

THE MODERN SCHOOL: ITS CRISIS AND ITS FUTURE

BY

SUNG SOO KIM
B.Ed., M.Ed.

A thesis submitted to the
Faculty of Education

Potchefstroom University for
Christian Higher Education

In fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of
DOCTOR EDUCATIONIS

POTCHEFSTROOM
January 1984

Promoter:
Prof. Dr. J.L. van der Walt

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The writer wishes to extend his sincere and heartfelt gratitude to his promoter, Prof. Dr. J.L. Van der Walt who inculcated in him the Christian world view which led to his studies. He also wishes to express his appreciation for his invaluable guidance and constant encouragement in the writing of this thesis.

A special word of appreciation is extended to Dr. L.C. Minnaar who has taught him Afrikaans with painstaking care and patience.

Further thanks are also extended to Dr. A.L. Combrink for careful editing of the manuscript, and to Mrs. H. Müller for neat work in typing it. A cordial word of appreciation is due to Mr. G.L. Kruger who undertook the proofreading.

In addition, the writer would like to express heartfelt appreciation to Prof. Dr. P.S. Oh, the Rector, and to Prof. Dr. K.S. Lee, the former Rector, as well as to other colleagues at the Kosin College and Seminary in which he chairs the Department of Christian Education for permitting him the privilege of studying at the PU for CHE and for their encouragement. The author is also deeply indebted to the Potchefstroom University for Christian Higher Education for financing the thesis.

A special word of gratitude is directed to the Rev. and Mrs. A.J. Du Plessis and the Rev. and Mrs. J.A. Schutte, to the church council of the "Gerformeerde Kerk Potchefstroom-Noord", and to all brothers and sisters in the Reformed Church in South Africa for their love in Christ.

Lastly, a word of gratitude goes to the writer's wife, Kyung Suk and his two children, Kwang Hyun and Eun Hae, for their patience and their prayers to God in the course of his studies.

Soli Deo Gloria

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM AND GENERAL ORIENTATION	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM	1
1.3 TOPICALITY OF THE PROBLEM	2
1.4 AIMS OF THE STUDY	4
1.5 SUBSIDIARY AIMS OF THE STUDY	4
1.6 THE METHOD OF RESEARCH	5
1.7 SCOPE AND DELIMITATION OF THE STUDY	6
1.8 THE PROGRAMME AND STRUCTURE OF THE STUDY	8
1.9 CONCLUSION	9
2. THE CRISIS OF THE SCHOOL IN ANCIENT, CLASSICAL, MEDIAEVAL AND MODERN TIMES	10
2.1 INTRODUCTION	10
2.2 THE ORIGINS OF THE SCHOOL	11
2.2.1 Schools in primitive societies	11
2.2.2 The relevance of the primitive school for the crisis of the modern school	14
2.3 SCHOOLS IN ANCIENT TIMES	16
2.3.1 The Sumerian school	16
2.3.2 The Babylonian school	18
2.3.3 The Persian school	19
2.3.4 The Egyptian school	20
2.3.5 The Indian school	23
2.3.6 The Chinese school	24

2.3.7	The Hebrew school	26
2.3.8	The relevance of the ancient school for the crisis of the modern school	28
2.4	SCHOOLS IN CLASSICAL TIMES	30
2.4.1	Orientation	30
2.4.2	The Spartan school	31
2.4.3	The Athenian school	34
2.4.4	Schools in Hellenistic times	47
2.4.5	The Roman school	49
2.4.6	Early Christian schools	52
2.4.7	The relevance of the classical schools for the crisis of the modern school	55
2.5	SCHOOLS IN MEDIAEVAL TIMES	57
2.5.1	Monastic schools	57
2.5.2	The Cathedral schools and scholasticism	58
2.5.3	The Court school	60
2.5.4	The "Burgh" or "Municipal" schools	60
2.5.5	The Chantry school	61
2.5.6	The guild school	61
2.5.7	Chivalrous education of the knight and vocational education of the craftsman	62
2.5.8	The relevance of mediaeval schools for the crisis of the modern school	62
2.6	SCHOOLS IN MODERN TIMES (UP TO END 19TH CENTURY)	65
2.6.1	Orientation	65
2.6.2	The schools in the Renaissance-humanist period	65
2.6.3	The schools of the Reformation and of the "Scientific Revolution"	67

2.6.4	Rousseau, Romanticism and the school	68
2.6.5	Pestalozzi (1747 - 1827) and his school	70
2.6.6	Froebel (1782 - 1852) and his kindergarten	72
2.6.7	Herbart (1776 - 1841) and the school	74
2.6.8	The relevance of the modern school (up to the end of 19th century) for the crisis of the contemporary school (in the 20th century)	76
2.7	CONCLUSION	79
3.	THE CRISIS OF THE SCHOOL IN THE 20TH CENTURY: NORTH AMERICA	81
3.1	INTRODUCTION	81
3.2	THE STATE OF PUBLIC EDUCATION AFTER THE TURN OF THE CENTURY IN AMERICA	82
3.3	PRAGMATISM: THE PHILOSOPHY OF THE "NEW SCHOOL" OF JOHN DEWEY (1859 - 1952)	85
3.3.1	Orientation	85
3.3.2	What is pragmatism?	86
3.3.3	The origin of pragmatism	86
3.3.4	Representatives of pragmatism	87
3.3.5	The terms pragmatism, pragmaticism, instrumental= ism, operationalism, progressivism, and reconstructionism	90
3.3.6	Dewey and pragmatism	91
3.3.7	Pragmatism as a form of irrationalistic philosophy of the 20th century	93
3.3.8	The religious ground motif of pragmatism	98
3.4	DEWEY'S CRITICISM AND IDEA OF THE SCHOOL	100
3.4.1	The school and social progress	100
3.4.2	The school and the life of the child	102

3.4.3	The school as a place of reconstruction of experience	103
3.4.4	The school and operation-method, logical inquiry and scientific method of problem-solving	105
3.4.5	The school as a social institution and its connection with both society and children	107
3.4.6	The school as a special environment	108
3.4.7	Dewey's experimental school	110
3.5	DEWEY AND PROGRESSIVE EDUCATION	111
3.6	CRITICAL COMMENT ON THE VIEWS OF THE DEWEYAN PRAGMATIC SCHOOL	114
3.7	SPUTNIK I: "TURNING POINT" IN THE AMERICAN VIEW OF THE SCHOOL	118
3.7.1	Three reaction formations	121
3.7.1.1	General orientation	121
3.7.1.2	The scientific reformatinal view of the school	121
3.7.1.3	The counterculture in the early sixties: a general survey (see also chapter 5)	127
3.7.1.4	The return-to-basics movement	137
3.8	CRITICAL COMMENT ON THE THREE REACTION FORMATIONS TO THE PROGRESSIVE SCHOOL	140
3.9	CONCLUSION	143
4.	THE CRISIS OF THE SCHOOL IN THE 20TH CENTURY (ctd.): LEFT LIBERAL CRITICISM OF THE SCHOOL	144
4.1	INTRODUCTION	144
4.2	DEFINING THE TERMS	145
4.2.1	The meaning of the term "left"	145
4.2.2	The meaning of the term "liberal"	146
4.3	GENERAL OVERVIEW OF LEFT LIBERAL EFFORTS TO REFORM THE SCHOOL	148

4.3.1	Orientation	148
4.3.2	Criticism of the school by left liberals	149
4.3.2.1	Neil Postman and Charles Weingartner	149
4.3.2.2	Herbert Kohl	152
4.3.2.3	Charles Silberman	154
4.3.2.4	Edgar Z. Friedenberg	157
4.3.2.5	George Dennison	159
4.3.3	School reforms suggested by left liberals	161
4.3.3.1	Postman and Weingartner: The inquiry method	161
4.3.3.2	Kohl: The open classroom	164
4.3.3.3	Silberman: The British infant school	165
4.3.3.4	Friedenberg: The diversification of the school	167
4.3.3.5	Dennison: The First Street School	168
4.4	THE SCHOOL IDEA OF ONE SELECTED LEFT LIBERAL:	
	A.S. NEILL (1883 - 1973)	170
4.4.1	Orientation	170
4.4.2	Biographical sketch of A.S. Neill	171
4.4.3	Neill's life-view (cosmoscope)	173
4.4.4	Neill's views of the essence, aim, and content of education	175
4.4.4.1	The essence and aim of education	175
4.4.4.2	The content of education	178
4.4.5	Freedom and discipline in the school	179
4.4.5.1	Freedom	179
4.4.5.2	Authority	182
4.4.5.3	Discipline	184
4.4.5.4	Punishment	185
4.4.6	The task of the teacher in the school	186
4.4.7	The Summerhill School: Neill's experimental school	188

4.5	CRITICAL EVALUATION OF LEFT LIBERAL THEORY OF THE SCHOOL (WITH SPECIAL ATTENTION TO A.S. NEILL'S SCHOOL IDEA)	190
4.6	CONCLUSION	196
5.	THE CRISIS OF THE SCHOOL IN THE 20TH CENTURY (ctd.):	
	LEFT RADICAL CRITICISM OF THE SCHOOL	198
5.1	INTRODUCTION	198
5.2	THE MEANING OF THE TERM "RADICAL"	199
5.3	GENERAL OVERVIEW OF A LEFT RADICAL ALTERNATIVE STRATEGY TO THE PRESENT SCHOOL SYSTEM	201
5.3.1	Orientation	201
5.3.2	Criticism of the school from the left radicals	202
5.3.2.1	Everett Reimer	202
5.3.2.2	Paul Goodman	206
5.3.2.3	John Holt	209
5.3.2.4	Paulo Freire	214
5.3.3	Alternative strategy suggested by left radicals	214
5.3.3.1	Reimer: democratic institutions	217
5.3.3.2	Goodman: a diversified educational framework	217
5.3.3.3	Holt: learning networks	220
5.3.3.4	Freire: "Conscientization".....	223
5.4	RADICAL PROPOSALS CONCERNING EDUCATION BY ONE SELECTED LEFT RADICAL: IVAN ILLICH	229
5.4.1	Orientation	229
5.4.2	Biographical sketch of Ivan Illich	230
5.4.3	Illich's criticism of the modern school	231
5.4.3.1	Illich's view of modern society	231
5.4.3.2	A "phenomenological" description of the school	233

5.4.3.3	The school and the "evil" hidden curriculum	235
5.4.3.4	The school as a manipulative institution	238
5.4.3.5	The school as a monopolistic instrument	240
5.4.3.6	Illich's philosophical premise of man's nature	242
5.4.4	Illich's radical proposals for alternatives to the present school system	244
5.4.4.1	Deschooling society	244
5.4.4.2	Learning networks, webs, or opportunities	246
5.4.4.3	Toward Epimethean Man	248
5.5	CRITICAL EVALUATION OF LEFT RADICAL CRITICISM OF THE SCHOOL (WITH SPECIAL ATTENTION TO IVAN ILLICH'S CRITICISM OF THE SCHOOL)	250
5.6	CONCLUSION	257
6.	THE SCRIPTURAL PERSPECTIVE ON SCHOOLING AS AN ANSWER TO THE ALLEGED CRISIS OF THE SCHOOL	259
6.1	INTRODUCTION	259
6.2	A PROFILE OF THE FUNDAMENTAL PROBLEMS OF THE SCHOOL (ACCORDING TO ITS CRITICS)	260
6.2.1	Orientation	260
6.2.2	Ontological considerations	261
6.2.2.1	The ontological "problem" of the school (according to its critics)	261
6.2.2.2	The Scriptural perspective on the ontological "problem" of the school, amongst others the origin of the school	262
6.2.2.3	Evaluation of the ontological "problem" of the school	265

6.2.3	Anthropological considerations	266
6.2.3.1	The anthropological "problem" of the school (according to its critics)	266
6.2.3.2	The Scriptural view of man	267
6.2.3.3	Evaluation of the anthropological "problem" of the school	274
6.2.4	Epistemological considerations	275
6.2.4.1	The epistemological "problem" of the school (according to its critics)	275
6.2.4.2	A Scriptural perspective on the epistemological "problem" of the school, amongst others the function of the school	276
6.2.4.3	Evaluation of the epistemological "problem" of the school	282
6.2.5	Considerations linked to societal relationships	284
6.2.5.1	The societal relationships "problem" of the school (according to its critics)	284
6.2.5.2	A Scriptural perspective on the societal relationships "problem" of the school	285
6.2.5.3	Evaluation of the societal relationships "problem" of the school	289
6.2.6	Ethical considerations	290
6.2.6.1	The ethical "problem of the school (according to its critics)	290
6.2.6.2	A Scriptural perspective on the ethical "problem" of the school	291
6.2.6.3	Evaluation of the ethical "problem" of the school ...	297
6.2.7	Considerations concerning the prevailing religious ground motif "problem" of the school (as highlighted <u>inter alia</u> by its critics)	298
6.2.7.2	The Scriptural ground motif of school and schooling	299

6.2.7.3 Evaluation of the religious ground motif	
"problem" of the school	303
6.3 CONCLUSION	304
7. GENERAL CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	305
7.1 INTRODUCTION	305
7.2 BRIEF RE-STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM OF THE STUDY	305
7.3 GENERAL CONCLUSION	306
7.4 SOME OTHER FINDINGS	307
7.5 SOME PRACTICAL PROPOSALS	308
7.6 FURTHER AVENUES OF RESEARCH	310
7.7 POSSIBLE SHORTCOMING OF THE STUDY	311
7.8 CONCLUSION	312
BIBLIOGRAPHY	313
OPSOMMING	345
ABSTRACT	351

DIAGRAMS

Diagram 6.1: Flow-chart to explain the origin of the school in human society	264
Diagram 6.2: Flow-chart to explain the understanding of the function of the school	277