Guidelines for the professional development of Mathematics teachers in the pedagogical use of ICT in open distance learning

Verona Leendertz

Guidelines for the professional development of Mathematics teachers in the pedagogical use of ICT in open distance learning

Verona Leendertz

Student number 13173391

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree Philosophiae Doctor in Training and Development at the Potchefstroom Campus of the North-West University

Promoter: Prof Dr A Seugnet Blignaut

Co-promoters Dr Suria Ellis

Prof Dr Hercules D Nieuwoudt

October 2013

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to my mother, Alida Magrieta Bailey, for her love and devotion and her endless support when I needed it most. Without you this would not have been possible.				

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to the following persons and institutions for their valuable contribution to this study:

- Professor A Seugnet Blignaut (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Faculty of Education Sciences), my promoter and mentor for the past five years. Thank you for the academic guidance, mentorship, and support. Thank you for the opportunity to be part of the CIMO project and the exchange programme to the University of Eastern Finland. You possess a fountain of knowledge and I was privileged to have you as my promoter
- Professor Erkki Sutinen and Dr Jarkko Suhonen, for the opportunity to study at the University of Eastern Finland
- Dr Suria Ellis (Statistical Services of the North West University, Potchefstroom Campus), my copromoter, for the many hours spent on the magnitude of statistical correlations and analyses
- Professor Hercules Nieuwoudt (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Faculty of Education Sciences), my co-promoter, for his insight, support and guidance
- Professor Robert Balfour (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Faculty of Education Sciences), for awarding me with the Sol Plaatje PhD prestige scholarship to study fulltime
- Professor Cornelia Roux, Maritsa Cloete and Danika Alberts, for the administration of the bursary.
- The National Research Foundation for the financial assistance
- Mrs Hettie Sieberhagen, for the proofreading and language editing of my thesis
- Dr Hendrik Esterhuizen, (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Unit for Open Distance Learning), for the critical reading of my thesis
- Anriette Pretorius and Louise Vos (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus) for your assistance when conducting the systematic literature review
- Mrs Dorothy Laubscher (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Faculty of Education Sciences), for arranging the visits to the school in the Potchefstroom area to validate the instrument and for the peer coding of the qualitative data
- Mss Joany Fransman, Dikeledi Mamiala, Tertia Jordaan, and Hermien Dreyer (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Faculty of Education Sciences), for assisting in the validation of the instrument
- Dr Audrey Wyngaard (Western Cape Education Department), for the permission to conduct research in the Western Cape
- Andrea Sampson, Phillip Cupido, Deodat Thomas, Razzia Ebrahim, Daclan Arries, Edward Schooder, Charles Snyders, Leila Daniels, Dumisani Mdalosa and Basil Sakoor, (subject advisors in the Western Cape Education Department), for accommodating me during standard setting meetings, and arranging the visits to the selected schools in their areas
- The principals and Mathematics teachers in the Western Cape for the cooperation and completing the questionnaire
- Mr Jacques Pienaar (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus, Unit for Open Distance Learning), for helping to solve many technical glitches these past two years.

Abstract

Professional development (PD) of teachers is part of the Department of Basic Education's (DBE) initiative to encourage school communities to use of information and communication technology (ICT) to improve the quality of Mathematics teaching and learning. The South African Council of Educators stipulates that PD programmes should align with system-wide needs, strengthen learning area content and outcomes, and promote system transformation. Imbedded in this system-wide criterion is The White Paper on e-Education to employ a fully ICT integrated system at all levels of education: management, teaching and learning, and administration by 2013. Mathematics teachers require PD that develops their technological pedagogical and content knowledge (TPACK) and their social professional identity (SPI). The PD of Mathematics teachers for ICT integration can assist the DBE to achieve the aims of The White Paper on e-Education and bridge the technology gap between South Africa and international education systems. Open distance learning (ODL) could be a viable method to deliver PD to Mathematics teachers to address their zone of proximal development, develop their TPACK, and establish and maintain their SPI. This study made use of a fully mixed sequential equal status multi-mode research design and methodologies to develop guidelines for the PD of Mathematics teachers in the pedagogical use of ICT in ODL. The qualitative phase (Phase I) was rooted in the interpretivist paradigm. Through an adjustable exploration of a systematic literature review, the researcher identified 23 core documents, analysed them with Atlas.ti™, and conceptualised four themes according to Engeström's third generation activity theory (AT). Phase II (radical exploration phase) of the research design was rooted in the radical structuralist paradigm. In the context of transformation, it developed, validated, and standardised a research instrument for the measurement of Mathematics teachers' PD requirements. The instrument was distributed to 300 senior phase (grades 7-9) Mathematics teachers in eight education management district centres of the WCED. The analyses of the quantitative data conceptualised a fifth activity system. The five activity systems from the adjustable and radical exploration phases were symbiotic, and co-dependent. Expansive learning was used for boundary crossing and network building during six phases of this study. The findings from the six phases of the expansive learning cycle indicated that PD of Mathematics teachers in ODL for Phase III implementation of the e-Education policy should be a joint initiative. Fundamentally ICT integration and implementation should start with Department of Basic Education (DBE) initiatives. The DBE and Provincial Departments of Education (PDEs) should conduct a needs analysis of ICT implementation, evaluate previous ICT PD programmes, plan ICT PD strategies aligned with the ICT development plan, as well as with the requirements of the Mathematics teachers. The DBE and PDE should invest in the provision of ICT equipment, afford human capital, reinstate the laptop initiative for teachers, and supply schools with networked-computer facilities to explore online platforms for PD. Mathematics teachers should assess their professional knowledge to construct new philosophies, create a subject network group, and interact as participants and members within their social environments. The standardised instrument could be used to determine and compare the PD of Mathematics teachers in other provinces and contexts.

Keywords:

- Professional development
- Social professional identity
- Governance
- School environment
- Systematic literature review
- Engeström's activity theory
- Expansive learning
- TPACK
- Zone of proximal development (ZPD)
- Fully mixed sequential equal status multi-mode research design.

Opsomming

Professionele ontwikkeling (PO) van onderwysers vorm 'n integrale deel van die Departement van Basiese Onderwys (DBO) se inisiatief om skoolgemeenskappe te motiveer deur die gebruik van inligting- en kommunikasietegnologie (IKT), asook om die standaard en kwaliteit van Wiskundeonderwys te bevorder. Die Suid-Afrikaanse Raad van Opvoeders bepaal dat PO programme ontwikkel moet word om die bepaalde behoeftes van die onderwyssisteem aan te spreek, die kritieke uitkomste van die Nasionale Kurrikulum Verklaringbeleidsdokumente te verwesenlik, asook om transformasie in die onderwys te bevorder. Die DBO vereis dat bepalings van die Witskrif vir e-Opvoedkunde op alle vlakke van bestuur, administrasie en onderwys teen 2013 afgehandel moet word. Om die uitkomste van die e-Opvoedkundewitskrif te verwesenlik, moet Wiskunde-onderwysers PO gebruik om hul tegnologie-, pedagogie- en inhoudskennis (TPACK) te verbreed en hul professionele sosiale identiteit te vestig en te ontwikkel. Hierdie studie het 'n ten volle opeenvolgende, gelyke status multimodale navorsingsontwerp en -metodologie gevolg. Die doel van die studie was om bepaalde riglyne te ontwikkel om oopafstandsleer vir die PO van Wiskunde-onderwysers in die gebruik van IKT vir onderrig-leer te ontwikkel. Die kwalitatiewe fase (Fase I) van die navorsing was in die interpretivistiese paradigma gegrond. Fase I (aanpasbare eksplorasiefase) het, deur n sistematiese literatuuroorsig, 23 kerndokumente met behulp van Atlas.ti™ geanaliseer. Vier opeenvolgende temas is volgens Engeström se derde generasie aktiwiteitsteorie gekonseptualiseer. Tydens Fase II (radikale ondersoekfase), gegrond in die strukturalistiese paradigma, is 'n vraelys ontwikkel, geldig verklaar en gestandaardiseer om Wiskunde-onderwysers se PO behoeftes te bepaal. Die vraelys is deur 300 Wiskunde onderwysers in agt onderwysdistrikte van die Wes-Kaap voltooi. Die analise van die kwantitatiewe data het 'n vyfde aktiwiteitsisteem gekonseptualiseer. Gesamentlik het die vyf aktiwiteitsisteme netwerke tussen die geïdentifiseerde komponente geskep om uitgebreide leer te bevorder deur die oorsteek van grense. Die bevindinge van die ses fases van die uitgebreide leersiklus bevestig die belangrikheid van samewerking tussen alle rolspelers om Wiskundeonderwysers se PO behoeftes, in besonder ten opsigte van die uitkomste van Fase III van die e-Opvoedingsbeleid, aan te spreek. Die implementering van die proses is die fundamentele verantwoordelikheid van die DBO. Die DBO en die provinsiale departemente moet behoeftebepalings administreer, voltooide PO programme evalueer, en strategieë ontwikkel om die PO behoeftes van Wiskunde-onderwysers aan te spreek. Wiskunde-onderwysers moet toegang tot IKT, skootrekenaars, en ten volle toegeruste IKT-sentra vir onderrig en leer verkry, asook geleenthede gebied word om in aanlynleeromgewings te eksploreer. Wiskunde-onderwysers moet aanleer om self te reflekteer, hul konseptuele Wiskundekennis te evalueer, nuwe onderwysfilosofieë te ontwikkel, netwerke met ander onderwysers te skep, en aktief deel te neem aan interaksie in hulle sosiale omgewings. Die gestandaardiseerde vraelys kan deur ander navorsers gebruik word om die PO behoeftes van Wiskunde-onderwysers in ander provinsies en omgewings te bepaal en te vergelyk.

Sleutelwoorde: Professionele ontwikkeling; sosiale professionele identiteit; bestuur, skoolomgewing; sistematiese literatuurondersoek; Engeström se aktiwiteitsteorie; uitgebreide leer; TPACK; area van optimale ontwikkeling (ZPD); ten volle opeenvolgende, gelyke status, multimodale navorsingsontwerp.

Solemn Declaration

Certificate of Proofreading and Editing

H C Sieberhagen SATI no 1001489 Translator and Editor 082 3359846

CERTIFICATE ISSUED ON 10 OCTOBER 2013

I hereby declare that I have linguistically edited the dissertation submitted by ms Verona Leendertz for the PhD degree.

Guidelines for the professional development of Mathematics teachers in the pedagogical use of ICT in open distance learning

H C Sieberhagen

A. Seberhagur

SATI number **1001489**

ID 4504190077088

Ethics Approval

Table of Contents

Dedicati	on	i
	ledgements	
	ning	
•	Declaration	
	te of Proofreading and Editing	
	Approval	
Table of	Contents	ix
List of F	igure	xv
List of T	ables	xvii
List of A	ddenda	xix
List of A	cronyms and Abbreviations	xxi
Chapter	One: Overview of a Research Journey through a Complex Landscape	
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Motivation and Problem Statement	1
1.3	Research Design and Methodology	5
1.3.1	Conceptual Framework	7
1.3.1.1	Origin of Cultural–Historical Activity Theory	8
1.3.1.2	Vygotsky's First Generation Activity Theory	8
1.3.1.3	Rubinshtein's Psychological-Philosophical Activity Theory	11
1.3.1.4	Leont'ev's Second Generation Activity Theory	11
1.3.1.5	Engeström's Third Generation Activity Theory	14
1.3.1.6	Principals of Activity Theory	16
1.4	Population and Sample	18
1.5	Ethical Aspects of this Research	18
1.6	Contribution of this Study	19
1.6.1	Mathematics Education	19
1.6.2	Proposed Research Niche Area: Technology Enhanced Learning for Higher Educ	ation
	(TELHE)	
1.7	Clarification of Important Terminology for this Study	19
1.8	Summary of the Chapters	21
Chapter	Two: Fully Mixed Sequential Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology:	
	Qualitative Aspects	
2.1	Introduction	
2.2	Worldview of the Research	
2.2.1	Ontology	23

2.2.2	Epistemology	23
2.2.3	Research Paradigms	24
2.2.3.1	Phase I: Interpretivist Phase	25
2.3	Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design	26
2.4	Qualitative Design	27
2.4.1	Mixed-method Systematic Literature Review	28
2.4.1.1	Process and Documentation for a Systematic Literature Review	31
2.4.1.2	Search Process Documentation	32
2.4.1.3	Selection Process Criteria Documentation	32
2.4.1.4	Quality Assessment of Primary Documents	33
2.5	Data Analysis	34
2.6	Role of the Researcher	40
2.7	Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research	40
2.7.1	Validity in Qualitative Research	40
2.7.2	Reliability in Qualitative Research	41
2.8	Ethical Considerations in Qualitative Research	42
2.9	Limitations of the Mixed-method Systematic Literature Review	43
2.10	Summary of the Chapter	43
Chapter	Three: Culminant Retrospect of a Systematic Literature Probe	
3.1	Introduction	44
3.2	Governance	44
3.2.1	Theme 1 of Literature Analysis: Governance	46
3.2.1.1	Objects of Governance	46
3.2.1.2	Subject of Governance	48
3.2.1.3	Tools of Governance	51
3.2.1.4	Community of Governance	52
3.2.1.5	Rules of Governance	53
3.2.1.6	Division of Labour in Governance	54
3.2.2	Governance as Activity System	55
3.3	School Environment	56
3.3.1	Theme 2 of Literature Analysis: School Environment	57
3.3.1.1	Object of School Environment	58
3.3.1.2	Subject of School Environment	60
3.3.1.3	Tools of School Environment	61
3.3.1.4	Community of School Environment	64
3.3.1.5	Rules of School Environment	65
3.3.1.6	Division of Labour in School Environment	65
3.3.2	School Environment as Activity System	65
3.4	Open Distance Learning	67
3.4.1	Theme 3 of Literature Analysis: Open Distance Learning	68
3.4.1.1	Objects of Open Distance Learning	68

3.4.1.2	Subject of Open Distance Learning	/0
3.4.1.3	Tools of Open Distance Learning	71
3.4.1.4	Community of Open Distance Learning	72
3.4.1.5	Rules of Open Distance Learning	72
3.4.1.6	Division of labour in Open Distance Learning	73
3.4.2	Open Distance Learning as Activity System	73
3.5	Professional Development	76
3.5.1	Theme 4 of Literature Analysis: Professional Development	76
3.5.1.1	Objects of Professional Development	76
3.5.1.2	Subjects of Professional Development	78
3.5.1.3	Tools of Professional Development	81
3.5.1.4	Community of Professional Development	82
3.5.1.5	Rules of Professional Development	84
3.5.1.6	Division of Labour in Professional Development	84
3.5.2	Professional Development as Activity System	88
3.6.	Activity Systems on Two Planes of Cultural-historical Analysis	89
3.6.1	Organisational Plane of Cultural-Historical Analysis	90
3.6.2	Personal Plane of Cultural-Historical Analysis	90
3.7	Company of the Objector	91
Chapter	Summary of the Chapter Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Met	hodology:
•	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Met Quantitative Aspects	
4.1	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Met Quantitative Aspects Introduction	92
4.1 4.2	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Met Quantitative Aspects Introduction	92
4.1 4.2 4.2.1	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology.	92 92
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Metal Quantitative Aspects Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology	92 92 92
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms	92 92 92 93
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase	92 92 92 93
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design	92 92 92 93 93
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Method Quantitative Aspects Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design Quantitative Design	92 92 92 93 93
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design Quantitative Design Quantitative Research Instruments	92 92 92 93 93 94
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Method Quantitative Aspects Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design Quantitative Design Quantitative Research Instruments Planning and Design of a Questionnaire	92 92 92 93 93 94 94
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1 4.5	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design Quantitative Design Quantitative Research Instruments	92 92 92 93 94 94 94 95
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology. Under Company Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology. Epistemology. Research Paradigms. Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase. Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design. Quantitative Design. Quantitative Research Instruments. Planning and Design of a Questionnaire. Stage One: Aim of the Questionnaire. Stage Two: Select the Questionnaire.	92 92 93 93 94 94 94 95
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1 4.5.2	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology. Introduction	929292939394949596
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1 4.5.2 4.5.3	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design Quantitative Design Quantitative Research Instruments Planning and Design of a Questionnaire Stage One: Aim of the Questionnaire Stage Two: Select the Questionnaire Stage Three: Linking with of the Research Question	9292929393949494959696
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1 4.5.2 4.5.3 4.5.4	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design Quantitative Design Quantitative Research Instruments Planning and Design of a Questionnaire Stage One: Aim of the Questionnaire Stage Two: Select the Questionnaire Stage Three: Linking with of the Research Question Stage Four: Linking with Key Aspects	9292929393949494959696
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1 4.5.2 4.5.3 4.5.4 4.5.5	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology. Introduction	929292939394949596969697
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1 4.5.2 4.5.3 4.5.4 4.5.5 4.5.6	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Metion Quantitative Aspects Introduction	92929293939494959696969797
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1 4.5.2 4.5.3 4.5.4 4.5.5 4.5.6 4.5.7	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology. Research Paradigms Phase II: Radical Structuralist Phase Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design. Quantitative Design Quantitative Research Instruments Planning and Design of a Questionnaire Stage One: Aim of the Questionnaire Stage Three: Linking with of the Research Question Stage Four: Linking with Key Aspects Stage Five: Clarification of Information to Address Key Aspects Stage Six: Determine the Target Population Stage Seven: Compile the Questions and the Metrics	9292929393949495969697979797
4.1 4.2 4.2.1 4.2.2 4.2.3 4.2.4 4.3 4.4.1 4.5 4.5.1 4.5.2 4.5.3 4.5.4 4.5.5 4.5.5 4.5.6 4.5.7 4.5.8	Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Design and Meti Quantitative Aspects Introduction Worldview of the Research Ontology Epistemology	92 92 92 93 93 94 94 94 95 96 96 97 103

	Part D: School Environment	100
4.5.8.4	Part E: Information and Communication Technologies	107
4.5.8.5	Part F: Professional Development and Open Distance Learning	108
4.5.8.6	Part G: Professional Development Models	109
4.5.9	Stage Nine: Determine Data Collection Strategy	110
4.5.10	Stage Ten: Piloting the Questionnaire	111
4.5.11	Stage Eleven: Prepare for the Data Collection	111
4.5.12	Stage Twelve: Collect the Data	112
4.5.13	Stage Thirteen: Data Analysis Phase II	113
4.5.13.1	Descriptive Statistics	113
4.5.13.2	Factor Analysis and Reliability	113
4.5.13.3	Comparisons between Biographical Information and Extracted Factors	114
4.5.13.4	Structural Equation Modelling	114
4.5.14	Stage Fourteen: Reporting of Findings	115
4.6	Role of the Researcher	115
4.7	Credibility in Quantitative Research	116
4.7.1	Validity in Quantitative Research	116
4.7.2	Reliability in Quantitative Research	117
4.8	Ethical Considerations in Quantitative Research	118
4.9	Limitations of Quantitative Methodology	118
4.10	Summary of the Chapter	119
Chapter	Five: Modelling Quantitative Measures and Results	
Chapter 5.1	Five: Modelling Quantitative Measures and Results Introduction	120
-	_	
5.1	Introduction	121
5.1 5.2	Introduction	121 123
5.1 5.2 5.2.1	Introduction Biographical Information Gender	121 123 123
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age	121 123 123
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience	121 123 123 123
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics	121 123 123 123 124
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language	121123123123124
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction	121123123123123124124
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification	121123123123124124
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7 5.2.8	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification Subject Specialisation	121123123123124124124124124
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7 5.2.8 5.2.9	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification Subject Specialisation School Districts	
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7 5.2.8 5.2.9 5.2.10	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification Subject Specialisation School Districts School Quintiles	
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7 5.2.8 5.2.9 5.2.10 5.2.11	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification Subject Specialisation School Districts School Quintiles Type of School	
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7 5.2.8 5.2.9 5.2.10 5.2.11 5.2.12	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification Subject Specialisation School Districts School Quintiles Type of School Number of Learners	
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7 5.2.8 5.2.9 5.2.10 5.2.11 5.2.12 5.2.13	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification Subject Specialisation School Districts School Quintiles Type of School Number of Learners Number of Computer Laboratories	
5.1 5.2 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 5.2.4 5.2.5 5.2.6 5.2.7 5.2.8 5.2.9 5.2.10 5.2.11 5.2.12 5.2.13 5.2.14	Introduction Biographical Information Gender Age Years of Teaching Experience Years Teaching Mathematics Home Language Language of Instruction Qualification Subject Specialisation School Districts School Quintiles Type of School Number of Learners Number of Computer Laboratories Overall Computer Available	121123123123124124124125125125125127

5.2.18	Access to the Internet129
5.2.19	Interactive Whiteboards129
5.2.20	Online Courses
5.2.21	Utilisation of Information and Communication Tools
5.2.22	Professional Development Models
5.3	Factor Analysis131
5.3.1	Reliability of the Factors131
5.3.2	Results of Factor Analysis of Governance
5.3.3	Factor Analysis of School Environment
5.3.4	Factor Analysis of Information and Communication Technologies135
5.3.5	Factor Analysis of Professional Development
5.3.6	Factors Conceptualised as Elements of Activity Theory
5.4	Comparisons between Biographical Information and the Elements of the
	Triangular Activity System139
5.4.1	Descriptive statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and
	Results of Hierarchical Linear Modelling140
5.4.1.1	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the Results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Gender Differences140
5.4.1.2	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Home Language Differences142
5.4.1.3	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the Results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Language of Instruction Differences144
5.4.1.4	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the Results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Qualification Differences146
5.4.1.5	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the Results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Subject Specialisation Differences149
5.4.1.6	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the Results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Education District Differences149
5.4.1.7	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the Results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Quintile Differences150
5.4.1.8	Descriptive Statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and the Results of the
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling, Effect Sizes and Type of School Differences153
5.4.2	Elements of Triangular Activity System and Results of
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling157
5.5	Summary of the Chapter
Chapter	Six: Mapping Guidelines for the Professional Development of Mathematics Teachers
in the P	edagogical Use of Information and Communication Technologies in Open Distance
Learnin	g
6.1	Introduction
6.2	Summary of Chapters160
6.2.1	Chapter One: Overview of a Research Journey through a Complex Landscape160

6.2.2	Chapter Two: Fully Mixed Sequential Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology:
	Qualitative Aspects
6.2.3	Chapter Three: Culminant Retrospect of a Systematic Literature Probe161
6.2.4	Chapter Four: Fully Mixed Sequential Status Multi-Mode Design and Methodology:
	Quantitative Aspects
6.2.5	Chapter Five: Modelling Quantitative Measurements and Results163
6.3	Synopsis of the Adjustable and Radical Exploration Phases of the Research163
6.3.1	Synopsis of the Findings of the Adjustable Exploration Phase of the Research163
6.3.2	Synopsis of the Findings of the Radical Exploration Phase of the Research165
6.4	Validation of the Adjustable and Radical Exploration Phases through
	Structural Equation Modelling166
6.4.1	Structural Equation Modelling of Governance, School Environment and Open Distance
	Learning166
6.4.2	Structural Equation Modelling of Mediation of Governance, School Environment, Open
	Distance Learning and Professional Development168
6.4.3	Structural Equation Modelling of Expansive Learning of Governance,
	School Environment, Open Distance Learning and Professional Development169
6.4.4	Five Activity Systems from the Adjustable and Radical Exploration Phases
	of the Research Connected Through Boundary Objects171
6.4.5	Expansive Learning through Boundary Crossing in the Five Activity Systems172
6.5	Guidelines for the Professional Development of Mathematics
	Teachers in the Pedagogical Use of Information and Communication
	Technology in Open Distance Learning174
6.6	Future Research
6.7	Value of the Research
6.8	The Researcher's Reflections of the Research Journey179
6.8.1	Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-Mode Research Design and Methodology179
6.8.2	Engeström's Activity Theory180
6.8.3	Systematic Literature Review
6.8.4	Data Collection Journey181
Biblioa	r aphy 182

List of Figures

Figure 1.1	Choosing a Multi-Mode Research Design according to the Four Paradigms of Social	al
	Theory	6
Figure 1.2	Vygotsky's First Generation CHAT	9
Figure 1.3	Leont'ev's Second Generation Activity Theory	12
Figure 1.4	Hierarchical Model of Human Activity	13
Figure 1.5	Engeström's Third Generation Activity Theory	15
Figure 1.6	Two Dimensions for this Multi-Mode Research Design	17
Figure 2.1	Phases of the complex research according to the four paradigms	24
Figure 2.2	Fully Mixed Sequential Equal Status Multi-mode Design	30
Figure 2.3	Mixed-method Systematic Review Flow Diagram of Document Selection Process	34
Figure 2.4	Atlas.ti™ Workflow	36
Figure 2.5	Structure and Code Density of the Guidelines for the Professional Development of	
	Mathematics Teachers in the Pedagogical use of ICT in ODL	39
Figure 3.1	Network views of the Four Overarching Themes from the Inductive Analysis	45
Figure 3.2	Governance as a Theme from the Literature Analysis	46
Figure 3.3	Governance Activity System	56
Figure 3.4	Mediated Relationship between the Subject and Object, and Interrelations among	
	the Elements of Governance Activity System	57
Figure 3.5	School Environment as Theme from Literature Analysis	58
Figure 3.6	School Environment as Activity System	66
Figure 3.7	Mediated Relationship between the Subject and Object, and Interrelations among	
	the Elements of School Environment Activity System	67
Figure 3.8	Open Distance Learning as Theme from Literature Analysis	68
Figure 3.9	Open Distance Learning Activity System	74
Figure 3.10	Mediated Relationship between the Subject and Object, and Interrelations among	
	the Elements of Open and Distance Learning Activity System	75
Figure 3.11	Professional Development as Theme from Literature Analysis	77
Figure 3.12	Professional Development Activity System	88
Figure 3.13	Mediated Relationship between the Subject and Object, and Interrelations among	
	the Elements of Professional Development Activity System	89
Figure 3.14	Four Conceptual Activity Systems on Two Planes of Cultural-Historical Analysis	91
Figure 4.1	Geographical Locations of the Districts in Western Cape Province	99
Figure 4.2	Group Session in the West Coast EMDC	110
Figure 4.3	Group Session in the Metro South EMDC	111
Figure 5.1	Computer Laboratory Bolted with a Metal Door	126
Figure 5.2	Khanya Laboratory with Computers under Workstations	126
Figure 5.3	Computers for Planning and Administration	127
Figure 5.4	Triangular Activity System	138

Figure 6.1	Structural Equation Model of Governance, School Environment, Open Distance	
	Learning, and Professional Development with Standardised Regression Weights	167
Figure 6.2	Structural Equation Model of Mediation of Governance, School Environment,	
	Open Distance Learning, and Professional Development with	
	Standardised Regression Weights	169
Figure 6.3	Structural Equation Model of Expansive Learning from Governance,	
	School Environment, Open Distance Learning, and Professional Development with	:h
	Standardised Regression Weights	170
Figure 6.4	Conceptual and Triangular Activity Systems	172
Figure 6.5	Expansive Learning Cycle for Guidelines for the Professional of Mathematics	
	Teachers in the Pedagogical use of ICT in ODL	173

List of Tables

Table 2.1	Ontological and Epistemological Assumptions of the Interpretivist Paradigm	25
Table 2.2	Six Key Steps in Conducting a Systematic Literature Review	31
Table 2.3	Terminology and Functions of Atlas.ti™	35
Table 2.4	Pattern Matrix of Factors	37
Table 2.5	Strategies for Validity of the Document Analysis	41
Table 2.6	Strategies for Reliability of Document Analysis	42
Table 3.1	Western Cape Education Department ICT Readiness	47
Table 3.2	Requirements for ICT Integration at National, Provincial and School Level	54
Table 3.3	Professional Development Models and Frameworks	86
Table 4.1	Ontological and Epistemological Assumptions of the Structuralist Paradigm	93
Table 4.2	Stages in Sample Selection	98
Table 4.3	Site Location of the Nine Education Districts in the WCED	99
Table 4.4	Participating Schools in the Eight Educational Districts	.101
Table 4.5	Types of Participating Schools	.101
Table 4.6	Quintiles of Participating Schools	102
Table 4.7	Medium of Instruction of Participating Schools	102
Table 4.8	Number of Schools and Participants	102
Table 4.9	Seven Guidelines to Formulate Questions	104
Table 4.10	Comprehensive Description of Compilation of Questions for Governance	105
Table 4.11	Comprehensive Description of Compilation of Questions for School Environment	106
Table 4.12	Comprehensive Description of Compilation of Questions for Information and	
	Communication Technologies	.107
Table 4.13	Comprehensive Description of Compilation of Questions for Professional	
	Development	.108
Table 4.14	Fourteen Stages in Questionnaire Development	.115
Table 5.1	Frequencies and Percentages of Part A and Part B of the Questionnaire	.121
Table 5.2	General Use of ICT Tools	129
Table 5.3	ICT Tools for School Use	130
Table 5.4	Frequencies and Percentages of Professional Development Models	130
Table 5.5	Factor Analysis of Governance	132
Table 5.6	Factor Analysis of School Environment	134
Table 5.7	Factor Analysis of Information and Communication Technologies	135
Table 5.8	Factor Analysis of Professional Development	136
Table 5.9	Professional Development of Mathematics teachers in the pedagogical use of ICT	
	in ODL According to the Triangular Activity System	139
Table 5.10	Descriptive statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and Results	
	of Hierarchical Linear Modelling and Effect Sizes to Test for Gender Differences	141
Table 5.11	Descriptive Statistics on Elements Triangular Activity System and Results of	
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling and Effect Sizes for Home Language	143

Table 5.12	Descriptive statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity Theory and Results	
	of Hierarchical Linear Modelling and Effect Sizes for Language of Instruction	
	Differences	145
Table 5.13	Descriptive statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and Results of	
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling for Qualification	147
Table 5.14	Effect Sizes to Test for Qualification Differences	148
Table 5.15	Descriptive statistics on Elements of Triangular Activity System and Results of	
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling for Quintiles Differences	151
Table 5.16	Effect Sizes for Quintiles	152
Table 5.17	Descriptive statistics on Elements of the Triangular Activity System and the Result	s of
	Hierarchical Linear Modelling for Type of School	154
Table 5.18	Effect Sizes for Type of School	155
Table 5.19	Hierarchical Linear Modelling for Biographical Information	158
Table 6.1	Standardised Regression Weights and Correlations between Governance, School	
	Environment and Open Distance Learning	166
Table 6.2	Standardised Regression Weights and Correlations of Mediation between Govern	ance
	School Environment, Open Distance Learning	168
Table 6.3	Standardised Regression Weights and Correlations of Expansive Learning from	
	Governance, School Environment, Open Distance Learning and Professional	
	Development	170
Table 6.4	Guidelines for the Professional Development of Mathematics Teachers in the	
	Pedagogical Use of ICT in ODL	174
Table 6.5	Partinent Future Research Questions	178

List of Addenda

Addendum 1.1	Publish Notification of Article to Pythagorus
Addendum 2.1	Diary of Systematic Review Search Process
Addendum 2.2	First Selection of Documents during the Systematic Review Process
Addendum 2.3	Documents Screened for Inclusion and Exclusion for Qualitative Analysis
Addendum 2.4	Documents Included for Qualitative Analyses
Addendum 2.5	Calculation of Cohen's Kappa
Addendum 2.6	Documents Selected for Peer Coding
Addendum 2.7	Output Values of Constant Comparative Analysis
Addendum 2.8	Factor Analysis of the Qualitative Data
Addendum 2.9	Atlas.ti™ Workflow of Qualitative Data Analysis
Addendum 3.1	Presentation for Edmedia Conference 2013
Addendum 4.1	Western Cape Education Department Organogram
Addendum 4.2	Letter to Superintendent-General of the Western Cape Education Department
Addendum 4.3	Education Management Information System Database List of Schools in
	the Western Cape Education Department
Addendum 4.4	Output of Questionnaire Data Captured with Epidata Software
Addendum 4.5	Stratified Sample of Schools Selected for Data Collection
Addendum 4.6	Frequency Tables of Schools Selected through a Stratified Sample Selection
Addendum 4.7	Cover Letter of the Cross-Sectional Questionnaire
Addendum 4.8	Basic Instructions to Complete the Cross-Sectional Questionnaire
Addendum 4.9	Validation of the Questionnaire with Mathematics Lecturers at the Potchefstroom
	Campus of the North-West University
Addendum 4.10	Validation of the Questionnaire with Mathematics Teachers in the North-West
	Province
Addendum 4.11	Cross-Sectional Questionnaire Distributed to Senior Phase (grades 7-9)
	Mathematics Teacher in the Western Cape Education Department
Addendum 4.12	Data Collection Schedule
Addendum 4.13	Ethic Approval of Project from the Potchefstroom Campus of
	the North-West University
Addendum 4.14	Research Approval from the Western Cape Education Department
Addendum 4.15	Reflection of Quantitative Data Collection
Addendum 4.16	Permission Letter to Schools to Distribute the Questionnaire
Addendum 4.17	Permission Letter to Curriculum Advisors to Distribute the Questionnaire
Addendum 4.18	Permission Letter to Senior Phase (grades 7-9) Mathematics Teachers to
	Complete the Questionnaire
Addendum 4.19	Turnitin Report of Chapter One
Addendum 4.20	Turnitin Report of Chapter Two
Addendum 4.21	Turnitin Report of Chapter Three
Addendum 4.22	Turnitin Report of Chapter Four

Addendum 4.23	Turnitin Report of Chapter Five
Addendum 4.24	Turitin Report of Chapter Six
Addendum 5.1	Descriptive Statistics of the Biographical Information
	of the Questionnaire (Part 1)
Addendum 5.2	Descriptive Statistics of the Biographical Information
	of the Questionnaire (Part 2)
Addendum 5.3	Pattern Matrix of Factor Analysis of Parts C, D, E, and F of Questionnaire
Addendum 5.4	Cronbach's Alpha Calculation for Reliability of Factor Analysis
Addendum 5.5	Hierarchical Linear Models with Statistical Programme for Social Science:
	Biographical Information and the Elements of Triangular Activity System
Addendum 5.6	Hierarchical Linear Models with SAS: Biographical Information
	(Parts A2, A3 and A4) and the Elements of Triangular Activity System
Addendum 5.7	Hierarchical Linear Models with SAS: Biographical Information
	(Parts B11, B13 and B14) and the Elements of Triangular Activity System
Addendum 5.8	Hierarchical Linear Models with SAS: Biographical Information
	(Parts B6 and B11) and the Elements of Triangular Activity System
Addendum 6.1	Structural Equation Modelling

The addenda are available on a CD-ROM at the back of the thesis.

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

ACE Advanced Certificate in Education

ANA Annual National Assessment

AT Activity Theory
BA Bachelor of Arts

BEd Bachelor in Education
BSc Bachelor in Sciences
CA Curriculum Advisor

CAS Conceptual Activity System

CAQDAS Computer Assisted Qualitative Data Analysis System

CFI Comparative Fit Index

CHAT Cultural Historical Activity Theory

CHET Council of Higher Education and Training

CK Content Knowledge

CMC Computer Mediated Communication

COP Community of Practice

CPTD Continuous Professional Teacher Development

DBE Department of Basic Education

DE Distance Education

DHET Department of Higher Education and Training

DL Distance Learning

EMDC Education Management District Centre

EMIS Education Management Information System

FIT Fluent with Technology

FITness Fluency of Information Technology

GPS Global Position System
GSP Geometer's Sketchpad

HDE Higher Diploma in Education
HEI Higher Education Institutes

HEQF Higher Education Qualifications Framework

HOD Head of Department

ICT Information and Communication Technologies

IEA International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement

IMG Institutional Management and Governance planning

ITE Initial Teacher Education

KMO Kaiser-Meyer-Olkim measure

LMS Learner Management System

LTA Learning Technology Advisor

MEd Master in Education

NCS National Curriculum Statement

NDoE National Department of Education

NEPAD New Partnership for Africa's Development

NQF National Qualifications Framework

NWU North-West University

OBE Outcome-based Education
ODL Open Distance Learning

OL Open Learning

PCK Pedagogical Content Knowledge

PD Professional Development

PDE Provincial Department of Education

PIAC on ISAD Presidential International Advisory Council on Information Society and Development

PLE Personal Learning Environments

RMSEA Root Mean Square Error of Approximation

SACMEQ Southern and East Africa Consortium for Monitoring Education Quality

SAIDE South African Institute for Distance Education

SAQA South African Qualifications Authority

SE School Environment

SEM Structural Equation Modelling

SETA Skills Education and Training Authorities

SITES 2006 Second International Information Technology in Education Study

SMT School Management Team
SNE Special Needs Education

SPD Social Professional Development

SPI Social Professional Identity

SPSS Statistical Programme for Social Sciences

TAS Triangular Activity System

TELHE Technology Enhanced Learning for Higher Education
TIMMS Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study

TK Technological Knowledge

TPACK Technological Pedagogical and Content Knowledge

TPD Teacher Professional Development
UODL Unit for Open Distance Learning
VLE Virtual Learning Environments

VPN Virtual Private Network

WCED Western Cape Education Department

ZPD Zone of Proximal Development