each of these shots creates a certain effect as the director, and the editor, insert or manipulate them in order to create these effects. To determine what kind of shot has been used within a film, it is important to note, “…the shots are defined by the amount of subject matter that’s included within the frame of the screen” (Gianetti 11). Zettl (145) explains that an extreme long shot is normally used to show the complete landscape and to create a feeling of desolation, isolation and alienation. Through an extreme long shot, the complete landscape can be shown to the spectators at once. Although a long shot is, to a certain extent, similar to the extreme long shot, it zooms in more, so less of the landscape is visible (Zettl 145). Medium shots, according to Zettl, are shots taken to represent the character or object in the frame as visible to the spectators from the knees or from the waist up. These medium shots can be taken outside or inside a building and are normally used when a neutral type of information is to be given to the spectators (Zettl 145). Close-up shots are shots taken from the shoulder up, or only of part of the face (extreme close-up shots). Close-up shots are normally used to involve the spectators emotionally with the character, since the character’s expression is more visible in these shots and they seem closer to the spectators (Zettl 145).
The next important technique is the angle of the shots. The angle of a shot depends on the juxtaposition of the camera with regard to the object being filmed. As Gianetti observes, “…the angle from which an object is photographed can often serve as an authorial commentary on the subject matter. If the angle is slight, it can serve as a subtle form of emotional colouration. If the angle is extreme, it can present the major meaning of an image” (Gianetti 13). It is considered a normal camera angle when the camera is at eye level to the person being filmed, while low-angle shots are created when the camera is at a low angle to the objects, even as low as the floor or ground level (Zettl 146). When something or someone is being filmed from below, it normally makes the person or object look more imposing and impressive, which attributes additional significance to the person and gives the spectators the impression that they are important and have a higher rank in the specific social hierarchy, such as Aragorn in the coronation scene (Zettl 191). Over-the-shoulder shots, such as Aragorn and Legolas’ greeting after the coronation, are taken over the shoulder of the character and they are used to show two or more characters that are each other’s equals within a certain frame of the film; they are all on the same level when filmed at this angle (Zettl 196-197). High angle shots, aerial shots and helicopter shots are the last type of filming mentioned. High angle shots are shots that are higher than the object, as they are taken from above, normally to show a landscape (Zettl 191-192). Aerial and helicopter shots are used to give the spectators a “bird’s-eye-view” by showing landscapes from above; for example, a river or a great mountain – several scenes are depicted in this way in the film. Helicopter shots are additionally used when the terrain that has to be filmed is too difficult to reach by vehicle or on foot (Gianetti 15).

Another important aspect of filming is the movement of the camera during filming and the effects created by certain movements. There are three kinds of movement found in filming: the primary motion of events and characters, the secondary motion, which is the movement of the camera, and the tertiary motion, referring to the sequence motion such as fading out and switching of shots (Zettl 250). During filming, the camera may be completely immobile and only the characters and objects move around within the frame, but the movement that is relevant to the analysis of the filmic spaces is the movement of the camera itself. Panning is the technique used when either the fast or slow swinging motion of the camera is used to create a certain effect. The slow swinging motion engages the spectators to experience the characters in the immediate surrounding space along with the character, whereas the fast swinging motion normally creates a feeling of anxiety and some impending danger. There is also the tilting movement of the camera,
which occurs when the camera rolls around, while a dolly shot is created when the camera is mounted on a track that runs along the edge of the set and films from a distance while constantly, smoothly moving. Such a shot will normally be a battle scene – as the battle on the Pelennor Fields in the film – or a chase, giving the illusion of either the spectators or a character looking at the scene taking place without being directly involved in the scene but gaining a full view of the events (Zettl 253). Follow shots are created when the camera creates the effect of the object or character being followed by the eye of the camera, and thus by the spectators, as this character or object moves away from the spectators (Zettl 252). This movement involves the spectators more closely with the events and the character, while, through following the camera movement, the spectator’s gaze may also be guided to note a certain point of interest (Zettl 252). In *The Return of the King*, follow shots occur multiple times, for example at the end of the film when Frodo is in Bag End and even when the Hobbits enter into the Shire on their horses. Camera movements include the technique of zooming in and out. This effect is achieved when the lenses of the camera either enlarge the scene or it becomes smaller at a very slow pace, causing the image within the frame to either come closer (zooming in) or move away (zooming out) (Zettl 253).

Focus is the action of concentrating specifically on one character or subject, moving the spectator’s gaze and interest to that particular object in a defined space. As Zettl notes, “our mental operating system encourages a considerable perceptual laziness that shields us from an input overload”; thus we all develop habitual ways of seeing and hearing that make us focus on and notice only a small portion of what actually is there” (Zettl 6). Within film, there are roughly five different types of focus. Deep focus makes a large part of a landscape visible in which the focus is on an object that is far away from the spectators. This type of focus is normally used with a long shot, such as the scene where the armies of Rohan are visible on the hill as they come to aid Gondor in the battle of Pelennor Field (Zettl 156). When sharp focus is used, it is done in conjunction with bright lighting to show the character’s emotion on his/her face and is thus used to capture the specific moment (Zettl 156). Blurred focus is used in order to create a feeling of uncertainty and may even be used in a supernatural environment where a feeling of absolute wonder or disbelief must be evoked (Zettl 154-156). Normally, selective focus is used when there are two or more characters in the same scene and the focus shifts from one to the other to emphasise the importance of that character or his or her dialogue at that specific moment (Zettl 155). The focus thus changes from the character speaking to the next character speaking (Zettl 155). An example of selective focus is the scene in Mount Doom where
Frodo and Sam exchange glances before Frodo decides to keep the Ring. Lastly, being out of focus may also be considered a type of focus technique (Zettl 155). For example, in a landscape shot, certain elements may be unimportant: to direct the spectator’s focus to that which is important, certain elements will be kept out of focus. This technique indicates that such elements do not carry any value towards the specific scene at that moment; this might also be the case when an important character is in the front and the unimportant background is rendered out of focus to prevent it from distracting any of the spectator’s attention (Zettl 155).

Composition is another aspect that plays an important role in the creation of space within a film, together with shots and focus. However, as with most of the mentioned aspects, the composition is not consciously registered in the mind of the spectators; it can be described in terms of three distinct lines formed by the camera in movement: horizontal, vertical and diagonal lines (Zettl 89). Horizontal lines create a feeling of peacefulness, calmness and a relaxed atmosphere (Zettl 89), whereas diagonal lines create an atmosphere of uncertainty and even of danger (Zettl 91); while vertical lines indicate the hierarchy of characters within a frame, making the one more imposing and important than the other, such lines are also more “dynamic, powerful and exciting” (Zettl 89). Vertical lines are also used, when for example a road over a high pass is to be taken by the character, and by this means, the spectators immediately identify with the character, because this view also shows the spectators how impossible this task really is, such as Frodo and Sam’s ascent of Mount Doom. A shot with diagonal lines might be used in a battle or even depicting an accident to create a feeling of uncertainty to emotionally involve the spectators. When a character moves from one side to the other, diagonal lines are formed; these are also used to show progression of the event within the landscape (Zettl 91).

Lighting plays an integral part in the creation of meaning as well as atmosphere in a scene by the “…deliberate manipulation of light and shadow for specific communication purposes” (Zettl 17). Lighting is able to be manipulated to create any atmosphere needed by the specific space; such as emphasising some parts of a scene by using different lighting techniques. Through lighting, the spectator’s eye is directed to focus on some important aspect that the film wants to highlight. Lighting, according to Zettl, “is the key ingredient of visual perception and orients us in space and time. It also affects our
emotions" (Zettl 17). Natural lighting is normally used with outside shots, to show the natural landscape and to keep colours as natural as possible (Zettl 26). Shots taken inside of buildings, such as scenes in a kitchen or in a room, are normally shot with studio lighting. Lighting may also be made either bright or dark. Bright lighting will cause all areas in the scene to be equally lit and there will be very few or no shadows, such as in Minas Tirith, whereas dimmer lighting will be the opposite, as in the case of Mordor. Brighter and dimmer lighting also contribute towards the creation of symbolic atmosphere (Gianetti 18).

The aspect of lighting cannot be appreciated separately from the aspect of colour, because colour may only be seen when light is present. Gianetti (25) notes that colour seems to be a subconscious element of film taken in passively by the spectators. Colour can also contribute to emotional intensity and may be symbolic in films (Gianetti 25). Colour not only attributes meaning to the visual awareness of the spectators, but also to the atmosphere and the emotional connotation that the spectators attribute to certain objects and characters within the film; it “helps us organize our environment” (Zettl 47). Natural colours are mostly used when the scene is neutral and there is no necessity to emphasise something specifically, or it might be used in natural scenes with the intent to emphasise the naturalness of the scene of, for example, the Shire. Colour may also be used to attribute symbolic meaning to certain aspects since it seems “to influence our perceptions and emotions in fairly specific ways” (Zettl 57), such as the colour white used in costumes in order to symbolise pureness, life and good in the character wearing the white robes, or green pastures symbolising fertility and life. It is, however, very important to take into account that an analysis of colour, as symbolic, must be undertaken in the context of the specific scene. For example, the colour red may symbolise love or war, depending on the context. In the same way that certain colours have certain symbolic values attributed to them, the aspect of colour contrast is also symbolic. Colour usually indicates the different values and norms of the characters to which these contrasting colours are attributed, consequently contributing to the space within which the characters find themselves. The colour within a particular space has a supportive role in the events taking place within that space and the characters that are associated with the specific space; this role may either be psychological or symbolic.
Another important aspect in the use of colour is saturation and de-saturation. According to Zettl (68), saturation indicates bright, strong, saturated colours and is more suitable to lively and energetic scenes such as chases, while desaturated colours, namely unsaturated and dull colours, are used in emotionally loaded scenes, such as the depiction of a dying character or in a love scene. From these definitions, the assumption might be made that saturated colours are used to place emphasis on happy, homely and energetic scenes, whereas desaturated colours are used to focus on the more depressing or tense scenes. Saturated colours are also usually associated with positive and happy emotions, whereas desaturated colours tend to be better suited for negative or sad emotions. Gianetti (25) states that colour “…tends to be a subconscious element in film. It is strongly emotional in its appeal, expressive and atmospheric rather than intellectual […] most people […] tend to accept colour passively, permitting it to suggest mood rather than objects”.

Sound is also a very important aspect used in film. The term *sound track* is used to define the three aspects that make up the sound in a film - dialogue, music and sound effects (Zettl 307). The dialogue or script consists of the spoken words between characters (Zettl 314). Not only does the script contain the dialogue, but it also includes the scene text which consists of “…scene headings, character and scene descriptions” and might also optionally include detail such as technical cues in the form of camera movements (Sternberg 520). The script is the key element that keeps the events within the film moving and to some extent explains the events, giving information to the spectators, whether the information is with regard to something that happened in the film, or “behind the scenes” as a sort of history or retrospective account to the events within the film. Usually, music creates a certain type of atmosphere: for example, an upbeat, fast tempo kind of music might cause the spectators to feel anxious and expect danger, such as during the siege of Gondor, whereas a soft, melodic type of music might calm the spectators down and cause a relaxed and harmonious atmosphere. The effect that the music has on the spectators will depend on the type of reaction the film and the specific space needs to achieve to carry over a specific meaning and the music might be used to manipulate the spectators into experiencing a specific emotion or reaction. Certain songs or types of music form a link or an association with certain characters, events or spaces (Zettl 317) within a film. For example, a sound may be used to introduce a specific space.

---

50 Gianetti uses American spelling in his book, *Understanding Movies*; the dissertation however uses British English and
and change ever so slightly in rhythm or tempo, to create a different atmosphere in the same space. Sound within a film not only consists of dialogue and music, but may take the form of sound effects: the extra sounds added to a scene to create a feeling of authenticity, such as the sound of two swords clashing against each other during a battle, or the sound of approaching footsteps. Zettl (311) explains that there are literal and nonliteral sounds. Literal sounds “…are referential, which means they convey a specific literal meaning”, whereas nonliteral sounds are sounds that do not refer to something specific and do not “…evoke a visual image of the sound-producing source”. Specific sounds might also “…reveal and define the location of an event, its spatial environment, and off-screen space” (Zettl 317). All of these sounds, whether it is the dialogue that helps to narrate the story, or music and sound effects that contribute to the creation of specific meanings within specific scenes, contribute to the creation of meaning and capture the involvement of the spectators. Through sound, spectators are more closely engaged with the character and the events taking place within a specific space during the film.

To make the film credible, it needs to be presented on the appropriate set. A set will thus be the area within which a certain scene will be shot. This might be a real landscape, as is the case with scenes shot for a battle; or to create a setting within a film; or it might be a specially designed and built set within a building, such as a throne room or a great hall. For such sets to seem real and credible to the spectators, décor such as curtains and furniture has to be added. Within these sets smaller objects, called props, are also needed to allow interaction with the characters and to create a feeling of authenticity and for example “homeliness”, hostility or alienation. Props include objects such as books, potted plants and cutlery.

As part of a successful film, the actors also have to become the characters they are representing, partially achieved by dressing in the appropriate clothes associated with a character or the costume, which plays an important part in the authenticity and credibility of the film. Gianetti (324) notes that costume and make-up are not simply to enhance illusions, but also “…aspects of character and theme” that may reveal class, self-image and “…even psychological states”. This impression is achieved by adapting the costume design of characters to suit a certain time context, such as the fourteenth century, and is
used as a means of assessing or describing a character, to determine his or her gender, age, social and economic class. Usually the costume also portrays the character’s personality and/or moral values. For example, a thief would wear a dark hooded cloak to stay invisible and to symbolise a darker side of his values. However, costumes do not only represent the individual bodies to which they are fitted, but might be “…reflective of social groupings and the negotiations which take place between ‘the self’ and the environment” (Street 83). Thus it may be assumed that the costume of a character also adds meaning to the space in which they are and that there might be interaction between the two; for example, the Elves through their clothing portray not only the individual, but also the race and also the characteristics of their race. Street (4) mentions that costume in film has the ability “…to support or transcend the demands of film narrative” and, contributing to this, Gains, (qtd. in Street 5), suggests that costume serves the narrative and relates “…to the demand of the plot and story” but it may also be used to express a character’s emotional core. Not only does the costume serve to enhance the character, the space and the plot, but it may also convey symbolic meanings (Street 6). Costume thus contributes to the space in a film by presenting the spectators with characters dressed in specific costumes to associate with certain social or geographical spaces, thereby adding to the symbolism within the space. Street (7) mentions that it is important to “…recognise that film costumes not only relate to the characters who wear them, but also to the audiences who watch them”. By taking into account the spectators, it may be assumed that costumes have the “…potential to extend a film’s national origin” by also relating not only to its own identity and culture, but also to that of the international spectators': thus expanding the film’s “…sense of place and space”, as well as crossing borders of time, the time in which the film is portrayed as well as the time in which the film is made (Street 12).

Make-up is additionally considered an important part of the film, because it is used on most characters to enhance their features and make them more “visible” on screen. However, make-up can also be used for special effects. A good example of the effectiveness of make-up would be the aging of a character, from a young man to an old man within the time span of one film and this will also be further enhanced by the space also aging or changing along with the character. Not only can a character be aged, but the film crew can also make use of make-up to create the illusion that a character is younger or suddenly has a change of appearance such as a scar, differently coloured hair or the loss of an eye. These illusions and effects created by make-up are the direct effect of the space on the character, as the character is influenced or affected by his or her surroundings. Make-up thus also contributes to the creation of space and the meaning
created within space, by bringing characters to life, by presenting emotions to the spectators, whether by using the make-up to create the illusion of pain and sorrow on the face of a character or by lightening up a character’s face with bright and clear make-up to show love or joy. Make-up is used to create characters who also contribute to the symbolic value represented in a space. For example, a dark scarred face covered in blood, with small protruding yellow eyes and fang-like sharp teeth (Orcs), immediately places the spectators under the impression that whichever place this character finds itself should be associated with evil. In the same way, a character clothed in white or another light fabric, with a clear, perfect complexion and using light and soft make-up, would be associated with a space symbolic of good, happiness and love, such as the Elves.

The last aspects of film theory concerned with the creation of space are the theme and world view of the film. Toker (4) states that not only is a theme the “…semantic field that accommodates multiple recurrent motifs” but also the “…latent statement that may be regarded as the organizing principle” of the text. According to Pyrhönen (599) the theme brings together textual clues such as motifs and stereotyped narrative sequences, the “…reader’s thematising attention and the thematic operations guiding this attention”. Every film has a theme forming the underlying and constant message that constitutes the meaning to be conveyed to the spectators. Metz (qtd. in Lothe 12) notes that “…film is a complex system of successive, encoded signs”. The theme of a film is not always the directly visible meaning gathered from the film, such as good versus evil, but it might also be a more abstract theme that has to be discovered by the spectators by following certain cues within the film. Rothman (xv) claims that film is a “…medium limited to surfaces, to the outer, the visible [yet it is] a medium of mysterious depth, of the inner, the invisible”, and that this characteristic of film endows it with various layers of meaning. Stephens mentions in his presentation *Routes, Movements and Situatedness: Narrative Space and Cognitive Mapping* that the “…cognitive mapping of space develops considerable thematic complexity”. A theme is not simply that which one may grasp at first glance, but might also include such an abstract meaning or theme of good and evil within every character. However, the type of person he becomes will depend on which choices he makes for his future. Some themes might be weightier than others, but “…explicit themes may be less important than implicit ones” (Pyrhönen 599). It is also possible for a “good” person to become corrupted by power and become evil through this corruption, as discussed in the analysis of the films. The theme of a text is thus the abstracted understanding of life that may be deduced by the totality of the space presented in the text. There might be a generalised, concrete theme, but also the more abstracted theme, that “…narrows the
general thematic designation to address a specific one" and not necessarily the group (Pyrhönen 599). A good example would be the focus on the difference of size within the film. The Hobbits find themselves among the normal sized beings; they however have an integral part to play in the film. Gandalf and Pippin, even though they differ in physical size, suggest a small force ready to vanquish whatever they might encounter, implying that that Pippin might be small, but he has great courage.

Zetl (6) contends, “…once we have made up our minds about something, we seem to expose ourselves mostly to messages that are in agreement with our existing views and attitudes, ignoring those beliefs that would upset our deeply held convictions. We also choose to look at things we like to see and are especially interested in, and ignore those that mean little to us”. Even though not all films consciously present a life or world view, it is the explicit intent of certain films to convey a message that reflects a specific point of view. The worldview in a narrative film is the all-encompassing understanding of life and the world that implicitly underlies, or is explicitly depicted in, the narrative world and is reflected in the production of the film. These messages might be associated with certain religions and their affirmation. In such a case, only the spectators who are sensitive to or aware of these specific cues or elements with regard to the world view proclaimed by the film, will even be aware of this motif. Spectators find meaning by allowing themselves to be drawn into the film and associating with specific characters: …Thus the spectator seated in the theatre lives with the film, and does so by finding means to recognise himself in this or that motif, or more generally, by successfully placing himself within the scope of a reception continually subject to images and sounds. The spectator, in sum, becomes engaged in the act of gazing, responding to the availability of the screen’s world by assuming certain responsibilities according to the demands of a true vocation. (Casetti 9)

The three spaces identified within the novel and film are, it will be recalled; Minas Tirith, Mount Doom and Hobbiton. Similar to that discussed in Chapter 3, these spaces are described and analysed in terms of the theoretical precepts identified above, with specific focus on space. Concrete space denotes the physical visual space in the film, such as landscapes, including mountains, rivers, fields and houses, which may be physically and symbolically experienced. Psychological space is the experience of a space: the social, economic and cultural atmosphere within the space, while abstract space transcends
these issues to address inherent beliefs, world views and ideology. In order to carry out a successful analysis, reference is made to examples from the film\footnote{The scenes that will be used are from the Special Extended Edition DVD edition. The scene numbers and names that are used are the numbers and names found within the accompanying booklet to the DVD, which contain the complete outline of scenes. See Appendix A.}, first through the discussion of the scene and then by means of a deeper analysis of descriptive examples of screenshots or screen captures. The analysis of the spaces in the film follows an integrated approach that involves various relevant theories. The first approach used pertains to the “…treatment of genetic place within film” and “…the impact of traditional framing modes” as propagated by LeHéron (qtd. in Carl 33). This approach involves an analysis of how and why a landscape is constructed and transformed the way it is within the film, by making use of mise-en-scène\footnote{A mise-en-scène is “all the elements – lighting, furniture, costumes, etc – that are placed in front of the camera to be filmed” (Lothe 30); the Routledge Encyclopaedia of Narrative Theory defines it as all the “activities that take place in front of the camera, such as arranging set elements, controlling the lighting” (Grodal 169), the staging and set-design of a film (Keating 530). One scene thus consists of many mise-en-scènes.}. Within the mise-en-scène, the emphasis is on looking at the way that the certain frames are shot and by looking at the images as they are found in that frame. The second approach of analysis concentrates on “…describing the form, composition and content of such representations, disclosing their symbolic conventions” (Cosgrove n.pag.).

4.3 ANALYSIS OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE FILM, THE RETURN OF THE KING

A film is chronologically progressive in nature, and The Return of the King is a narration of a journey. The progression of the story and the way in which the space contributes to the spectators’ interpretation by constantly “moving” with the character through different spaces is important. This progression is created and developed within the film. Firstly, the spatial aspects of each of the three chosen spaces are discussed with regard to the narrative progression which implies movement from one space to another. In addition, different mise-en-scènes, which are called screen captures for illustration purposes, are then chosen to better describe, analyse and interpret some of the detail in these three important spaces.
In the film, *The Return of the King*, there is a constant interchange between different spaces. The story follows four different groups; Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas, Merry and Éowyn, Gandalf and Pippin and then Frodo and Sam. The interchanges are affected in order to keep the plotline of all three narratives constantly moving and the quick interchanges, especially during the battle, might cause suspense for the spectators as they are aware of all the different spaces and events within these spaces, while the characters themselves are unaware of the others’ actions.

In the beginning of the film Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas are depicted together with Pippin and Gandalf in Edoras, but the former stay behind and travel with King Théoden to Gondor. The three companions also take the Dimrill road to find the army of the Dead and finally reunite with Merry and the people of the Rohan in battle on the Pelennor fields. Merry is left behind as the above mentioned three characters travel to find the army of the Dead and is thus available to travel with Éowyn into battle. Pippin and Gandalf take their leave of the company in Rohan to travel to Minas Tirith to warn the Steward of the impending danger from Sauron. After the battle of the Pelennor Field, all of these companions reunite and travel to the Black Gate in Mordor. Completely separated from the rest of the fellowship, Frodo and Sam (along with Gollum) travel through the harsh and rough terrain of Mordor to reach Mount Doom. There is a constant varying of spaces, between Rohan, Minas Tirith, Mordor and the road that is travelled between these spaces. Hobbiton is also featured in the film, but only at the end, as indicated, and is thus not part of the continual changing of scenes within the film.

### 4.3.1 Gondor: Minas Tirith

Minas Tirith is the capital of Gondor. It is represented for the first time in the third film, and is consequently still unknown to the spectators. It is depicted as a great White City, situated directly opposite Mordor and is built on different levels, each showed as a circular level leading up to the Citadel, which contains the White Tree of Gondor and other more important structures such as the White Tower. In the film, the City is depicted in terms of two very different atmospheres; suspense and fear and joy and victory. These dissimilar atmospheres within the same space are created by the different use of lighting, music and character interaction.
Within the film *The Return of the King*, Minas Tirith is central with regard to the plotline of the third and final instalment of the trilogy. It is one of the two main spaces within which the narrative and events are depicted, being important because this is where one of the main battles takes place; it is the City that has the best chance of survival and where Sauron intends to attack; it is, as noted, the governing seat of Gondor. The first time the City of Minas Tirith is mentioned and the spectators are given a glimpse of the City is in Pippin's dialogue when he recalls that which he saw in the Palantir to Gandalf in flashbacks: “A tree, there was a white tree in a courtyard of stone. It was dead [...] the City was burning”. The only way that the spectators who are not familiar with the novels are made aware of the fact that this is Minas Tirith is because Gandalf asks Pippin if that which he saw was indeed the City. Gandalf and Pippin journey from the region of Rohan where they stayed in the safety and protection of King Théoden to Minas Tirith in order to warn the steward, Denethor, of Sauron's intended plan to attack Minas Tirith. As they travel, they are presented to the spectators in a long shot, slowly becoming smaller on the screen as they ride off over fields and through rivers, emphasising perspective and distance. As they proceed, they are constantly revealed as travelling across many different spaces, mountains and fields, through forests and small rivers until they finally come to the capital City of Gondor.

As Gandalf and Pippin move over a small hill, the majestic city is revealed to them, and through their eyes to the spectators. They begin to notice the many small towers leading down to the terraces of the city until the City is finally shown to the spectators in all its glory, shining white against the dark mountain, with a ray of sunlight shining down onto it. As they finally behold Minas Tirith, Gandalf and Pippin stand still to take in the majestic site of the massive city represented on the right hand side of the screen. For this description and analysis, use is made of the represented space of Minas Tirith throughout the film *The Return of the King*. The City is portrayed as a magnificent, massive White City with multiple towers of different sizes and many different levels, as seen in Screen capture 1.

According to Rawlings (*Musical Themes in “The Lord of the Rings”*) Howard Shore uses a Wagnerian Leitmotif idea in his score for *The Lord of the Rings*. Leitmotifs represent important elements within the film such as characters, objects, spaces and even ideas as “musical themes or motives (*leitmotif* = “leading motive”)” that expands and comments on
developing action. This theme not only signifies something, but also adds different layers, elucidates and comments on event and characters within the spaces. Wolf (276) explains that a leitmotif represents or symbolises “…a person, object, place [or] idea” which relies on memorable simultaneity of music and the content “…at the introduction of the motif” to be recognised by the spectators. One of the musical themes of *The Lord of the Rings* is playing in the background as Gandalf and Pippin approach Minas Tirith and as they ride from the lower levels to the Citadel, but here the theme alters slightly and is performed by trumpets. The theme music of Gondor is more regal and formal in sound, than for example the pennywhistle theme of the Shire, especially since trumpets normally pertain to royalty, nobles and great warriors (Cirlot 353) and are used to announce something, in this instance, the arrival of Gandalf and Pippin.

The City slowly becomes visible in a long shot, as Gandalf and Pippin ride over a hill, filmed with a following shot to reveal the City from the top of the tower to the foundations of Minas Tirith, with the complete City and its surroundings visible in the frame. Then the shot moves from top to bottom as Gandalf comments, “the City of Kings”. By doing so the complete space of Minas Tirith is introduced to the spectators; it is a massive White City, situated against the foot of a dark, dimly lit mountain, surrounded by an open field, and in the bottom left, the river (Anduin) only slightly visible. In the shot (not inserted here as a mise-en-scène, as it is a progressive motion) just after Gandalf names the city as “Minas Tirith, the City of Kings”, the City is once again shown from below to the top with a low angle shot from the bottom. This once again impresses on the spectators the intensity, absolute majesty and massive size of the City. When the characters in Screen capture 1 are visible, the City towers above them like a mountain would; once again impressing upon the spectators its sheer magnitude. As Gandalf and Pippin ride through the City to reach the Citadel, they are constantly shown moving, while shot from below upwards. They ride through the white streets and guards dressed in dark armour are visible as they move through the City.

In Screen capture 2 they are seen travelling through the City. When the City is shown to the spectators from the inside, the bright whiteness of the stone with which the City was built is very prominent, but it is also clear that the City is very old, as the spectators can see that the stone has been worn in some places and turned darker. This image therefore shows the spectators that here time and space is chronotopically connected, as time
which has passed is also visible in the space. Bakhtin (qtd. in Pier “Chronotype” 64) calls this the “...thickening or materialising of time in space”. These images of time, age and decay are not visible when the spectators first see the city, and it is only through the movement by the characters, from the outside of the City to the inside, that the smaller detail becomes visible.
Screen capture 1: Gandalf and Pippin on route to Minas Tirith.

Screen capture 2: Minas Tirith exterior taken from inside the City.

Screen capture 3: Minas Tirith aerial shot

Screen capture 4: White Tree and guards, with Mordor in the background.
Gandalf even notes that the City has “…fallen into decay [and] the people of Gondor fell into ruin [… and] the White Tree withered”. His words contribute towards the mind mapping constructed by the spectators connecting the three components that are falling into decay: the City, the people within the City and the White Tree. This splendid City which gleams bright and glorious in the sunlight is a symbol of the glory that once was, but on closer inspection the decay may be seen in the City as it can be observed in the people who live within its walls: they have lost hope, joy and pugnacity. The City has become a metaphor for the people as well as the hope and joy that they once held for a bright future and a new king. Gandalf tells Pippin as they walk out of the throne hall, that the City is falling into decay, but the Citadel guards still guard the White Tree because they have hope: “…a faint and fading hope that one day it will flower, that the king will come and this City will be as it once was”. The withered Tree is visible in Screen capture 4. This same fading hope is present in the people and the City itself. As the tree might be symbolic of life, it is also important to note from Gandalf’s statement that the Tree withered as the City started falling into decay, along with the people’s spirit. The Tree came to symbolise the heart of the City in the film, so that with the crumbling of all that was good, valiant and honourable in the City, so also its ‘heart’ withered and would not bloom again. The first sign of hope is seen during the siege of Minas Tirith when the follow shot moves from right to left following Denethor and the burial party but stops and focusses on the single white blossom on the withered Tree as seen in Screen capture 5. At the end of the film, this hope and renewal is also represented to the spectators at Aragorn’s coronation when the Tree is in full bloom and the flower petals fall from the sky.

As seen in Screen capture 2 of Minas Tirith, the City’s grandeur and enormous size are once again emphasised as the upward moving shot, taken from a low angle, once again moves up from the path on which Gandalf and Pippin enter the City to where the windows of rooms are visible. In this scene, the City continues to be shown to the spectators with fast-motioned panning shots from the left to the right and right to left, almost giving the impression of a spiral path leading up to a pinnacle, until finally, Gandalf, Pippin and Shadowfax reach the Citadel. The Citadel is disclosed to the spectators from a low angle, follow-shot as the companions ride up to reveal the bright white buildings on top, with guards dressed contrastingly in dark colours surrounding the withered Tree of Gondor visible to the right.
From this interior shot, the film moves to a long, aerial shot to show the top of the City, depicting the buildings, the four green corners of grass and the cascading buildings below. Also visible from the aerial shot at this stage, is the form of a cross that is found on the Citadel between the grass corners with the Tree in the middle, and the same cross figure (intersecting roads) in the shot to the right on the dull fields below the City (see Screen capture 3). These lines might indicate a crossroad that will be dealt with in this space. The diagonal lines created by the tilted shot and the physical lines of the roads and paths are also likely to create a feeling of uncertainty in the spectators, as the warning of impending doom is to be given to the Steward and the fate of Middle Earth and Minas Tirith are to be decided. Not only is the whole city in a state of uncertainty and fear, but so are the individual characters. Pippin’s face and attitude is that of someone in uncertainty and someone feeling out of place. Even Gandalf is uncertain about the doom, where Sauron will strike and if Denethor will listen to his advice in time. As they enter the throne hall, there is no music, just the sound of their footsteps and Gandalf’s staff on the cold hard floor. This silence and almost clinical atmosphere causes the spectators to experience Gandalf and Pippin’s unease and uncertainty, which is also expressed by the almost cautious manner in which they address the Steward. Gandalf’s attitude and facial expression illustrate his urgency, his need of haste and of summoning help as quickly as possible. Denethor’s head is bowed down; he is clothed in a black robe and hunched over in his throne with his long grey hair hanging loose over his shoulders. He is the ultimate embodiment of despair, anger and hopelessness. As Denethor rises from the throne he tells Gandalf that the rule of Gondor is his, and none other’s; he will not bow to a ranger from the north (Aragorn). Gandalf angrily mentions to Pippin as they leave the hall that Denethor uses his grief as a cloak and that his actions have turned into vain ambition. The tenseness of the uncertainty and urgency to act has shifted to anger and desperation. The two can feel the despair in the silent, cold hall where Denethor sits amongst the great white statues, probably of great Gondorian Kings. It is visible through dialogue, body language and expression that the shadow has also reached here, in the heart of the city.

In the film, during Faramir and his armies attack on the army at Osgiliath, Pippin is demanded to sing a song to Denethor. In this majestic throne room, Pippin sings a song that he describes as “not fit for great halls”, which contrasts sharply with the space in which he currently finds himself and the Shire, which he left behind. He sings:
Home is behind, the world ahead
And there are many paths to tread
Through shadow, to the edge of night
Until the stars are all alight

Mist and shadow
Cloud and shade
All shall fade
All shall fade

This song is sung in a minor tonality or key, and creates an audible sadness within the space of the throne hall. While Pippin is singing this sad song, longing back to his beloved “home”, Faramir is attacked by the Orcs and Pippin starts crying very softly at the end of the song, as he realises that Faramir is likely to die. His song describes the path that they have taken from their home, treading through shadows and going to the edge of darkness found within battles and for Frodo and Sam in Mordor itself, but there is hope that “all shall fade” and the mist, shadow, cloud and shade shall be only a memory. This shadow and shade is represented by the use of colour within the film.

In all the scenes of the City shown to the spectators there is very little colour within them throughout the film, except shades of white and its direct opposite, black. The City is filmed so as to create the effect of natural light, even though it has to be noted that Minas Tirith was a miniature (Sibley 63). On The Appendices DVD Part Five: The War of the Ring53, the miniatures department mentions that Minas Tirith was Tolkien’s greatest architectural invention, which was built for the film based on Alan Lee’s drawings54. The miniature was built at a 1/72 scale, 7 meters tall and 6 ½ meters in diameter. All the sets were constructed, thus making use of studio lighting, as well as digital animation, to light the city, populate it and bring it to life in high, aerial shots. The studio lighting, as well as digital effects, might also have contributed to the brightness of the colour white found in the City and the almost unnatural green of the grass, thereby creating an even more fantastic space, as it does not look real. As Minas Tirith is a city within a fantasy world, it might purposely have been presented in unnaturally bright colours to contribute to the

53 Within the Special Extended Edition DVD pack of The Return of the King are included two DVD’s named The Appendices, part five and part six, which contain background information on the making of the film, building of sets, characters and music.
perception of such a world. There are four patches of green grass found in front of the royal court within the courtyard where the Tree stands. These patches are the only bright colours that break the whiteness of the City. Green is symbolically linked with not only vegetation and life, “but also with death and lividness” (Cirlot 53). These patches of green are thus a connecting-link between death and life. This might be the implied intention or suggestion. It was previously noted that the City has fallen into decay; likewise this colour (green) is symbolic of life, but also of death.

It is also noteworthy that in the film, there are four paths leading from the centre of the courtyard where the fountain and the Tree stand. According to Cirlot, in symbolism, the Tree of Life is in most instances described with four rivers running from the foot of it in the four directions of the Cardinal Points (Cirlot 113). These four paths might thus also symbolise the four rivers, which would also in turn support the idea that the Tree is indeed the Tree of Life, whether only for the City or for the whole of Middle Earth. This assumption can be made by taking into account that the City’s decay over time has paralleled the withering of the Tree with the decay of the City. Yet after Aragorn is crowned and the battle won, the Tree once again blossoms. The Tree then becomes symbolic of both Life and Death.

This Tree thus also symbolises the centre or the source. Minas Tirith is portrayed as the centre of good. It is depicted as the centre of the moral values of Middle Earth; it is the source of justice, of economic wellbeing and even of social norms and relations. The Tree is so important to the people of Minas Tirith that it has a special place on the top of the city, in the middle of the Citadel. Not only does the position of the Tree give the spectators a notion as to its importance but it also appears as the emblem of the City on the banners that are seen in the City (above the Tree on the banner, there are also seven stars). This same emblem of the Tree is repeated on the suits of armour that the guards wear, on the shields of the soldiers as well as on the King’s crown.

A very creative, comparable and symbolic frame is found in the same scene (Screen capture 6). The frame shows the White Tree of Gondor and the Citadel contrasted with the dark, brooding mountain, shadowy clouds and fiery centre of Mordor seen in the

54 See Appendix B for drawings of Minas Tirith and the Dark Tower by Alan Lee.
background of the frame. This scene serves to connect the two separate spaces as well as to contrast them. This Screen capture also shows the spectators the way in which the two spaces are situated with regard to one another: they are directly opposite each other. Within the cognitive map of each spectator, the spaces have now merged and a complete “map” may be drawn. The space of Minas Tirith is directly able to symbolise the good, and with the landscape full of light and presented in lighter colours, it might be assumed by the spectators that the inhabitants would also be on the side of good.

Gandalf further establishes the space as a positive space in the dialogue when he explains to Pippin as they stand upon the courtyard looking out (Screen capture 6), “…this city has ever dwelled in the sight of its shadow” – by implication, Mordor. There are a few descriptive references in the scene to the impending doom of the City. These include, as part of the soundtrack of the film, brooding, almost pounding music and thunder in the background, as well as the dialogue of the characters speaking of the danger lurking; moreover, as the visual representation of an ever-darkening mass moving towards the City in the form of a dark shadow and clouds covering Mordor (Screen capture 6). By taking all the filmic representational references and their meanings into account, the spectators can definitely establish that this wonderful city is indeed in danger. Gandalf further emphasises the danger when he explains that the shadow of Mordor, which Sauron sends out in front of his armies, will reach the City soon and the tense atmosphere is seen and felt by the characters and spectators alike.

The tension grows even more within the space of Minas Tirith when Denethor despatches Faramir to Osgiliath to reclaim the city from the enemy. This is not achieved, and Faramir, the son of the Steward and the captain of the armies, is badly wounded. This defeat at Osgiliath, the loss of so many of the knights sent with Faramir and his own injuries further contribute to the fear of the people within the City. The hope that they still might have had is slowly fading since not even their captain could stand against the armies. As the suspense builds by means of events, dialogue, visual and sound effects, the climax is reached in the scenes portraying the siege of Gondor. This peaceful City is suddenly changed into a city filled with chaos. The armies of the enemy move into the Pelennor Field surrounding the City, and the multiple dark patches as the visual representation of the deployment of the army are seen by means of an aerial shot (Screen capture 7). The Orcs, Uruk-hai, Trolls and their monstrous battering ram, Grond, start besieging the City by hurling the severed heads of the fallen soldiers into the City with catapults, followed by
stones and balls of fire. The enemy army also advances even closer to the walls of the City, with their transport towers pushed by huge mountain trolls; they latch onto the walls of the City and so enter it by scaling the first wall. During the siege, the first gate is shattered and the first level of the City is lost. The scene is presented with follow shots and a variety of different shots, from different angles showing the chaos and confusion as people scurry for safety while some are killed by the Orcs entering the City. Screen capture 8 is introduced to the spectators with a low angle, follow aerial shot, that moves to the top of the City to show the complete space of Minas Tirith engulfed in darkness, fires burning throughout the City and smoke rising. This scene is preceded by a scene showing the severed heads of fallen soldiers and fireballs being shot into the City, giant Cave Trolls breaching down the main gate to the City and panic reigning everywhere within. There is a constant pounding sound heard by the spectators as the Orcs in Sauron’s army hammer on their drums, as seen in previous scenes, and on the doors of the City. This undoubtedly creates a feeling of excitement and anxiety in the spectators.

Once the main door is broken, the armies of Sauron stream into Minas Tirith (Screen capture 9). In this shot, the space previously identified as peaceful, and a beacon of hope and goodness, is suddenly infiltrated with evil, allowing for a direct contrast between the two representations of the same space. The aerial shot shows the devastation that is brought upon the City as the buildings are destroyed and set aflame. Everywhere visible is fire; now the once White City is depicted in saturated browns, or shades of black, and the only light (fire) is seen through the smoke and dust presented in shades of red throughout the City. This devastation is also heard in the sounds now present in the space; the sound of screams, of swords clashing, Orcs chanting and of fire kindling wood. No theme music is played during this specific scene (depicting Denethor and Faramir); only the previously mentioned sounds of combat are audible. The lack of music contributes to the atmosphere of war, death, aggression, pain and despair. During the siege, Denethor’s dialogue also presents a mood of despair when he looks down at the lower levels of the City and wonders, “why do the fools fly? Better to die sooner than late. For die we must”.

During the siege of Gondor, the music reaches a crescendo as the camera moves from the chaos of the fight below to an aerial shot, finally to depict Pippin in the courtyard on top of the Citadel. The music abruptly stops as the shots zooms in on Denethor and the men who follow him, behind Pippin, coming out of the throne hall. Denethor carries a torch and the
Screen capture 5: The first blossom on the withered Tree of Minas Tirith.

Screen capture 6: Mordor seen from the Citadel.

Screen capture 7: The armies of Mordor seen from the Citadel.

Screen capture 8: The siege of Minas Tirith, aerial shot.
spectators can now observe that the men following him are carrying an unconscious Faramir. Denethor says that Gondor is lost and there is no hope for men. The utter hopelessness and despair of Denethor can be heard in this dialogue. The scene switches to an aerial shot that moves diagonally from the battle on the field to display Denethor and his company as they walk from the Citadel to the burial houses. As they enter the dimly lit burial house or mausoleum, the scene moves directly forward to the middle of the mausoleum, where a dark carved stone structure stands. Arches that lead to other halls containing the remains of the Gondorian kings surround this structure. The camera shot swings in a clockwise movement from behind the structure, around it to show Denethor standing on the left hand side as it zooms in on his face when he says, “Bring wood and oil”. Denethor tries to commit suicide and murder his son to escape his responsibilities as Steward of Minas Tirith, influenced by Sauron to believe that all is lost. The mausoleum forms part of a fear invoking space through the dim lighting, the absolute silence in it and the rising of suspense as the spectators wait for Denethor to burn Faramir, hoping that someone will come to his aid. The scene constantly varies between the interior space of the silent mausoleum, and the chaotic exterior space of the battle in the City. In this chaos Pippin frantically searches for Gandalf to warn him of Denethor’s intentions. The constant switching between spaces, battle at the main door and the silence in the mausoleum, creates an atmosphere of suspense. In a close-up shot, Denethor is shown pouring oil over himself and onto Faramir, who is laid upon the structure surrounded by wood. As the guards with the torches walk up to the pier the music starts building up to a crescendo of trumpets as Gandalf, Pippin and Shadowfax burst through the doors. Faramir is saved from the fire, but Denethor is deliberately set alight and as he sees Faramir’s eyes opening, he runs, burning, from the mausoleum across the Citadel to the uttermost point of the rock façade protruding from the Citadel. In an aerial shot, moving from the City to the point of the rock, Denethor is seen running as a ball of flame, throwing himself over the edge of the Citadel as seen from the low angle shot. The shot zooms out to show the City and Denethor almost vanishing, with only the City and the battle visible. Denethor is an example of the power of despair and fear that Sauron inflicts on the people of Middle Earth, driven into desperation and madness; as a result, the City is left without a leader who will take a positive stance, who will be able to uplift the spirit of the people and resurrect the City. Denethor contrasts strongly with Aragorn who is represented as a heroic warrior, honoured new king and loving friend and partner.
Chapter 4: Space in the film, The Return of the King

Screen capture 9: Minas Tirith ablaze. Interior shot of City.

Screen capture 10: The armies of Rohan seen in front of the sunrise.

Screen capture 11: Sunlight shining on the City after the War of the Ring.

Screen capture 12: The coronation of the King (Aragorn).
Throughout the entire scene, Gandalf in his white garments establishes order; he is the character who motivates “…the soldiers of Gondor” to keep faith and to resist the enemy: “…no matter what comes through that door, you will stand your ground”. In this space, the once tough and brave soldiers have changed into fearful characters, whereas Gandalf has risen again as a leader who inspires and motivates them, who keeps order and gains control. This once secure and safe space has now altered into a space of insecurity and fear. As Gandalf rides to save Faramir, he is confronted by that embodiment of evil, the Lord of the Nazgûl on his fell beast. The apparition asks Gandalf if he does not “…know Death” when he sees it. This confrontation is designed not only to demonstrate the invasion of evil in the City, but also to contrast Gandalf and the Lord of the Nazgûl in direct opposition to each other. This Lord is also known as the Witch-king of Angmar (Foster 444). This descriptive name indicates that Gandalf and the Nazgûl are both equally pitted against each other. Just as he is about to kill Gandalf, a horn is suddenly heard in the background. As the horn blows the army of Sauron looks up to its right where, in a long shot, the army of Rohan standing at the top of a hill with a bright golden sunrise behind them becomes visible (Screen capture 10). The allied armies have come in answer to Gondor’s call. They bring new hope and a “…source of life and energy”, which is symbolised by the sunrise (Cirlot 320). King Théoden also encourages his armies by telling them that they should “…fear no darkness […] it is] a red-day, ere the sun rises”. The dialogue accompanied by the visual of a sunrise gives hope to the spectators that the darkness (and the dark times) will be lifted. The battle is won on the Pelennor Field, partly because of the armies of Rohan, and the Undead Army who accompanied Aragorn.

The White City is clearly established as a City of Kings when Gandalf’s statement that it is such a city is taken into account. It is also symbolised by the space and the objects within the space. These concrete objects such as the majestic towers, large white statues of previous kings and tall columns become symbols that include the brightness which enfolds the City, and the colour white which is always present, before and after the war, and even during it. Others of the spatial attributes that contribute to the idea of the City of Kings are the fantastic and massive, almost cathedral-like structures that rise out each of the seven levels. The structural image might suggest to the spectators the idea of a cathedral and almost gothic style of the buildings. Gothic style architecture is most commonly recognised in its design of the towers, pinnacles and large windows grouped together. The original Gothic architecture, narrow structures with high walls and towers that reach out to heaven, which might suggest a higher power, is not explicitly depicted in this film. Another structural attribute relates to the many large statues, probably of leaders.
and heroes of the past, which line the streets as well as the interior of the buildings, such as are evident within the royal court where Gandalf and Pippin address Denethor. There are also many flags seen moving ever so slightly in the wind, almost unnoticeably, giving it the effect of a castle or fortress. Another aspect of the interpretation of a castle or fortress which is encouraged in the minds of the spectators, comprises the guards dressed in their royal suits of armour with shields and helmets adorned with wings, symbolising in the more moral sense, "spirituality, imagination and thought", as well as intelligence and enlightenment (Cirlot 374). Wings are also associated “with the higher, active, male principle" (Cirlot 375) which might be representative of Aragorn and the wings on his crown.

When Minas Tirith is shown at the end of the film, after the battle of good and evil within as well as outside of the City, it is represented as a space of triumph and of new beginnings. It is once again brought into the screen from a low angle shot, which follows upward to the pinnacle of the City and depicts the complete City in the long shot used. From the left, rays of sunlight may even be seen (Screen capture 11), literally and symbolically showing that the shadow of Sauron has been driven away and that sunlight shines on the City again. Sunlight symbolises a source of life and energy, as well as rebirth (Cirlot 319-320) suggesting that the City has been reborn; it has a new source of energy and life. The soft flute music alters in tempo and is joined by other instruments to reach a climax just as the camera shot reaches the top of the City, revealing a courtyard filled with a crowd of soldiers, people of Rohan and Minas Tirith, as well as an entourage of Elves, Gimli and Gandalf. There are banners flapping in the wind, once again creating the image of a castle and of festivities.

On top of Minas Tirith in the Citadel, Aragorn is crowned as King by Gandalf. The scene is presented as an aerial shot to the spectators, changing to a follow shot to finally portray a row of guards dressed in black armour on both sides of a path laid with a light blue carpet leading up to the steps in front of the Royal Court. Behind the seven steps on which Aragorn is crowned are seven arches while on both sides of the arches are two big black banners. The banners are adorned with the emblem of the White Tree under seven stars; the right-hand banner (Screen capture 12) also depicts a crescent moon above the stars while the left-hand side contains a sun. The number seven is highly symbolic and

55 The arches consist of the five outer arches, the inner big arch and the door itself as the seventh arch.
repeatedly used throughout the film as mentioned previously. There are seven levels in
the City, seven arches in the capiter above the seven stairs and seven stars on the
banners. Seven is symbolic for “perfect order, a complete period or cycle” (Cirlot 233).
Accompanying the symbol of the number seven is the symbol of the circular form, or ring.
This symbol contributes to the idea that the king has completed a cycle as he returns to
the City. In addition, the cycle of the journey has been completed. A moon symbolises the
female, whereas the sun symbolises the masculine: together they form a union that is
generally thought of “as the marriage of heaven and earth” (Cirlot 215). The crescent
moon on the banner conveys a dual meaning: it is associated with the passive principle
(imagination, sentiment and perception), the feminine and the phenomena of change;
when associated with a star, the symbolism alters and it becomes the symbol of paradise
(Cirlot 66). On the banner, the crescent moon might be symbolic of the change that the
City has undergone and when taken as a whole (including the seven stars) it might also
represent that this is now in some manner a paradise for those who dwell in the City. The
other banner has a sun in the place of the crescent moon. The sun on the banner is in
contrast to the moon by being associated with the active principle (reflection, good
judgement and will power), the masculine and a source of life and “ultimate wholeness of
man” (Cirlot 317-319). Together the sun and the moon complement and contrast each
other, both having essential qualities needed in the character of a person, specifically, the
King. The colour blue found on the carpet represents “the clear sky” as well as daylight.
The colour symbolises the act of thinking (Cirlot 53). Cirlot (54) also mentions that blue
stands for “the vertical – and the spatial, the symbolism of levels – means height and
depth […] an upward-tending force in the pattern of dark and light”. Physically, the City is
upward-tending and its structures are high, but there is also an emotional growth
represented by the colour blue. These visual cues suggest symbolically that the City as
well as Aragorn have reached a new height and even depth as they have grown in
character and wisdom. The City as well as its inhabitants has also been a force moving
against the darkness of the evil that Sauron unleashed. Blue is thus strongly symbolic in
this space.

Within this coronation scene, there are many close-up shots of characters’ facial
expressions to convey their emotional state, such as Gimli when he shows his
astonishment as Aragorn is revealed as the King: he even opens his mouth slightly in
amazement. Gandalf is also depicted in a close-up so that the spectators can see the soft
and caring way in which he looks at Aragorn as he places the crown on his head and
pronounces, “Now come the days of the King, may they be blessed”. Aragorn is illustrated
from a low angle shot, upon the steps, enclosed within the arches of the Royal court, fully
dressed in royal armour and adorned with Narsil. This type of shot is usually used to show
that someone is in a position superior to the characters surrounding him or her. The rest
of the people (characters) not only look up to Aragorn; he is also recognised as their
superior. He seems to be slightly emotional as he kneels and when he stands up to face
his people, he looks at and speaks to them softly and kindly. He has developed from
being a Ranger and is now shown within the space of the capital city of Gondor, as a
character hierarchically, and at the moment of the coronation, also physically higher than
the rest. Unlike the first view that the spectators have had of the City, it is important to
note that now it is filled with laughter and applause since the faces of the crowd are
portrayed as laughing and smiling while the People of Gondor and their guests from
Rohan, Hobbiton and Rivendell are cheering and clapping their hands. A crowd
symbolically also refers to the “oneness” of a “…fragmented whole”. These sounds further
enhance the representation of a celebration as well as the fact that just before Aragorn
starts singing, white flower petals fall from the sky, emulating confetti. This occasion
becomes a celebration of a new time of fresh beginnings and peace. The Tree that was
once withered is now in full bloom within the fountain on the left side of the frame, as the
camera turns to show the screen from Aragorn’s perspective (Screen capture 13).

As Aragorn descends the stairs and walks along the carpeted path he is acknowledged by
Faramir and Êowyn, then by Êomer and is finally met by Legolas (in an over-the-shoulder
shot) presented in a light, festive coloured robe: they greet each other. These actions
reinforce the idea of the bond and mutual respect that Aragorn has with the Elves and
those that fought alongside him. The shot moves from Aragorn and Legolas to show two
Elves moving out of view to present Lord Elrond with another character next to him behind
a cream-coloured banner, also adorned with the image of the Tree. From behind the
banner Arwen is slowly presented to the spectators in a medium over-the-shoulder shot.
The only sound heard is the soft chanting theme associated with the Elves in the film. The
shot becomes a close-up that shifts between Aragorn, with his overwhelmed gaze, and
Arwen with a soft look of true love. They meet in the middle to show the two characters in
front of each other in a long shot as
Screen capture 13: The crowd gathered in the Citadel and the blossoming White Tree of Gondor.

Screen capture 14: Aragorn and Arwen reunited.
seen in Screen capture 14. In the background, the crowd can be observed to be smiling. Both of the characters are wearing crowns to indicate to the spectators that they are both of royal blood in their own regions and races. Aragorn is presented in his dark silver armour with Arwen in a light, coloured dress, redolent of the first green of the spring. She looks soft and light, feminine, whereas Aragorn in his armour appears very masculine and strong. Her green dress represents earthiness, “growing things” and represents “the function of sensation” (Cirlot 53). She represents life, and is indeed the embodiment of life to Aragorn. When they meet Arwen bows her head in respect to the King, but Aragorn lifts up her chin, making them equals. Their kiss seals the promise of new life and of a peaceful future. At the moment of their kiss soft violin music starts playing and the crowd begins cheering and clapping again. Happiness is present in every aspect of this space at this moment. Together they unite two races, Men and Elves, but also the past and the future, the mortal and immortal and the regions of Gondor as well as Rivendell.

The balance has now been restored. Moreover, it is foretold, not only by Gandalf, but also by the complete space, that they indeed will be blessed - the Withered Tree blossoms, many races are gathered together, united, the shadow has been driven away, blue skies are visible and sunlight now shines on the City and its inhabitants (Screen capture 13). Aragorn also unites the already gathered races of Men (Rohan and Gondor), Dwarves, Elves and Hobbits when he declares that that day does not belong to one man, but to all of those gathered there, so “….let us together rebuild this world that we may share in the days of peace”. The soft wind that blows and the petals that fall from the sky may also symbolise new beginnings; a kind of spring after the darkness and evil that covered Middle Earth. Minas Tirith has come not only to symbolise new beginnings and celebration of life for the people of Gondor, but also for Aragorn himself, as he discovers that Arwen is alive and they are finally reunited. The scene concludes with an aerial shot of the City zooming out from the Citadel to fade into a drawing of the City on the map of Middle Earth. This image of the map links the film to the novels.

The space of Minas Tirith is represented to the spectators by a variety of shots from different angles and levels, in order to guide the spectators’ gaze to important elements within the space. By focussing on specific objects or characters, the importance of that character and his or her dialogue within the space is established. These important images are emphasised by sound, colour and lighting to give the space a specific effect desired at
a particular moment for a specific event, such as the light-hearted, laughter-filled coronation scene where almost no darkness or shadow are seen and the atmosphere supports the victory of the battle that preceded it. There are many contrasting elements in Minas Tirith: the first is the direct dissimilarity from Mordor, but the interior spaces contrast with the exterior spaces too, such as the previously discussed silent mausoleum where Denethor and his soldiers plan to burn Faramir and the exterior, battle-sound filled city is engulfed in fire and smoke. Lighting, colour and sound played an intricate part in the creation of specific atmospheres in the space, which in turn elicit certain emotions and experiences in the spectators.

4.3.2 Mordor: Mount Doom

Mordor\textsuperscript{56} has been briefly introduced to the spectators in the previous two films through flashbacks and characters mentioning the space. Along with Minas Tirith, Mordor is the other major space in which the events of The Return of the King take place. The two spaces are in direct contrast with each other. Mordor is the seat of the Dark Lord Sauron and thus embodies all the values and characteristics that can be associated with evil. The landscape is rugged, harsh, dry and uninhabitable. The characters associated with this space also share these characteristics with the landscape: evil, rugged-looking and harsh, filled with malice and portrayed as extensions of the physical, geographical space. Through lighting and sound effects, the atmosphere of the space is also interpreted so as to create an effect of fear, darkness, heaviness and despair.

In the second scene of the film, spectators for the first time in the film narrative are confronted by the journey that Frodo and Sam undertake to the region of Mordor. The scene starts with a low angled shot that focuses on the grey sky outside, moves downwards, over lifeless trees (Screen capture 15), and then moves inwards, finally to reveal Sam and Frodo hiding inside of a diamond shaped structure. When this tilting, low

\textsuperscript{56} Scenes for Mordor were filmed in the Tongariro National Park on the Northern Island of New Zealand. The natural landscape that was encountered there was perfect for the scenes of Mordor, since the landscape was rugged, formed by volcanic activity. Mount Doom was shot at “Mount Ruapehu, an active volcano with a dry, rocky, desolate look” (Braun 167). There were many digital additions made to Mount Doom, in order to create a space of fear and impending danger, since the crew could not film on the top of the mountain (Sibley 37). Also see Appendix B: Mount Doom.
camera shot is used, the spectators are able to see the interior and exterior space of the shelter in which Frodo and Sam hide. There is no music, only environmental sound effects are heard, which include crows squawking and an unknown, unearthly, louder bellowing sound. The absence of music and the symbolic crow’s squawking would create an eerie feeling of death and despair in spectators. The ominous cry of the crow as the scene opens might imply to some spectators a specific symbolic value, which might add more to the meaning of the space. Even though the crow cannot be seen, the sound can still be heard and recognised, a literal sound\textsuperscript{57}. Crows have come to symbolise many things, but in this space, they represent “an allegory for solitude” (Cirlot 71). Sam and Frodo are alone: they are in a space which they do not know and where they are not welcome; there are no other living beings except the two of them and Gollum.

What is also significant is that the sound of the crow is heard just as Sam is brought into view in the left hand lower corner. This is important, because a crow also symbolises spiritual strength (Cirlot 71), and Sam is the embodiment of this strength and of physical strength; he is Frodo’s pillar of strength, he encourages him emotionally and psychologically, but he also helps him physically even in such a dramatic way as to carry him up the foot of Mount Doom. The colours in the scene are desaturated shades of brown, grey and black. The colour brown is associated with the earth and grey with “depression, inertia and indifference” (Cirlot 54). These colours thus also suggest dejection and death. The trees surrounding the scene are dead, there is dust and the ground is hard and harsh. Together with the physical images of death and lifelessness, the colours also contribute to a tenser atmosphere, which might even cause Frodo to become more depressed as he tells Sam that he has a feeling that he might not be going home to the Shire as the days grow darker. The surroundings might create the image of winter, rocky, hard desert like space in the minds of spectators, as there are no leaves on the trees, the ground is barren and dry and there is no living plant to be seen. Even though the space and Frodo’s mood might be presented as hopeless, Sam is not. In Screen capture 16, Sam is seen from a low angle shot standing with his back to Frodo, who is in the front of the visual field, looking up to Sam as he stands looking out of their hiding place. The edges of their hiding place also frame him in an off-centre, diagonal way showing uncertainty and creating an even greater feeling of tension.

\textsuperscript{57} The definition of a literal sound, as given by Zetl1, is provided in Chapter 2.2, paragraph 15.
Sam stands up tall, framed by the diagonal lines, which might be representative of uncertainty as well as a compass; a compass for their road ahead, their journey to Mount Doom. They will have to face the barren space that they see as they stand within the shelter, with only their hope and faith in the purpose of their journey as the compass guiding them. This type of shot, from such a low angle, also demonstrates that even though Sam might not be as important within the quest as Frodo at first glance, since he is not mentioned as many times and he is not the Ring bearer, he is the leader within the space of Mordor. He plays a more significant role than Frodo and is of major significance to him in the triumph over the space and the hopelessness that the space creates in his master’s mind and heart. It is through his perseverance and support that Frodo, as well as the Ring, travel through many spaces to reach their final destination, Mount Doom. He is an integral part to succeeding in this quest. In the scene where Gollum leads Frodo and Sam to the city of Minas Morgul, Gollum grumbles to Sam as they travel through Mordor, that they “…are not in decent places”; in response to those words, Frodo suddenly stops. It is as if he realises something and says to Sam that “…it is just a feeling […] I do not think that I’ll be coming back”. Sam once again shows his spiritual strength, implied by the peaceful and memorable soft musical theme of the Shire that can suddenly be heard, as he answers, “Yes you will […] of course you will […] that’s just morbid thinking, we are going there and back again”.

During this scene, there is a rumbling and the earth starts to shake for a few seconds. The sound track and visual effects in the scene create the effect of an earthquake. At first, the spectators might only experience the suggestion of an earthquake by means of the sound and the effect of a moving or shaking image. Sam also starts trembling and in the far right of a long shot which follows within the scene, Mount Doom can be seen erupting and belching fire from its pinnacle, but only for an abrupt second. Frodo is seen huddling in the corner of a dark structure, almost as if he is hiding; his back is also turned towards the spectators, and he is covered in shadow. The spectators might associate the scene with a feeling of hopelessness since the quest and the road ahead appear dark, ominous and probably fatal. The atmosphere is gloomy, since the colours, such as shades of black, brown and grey, are used to signify not only the evil that broods in Mordor, but also unfriendliness, alienation, lifelessness, fear and even the possibility of failure. This effect may be regarded literally and symbolically. The scenes of the journey to Mordor in the film are inserted with the intent of creating a fuller, complete representation in the mind of the spectators as to the geography and atmosphere of Mordor and subsequently building up to the climax of finally reaching Mount Doom, the final frontier. Mordor is without
vegetation; there are no green living plants or animals, only barren, greyish, rock-covered ground, fire, fumes and smoke. A follow shot leads the gaze of the spectators along with Frodo and Sam over a mound, standing upon the top and finally showing the complete space of Mordor in an extreme long shot.

This follow shot engages the spectators, as it takes the spectators along and makes them feel as if they might also be walking along the utterly desolate and uninviting road to Mordor. “We did it Mister Frodo, we made it to Mordor” is Sam’s first remark as they arrive on the mound to look out over the landscape. He thus immediately names the space and proves the spectators with information. The colours used in the scene are totally desaturated and very dark, emphasising that everything is coloured in shades of black with only hints of light shining on the front of the characters. The only sources of light in the dark space are the fires that burn on the plain, the glow of fire from Mount Doom and the Eye of Sauron on the Tower (Screen capture 17). The music is dramatic, growing to a crescendo that becomes fortissimo, where the tone of the music and the instruments used alter when the Hobbits finally see Mordor. All of these effects almost overload the scene, which may well create the impression within the spectators that the space feels heavy and unbearable as the tension rises. The effect might have been created in order to also place the overwhelming feeling of heaviness and being burdened onto the spectators, in the same way that Frodo is being burdened with the Ring. Mordor as portrayed in Screen capture 17 is a place in total contrast to Minas Tirith. It is a space dominated by darkness, where black and red colours are used to portray the evil and the brooding danger. In the extreme long shot the spectators, for as far as the eye can see, are shown the dark, barren plateau surrounded by mountains with peaks that spike out to reach up to a sky filled with dark clouds. Almost in the middle, and definitely the focal point of the space, a volcano is visible: Mount Doom. It is placed in the centre once again to reinforce its importance and the role it plays in the quest. It is from this mountain that the bright fire (lava) is heard and seen spurting and erupting. It seems almost as if the dark clouds are boiling from the peak of the mountain. Mordor is barren and lifeless, the foul creatures that live there are unnatural and inhuman; they travel in darkness, as they cannot bear the glare of sunlight, and are corrupted entities who have been created by Sauron, thus not actually part of the world.

---

58 As the spectators of the film might have read the novels as well, it can be assumed that they will have the background knowledge to know that Sauron corrupted Elves to create Orcs (Tolkien *The Silmarillion* 49).
Chapter 4: Space in the film, *The Return of the King*

Screen capture 15: The journey through Mordor.

Screen capture 16: Sam framed by structure.

Screen capture 17: The first sighting of Mount Doom.

Screen capture 18: The Eye of Sauron.
The lines of red fire on the plateau create the illusion of a sea of darkness, of waves. That the sea is regarded as a transitional and mediating agent between “life and death” (Cirlot 281) seems to be very fitting in this space. Frodo and Sam are obliged to cross a symbolic sea of darkness and evil creatures, a type of boundary between the two regions, in order to reach their destination, Mount Doom, to complete their quest. The symbolic sea that lies in front of them is dark and treacherous; they know their chances of survival are slim. Frodo says that there are “…so many of them, we will never get through unseen”. At that moment, the close-up of Frodo and Sam changes to a low angled shot that moves upward to show the dark tower with the Eye of Sauron perched at the top, gazing about his lands, almost frantically (Screen capture 18). A single eye is symbolic of something inhuman, subhuman or the unnatural, since it is not normal to have only one eye. An eye is also associated with the spirit, because the eyes are the windows of the soul (Cirlot 99). Thus when looking at the soul of Sauron, the characters as well as the spectators can clearly see the chaotic situation of blazing flames, and it is suggested that it might explode at any time. The next shot is a close-up of the Eye of Sauron, showing the spectators a blistering red eye in a darkly coloured frame. The red colour used is also symbolically linked to the colour of fire and to “surging and tearing emotions” (Cirlot 53), and likewise associated with death and sublimation. These emotions are visible in the frantic and obsessive search that Sauron undertakes for the Ring. It also influences Frodo who has sudden emotional outbursts and the spectators are able to view the two forces in his being, good and evil, tearing at his soul, very visible through his outer, physical appearance and the way that he seems to suffer and bear a constant heavy weight. This weight furthermore grows heavier as Frodo and the Ring near Mount Doom. This emotional struggle and his emotions can be distinguished as the psychological space for this character within the larger geographical space.

Once in Mordor, the landscape is viewed through many different shots and from a variety of angles, as well as by the use of colour, lighting and sound effects. The way in which Mordor is presented may lead the spectators to infer that it is a complete wasteland. In Screen capture 19, Frodo and Sam are shown to the left, as almost undistinguishable between the rocks scattered on the terrain. The terrain is harsh: it is also suggested that it is very dry, since there is grey dust seen everywhere and the large grey rocks further contribute to the feeling of aridity and of uninhabitable, rough terrain. When looking at Screen capture 19, the spectators can see that there is only a flat terrain in the plateau; there are no hills or higher structures. Screen captures 20 and 21 further lead the spectators in this notion and reinstate the idea of a barren wasteland. Closer to the
Chapter 4: Space in the film, *The Return of the King*

Within Mount Doom, the whole atmosphere changes from darkness to vividness, not of light, but of fire (Screen capture 22). In Screen capture 22, the whole frame is covered in bright, yellow-reddish fire and smoke or fumes. The bridge leading into Mount Doom is seen silhouetted, directing the eyes of the spectators diagonally across the middle of the screen to where Frodo stands holding the One Ring. This diagonal line that is created shows the progression of Frodo from the outside (left) of the cavern to the inside (right). This movement might also imply the progression of the journey from the Shire to finally reaching the heart of Mordor. The diagonal line makes the spectators subconsciously aware that nothing is certain and they may be reminded of Isildur who stood in the same space with the same Ring and quest as Frodo, but who could not throw the Ring into the fire. Because the frame’s right-hand lower corner is lighter and much brighter, the spectator’s eyes are directed towards this in the spatial field of this mise-en-scène. The diagonal line created by the bridge also guides the gaze to the lighter corner of the frame, where Frodo and the Ring are standing. The last true battle takes place here, between the evil and will of the Ring and the willpower of Frodo. The scene is intense and packed with emotion. This tension is created by the extreme close-up shots that oscillate between Frodo and Sam to show their emotions on their faces; Sam determined, looking urgently at Frodo, wishing him to fling the Ring into the fire, and Frodo looking back at Sam first with a tired expression and then with an angry one as he decides to keep the Ring. The spectators can see the intense struggle on Frodo’s face, and Sam, crying and filthy, begging him: “Just let it go”; the tension further enhanced by the music- legato phrases played by stringed instruments. On the close-up of Frodo, just before he decides to keep the Ring, the music suddenly changes and becomes almost a heartbeat sound as a misterioso coro is heard: the sound of a palpitating heartbeat of a space trying to finally
win over the bearer of the Ring and attempting to stay alive, to survive. The Ring triumphs momentarily: Frodo is turned, even just for a few seconds, as he gives in to his yearning to possess power. They are in the heart of Mordor, at the source of the evil – and this space is alive. It is personified by the sound effects used in the space that suggest a heartbeat, by the dialogue as it is referred to as the heart of Mordor and by the fact that Sauron does not have a physical form, but is represented by the space.

Mount Doom as a whole is also a symbol of fire symbolising “control”: according to Cirlot (105), there is a belief in the notion that fire is an agent of destruction and of “transmutation, since all things derive from, and return to, fire”. This idea reinforces the whole purpose of the quest to destroy the Ring. The Ring is also a transmutation of the original Rings of Power described in the first film, because unlike the other Rings, used for good and the development and improvement of Middle Earth, the One Ring was designed to rule over all the other rings of power. Through this Ring, Sauron has corrupted many characters in the narrative, and altered them into something different, or rather brought out that which was hidden within them, the yearning for power. Gollum is one of these characters. He finally catches Frodo in the heart of the mountain where they struggle with each other, the fight ending as Gollum bites Frodo’s finger with the ring on it and falls into the chasm clasping the One Ring triumphantly.

Gollum falls into the lava below, which might be in part due to his struggle with Frodo, and in part due to his destiny being interwoven with that of the Ring; the one cannot exist without the other. Sam convinces Frodo to grab hold of him and pulls him up. This
Chapter 4: Space in the film, *The Return of the King*

Screen capture 19: Mordor terrain.

Screen capture 20: Ruggedness and barrenness of Mordor.

Screen capture 21: Mount Doom, exterior.

Screen capture 22: Inside the Crack of Doom in Mount Doom.
action once again impresses on the spectators the importance of Sam within the space of Mordor: he saves Frodo multiple times, from exterior enemies, as well as his own interior enemy. Gollum, triumphant at finally having the Ring back, is depicted as melting away in the fire with the Ring. As the Ring is destroyed in the heart of evil, this space of Mordor suddenly explodes with activity. At the moment of the Ring’s disappearance into the lava, a screeching sound is heard from the tower with the Eye. Elsewhere, as Sauron’s armies are fighting the armies of Gondor in front of the Black Gate, they suddenly seem to waver and panic - they stop fighting and flee. The tower with the Eye literally explodes and the spectators can hear the sound of the tower as it shatters like glass and tumbles to the ground (Screen capture 23). The tower begins to fall in on itself, and the spectators are given a close-up view in a low angle shot showing the tower crumbling to the base. As it collapses the music also alters to one of the musical themes associated with Gondor, suggesting to the spectators that this side might have been victorious. This theme then also changes again to a coro crescendo when the Mountain erupts. In the long shot of the tower exploding (Screen capture 24), Mount Doom may be seen on the right hand side with the collapsing tower on the left. As the Eye’s fire extinguishes, a sudden explosion of wind rushes from the tower and pushes the rubble forward forcefully, as though cleansing the space (Screen capture 25). The visual field of the mise-en-scene is completely engulfed by this mighty wave of debris for a few seconds, bringing the events right up to the spectators. The earth breaks open, presumably from the force of the destruction of the Eye, engulfing most of Sauron’s army and structures. The Black Gates also crumble and fall into the chasm created in the ground. Mount Doom erupts into a clear, bright fire and the area is covered in lava.

As indicated, the colour scheme of all the Mordor scenes is in shades of grey and black as well as the red colour of the flames. Gianetti (25) mentions that colour symbolism associated with red in films tends to suggest “aggressiveness, violence and stimulation”. Grey is said to be associated with ash, might refer to “depression, inertia and indifference” and is also symbolic of egoism (Cirlot 54). The space is thus presented as one of depression and as one that resists change and is indifferent to its lack of care towards its inhabitants; it is a harsh and rugged terrain. The symbolic reference to egoism as well as indifference might also be directly attributed to Sauron. He does not care for those that serve him, he bends them to his will and they fight and die in order for him to try to regain his Ring, and that which it signifies: power, the only thing that really seems to matter to him. As grey is associated with ashes, it is quite fitting that Mordor is destroyed by fire and dust, which may be associated with ash.
The long shot (Screen capture 24) used in the scene where a white light begins to shine through the dark clouds over the mountains suggests that there is light again, a light at the end of the dark and perilous journey. With the destruction of the Ring comes the destruction of the space which was once Mordor and Mount Doom. “Here at the end of all things”, Frodo exclaims as the mountain around them falls into nothingness. In the space of Mordor, the symbolism of fire is repetitively used. In this scene, the fire symbol once again emerges, symbolising transformation, which is exactly what the Ring is: it reveals the other side of characters and spaces, more corrupt and evil in nature. Frodo is an excellent example: not only does the Ring start to weigh on him, but the space of Mordor, the darkness begins to weigh him down, it changes him and drains the spark of life and hope out of him. He has matured from the contented Hobbit the spectators initially met in the first film, *The Fellowship of the Ring*, to the ‘older’, wiser and more quiet Hobbit in *The Return of the King*. The transformation came through the struggle with Sauron (the Ring’s) influence, his experiences on the journey and the characters with which he interacted. It has only taken them thirteen months to travel from the Shire to Mordor, but in this period they have travelled through multiple spaces and met many characters, which have all contributed to a permanent maturing in the Hobbits. Frodo was almost completely lost in Mount Doom, but unexpectedly and unintentionally saved by his evil counterpart, Gollum who is completely corrupted and completely enthralled by the power of the Ring. Gollum did not save Frodo intentionally, but his greed overwhelms him and he takes back the Ring, and in so doing, is consumed by the fire (implied evil) as he falls from the bridge into the pit of fire. The spectators of the previous films would have foreknowledge of the notion advanced by Gandalf that it might have been fate that Bilbo did not kill Gollum, because he too has a role to fulfil; that sometimes, even though not intentional, evil can bring about something good.
Screen capture 23:  The Tower crumbling to the ground.

Screen capture 24:  Tower shattering, Mount Doom erupting.

Screen capture 25:  The destructive blast from the tower.
4.3.3 The Shire: Hobbiton

The Shire, the home country of the Hobbits, is a space that is only revealed at the end of the film. After the scene where Aragorn is crowned and the physical landscape evolves into a map, the camera pans across this map of Middle Earth, finally to show the Shire. The previous music, in which a flute plays most of the melody line, is continued and has now come to be associated with the Shire, as introduced in the first film. The musical theme, a simplistic kind of flute or pennywhistle music, is associated with and evokes memories of the Shire. It recurs in the film every time that the Shire is mentioned or one of the Hobbits talks of their home. The theme is rendered in a “folksy slightly out-of-tune pennywhistle flute version” which creates a heart-warming, comfortable and inviting atmosphere (Rawlings “Shire”). The scene is introduced to the spectators in a follow shot of the four Hobbits, each on a horse, as they ride into the Shire, into Hobbiton. The riders seem content, an impression derived from their relaxed posture and their smiles. This relaxed atmosphere is represented to the spectators through the soft music that can be heard as they enter into Hobbiton; they are finally home. The Shire and Hobbiton, as discussed earlier, is an agricultural area. The vegetation is rich, with a green hill-covered countryside, which greets the spectators as they follow the characters into the space. The colours in the space are so bright, that the space seems even more fantastical in nature.

The colour green is associated with vegetation and thus, with life and growth. Even although it can be assumed that Hobbiton is such a space of growth and life, there is not much development in the structures and inhabitants of the village itself, as it remains constant and unchanging in character and in life view. This perception is verified by the way that the inhabitants of the village carry on with their same daily chores as usual; they are still unaware of the War of the Ring; only Frodo, Merry, Pippin and Sam have changed and grown. Green is also the link between life and death (Cirlot 53), imprinting the concept that this village was the link between good and evil. It is from Hobbiton that four of the significant characters came, and in the end it remains up to all of them to save Middle Earth. The Shire is the region that Sauron forgot, he forgot about the inhabitants, the Hobbits. Yet they form the link between death and life and are therefore crucial to the success of the quest. They are significant, because they indirectly gave life to the inhabitants of Middle Earth, in the same way as they would tend to their gardens. Interestingly enough, green connects to the ability to adapt and to sympathise. Adaptability may link to the characters from Hobbiton, but not to the space itself. Frodo,
Merry, Pippin and Sam have had to adapt in different spaces and situations in order to survive. Aragorn tells Merry that he has learned that Hobbits are “hardy” folk. Consequently, the green hills and the growth of plants in Hobbiton might actually be symbolic of the people that inhabit it.

In the film, Hobbiton is represented as an all-natural and nature-orientated space. The atmosphere is one of happiness; the characters laugh loudly, drink beer and enjoy their lives. The scene is light and there is almost no darkness found in Hobbiton. Bright saturated colours are used, which suggest to the spectators that the surrounding space is one of joyfulness and brightness. Throughout the film, the spectators may recall Hobbiton as a haven; a homely space to return to and where one may be safe. In contrast to the other spaces, the grass is greener, the sky is bluer, colourful flowers are seen everywhere and on the hills sheep graze contentedly. When the characters ride into their home country on a pathway between two hills, one on each side of the frame (Screen capture 26), the spectators experience the effect of walking or riding through a wondrously peaceful space.

Twilight reveals a different part of the same space (Screen capture 27). The representation of Hobbiton is a place totally removed from the rest of the spaces seen or mentioned in the rest of the film. Neither white nor black are dominant colours in this space; rather, all colours are represented equally. The colour brown might be more dominant in some scenes. Brown and ochre are symbolically associated with the earth, reinforcing the idea that the Shire and its inhabitants are close to nature and earthy in character. It is neither evil, nor does anything suggest to the spectators that there is only good to be found in the space, it is thus neutral. It is however, the only space which remains constant in the film, and has remained unchanged by the war: all of the characters are the same in *The Return of the King* as they were first seen in *The Fellowship of the Ring*. At first glance only Frodo, Sam, Pippin and Merry have changed, but there are subtle changes in the village: the world has encroached on them. The extreme long shot shows rolling soft hills and a village scene with houses and windows filled with soft light and chimney smoke. In this Screen capture (27) the spectators can see the bridge that links the village to the Old Mill. A bridge symbolises the link between that which can be seen and that “which is beyond perception” (Cirlot 33): it is an image of transition from one state to another. Through their travels, the fellowship crossed many
bridges into the unknown and as none of the four Hobbits had ever left the border of the Shire before their quest, they too undertake the challenge of passing over the bridges in the Shire to start their journey to Rivendell. They move from the known, safe space of home, to the unknown and different spaces of Middle Earth. Once they cross the bridges, the new characters they meet as well as the spaces and objects within the spaces undoubtedly influence them. This change is also symbolised by the bridge and is reinforced by the next scene of the tavern.

The four friends are presented in the tavern sitting almost quietly, while all the other Hobbits laugh and drink around them (Screen capture 28). While there is so much that could be said between them, they prefer to stay quiet. The silence is not uncomfortable in any way; their quest, journey and friendship have brought them together in a social space where words are almost unnecessary. On the other hand, they have changed since crossing the bridge from the Shire into the other regions, from the overly excited and fun-loving friends the spectators have seen in the first film, to more mature Hobbits in the last. This bridge might also be a symbolic bridge crossed between their safe and comfortable lives, to a new, adventurous and challenging journey. The other Hobbits have not crossed the bridges or borders; they still keep to themselves and do not care for the business of the outside world. They seem unchanged. The four friends have seen the world, they have done battle and they have changed the world, not only the larger world (Middle Earth), but they have also altered their own inner worlds. As they have grown in character, they have also brought home their different personalities and a transformed, broader outlook on life. Consequently, their experiences have modified their immediate personal and social space within the larger space of Hobbiton. With change also comes a new perspective on life. This perception is reflected in the pink and orange colours of the sky in the background of the Screen capture. In the front of the screen is a lake, coloured with the same colours as the sky, intimating to the spectators that the sun is setting. The sun has also set on an episode of their lives and they can now start again fresh to carry on with their lives, but with newly attained knowledge and wisdom.

The scene of the friends departing from Hobbiton to the Grey Havens (Screen capture 29) occurs later in the scene within the Shire. It is an aerial shot, once again to present to the spectators the fantasy space of Hobbiton; it also depicts the peacefulness and the almost pastoral environment of the village. The lake takes up most of the space in the left hand
side of the frame, with a house on the right hand side, in opposite corners of the frame. The house has generally always been associated with the feminine as represented by Rosie and the children awaiting Sam’s return from the Grey Havens. Once again, the spectators are reminded in this shot of all the houses visible in the village, reinforcing the idea of a safe, homely environment. Water is equated with the image of life and the forces of good. These images of the lake captured in Screen captures 27 and 29, emphasise the peacefulness of the lake, with no movement on it, creating the feeling of stability, tranquillity and peacefulness. The waters suggest no turmoil.

There are two interior spaces shown to the spectators in Hobbiton, the tavern and Bag End. Within the tavern, there is low light, also reinforced by the candles burning on the tables, creating a peaceful atmosphere, almost romantic. All of the characters within the space display smiling faces, representing their good heartedness and their good natures, while the soft violin music together with laughter, chattering and the sound of ale mugs clinking against each other reinforces the space as one of happiness and relaxation. The four friends are in the front of this medium shot spatial field, (Screen capture 28), placing the focus on them. In the background of the same shot, other Hobbits are visible, laughing and having a good time. The four friends are dressed in white shirts, making them stand out from the rest, reinforcing the image of their good nature to the spectators. As previously mentioned, they have changed with regard to some aspects of their identity. As they clink their mugs together, the words that Frodo uttered just minutes previously ring true again: they are friends bonded for life. This companionship is a central theme throughout the film and is all the more significant, because it contrasts with many acts of betrayal. Through the journey they had undertaken, they have bonded and their friendship and loyalty have grown stronger. It is a very personal space, a medium close-up shot, bringing the spectators closer to the friends, a social space of friendship and togetherness. The space also has emotional value, as it is the one memory that they all shared as they travelled and yearned for the day that they could return: to sit once again in the tavern with a mug of ale – and here they are, all together sharing the memory.

The other interior space is that of Bag End, the largest house in the village, where Frodo lives. Houses represent safety and privacy. Bachelard (4) states that “…our house is our corner of the world […] our first universe” which thus shapes our frame of reference. The
Chapter 4: Space in the film, *The Return of the King*

Screen capture 26: The four Hobbits entering Hobbiton.

Screen capture 27: Sunset over Hobbiton.

Screen capture 28: In the tavern.

Screen capture 29: Hobbiton before the journey to the Grey Havens.
house thus becomes the first small cosmos within the larger cosmos of the world, showing the inter-connectedness of all the spaces. These houses, or homes also retain memories, and through memories, also protection (Bachelard 5). These Hobbit-homes are dug into the hills and are represented with round wooden windows and doors. The houses in the ground which the Hobbits live in, might mimic the representation of the burial mounds where Théoden laid his son to rest. These hollows might also represent gateways to new worlds; they are also associated with the “...unconscious as the link between all these different aspects” (Cirlot 150). The aspects are death, memory, fertility and the concept of a mother figure. The hole is furnished with wood on the inside, creating a warm, homely feel. The colours are largely shades of brown, which is quite literal when taking into account that the hole is indeed in the earth as well as symbolic when thinking of the earthy and natural character of the space. There are fires burning in the hearths and the spectators can hear the sound of the fire crackling as it burns peacefully. The colours, lighting and sounds of crackling fire create a warm and peaceful atmosphere.

Within the house, the different rooms are shown by means of follow shots, which create the illusion of a search. The search is for Frodo and to show where he is within the house. Every time Frodo is shown within the house, he is framed by the structure of the house. Frodo is seen in Screen capture 30 within the circular forms of the arches in the house while in Screen capture 31 he is again framed by the doorway, which also has a soft rounded form. By framing him in such a way, the spectators seem to be looking into another frame, standing on the outside, peering into this warm and homely atmosphere created by the soft music, the sound and sight of the fireplace and also the use of colour: soft, muted hues of red, light brown, warm browns and yellow. Brown and shades of brown are associated with “the earth” (Cirlot 53) and together with the images of green healthy vegetation, of people living close to the earth, the spectators recognise that this is a space connected to the earth. The space is inhabited by characters who live in accordance with the rules of nature. They regard and respect it and in return nature gives fertility to the fields.

In Screen capture 31, Frodo is filmed with his back to the spectators, making it easy for anyone to associate with him and place themselves in Frodo’s position. The light shines through the rounded window onto Frodo where he sits writing in the study, at the same desk where Bilbo is first presented in The Fellowship of the Ring. This same space in
which they are portrayed, doing the same thing, writing, connects Bilbo and Frodo not only as family members, but also as two individuals who have travelled, have seen many wondrous and evil things, and have both known the effect of the Ring on their lives. The light shining through the window might seem symbolic: by indicating the absence of darkness, it could be concluded that the events signifying the forces of darkness have been driven away and light now shines on Frodo. He is no longer burdened with the weight of the Ring and his internal emotional struggle. However, not everything is perfect. He notes that there is no really going back, no going back to the way things were: he has also been changed forever. The shot alters to a medium close-up to show Frodo, where he is writing, stopping to rub his left shoulder. He tells Sam that it is four years to the day since he had been injured on Weathertop, but the wound has never really healed. The wound he sustained on Weathertop in the first film, *The Fellowship of the Ring*, constantly ails him. He is thus not truly saved, and the war has left a lasting, unhealed scar. The atmosphere in this scene is calm and relaxed. Frodo is narrating in a soft voice before Sam enters and the music is peaceful, with the soft sound of birds twittering in the background. It is an idyllic space, a safe haven to which all characters and spectators may escape. A close-up shot reveals the title of the book Frodo has been writing in: “There and back again: A Hobbit’s Tale by Bilbo Baggins & The Lord of the Rings by Frodo Baggins”. As he closes the book, the shot reveals it covered in an oldish red leather cover with a silver star at the top. It seems to the spectators that the Hobbits might have been writing the story all along, as the characters, events and spaces within the film are now written down in a recollection. This definitely also subtly refer back to the original written text by Tolkien.

The book within the space is highly symbolic. Not only is it part of the space; it also concerns the space of the complete trilogy, as it records the written events represented in the film. Cirlot (31) notes that the “…universe is an immense book; the characters of this book is written” just as the characters, and their paths in life, within the novel and film have been written. This book might thus also symbolise the embodiment of the space of Middle Earth. Frodo sits and writes down their experiences on the journey, writing down the events of their lives, thereby perhaps penning the book of his life. According to Cirlot (31), a book also symbolises the power to “…ward off evil spirits”. This book tells the tale of the battle against an evil spirit, Sauron, and recalls the triumph not only over Sauron, but also the battle with the multiple internal evil spirits within the characters, such as Frodo’s desire for the Ring, Pippin’s lack of courage and Aragorn’s doubting of himself and his destiny. The silver star is symbolic of the spirit (Cirlot 309), which is captured
within this book that he has written. The book of his life becomes his legacy, and might one day become a legend. A star almost always conveys more than one meaning, and might allude to the “…spirit struggling against the forces of darkness” (Cirlot 309), which also thus comes to represent Frodos’ internal struggle with his desire for the evil Ring and the power that it holds and his own, good nature.

The space of Hobbiton is a reassuring space for the characters and thus also indirectly for the spectators; it is peaceful and filled with laughter, the sound of birds and with many emotions of friendship, joy and love. This space is the only one in the film that connects with the emotions of happiness and love throughout the trilogy and does not alter in meaning. Symbolic spaces, especially imaginary ones, are spaces that address the spectator's own experiences, frame of reference and knowledge. Certain landscapes lend themselves to specific emotions connected to them and this is why spaces are so important within the films, as they evoke specific emotions through the narrative within the spectators.

The last scene of the film is of Sam returning once again to his home (Screen capture 32) after their journey to the Grey Havens, where they took leave of Frodo and the last of the guardians of Middle Earth, Celeborn, Galdriel, Elrond and Gandalf. The brightness of the light and the vivid colours used in this scene create a space filled with a feeling of happiness and of light-heartedness. The psychological space is thus one of warmth and happiness. The soft round bend of the path corresponds with the circular shapes of the doors and windows of the houses and once again with the circular form of the Ring. The circle image is repeated throughout the film, in the shape of the Ring, the journey that starts and ends in Hobbiton and also in the circular doors, windows and arches of the houses. This symbolises something that has come full circle, something that has taken place over a passage of time. These images of roundness also symbolise completeness. Bachelard mentions that such images “…help us to collect ourselves […] and to confirm our being intimately; inside […] being cannot be otherwise than round” (Bachelard 234). The door is yellow (Screen capture 33), which symbolises the sun (also circular in form) and the fact that the sun comes out and drives the darkness away. Yellow also symbolises “magnanimity, intuition and intellect” (Cirlot 54). All of these are highly regarded moral values throughout the film, which the main characters have achieved in some measure at its conclusion. They have grown in character, in values
Screen capture 30: Frodo walking through Bag End.

Screen capture 31: Frodo in the study.

Screen capture 32: Sam’s house.

Screen capture 33: The round yellow door.
and moral stature. Their view has broadened through their journey and they have achieved enlightenment, each in their own time and in their own manner. The round door correlates with the image of the Ring, which is the constant motif and most important symbol in the narrative. However, the round door symbolises good, whereas the Ring is evil in nature. As the ending, the circular yellow door, that slowly fades away into a black screen, conveys the message to the spectators that at the end of the journey, the sun shines again, good has been achieved and the darkness driven away.

4.4. CONCLUSION

As evident from the analysis, different effects and atmospheres are created within the same space by using various film techniques. Every shot is planned, from the lighting to the costumes, to fit the event, the current situation, the characters and of course, the space in which all of these take place. The three spaces that have been analysed all speak for the representation or concretisation of a life and the worldview represented in a fantasy story. All three represent the world view of the triumph over evil. Minas Tirith is presented as the city of good, of freedom and peace, depicted by the use of light, bright colours, bright lighting and symbolism created by objects such as the Tree within the City. Mordor is presented as the city of evil, enslavement and death. Mordor, in contrast to Minas Tirith, is revealed in dark, saturated colours and dim lighting, creating an atmosphere without hope. The space directly surrounding the characters symbolises evil when contrasted with Minas Tirith; it represents the type of character that inhabits such a space; a dark place with a lifeless environment is thus inhabited by evil. The contrast to Minas Tirith is extended with regard to the colour and symbolism linked with colour, as well as the physical, geographical space or terrain of Mordor. The structures of both Minas Tirith and Mordor stretch to the sky in vertical lines, but the association differs greatly. The structures in Minas Tirith are associated with the gothic and religious, whereas the structures in Mordor further emphasise a barren, unsafe, evil space. Each of the spaces is represented by its inhabitants: those of Minas Tirith tend to be peaceful and good hearted by nature, whereas those of Mordor are evil by nature. Darkness is only symbolic of evil when it is directly contrasted with light, which will then represent good (Cirlot 77). This is indeed the case in this film, as the two regions, Gondor and Mordor, are not only contrasted with each other with regard to the obvious use of colour, darkness and brightness, but also by directly being placed opposite each other on the map of Middle
Earth. The contrast of good and evil is also emphasised when the characters who inhabit the space and the objects that are found within the place are taken into account.

Hobbiton, unlike the other two spaces, is a constant space in the film. Represented as a space untouched by and unaware of the danger and evil, it is a middle ground where there is not simplistic good or evil, but where the good-heartedness and inherent good nature of the Hobbits are prevalent in the physical, and symbolic representation of the space. There is harmony in the space. It is also clear from the analysis that there are many symbolic meanings within these spaces that are unconsciously registered in the mind of the spectators. Through these spaces, whether they are concrete, emotional or psychological and symbolic, the spectators gather meaning to fit each of their situations and ideologies and make the film and the message contained within the film relevant to themselves. There are a multitude of themes suggested throughout the film. The first and primary theme is that of good versus evil. There are also secondary themes that contribute to the primary one, such as friendship, honour, spiritual and mental growth and the conservation of nature. If some of the secondary themes such as friendship had not been present, the primary theme of good versus evil might not have existed and the good would not have prevailed over evil. The three spaces are representations of the themes within the film, and through the specific representations of the spaces, the characters are allowed to grow and discover who and what they truly are. Space within the film is successfully represented. The brilliant use of lighting, colour and music creates contrasting and diverse spaces, which are still binary opposites in nature, which represents the real world and its passage. The themes within the film are ones that speak to all ages, genders and races. It transcends the boundaries of space and time, as the spaces presented in the film are recognisable.
CHAPTER 5:
SYNTHESIS: COMPARISON AND CONCLUSION

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This study has attempted to establish how spaces are represented in the novel, *The Return of the King* (1955), as well as in its 21st century film adaptation in order to determine the resonances in which the rendition of the described written spaces in the novel conveys the meaning in their visual film counterparts. For this purpose, theoretical issues were investigated in Chapter 2, which include narrative space and specifically the representation of space in novel and film by comparing similar scenes from both texts, taking note of the objects found within these selected spaces, the interaction of the characters within these spaces, the interaction between space, the role of the narrator, events and time, as well as the meanings generated, both concrete and abstract, within these spaces. Semiotics comes into play in the abstract and symbolic interpretations of the spaces, although it is superseded by “perspective” as a determinative factor in the interpretation, because the individual interpretation plays a decisive role in this discussion. Semiotics is the study of signs and the way in which they are given and interpreted. Such an interpretation would of necessity refer to the theory concerned with the reader/spectator interpretation of the spaces, the theme and world view of the novel, as well as taking cognisance of the symbolic meanings associated with these specific scenes and their interpretation in terms of the two texts, as well as their significance within the entire trilogy of *The Lord of the Rings*.

Chapter 3 entails an analysis of the novel and narrative space. The discussion addresses the representation of space in a novel and raises the importance of space within any epic quest novel such as *The Lord of the Rings* and in particular *The Return of the King*. A detailed analysis of the three selected spaces within the novel is presented and the prominence of space and its significance in the creation of meaning within the novel is emphasised. The spaces are discussed by focussing on the concrete spaces and the symbolic meaning thereof, as well as the psychological experience and abstract spaces within each space, as referring to a world view. However, it is important to realise that the
spaces selected form part of the various journeys undertaken by members of the fellowship, who reflect their experiences in their respective observations and actions. All these different perspectives serve to contribute towards the generation of symbolic meanings embodied by the spaces and highlight the symbolic meaning of the main “pilgrimage” undertaken by Frodo and Sam.

This same structure of analysis and the same spaces are used to carry out an analysis in Chapter 4, but in terms of the film as a medium and of film theory. As with Chapter 3, the focus in Chapter 4 is on the space, the importance of space within the quest of the characters as well as the meaning and influence of the space on the characters and the spectator. With these analyses of spaces in novel and film at hand, it should be possible to compare and assess the respective impacts achieved by the two different mediums. Consequently, reference to the theory of adaptations should be observed. In the comparison between the spaces in novel and film, emphasis will be placed on their respective ways of representation in order to determine the variants and the constants present within the two mediums. Firstly, the representation of the variants will be discussed, followed by the representation of constants. The conclusion will then serve as an exposition with respect to the means of representation of the spatial aspects within the novel and the film.


Bal (9) notes that a narrative text is a story “conveyed to recipients, and this telling requires a medium”, which can be effected through language, imagery, sound or even by combining the different mediums. Narrative texts can thus be written texts as well as visual representations, such as film. Whereas a novel is a written text, a film is a medium that integrates “most other arts in its representation, from music, architecture, and acting to literature and poetry” (Grodal 168) by visual showing. The original written text has been adapted to film by Peter Jackson and retained its original name in the film as well, The Return of the King. Although the film is a narrative “in contrast to literary fiction it communicates in film” (Lothe 11). An adaptation of a novel to film is, for Lothe (8) and many other scholars, the transposing of literature to film or as Lothe calls it, a “translation
to film language”. The transposing of literature into film is however not simply taking the characters, the events and the spaces within a novel and putting them onto digital media: it is much more. In order to adapt the novel to film, the plot has to be fitted to the latter. Novels are often longer than films, so the chronology has to be adjusted, and thus the director also has to decide what the important events are and what can be left out without affecting the main story too much. Unlike written texts, film “may provide a wide variety of data simultaneously” (Grodal 169) which presents the spectators with a multitude of information at once, for example, such as the representation of a specific space. All of these aspects have to be taken into account when attempting to adapt a novel into another medium.

Grodal (169) notes that it is almost impossible to isolate signifiers in the film that correspond to words within a text. It is not a “one-to-one transposition of story elements into images” (Bal 167), but rather the novel’s most important aspects and meanings that have to be visually worked through and adapted to fit the visual medium. Lothe emphasises the fact that “literary and screen texts are in many ways very different”, for example the language and the medium in which it is presented; however “the most important components […] time, space and causality – are central concepts” in literature as well as in film (Lothe 8). He also mentions that characters are “part of a linguistically constructed fiction, in film they are indeed visualized for us”; they are part of a complex aesthetic device (Lothe 76). It is the narrative aspects of novel and film that are crucial for both the way in which the text functions and the effect the text has on the audience; the aspects only differ in the way they are presented to the reader and spectator. Cohen (qtd. in Lothe 88) mentions that in “both novel and cinema, groups of signs [are present], be they literary or visual signs, thus implied semiotics are apprehended consecutively through time”, making them potentially comparable in both mediums. The points of view in a novel and film are usually the same, with the exception that the point of view in the film might not only be a metaphor, but also the “concrete perceptual fact linked to the camera position” (Grodal 168). Film thus not only imitates but also expands the already existing written texts.

While (Bal 167) focuses on the “principle of meaning-production” which is the same for both textual and visual texts, Lothe (87) and the critics mentioned below emphasise various aspects that influence the success of film adaptations involving sound and light
effects and the synchronisation of time. According to Lothe (87), the director of a film will tend to use “forms of presentation which do justice to, and highlight the artistic quality of the literary starting-point” when adapting a novel to film. Braningham (qtd. in Lothe 90) believes that “light and sound create two fundamental systems of space, time and casual interaction: on screen and within a story world”, while Mast (qtd. in Lothe 63) notes that film’s greatest value lies in the fact that there is an “uninterrupted flow of film and time” which binds the spectator’s full attention to the screen.

Yet, Eikhenbaum (qtd. in Lothe 87) claims that people watch films more often than they read books nowadays, and these films have to possess some kind of magnetism in order to create such a following. However, this could also be attributed to a dislike of reading as such. Bal’s view (7) is more analytical as she claims that analysing a text requires the recognition of and the distinction between the different layers of a text. Such an approach would determine the effect that the text has on the recipient, which can be understood and analysed. She (Bal 11) substantiates her opinion by claiming that textual description of a text creates a basis for the interpretation of the text, from “which it cannot be distinguished”.

Lothe (86) clearly emphasises that “film is the most vital and exciting of artistic media” which create different emotions in the spectators, who all come from different environments, different socio-economic and geographical backgrounds. Yet novels and films have an effect on people and these effects are important to keep in mind, because even though there are so many differences between the two mediums, there are still constants: pleasure is present when reading and experiencing a novel as well as when watching and experiencing a film. The message carried through the novel and the film to the receiver might still be the same and the two mediums might convey the same story. Fictional texts and film are thus comparable in that both are forms of narrative, which consist of space, events and characters who may differ in the way that they are represented to the recipient, but film might also make use of literary concepts such as personification and metaphors.
In 5.3, the representation of the three spaces, Minas Tirith, Mount Doom and Hobbiton is discussed and compared, novel against film. This is done in order to create a summary of variants and constants within the presentation of space in both media. Firstly, the variants are compared, which are followed by the constants. The variants and constants will be compared by making use of the theories discussed in 2.3, which include the content and meaning of spatial representation, objects described in the space, repetition and accumulation of spatial information, as well as the movement and interaction of characters within and between different spaces. The spaces will be compared by focussing on the different dimensions of space: concrete or physical, interactive and abstract space. In conclusion, a complete exposition will be given to discuss the final variants and constants, as well as the difference in representation. This will also be displayed at the end of the discussions in a summarised table.

5.3. VARIANTS IN THE REPRESENTATION OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE NOVEL AND FILM

The variants are aspects within the representation of the novel and the film that have been modified with the adaptation from one medium to the other. The representation of space will be assessed by comparing the difference in the focus of the variants within the novel and the film. A table consisting of the variants and constants in the novel and the film is provided at the end of Chapter 5.4.

One of the first variants between novel and film is of course the nature of the medium. A novel is a medium that tells a story in a written text, whereas a film visually displays or performs the story through images in a variety of colours, different sounds and by mimicking real life. Lothe (11) conveys the idea that “film is narrative in the sense that it presents a story, but in contrast to literary fiction it communicates filmically”. The concrete, physical spaces of Minas Tirith, Mount Doom and Hobbiton are depicted by the narrator through descriptive paragraphs in the novel. However, these same descriptive words are transformed into visual representations in the film. The images that the readers are invited to imagine now need to be visually presented to the spectator. The narrator and descriptive detail are thus not necessary in the film, as the visually information-loaded scene is presented to the spectator. The spaces within the novel are represented to the reader over the span of 1112 pages (in the complete trilogy), accompanied by forewords,
appendices and maps. The information is given to the reader in scattered pieces of information right throughout the novel and he or she must also involve his or her imagination to put together the information and create a full mental image of that which is described, and even that which is not described in detail. In the film, the spaces are depicted through images and sounds. The spectators do not need to use their imagination to envision the spaces in the film, as they are depicted in fine and full detail. A shot can contain thousands of informational signs that are thus given to the spectators all at once and not over a period as is the case with the novel.

Unlike the novel by Tolkien, Jackson did not separate the two major storylines of Frodo and Sam and the rest of the Fellowship, but interwove these within the film to produce a feeling of progression in both of the storylines, leading up to the climactic finale. Tolkien wrote the novel with different storylines, as many as four, that eventually converge near the end of the novel in Minas Tirith. The different lines might have advanced quite a long way with regard to events, character interaction and even over various spaces before Tolkien would continue with the next line. In the film, however, the different storylines are interwoven more frequently: almost every other scene is from a different storyline. The novel, *The Return of the King*, also spans over the 387 pages that can be read at the reader’s leisure, and the time devoted thus to the description of each space depends on the reader, whereas the film spans approximately 240 minutes, creating a difference in time as well as means of representation. In order to capture all of the information in the novel in the short span of 240 minutes, the screenwriters have to change, add or eliminate certain events, characters and spaces within the novel, without affecting the plot. Some events have also been moved from the novel in which they occur to different scenes and even different films. These scenes include, for example, the road to Isengard, the scene with the Palantir, Shelob’s lair, Cirith Ungol and the road to the crossroads which occurred in the second novel, *The Two Towers*, but were moved to the film *The Return of the King* in order to accord Frodo and Sam more prominence and interaction within the last film. The most prominent and major scene left out of the film, *The Return of the King*, is the scouring of the Shire, which is only portrayed to the spectators as a vision when Frodo glances into Galadriel’s mirror in *The Fellowship of the Ring*. 
The representation of space within the novel and the film will be further discussed in order to compare each space’s representation, so as finally to produce a summary of variants found within the novel and the film, *The Return of the King*.

### 5.3.1 Gondor: Minas Tirith

As mentioned in 5.3, the means of representation differ in the novel and the film. In the novel, the narrator has much more time to describe the space of Minas Tirith to the readers. He might give information on the City throughout the trilogy and then more specifically in the novel, *The Return of the King*, leading up to the full representation of the space. Minas Tirith is depicted to the readers by means of descriptive paragraphs that explain, from Pippin’s viewpoint, how the City is seen by the character. In the novel, the narrator makes use of descriptive words such as “light”, “airy”, “fair” and “cool” (Tolkien *TLR* 742) to describe the atmosphere and the visage of the City. These words convey certain traits of the City to the reader. Words such as “strong”, “white” and “seven” are also repeated several times throughout the novel to emphasise the importance of this specific trait and also to connect certain words in the reader’s mind with this image and the significance of the specific trait of the City. Minas Tirith is continually described as the “White City”, containing a white tower; this repetition and accumulation of terms to describe it continually adds another aspect of the represented space to the City imagined by the readers. The City is further described by the characters’ dialogue and interaction with each other. Through their words and their actions, certain information regarding the space and the atmosphere within the space is implied. Pippin and Beregond discuss the effect that Mordor seems to have on the City and the people within it; through their perspective and conversation, the narrator gives the readers further information on the physical description of the City. They stand on the Citadel looking out over the Pelennor Fields and describe the fact that the shadow has grown and the City is living under it. Through this discussion of the physical space of Minas Tirith, the psychological space of the City is also suggested. The author also incorporates maps and appendices as well as forewords, which can contain information on the space, in order to visually aid the description, thus enhancing the image of the space in the minds of the readers.
The film does not have the luxury of introducing a space, and then gradually building on the description through descriptive text, because the time has to be compressed in order to facilitate the film, since the director only has the stretch of a few hours to introduce and describe a space. This description in a film can also not take the form of a foreword or appendix as in the case of the novel; it has to be done so as to keep the movement of the film flowing, to emulate the course of the story in the film. The film therefore has to sacrifice some of the events and characters in the novel. The events not used in the film include the march of the allied forces into Minas Tirith, the council held after Aragorn’s coronation and the replanting of the Tree of Gondor, to mention a few. Characters that are not mentioned in the film are, for example, Beregond and his son, Bergil, as they do not contribute to the overall storyline. To capture all of the relevant information in the novel in the short span of 240 minutes requires discipline to conform to the main plotline of the story and exclude the non-essential. Another reason for omitting some of the events and characters from the film is that each new character has to be introduced and placed into context, which will take up more of the time available for the film. The description of the space in the film differs thus, in that the spatial information is given to the spectators during the viewing of the film. The movement of events and characters from one space to another takes up and guides the spectators’ attention, so that some of the detail of the represented space might be overlooked, whereas in the novel, the information is given to the readers piece by piece to accumulate over the timespan of the novel.

Where the space is represented in the novel by descriptive paragraphs and by means of information given to the readers by the characters as they walk through the City, the film differs in the manner of representation. As the film does not make use of written, descriptive text, the information is visually represented to the spectators. In the film, different means of representation to depict the space of Minas Tirith to the spectators have to be used. Sibley (73) mentions that since the filming of *The Return of the King* is set in a fictional world, “virtually every single item had to be custom-made” to represent the objects, the spaces and the characters within the novel and stay true to the novel. Jackson used sets as well as a miniature for his “key location in *The Return of the King*”, Minas Tirith (Sibley 63). All of the sets and miniatures are inspired by Tolkien’s novel, but illustrated by conceptual artists Alan Lee and John Howe59, who “shape much of the look of the film” between themselves (Sibley 60). The depictions of the spaces are thus a

59 See Appendix B for conceptual sketches by Alan Lee of both Minas Tirith and Mordor.
depiction that is inspired by Tolkien, conceptualised by Lee and Howe and finally constructed as sets, thus being not the direct interpretation by the narrator in the novel but an interpretation of an interpretation. Sibley (60) mentions that Jackson wanted “to see Tolkien’s world as fully visualized as possible. So we made elaborate architectural models” and the detail had to be as true to the novel as possible.

Along with the miniatures, Jackson made use of visual effects to enhance the space and “show” Minas Tirith to the spectator. The space is depicted by means of different shots: long shots and aerial shots giving a complete view of the space, showing the whole City in all its glory, medium shots displaying the interior of the City in more detail such as the arches and columns in the streets of Minas Tirith, and close-up shots to portray the characters’ emotions or to focus on specific objects within the space such as the first blossom on the Tree. By the film crew’s making use of certain shots and angles the spectators are able to experience time, space and interaction between characters in a more personal manner, as these effects might include the spectators more personally. The depiction of the space might also be conveyed through the actions of the characters. For example, in the novel the narrator might write that Pippin is in awe of the City, but in the film this has to be visually represented by the actor’s actions, body language and facial expression. By portraying the various characters’ expressions, the space is loaded with specific emotions in specific contexts, creating unconsciously (in the spectator) the psychological space of Minas Tirith. Characters are depicted expressing anger and showing fear during the siege of Gondor, which in turn implies to the spectators that this is now a space of despair, chaos and fear. The same characters (such as Pippin and Gandalf) are later portrayed laughing and celebrating the coronation of the king, transforming the psychological space of the City to one of joy, rejuvenation and peace. The novel and film thus differ in the means of representation of the space: even though the film keeps the representation as close as possible to the description in the novel, certain aspects had to be altered for the space to be represented filmically.

One of the major variants in the representation of the space between the novel and the film is the wall around the Pelennor field and subsequently the battle in the latter. In the novel, this field surrounds the City and is in turn surrounded by a great wall which is being repaired as Gandalf and Pippin journey to Minas Tirith. During the battle, the wall surrounding the field is broken through and Sauron’s armies march to the City, breaking
down the first door, but are surprised when the allies of Minas Tirith arrive. They all retreat into the field where the major battle is fought. This is altered dramatically in the film as there is no wall surrounding the field. This might seem trivial, but as there is no wall to break through in the field, the army breaks through the first wall of the city, entering into the City and also breaking down the second door. The implication is that armies of Sauron, who never physically enter into the City in the novel, now wage battle within its walls, attack men, women and children and take control of the first level of Minas Tirith. This change might seem preferable in the film as it creates a more exciting and action filled battle scene, also representing the City in more detail and a different atmosphere, but it affects the image of the City. The City has never been invaded previously in the novel; in the film, though, the City is thus infected or ravaged by the enemies and its purity and innocence is stripped away. There are no other major alterations in the physical structure of the City, except for the White Tower that has been moved to the right hand side of the throne hall, and not directly on top of it. This is also to illustrate that the tower does not play such a significant role in the film.

The characters contribute to the space as they interact with other characters there, as well as with objects and the space itself. In the novel, the interaction has to be written and described to the readers who then form a partial image of the description in their minds. It is partial, since the information given in a novel can never be imagined in full detail and the readers have to be creative and insert information where gaps appear in the description. In the film, the characters are presented to the spectators with make-up and costumes to represent certain cultures, backgrounds or other information. Each character can express different emotions within the space, contributing to its atmosphere and the spectator’s experience of the space. Music contributes to the atmosphere of the film as well as the spectator’s reception of a specific event. By means of music and sound effects, the spectators can be influenced to feel tense or afraid as in the siege of Gondor, whereas later in the same space, with a different musical score playing, the same space can fill them with joy, peace and a feeling of being content. Thus, by including make-up, costume, visual effects and music or sound, more information can be given at once to the spectators regarding the space, which is not possible in the novel. Even though Tolkien included written songs in his novel, the readers cannot know how the author intended the songs to sound, in which voice and accompanied by which instruments. The songs are thus reduced in the novel to mere poems, not music. All of these aspects of film convey meaning more quickly and even more clearly than the words and descriptions in the novel.
The characters in the film were adapted and altered, keeping certain characteristics from the novel, but also changing many of them, which in turn causes certain events to differ. Aragorn is one of the characters who has been altered the most with regard to his personality and characteristic traits. In the novel, Aragorn has been raised in Rivendell fully knowing who he is and what his role will be in the battle against Sauron. He has been fighting against Sauron and his allies for many years as a Ranger, but only after the battle at Pelennor Field and by healing the characters in the House of Healing, does he feel himself worthy of entering the City as King. In the film, the spectators might gain the impression that Aragorn does not want to follow in his forefathers’ footsteps and become king, that he doubts in his ability to be a good ruler. He seems hesitant towards any suggestion that he needs to ascend the throne, and seems content with his life as a Ranger. Unlike the novel, Aragorn does not only seem to doubt his own abilities as a worthy king, but is also uncertain whether he wants to obtain the responsibility of becoming king and wielding so much power. Jackson comments that Aragorn "is the heir to the throne; he is the sole person capable of assuming this position in Minas Tirith, but he is unsure of his worthiness to lead mankind" (A note from Peter Jackson). This modification in Aragorn’s character however does create another level of meaning in him as a character. To discover the answer to his inner struggle, he has to undertake an internal journey to make peace with the past and discover that he does not long for power, but for the bettering of Middle Earth. Elrond only awards Anduril, the sword that he wears, to Aragorn before he takes his leave to search for the army of the Dead in the film. However, in the novel Aragorn carries the shards of Narsil with him, and later the reforged sword. Nowhere in the film is any mention made of the fact that Elrond will only let Arwen marry Aragorn if he becomes King of Gondor and Arnor, as he does in the novel. The alteration in Aragorn’s character might diminish his heroic nature and his honoured, royal heritage. The changes in characters are not visible to the spectators who have not read the novels, but the readers of the novels might find that Aragorn has lost some part of his authority.
The themes and pointers to its worldview within the novel depend on the implied reader’s perception of them. Even though all of the same themes and ideologies might be clear to all the readers of the novel, specific themes or worldviews might be more important to one reader than to another; their perception differs. This is true also for the themes and worldviews within the film. Within the latter, however, more focus and significance can be placed on certain themes. An example would be the focus placed on the theme of romantic love as Aragorn and Arwen’s love for and connectedness to each other was made more central to the film than in the case of the novel. In the novel, Tolkien concluded the love story of Aragorn and Arwen in the appendices, but in the film the spectators are given a glimpse of their future when Arwen sees their child in an apparition. In order to incorporate Arwen better in *The Return of the King*, the film connects her fate to that of the Ring: the stronger the power of the Ring, the weaker Arwen becomes. This differs completely from the novel.

As the film adaptation can never be true to the novel in every aspect, Hutcheon (xv) mentions that the appeal of adaptations actually lies “in the mixture of repetition and differences, of familiarity and novelty”. The novel, as well as the film adaptation, relies on the reader or spectators’ response. They need to be able to relate to the characters, events and spaces within the novel and the film.

### 5.3.2 Mordor: Mount Doom

Mordor is the depressing, barren and dark space representing the evil in the novel, and the film is kept quite true to the descriptions in the novel. The novel describes the space through the descriptive paragraphs and words as seen from the viewpoints of Frodo, Sam and also Gollum. In the film, the means of description differ, since it makes use of colour, sound and visual representation through images.

Unlike the missing scenes in Minas Tirith, Mordor has extra scenes in the film. The film moved some of the scenes found in the second novel to the third film in order to balance the events and storylines between Frodo and Sam, and the rest of the fellowship. Scenes from Shelob’s lair, the tower of Cirith Ungol and their journey through Mordor have been added from the second novel. By adding scenes, the film interacts more with the
characters of Frodo, Sam and Gollum; it also emphasises the importance of the space in the film, as both Mordor and Minas Tirith receive roughly the same exposure.

After the Ring is destroyed in the Crack of Doom, Mount Doom erupts and the Dark Tower crumbles in the novel. In the film the effect is much more dramatic as the Tower crumbles and upon its touching the ground, a mighty blast of air and debris explodes from it. Along with this massive blast, Mount Doom’s eruption causes the earth to rip open, after which the Black Gates and almost everything in Mordor as well as the servants of Sauron are plunged into a dark canyon in the earth. The change might symbolise in the film that Sauron’s entire evilness is obliterated, but it also destroys the land on which he built his empire, which might seem unnecessary as one of the themes of the novel is the conservation of nature. By completely destroying this space, any opportunity of rehabilitation, re-habitation and healing becomes completely impossible, by implication also modifying or diminishing one of the important themes of the novel in the film.

A physical structure that alters in meaning from the novel to the film is the Eye of Sauron. The Eye is described in the novel as being at the uppermost level of the tower of Barad-dûr and is described as large, fiery and red. Even though the description of the Eye is kept the same in the novel and the film there is a difference. In the novel the Eye is used attributively for Sauron, metaphorically for his constant yearning and search of the Ring. Through this Eye, Sauron can see that which he desires to possess, and the Eye might just be a disguise or metaphor for the Palantir that Sauron possesses. In the film though, the Eye represents Sauron as a character. He never has a physical form in the film, except in the first film, The Fellowship of the Ring, in the battle before he is destroyed by Isildur. In the novel, Gollum tells Frodo and Sam that he saw Sauron when he was tortured and that Sauron had four fingers on his one hand. This suggests to the readers that Sauron indeed has a physical form, and avid readers of Tolkien literature might also know that Sauron could take any form that he wished, including the form of an eye. The modification of the Eye to represent Sauron as a character influences the image of the Dark Lord that the spectators may have developed, since in some opinions, a huge Eye is less of a threat than a vicious Enemy of physical form that also possesses the ability to enter into one’s thoughts.
The characters in the space are influenced by the space, as previously mentioned, and this is indeed seen in Frodo more than any other character. The sight of the shadow and the dark space of Mordor causes other characters to lose hope and start fearing Sauron and his armies. In Frodo, the physical space causes him to doubt if he will return to the Shire and if he will be able to fulfil the quest, but in Frodo’s case, he also carries the Ring that influences him. Since the Ring was made in Mordor, it becomes associated with part of the space; consequently the interaction between Frodo and the Ring, an object, is also dependent on the space of Mordor, which like the Ring is evil by nature. Frodo becomes more possessive of the Ring, he becomes more depressed and the weight of the Ring bears heavier on him every step of the way. In the film, the weight of the Ring is physically represented to the spectators by the chain with the Ring around Frodo’s neck, which cuts or burns into his flesh. The novel never describes the Ring physically weighing down on Frodo, only psychologically, which causes him to feel tired and to lose hope. This change might also have been made to physically represent the weight of the Ring to the spectators, as the film cannot accurately describe Frodo’s internal struggle with the Ring and the toll that it takes on him psychologically.

The novel describes Sam as Frodo’s gardener, even though they are good friends. Sam and Frodo are thus employer and employee. Sam is however still a trusted confidant who keeps a professional distance by continually addressing Frodo as Mr. Frodo or “Master” (Tolkien TLR 924). In the film, their relationship is modified slightly; they are friends more than employer and employee. In the film, as the Ring’s influence over Frodo grows, his paranoia increases: Gollum sees and uses this to his advantage. He constantly tries to turn Frodo against Sam with mischievous intentions such as telling Frodo that Sam wants the Ring as his own and by blaming the disappearance of the lembas bread on Sam. This strategy ultimately pays off as Frodo becomes so suspicious of Sam, and more trusting in Gollum, that he sends Sam away. This never happens in the novel. Sam and Frodo travel through Shelob’s lair together and Sam never leaves Frodo’s side, except where Frodo is taken to the Tower of Cirith Ungol. This variation might have been added to the film in order to create more suspense and danger as Frodo is now led blindly by Gollum, whom the spectators know has his own agenda. The space of Mordor thus contributes to the paranoia created by Gollum.
This alteration in the film completely influences the theme of friendship. In the novel, Sam never leaves Frodo’s side. He is loyal to him and is the driving force behind Frodo for him to succeed in this quest. However, in the film Frodo is influenced by Gollum and starts distrusting Sam to the point that he orders him to go. What is even more distressing is that Sam does indeed leave after Frodo asks him to do so. Sam made a promise to help and protect Frodo, and as a friend he would not have abandoned Frodo even if Frodo requested this. Sam does return to Frodo in the film though, and saves his life, rectifying his lapse in judgement and unfriend-like action. The theme of friendship and loyalty is very prominent in the novel and slightly less prominent in the film.

5.3.3 The Shire: Hobbiton

The representation of Hobbiton is one of the most significant differences in the film. In the novel the Shire is taken over by Saruman and Grima, who influences Lotho Baggins into modifying the Shire into an almost factory-like space. The Party Tree, which is an important aspect of Hobbiton, is cut down and different, un-Hobbit-like houses are built; the mill has been replaced by a new, larger, more mechanical one and the gorgeous lake has been polluted with the debris from the latter. The Hobbits were obliged to experience the space as different in terms of all their senses: the space looks different, it probably smelled worse because of the pollution, the sounds became mechanical; this experience of the different space alters the meaning of the space completely. The inhabitants of the space are also under strict orders not to house anyone without permission from the Chief (Lotho) and they now have gates controlled by ruffians. All of these changes signify, in the novel, that the war has also reached the Shire and that no space is untouched by the evil that dwelled in Middle Earth. The safe haven that all of the Hobbits yearned for while on their journey has been disrupted. The once friendly inhabitants and atmosphere of the Shire have become filled with hostility and cautiousness. The space has been transformed from a country-like, agricultural village into a mechanical, industrial space. Here the theme of nature conservation is also important as evil rules in the form of Saruman and Grima who disrespect nature. The four friends make it their mission to restore Hobbiton to what it once was and restore the peace, joy and relaxed atmosphere it once had. They besiege Bag End, where Saruman had taken up refuge, and Saruman is killed by an angry Grima in front of the house. Blood has been spilled and the enemies destroyed. Over a period of two years, the Hobbits restore Hobbiton.
The novel describes Bagshot Row as being dug up and Bag End also needing to be restored. After this restoration Frodo invites Sam to come and live at Bag End. This invitation also differs in the film. In the novel, Sam and Rosie, and later their children, move in and live at Bag End. They also remain there after Frodo has passed across the ocean from the Grey Havens, whereas in the film Sam’s house is represented as down the road from Bag End in Bagshot Row, in a different smial. The colours of the doors of Sam’s house thus also differ, in the novel being green and in the film yellow.

In the film the representation of the space differs drastically. Hobbiton is represented as the unchanging, safe, homely space that is first presented to the spectators in the first film, *The Fellowship of the Ring*. This image of the space is kept the same during the film and the scouring of the Shire is completely taken out of the film. Saruman and Grima are killed after Orthanc is destroyed by the Ents, so they are not able to invade the Shire. There are glimpses of what might have been the scouring of the Shire in Galadriel’s mirror. However, she suggests that if Frodo were to fail in his quest to destroy the Ring, the scouring would come to pass, when in fact, the scouring is an incident completely removed from the Ring. It happened (in the novel) even though the Ring had been destroyed, suggesting that it is not connected to the Ring. This change is significant in that, excluding the scouring, Hobbiton seems still unaware of the War of the Ring and completely untouched by any evil, which means that neither the space nor its inhabitants evolved or developed in any way. It also does not leave room for the four Hobbits that have developed in character and strength, physically and psychologically, to save their own home as well.

5.4 CONSTANTS IN THE REPRESENTATION OF SELECTED SPACES IN THE NOVEL AND FILM

A constant is an aspect within the novel and the film that has stayed unchanged. The constants are important within the analyses as they provide a list of aspects which prove that the film has indeed been kept as true to the novel in representation of the three spaces as possible. Comparing the constants in the novel and the film will make it possible to compare them with the list of variants and constants in the table provided.
The first aspect that is indeed a constant in both the novel and the film is the genre of *The Return of the King*. Both the novel and film create an adventure story set in a fantasy world called Middle Earth, and both present events taking place in the most important spaces within the texts, such as Rohan, Gondor, Mordor and the Shire. The three spaces are all represented in both the novel and the film, and both Minas Tirith and Gondor retain their importance to the original plot in the novel. The Shire differs though, as discussed in 5.3.3. The plot remains closely aligned to that of the original novel by Tolkien, with a few modifications. With regard to the themes in the novel, the plotline is very significant and by keeping the film plotline as close as possible to the novel, the film ensured that many of the themes were successfully transposed into the visual medium.

### 5.4.1 Gondor: Minas Tirith

Minas Tirith is represented in the novel as a beacon of hope to the people of Gondor and a space that will most likely be a refuge for all the free people of Middle Earth. The City is described as a magnificent, enormous one built on seven different levels and surrounded by white walls. Its top level is called the Citadel and boasts the White Tower as well as the greatly symbolic and significant White Tree of Gondor. One praises the film for retaining the same representation of the City. In the film it is also built upon seven levels, surrounded by white walls and is quite striking because of the sheer magnitude of the city space. On top of the City the White Tower is seen, slightly moved from the position described in the novel, while the White Tree is presented in the middle of the court yard within the Fountain, completely withered. The visual representation of the City is effected by making use of miniatures, as well as special effects, colour and lighting, and the City's importance is even further enhanced by the music and sound effects attributed to the space.

In both the novel and the film, the City is represented from the viewpoint of Pippin. This is quite effective in both mediums, as the City appears even more magnificent from his small stature. Beregond is removed from the film, but is replaced by Gandalf and the same descriptive dialogue surrounding the space of Minas Tirith is thus used, but by different characters from those in the novel. The City is described in the novel through words and descriptive paragraphs depicting it as of enormous height; the complete space is described as white, cool and light, while the inhabitants are also described as kind-
hearted. This characteristic is presented to the readers through Pippin’s experience with Beregond and his son. In the film, the same description is represented visually. The written text thus has to be transformed into something visual: for example an exclamation by Pippin in the novel will be presented by the character of Pippin in the film through changing his tone of voice and by the use of his body language and facial expression. Through the characters’ interactions with each other the inhabitants are also presented to the spectators as the kind and peaceful people described in the novel. Pippin experiences a very special moment in the film with Faramir that might be intended to replace his interaction with Beregond, where the spectators can experience the softness, truthfulness and kindness of Faramir and indirectly those of the inhabitants of Minas Tirith. The love that the people have for Faramir, also showing their respect for him, is represented by the rows of inhabitants lining the street, looking sad, understanding and empathetic as Faramir and his soldiers march out of the City to face the armies at Osgiliath. The inhabitants weep and throw flowers in the road in front of the horses and their soldiers.

The colour schemes used in the presentation of the shots are cool, light colours and different shades of white. Through the use of colour, the film represents the White City of Gondor that is described in the novel. The City is further brightened even more by the use of bright lighting and also studio lighting, to create an almost unnaturally white and pure structure. By also creating a dark backdrop, in the form of the “dark mass of Mount Mindolluin” (Tolkien TLR 734), the novel as well as the film further enhances the whiteness of the City, by placing it against a dark background. The use of the lighting and colour to present the form in almost unnaturally bright colours also contributes to the fact that the genre of the film is fantasy, and the City thus seems fantastical in its appearance. During the siege of Gondor, the lighting is altered, to create an atmosphere of fear, war, death and doubtfulness. Along with the darkness in the visuals of the space, the repetition of words such as “shadow” and “darkness” increases tension. The same repetition of words also creates tension in the novel. The bright lighting becomes dark and the colour scheme becomes one of darker colours, which recreates the atmosphere of tension described in the novel. It also conveys to the spectators, visually, that the shadow has reached its full, and the White City is now shrouded in darkness. Even though the it is besieged by the enemy and under the shadow for a time, it retains its symbolic value as a city of virtue, hope and goodness by always remaining white. This is also shown to the spectators at the coronation scene when the sun is seen shining onto the Minas Tirith, gleaming white.
In the coronation scene, Arwen is revealed to Aragorn, who passionately kisses her, and they walk on together. This scene differs from the novel, because Arwen is not present at Aragorn's coronation, and they are only wed later in the novel. The film chooses to combine the two scenes on account of time limitations on the presentation of events; furthermore, by bringing Arwen into the coronation, along with the other races in the Citadel, the same theme of interconnectedness between different genders and races is presented, thus retaining the atmosphere of community.

The symbolism of the City is kept intact after its adaptation into film. Not only is the City portrayed as white, shining and a beacon of hope, but it also retains the importance of the White Tree in the film, as was the intention in the novel. The White Tree is represented as an integral part of the City's history and future. Aragorn does not find a new sapling in the film, as he does in the novel, and replant it, but after the war, the Tree is represented in full bloom. Thus, the symbolism and meaning of a new time, life, peace and hope is represented in both the novel and the film. The importance of the number seven is also evident in the film. It retained the symbolism of the seven levels as described in the novel, and even further enhances its significance by also placing the banners with the seven stars on either side of the space where Aragorn is crowned. The symbolism in that scene is even made more pertinent as the film also adds seven arches to the doorway and seven stairs in Aragorn's coronation scene.

5.4.2 Mordor: Mount Doom

Mordor and Mount Doom are the spaces most associated with war, death and corruption. In order to retain the meaning of this space, the film has had to keep to Tolkien's description of the space. The film successfully represents an interpretation of Mordor to the spectators through the use of different techniques. The novel describes Mordor as a “dead land, silent, shadow-folded” (Tolkien TLR 924), a great plateau surrounded by mountains, with only two focal points in the empty space: the Tower of Barad-dûr and Mount Doom. In the film, the same image is given to the spectators when Frodo and Sam first walk over the hill from the Tower of Cirith Ungol to see the large plateau filled with darkness, containing only the two lonely structures. The darkness and use of the colours black and red are essential in presenting the dark land, symbolically representative of evil. Gianetti (25) mentions that colour is normally perceived by the spectators unconsciously,
which enables the colours to contribute to the mood or atmosphere of the space, rather than to the physical object. The barrenness of the space is visually represented to the spectators by the jagged, teeth-like rocks and gorges visible as Frodo and Sam pass through Mordor. The space also becomes increasingly darker the nearer they come to Mount Doom, which is undoubtedly created by darker lighting to enhance the absence of light in the space. The suspense is increased in the space by the constant darkness, gloomier lighting and the dramatic music that accompany the scene. Frodo and Sam are represented as perspiring and dirty, visually conveying the impression that it is a space filled with heat which evokes the perception of drought and dust.

Mount Doom is described in the novel as a volcanic mountain in which Sauron forged the One Ring. The mountain is depicted exactly as narrated in the novel, a volcano with one peak, filled with “fires below [...] and all the cavern was filled with a great glare and heat.” (Tolkien TLR 925). This written description was transposed into a partly real, partly computer generated mountain filled with lava. The heat and glare described is made visual in the scene where Frodo and Sam enter the cavern, intending to destroy the Ring. From the dark coloured, low, dark and ill-lit space of Mordor, the spectators are now moved into a brightly lit, yellow and reddish scene, containing visual representations of the heat generated by the lava as the air seems to move and there is a terrible throbbing movement within the cavern. In both the novel and the film, Frodo decides to keep the Ring, only to be attacked by Gollum and his finger bitten off. However, in the novel, Gollum’s fall is attributed more to accident, and maybe even fate as foretold by Gandalf, than in the film, where Frodo retaliates and both of them fall down into the fire. Frodo is caught by Sam, but Gollum, as in the novel, perishes along with his precious Ring.

The Great Eye at the top of Barad-dûr is very similar to the description of the Eye given in the novel. It is a fiery ball with a slit-like pupil, that constantly watches and searches for the Ring. In both the novel and the film, the Eye is constantly mentioned and unlike the novel, the Eye seems to represent Sauron as an entity in the film. The Eye is in both mediums however used as an object that is used to search for the Ring and which creeps into the minds and thoughts of those who wish to possess it. Any mention of the Eye in the novel, but even more so in the film, immediately imposes on the space a tense atmosphere and fills the characters with fear and a feeling of hopelessness. The symbolism associated with the Eye is also pertinent as the Eye is all-seeing and
represents someone who is supernatural, intelligent, but seeking his own advancement and elevation.

As both the symbolism in Minas Tirith (white) and Mordor (black) have been retained and adapted successfully, the contrast intended in the novel is also visually manifested in the film. By contrasting the two spaces, the clear and arguably central theme of good versus evil is presented to the spectators.

5.4.3 The Shire: Hobbiton

The Shire and Hobbiton are two spaces that have been modified in many aspects from the novel to the film, as mentioned in 5.3.3.

There are very few constants in Hobbiton. The place names remained constant within the space, as the names also remained constant within the other two spaces. After the War of the Rings the four Hobbits returned to Hobbiton in both the novel and the film. At their return they were welcomed by all the same familiar faces whom they had left behind, including Sam’s sweetheart Rosie. In both the novel and the film Sam and Rosie are married; the only difference is the time of their marriage within the novel and the film. In the novel Sam only marries Rosie about a year after they returned to the Shire, whereas the film does not necessarily depict the time between their return to the Shire and the wedding.

Within the novel, after Saruman and Grima are removed from the Shire, the Hobbits start restoring their village and breaking down the structures that were erected during the Scouring. The scene within the film of Hobbiton as the four Hobbits finally return to their home is very similar in representation to that described in the novel after the restoring begins. The narrator describes Hobbiton in the spring, with new freshly sprouted and beautiful growing trees, including a new Party Tree (Mallorn Tree). The space is represented as filled with lavish sunshine and “delicious rain”, as well as “an air of richness and growth, and a gleam of beauty” (Tolkien TLR 1000). This description of the representation of Hobbiton is very close to that of the Shire within the film. The scenes in
the film are represented in bright colours to show the richness of the earth and the space. Several lush trees are seen, the grass is thick and bright green and there is an array of brightly coloured flowers. This representation of the space in the film correlates with the representation of the space within the novel as it is described during spring. Since a new Party Tree is planted in the novel, the old Party Tree in the film might also be considered a constant, as both the representations contain a Party Tree that symbolises the community of the inhabitants and their festive, joyous nature. The novel also describes Bag End after its restoration as looking almost as it had been before. Bag End, and the hill in which it is carved, is a constant within the novel and the film. It is also a prominent focal point in both the representations of the space.

Another aspect of the space of Hobbiton that stayed constant throughout the novel and the film is the meaning that the characters, the four Hobbits, attach to the space. They all remember the space as a space of warmth, safety, home and a place of peaceful rest. Hobbiton is the space that they all yearn for during their journey.

A scene from the novel also retained in the film is the scene in Bag End where Frodo sits and writes in his study. In both the novel and the film Frodo and Sam are represented as the only characters within this space as Frodo displays the book to his friend. It is a “big book with plain red leather covers”, containing a few empty pages still for Sam to continue his story in (Tolkien *TLR* 1003). The book in the novel and the film contains the stories written by Bilbo and Frodo. The book is thus a very important object within the space, as it not only represents the life of Frodo and his adventures, but also the story within the story. The story told in the novel and the film thus also features within them, in the form of the book. In both mediums Frodo tells Sam that he leaves the last pages open for Sam to write, symbolising that Sam will therefore now write the story of his life within the book, to accompany the previous written stories by Bilbo and Frodo. It also represents thereby the continuity of time and life: as one ends, another picks up the pen and continues writing.
Table 1:   Variants and Constants in Novel and Film

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>VARIANTS AND CONSTANTS</strong></th>
<th><strong>Representation of space in narrative</strong></th>
<th><strong>Minas Tirith</strong></th>
<th><strong>Minas Tirith</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Novel</strong></td>
<td>Space represented by means of strategies used in the novel; in words written in text.</td>
<td>Names remain constant.</td>
<td>Described from Pippin’s point of view.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Film</strong></td>
<td>Space represented by means of film techniques; in moving images and sound.</td>
<td>Names remain constant.</td>
<td>Described from Pippin’s point of view.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Content, function and meaning, also symbolic meaning
2. Objects described and depicted (film) in space
3. Repetition of spatial information
4. Accumulation of spatial information
5. Movement in the same space as well as movement from one space to another
6. Interaction between spatial aspects as such
7. Interaction between spatial and other narrative aspects, namely narrator, focalization, character (e.g. character-bound spaces), events and time
8. Dimensions of narrated space
8.1 Concrete / physical space
8.2 Symbolic meaning of space
8.3 Abstract space: different versions of psychological, ideological, philosophical, religious space associations with the represented space –
9. Space and the theme of

Minas Tirith
- Names remain constant.
- Described from Pippin’s point of view.
- City personified.
- A large, white city built on seven levels.
- Surrounded by Pelennor Field and wall around the Field.
- White City with White Tower.
- Withered Tree in Citadel.
- Tree replanted by Aragorn.
- City under governance of Denethor, Steward of Gondor.
- Pippin and Beregond discuss the City and surroundings.
- Before siege represented as white, airy and good.
- Besieged by Sauron’s army.
- City described as filled with fear and dread during siege under the shadow.
- Enemies besiege the walls with catapults and sling severed heads

Minas Tirith
- Names remain constant.
- Described from Pippin’s point of view.
- City personified.
- A large, white city built on seven levels.
- Surrounded by Pelennor Field, but no surrounding wall.
- White City with White Tower.
- Withered Tree in Citadel.
- Withered Tree starts to bloom again.
- City under governance of Denethor, Steward of Gondor.
- Pippin and Gandalf discuss the City and surroundings.
- Before siege represented as white, airy and good.
- Besieged by Sauron’s army.
- City described as filled with fear and dread during the siege under the shadow.
- Enemies besiege the walls with catapults and sling severed heads over...
### Mount Doom

- Names remain constant.
- Scenes from Shelob’s lair, Tower of Cirith Ungol and journey to Mordor not present.
- Mordor described as dark land covered in shadow.
- Virtually no light.
- Great barren plateau surrounded by mountains.
- Two main structures, Mount Doom and Barad-

### Mount Doom

- Names remain constant.
- Scenes added from Shelob’s lair, Tower of Cirith Ungol and journey to Mordor from second novel.
- Mordor described as dark land covered in shadow.
- Virtually no light.
- Great barren plateau surrounded by mountains.
- Two main structures, Mount Doom and Barad-
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hobbiton</th>
<th>Hobbiton</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Names remain constant.</td>
<td>Names remain constant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vivid rich colours.</td>
<td>Vivid rich colours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural region.</td>
<td>Agricultural region.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Represented in Hobbiton.</td>
<td>Represented in Hobbiton.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springtime.</td>
<td>Springtime.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Bag End on hill, owned by Frodo.</td>
<td>- Bag End on hill, owned by Frodo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Round doors and windows.</td>
<td>- Round doors and windows.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Party Tree cut down.</td>
<td>- Party Tree intact.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Un-Hobbitlike houses, gate and ruffians.</td>
<td>- No un-Hobbitlike houses, gates or ruffians.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- A place of safety and rest.</td>
<td>- A place of safety and rest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Symbolic of home, safety and joy.</td>
<td>- Symbolic of home, safety and joy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Scouring of the Shire.</td>
<td>- Scouring not in the film.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Hobbiton is invaded by Saruman and Grima.</td>
<td>- Hobbiton not invaded by Saruman and Grima.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Saruman and Grima killed in front of Bag End.</td>
<td>- Saruman and Grima killed at Orthanc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- All four Hobbits return to Hobbiton after the War.</td>
<td>- All four Hobbits return to Hobbiton after the War.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Battle of Bywater.</td>
<td>- No battles fought in Hobbiton.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Sam marries Rosie, moves into Bag End with Frodo.</td>
<td>- Sam marries Rosie, lives down the road from Bag End.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Frodo ailed by wound.</td>
<td>- Frodo ailed by wound.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Leaves pages (as textual space) empty for Sam.</td>
<td>- Leaves pages (as textual space) empty for Sam.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.5 CONCLUSIONS

The variants and constants in the novel and the film are important as they all embody the different means of representation. Even though the two mediums differ, as do their means of representation, the same basic plotline, characters, events and physical description of the spaces are present in the novel and the film.

The novel is skilfully written: describing the spaces in so much detail that the readers will not be able to comprehend and take in all of the information in just one reading. Tolkien's spaces are vivid, so that as the readers go through the text, they might become so intrigued and involved with the novel that it may seem to represent real events, experienced by real people in real spaces. The same skill is visible in Jackson's film The Return of the King, which also needs at least several additional screenings to see all of the detail and listen to every word and sound. Jackson commented that all of the crew working on the film had one thing in common: "A great and enduring love of the books, which in turn, resulted in an unfailing commitment to do our best work on these films" (A note from Peter Jackson par.3), and this is why they strove to keep the film as true to the novel as is possible, but still make it spellbinding and successful in film form.

The plot remains close to the text by Tolkien, almost precise in the presentation of textual events and filmic characterisation of the text's characters. Minas Tirith is not only a White City with a dead Tree, but a symbol of regeneration, rejuvenation, hope and life. Mordor is metaphorised as a person, almost wild, containing fang-like structures, dark and brooding, with Mount Doom becoming the heart of Mordor, the source of the evil. There are specific symbols or motifs that are constantly repeated throughout the novel and the film. These include the journey, a ring or circular form, a Tree and also different colours such as white, black and green. Nøjgaard (qtd. in Lothe 50) notes that "a journey, which can of course take place in inner space, is the expression of a strong spatialisation of the experience of time and is therefore well suited to expressing the complex of problems associated with our realization of ourselves, which is fundamental in narrative texts". Spatial dimensions play a crucial part in all narratives. The journey the fellowship undertakes is not only a physical journey to a different space, but also a psychological journey of self-discovery. By travelling from one space to another interacting with characters from different spaces and taking part in multiple events in different spaces.
results in “a detailed yet panoramic view of a whole world in movement and turmoil” (Thomson qtd. in West 75). Each of the meanings, symbols and ideological meanings within the novel and the film are connected and represented in each space, generated by different techniques. These meanings might also differ from person to person: each reader and spectator brings their own interpretation, their own background and their own frame of reference to the story; they connect with different characters and thus each takes a different meaning from the space and the story than the next reader of spectator. In this sense, readers who are Biblically aware, might sense strong allusions to the Christ figure as “the King” and also note other covert references to the Bible and its teachings.

The themes which were evident in the novel are also visible in the film. The film does not sacrifice the core meaning found within the novel. Tolkien's *The Return of the King* presents the themes of good triumphing over evil, true friendship, loyalty, courage, the preservation of nature and equality amongst all, to mention only a few. All of these themes are provided in some way through the spaces of Minas Tirith, Mordor and Hobbiton. The spaces might embody the theme itself, but the space might also make clear the theme by influencing characters within the space to bring forth the theme or meaning: for example the theme of friendship is prompted by the space of Mordor, as it tempts Frodo and Sam and tries to drive a wedge between them in the novel. One of the central, implicit, themes of *The Return of the King* in both the mediums is that size does not matter. The main characters and heroes of the story are small Hobbits, those whom Sauron overlooked. Through their determination and courage they save the world of Middle Earth, and prove that even the smallest act, such as simply encouraging one's friend as Sam did, can move mountains.

The overall effect of the film adaptation is that the film is indeed recognisable as Tolkien's novel, *The Return of the King*, but it still contains changes that are, arguably, fitted to the film medium. Each of the mediums represented spaces that might be recognisable by its readers and spectators. It also evaluates and addresses issues that are still relevant today through the representations of the space and the meanings gathered from the latter. Each space represents some aspect of life that might be applicable to the lives of the recipients, Mordor might thus represent a troubled time in spectators' and readers' lives where they are faced with a mountain to climb, whereas Hobbiton might represent a safe haven where rest is always available. The novel and film represents the journey of
self-discovery through many spaces, finally to reach the final destination of growth, wisdom and maturity. As Tolkien so poignantly states:

Still round the corner there may wait
A new road or a secret gate;
And though I oft have passed them by,
A day will come at last when I
Shall take the hidden path that run
West of the Moon, East of the Sun.

(Tolkien TLR 1005).

www.archives.theonering.net/features/newsroom/files/rotk_prod_notes.html#note


APPENDIX A:
PHOTOS OF SPACES IN NEW ZEALAND WHERE SELECTED SPACES WERE FILMED

The photos in Appendix A were taken by the researcher.

**Image 1:** Some of the Hobbit homes in Hobbiton, with Bag End at the top of the hill. New Zealand, Matamata, *The Lord of the Rings* filmset. 28-03-2012.
Image 2: View of Hobbiton from Bagshot Row, with the Party Tree (left) and the Green Dragon Tavern (right). New Zealand, Matamata, *The Lord of the Rings* filmset. 28-03-2012

Image 3: Mount Ruapehu (volcano) in National Park, New Zealand featured as Mount Doom. The top of the mountain had to be digitally altered and inserted as the film crew was not allowed to film on the peak of the mountain. 30-03-2012
APPENDIX B:
ILLUSTRATIONS BY ALAN LEE

All of the illustrations are drawn by conceptual artist, Alan Lee, who consulted and designed many of the structures for the film, *The Lord of the Rings*.

www.alan-lee.narod.ru

Image 1: “Pelennor Afterwards”
Image 2: “Minas Tirith”
Image 3: “The Dark Tower”
APPENDIX C:
DECLARATION

CERTIFICATE

D N R LEVEY (PROF.)
FREELANCE LANGUAGE EDITOR AND CONSULTANT
t/a Expert English Editors CC 2007/147556/23
editsa@gmail.com
P O Box 14889, Hatfield, 0028, South Africa
Tel. +27 (0)12-333-5063. Cell +27 (0)83-364-1224. Fax 086-511-5439 [South Africa only]

Member of South African Translators Institute. For bouquets or brickbats regarding quality of service please contact SATI at
P O Box 1710, Rivonia, 2128. Tel. +27 (0)11 803-2981, sati@intelsom.co.za

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN

This is to certify that I have edited the following document for English style, language usage, logic and consistency; it is the responsibility of the author to accept or reject the suggested changes in order to finalise the document.

Author: Ms Shané du Toit
Item: MA Dissertation: *Lord of the Rings* The Representation of Space in the Novel and Film Texts of “The Return of the King”

Sincerely

Levey

DAVID LEVEY
2013-11-12